The relative effectiveness of fixed-wing aircraft and helicopters for surveying Trumpeter Swans

Len J. Shandruk1 and Kevin J. McCormick2

Abstract
The effectiveness of fixed-wing aircraft and helicopters for surveying Trumpeter Swans Cygnus buccinator is compared. The helicopter survey yielded 70% more adults and 44% more cygnets than the fixed-wing aircraft survey. The additional adults observed during the helicopter survey included two pairs, a single bird, and a pair with four cygnets. All birds observed during both surveys were undetected by one cygnet during the fixed-wing aircraft survey. The lower flight speed and greater manoeuvrability of helicopters are obvious assets during aerial surveys.

Introduction
Fixed-wing aircraft have been used in wildlife management for over 40 years (Crissey 1954). Their range and relatively inexpensive operation have allowed biologists access to otherwise inaccessible locations. Accordingly, they have been an indispensable tool for population surveys (Lottër and øom­cygnets during the fixed-wing aircraft survey. The lower flight speed and greater manoeuvrability are obvious assets during aerial surveys.

These advantages, however, are offset by their limited range (Diem and Lu 1960; Martinson and Kaczynski 1974) and generally underestimate animal numbers (Caughley 1974). Biologists have increasingly turned to helicopters in response to these constraints (Kaminski 1979; DeYoung 1985; Ross 1985). Ross (1985) concluded that helicopter surveys of waterfowl produced results similar to those from ground searches. Helicopters offer the advantages of slower cruising speed, variable flight heights, and greatly increased manoeuvrability. These advantages, however, are offset by their limited range and greater operating costs (Thompson and Baker 1981).

Although most Trumpeter Swan Cygnus buccinator popu­lation surveys have been conducted in fixed-wing aircraft (King 1973; McCormick and Shandruk 1986, 1987), helicopters have been used occasionally for localized surveys or other work (Shandruk and McCormick 1988). In July–August 1986, we surveyed an area with both a fixed-wing aircraft and a helicopter. The purpose of this paper is to present our results and to discuss their implications for future Trumpeter Swan surveys.

Study area
The study area is situated in the vicinity of Nahanni Butte, in the southwestern portion of the Mackenzie District, Northwest Territories. It includes the wetlands adjacent to the Liard–South Nahanni river junction and along Fishtrap Creek and Tetelee River (Fig. 1). The wetlands occur on sil­clay flood plains that border the rivers and creeks. These recent alluvial soils support forests of white spruce Picea glauca and balsam poplar Populus balsamifera in mixed or pure stands. The shrub layer consists of alder Alnus incana, squawberry Viburnum edule, and wild rose Rosa acicularis. Emergent vegetation is composed of cattail Typha latifolia, bog-mush Juncus sp., sedges Carex spp., and horsetail Equisetum sp. Watery Nuphar variegatum is the only obvious submergent species.

Methods
We (LJS and KJM) surveyed the study area in a Cessna 185 airplane on 27–29 July 1986. Survey height and cruising speed were approximately 225–300 m above ground level (agl) and 250 km h−1, respectively. All water bodies within sight of the survey route were examined. When one or more Trumpeter Swans were sighted, flight speed and altitude were reduced to determine the number of adults present, the breed­ing status of the birds, and the number of cygnets present. More than one pass was made over the birds to confirm our observations if necessary. Survey height and cruising speed were reduced to 60 m agl and 150–165 km h−1, respectively, on the lower passes (D. Kirkhus, pers. commun.).

We surveyed the same area in a Bell 206-B helicopter on 1–2 August 1986. Cruising speed — 200 km h−1 — and survey height — 150 m agl — were reduced to 50–60 km h−1 and 30 m agl, respectively, when closer inspections were re­quired (I. Broadbent, pers. commun.). Wetlands were tightly circled as required to facilitate observations.

Results and discussion
The survey results are presented in Table 1. The fixed-wing aircraft survey yielded 10 adults and 18 cygnets, whereas the helicopter survey revealed 17 adults and 26 cygnets — 70% more adults and 44% more cygnets than the fixed-wing aircraft survey. This study was conducted during the molt, when adults are unable to leave their breeding wetlands; as a result, migrations from one wetland to another did not influence our observations. The large difference in the results of the two surveys may be attributed to two major factors:

1. As the minimum cruising altitude and speed of fixed-