

Canadian Centre
for Foreign Policy
Development



Centre canadien
pour le développement
de la politique étrangère

125 Sussex Dr. Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0G2

REPORT FROM THE ROUNDTABLE ON INDONESIA

CCFPD

13 March 2000 (Victoria, BC)

5007.1E

ISBN: E2-225/2000E-IN
0-662-30070-X

REPORT FROM THE ROUNDTABLE ON INDONESIA

March 13, 2000
Victoria, British Columbia

A roundtable organized by the Canadian Centre for Foreign Policy Development and the Southeast Asia Division of the Department of Foreign Affairs was held on March 13, 2000, in Victoria, British Columbia. Academics, federal government officials, military policy analysts, election observers, human rights monitors, regional security specialists, leaders of NGO initiatives and students of Pacific Rim Studies met to discuss current issues in the context of recent political and economic reform processes in Indonesia and to offer advice on future Canadian policy developments. The roundtable was a follow-up to a recent and similar meeting in Montreal, Quebec. Canadian Ambassador in Indonesia, Ken Sunquist, was a resource person. The roundtable focussed on issues related to Indonesia's current transition, the roles of Indonesian civil society groups and roles of Canadian civil society and the Canadian government in furthering bilateral relations with an evolving Indonesia.

SETTING THE CONTEXT:

Background documents with an analysis of recent Indonesian developments and critical issues such as national stability and unity, threats to democracy and the development of civil society were distributed to participants before the roundtable. As an introduction to the dialogue, Canadian Ambassador, Ken Sunquist, gave a briefing on the current transition processes taking place in Indonesia.

Ambassador Sunquist related that East Timor is moving forward and predicted in two years it should be a small independent country. He said there is some sense of legitimacy in Indonesia because of the recent independence movements of East Timor. Indonesia, itself, is in deep transition. Democracy, although not institutionalized, is being talked about openly. This shift in thinking has not translated to power-sharing as yet. There is a lack of cohesion in the Government Cabinet. The Prime Minister is the visionary and tends to approach one issue at a time. His foreign policy outreach has been excellent.

The next three years and subsequent election will be the real test for Indonesia. Civilian control of the military is showing some signs of movement. The role of the military in the reform agenda and the everyday life of Indonesia is a critical issue for Indonesia. Intertwined is the process of decentralization taking place in the country. Seen as a political issue, rather than an economic one, the rules of the decentralization process have not been fleshed out. This is a problem for foreign investment and the number one issue for Canada to be watching.

Unemployment has doubled and people's expectations are high. A free press (the freest in Asia) has emerged with a rapid emergence of civil society groups who are building partnerships amongst themselves. There is a strong sense of regionalism coupled with the issues of human rights and economic justice. The nature of ASEAN has changed in Asia. The human security of 600,000 refugees is critical. Islamic politics and their differing perspectives have a huge impact on the region as a whole and more specifically Indonesia which has the largest Islamic population in the world. In summary, Ambassador Sunquist highlighted the emergence of democracy, the open media and the potential of Indonesia to have a positive impact in the region as a whole.

INDONESIA IN TRANSITION:

POLITICAL AND ECONOMIC REFORM PROCESSES: EMERGING ISSUES:

Democratic Development:

As a democracy in transition, Indonesia faces many critical issues. There is a feeling of renewal in the country with the recent changes and the election results, but the capacity of the different levels of government is in question. Support for institutional development and training is needed to strengthen legal processes – from the police to the judiciary.

Civil Society in Transition:

Civil Society is shifting ground and changing in nature throughout Indonesia. Civil Society is recognized as a broad range of groups of academic, educational, legal Institutions and NGOs including environment, labour, refugee, and human rights groups. Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are mushrooming throughout Indonesia. In East Timor alone there are 57 domestic NGOs and 59 international NGOs. Many domestic NGOs are moving to become international NGOs with high wages which cannot be sustained over the years. Four or five of the current Cabinet Ministers have come from organizations such as WAHLI, a credible, environmental leader.

Decentralization:

There appears to be a strong recognition that the country can no longer be centrally controlled and administered and that decentralization will in the long run be good for the provinces. However, it is not clear how decentralization is viewed from the periphery, how it will be administered and whether local communities will be able to have elected representation.

Territorial Integrity: West Papua

Each of the separatist movements within Indonesia is viewed as unique. Key areas include West Papua and Aceh. For some it is important to understand what the broader communities and people are thinking and balance this with the goals of the leadership and elite supporters within the independence movements. Canada's support for Indonesia's territorial integrity has in some cases, such as East Timor, led to problems in the past. West Papua is viewed by some as a special situation as both a cultural and racial issue. Those closer to West Papua community

leaders have heard clearly that people in West Papua want independence. The December independence declaration in West Papua, which Canada provided some support to (through NGOs), is unique. It was suggested Canada review its current policy of recognizing Indonesia as a nation and adopt a clearer policy as the current Canadian messages are mixed.

Regional Security:

The ASEAN Secretariat and ASEAN Regional Forum (based in Jakarta) are relatively new and untested, due somewhat in part to the Forum's structure. So far, the ASEAN Regional Forum hasn't taken a leading role in the region. Many feel ASEAN is the future and needs to be supported financially (perhaps from Singapore) with a strengthened leadership role. An encouraging development is that human rights issues have been raised in ASEAN for the first time in six years. A question for Canada is if Canada now helped West Papua after East Timor, then what message is this giving to Indonesia's neighbours in the region?

Human Security:

Ethnic and religious clashes are a major challenge to human security and democratic development in Indonesia. Refugee settlement and rights need to be addressed by the country.

Current Economic Situation:

The unemployment levels in Indonesia have doubled in recent years. Because the rules of decentralization are still unclear, foreign investment is cautiously looking at Indonesia. Decentralization has created some competing and unresolved issues. For example, a business or corporation may be paying taxes to the central government and the provincial government wants this source. Some revenues such as mining are shared with the provinces whereas oil and gas are not. Integrating local people into these discussions is important. Critical issues around land use and ownership are unresolved at this point.

WHAT CAN CANADA DO?

Canada should support the current change process taking place in Indonesia. Roundtable participants identified elements of the change process to support and possible niches for Canada. They included:

1. Economic Reform:

This discussion focused on the role of Canadian corporations in Indonesia. The role of Canadian corporations exercising their influence in environmental stewardship was raised in the discussion. Canadian standards are higher than anywhere in the world and this often leaves Canadian companies in unclear situations. Several indigenous NGOs have been receiving support from CIDA around indigenous land rights. It was suggested Canadian mining corporations should renegotiate their current contracts to include compensation packages. It was further suggested Canada address one of its own entities – the Export Development Corporation – whose terms are under review and historically hasn't had to exercise environmental standards.

Some economic concrete steps mentioned were: assistance with pension and insurance procedures, implementing national regulations and customs procedures and trade negotiations.

2. Democratic Development:

Indonesia is a new democracy with its first democratically elected government. The Cabinet is barely functioning and the capacity of Parliament is weak. Canada could, therefore, support the capacity development of the Indonesian Parliament, election-monitoring, civic education and support to electoral groups. The military has had a significant governance role in Indonesia. The role of the military is currently in transformation. The promotion of the rule of law is essential.

3. Human Rights and Governance

There is a need to focus and re-start a dialogue on human rights. Canada could provide technical assistance and advisors to the Ministry of Human Rights, a Human Rights Commission and a National Commission on Violence Against Women. The Ministry of Women's Equality in British Columbia is a leader on violence against women programs.

4. Development and Humanitarian Assistance:

In 1997, Canada was planning to decrease development assistance (through the Canadian Development Assistance Agency - CIDA) to Indonesia. The CIDA programs have now been extended to 2001- 02. This is an opportunity to review current CIDA programs and design solid development support for Indonesia's transition over the next 5 years. There are two separate envelopes/budgets for Indonesia and East Timor.

Training was suggested for teachers, civic educators and religious and ethnic training in tolerance and diversity. CARE, CUSO, World Vision and WUSC have implemented democracy education. There is some concern by elected people that Canada supports NGOs to do democracy education and training. The question is who is best placed to do this training.

Poverty-alleviation is the focus of CIDA. Basic education, children in vulnerable positions, healthcare and HIV programs were highlighted as CIDA refines its development priorities. It was suggested Canada should be providing food aid to certain sectors of Indonesia.

5. Broader Civil Society Involvement:

The roundtable participants were asked to identify key players in Indonesia's civil society and these groups are listed and attached to this report. It was highlighted that the Indonesia-Canada Forum was a good model for Canadian NGO to Indonesian NGO relations. Funded by CIDA, the model was considered to be ahead of it's time in the mid 90's. Re-visiting this model would be timely as Canada looks to broadening civil society participation. Canada is gender mainstreaming in all CIDA projects now to encourage

more participation by women. Canada could support the education of minorities, parenthood organizations and provide community groups with financial training and social safety net training.

6. Canada BIndonesia Relations

Canada should encourage Government to Government meetings, invitations to Canada (the President), travel exchanges and building bridges within Indonesia. Civil society to civil society exchanges for youth and students should be encouraged between Canada and Indonesia.

7. Sharing Canadian Models

Appropriate models of project management, transparency and process management could be shared with the Indonesian civil service and civil society groups. Canada could address critical issues about diversity and tolerance by sharing models about dispute resolution and diversity management. Experience with First Nation negotiations could be exported for use by government and civil society groups. The Pacific Peoples Partnership has a successful model for Indigenous – Canada linkages and internships where First Nation youth are sent overseas.

Environmental issues such as deforestation were flagged but not developed during this meeting. WHALI, an environmental leader in Indonesia has significant influence. It was noted Canada might have some models it could share with Indonesia. The BC Ministry of Forests may have some best practices to share around deforestation.

8. Reconciliation:

Despite most Indonesians wishing to move beyond the past there are deep and unhealed wounds in the country. Victims of abuse and rape require counseling and other support. The rape of indigenous Chinese women should be given a priority. It was suggested that a Truth and Reconciliation Commission be established to address the issues of the past. Respecting most Indonesians do not want to go back too far in their history for fear of destabilizing the progress of the past year, a Commission could address abuses and admissions of guilt and help move the healing process on.

9. Regional role for Indonesia:

It is important to find balance between Indonesia's governance and domestic issues and the need for regional security. A model to consider is the South China Working Group, which has worked closely and successfully on the South China Sea. ASEAN is seen as the key to the future and should be supported to become a leader in the region.

CHALLENGES FOR CANADA:

Territorial Integrity: West Papua:

Canada respects Indonesian territorial integrity. There are, however, 173 different tribes throughout Indonesia and each separatist movement are considered unique. Canada funded the first Congress in West Papua to help with cohesion in the movement. Some strongly feel Canada should support territorial integrity with one exception, that being West Papua, and others recognize the fragile stability that exists in the region.

The question for Canada is: "What would the future of Indonesia be with a growing trend towards independence" and "How would Canadian interests be served by assisting West Papua independence?"

Decentralization:

The question was posed, but not answered at this roundtable, whether decentralization in Indonesia is associated with reducing federal powers and therefore leading the way for corporations to fill the space. The rules of decentralization are unclear and this is considered the most important issue for Canada to be monitoring in Indonesia. It was suggested a federal authority be established and supported which would regulate and monitor this transition.

The question for Canada is: "Should Canada draw on it's experiences and advise Indonesia on models and processes of decentralization – that is decentralization of certain central government roles and powers to the provinces"?

Military to Military Contact:

The Indonesian armed forces are smaller per capita than Canada and although Indonesia's military may be small, it is known for it's inappropriate use of force such as crushing civil liberties in East Timor. With freedom of the press has come a greater understanding by the public of what has and is happening with the military. For example 7,000 human rights abuses by the military in Aceh have been exposed. By 2004 the military is to be no longer in the Parliament. However, decentralization will directly influence the future role of the military and this must be monitored closely.

There will be civil society unrest over the next 5 years. People now know through recent experience that protests - particularly violent protest - gets results. The military and police need to understand that non-violent protest is part of democracy and that people have these rights. Violent protest, however, is not acceptable in a democracy. Education and training to meet these challenges is necessary. There have been some fundamental changes in the military in the last 18 months so there is room for Canada to re-consider its role with the Indonesian military. Arms sales have ceased and the next naval change is in 2001, which indicates there may be a maritime peacekeeping role in the future. Training of both police and military officers in peacekeeping and peacebuilding would help transform the law enforcement practices in the country. Democracy needs to be institutionalized and war crime trials have to take place before there are any future military sales to Indonesia.

The question for Canada is, in part: "Will the Indonesian military decrease in size and influence, what conditions should exist to begin military to military contact and what should or should not Canada be engaged in, support or be encouraging?"

CONCLUSION

Canadians are very aware of Indonesia and the recent political changes in the country. Electronic monitoring and media profiles bring the issues closer for Canadians to follow. Canadians, particularly students on the West Coast of Canada have been following these issues for many years – issues of deforestation, cultural issues such as language and arts and human rights in East Timor and West Papua.

A new framework for Canada – Indonesia relations is required for an Indonesia in transition. A framework that embodies the Canadian pillars of human security and democratic development going hand in hand with Canada's economic interests in the region. A number of key initiatives for a Canadian framework include:

Institution building such as police training, civilian police training, sharing the Canadian Human Rights Commission best practices, and labour standards to respond to globalization.

Capacity-building initiatives included support to civil society groups, NGO-NGO activities, and strengthening partnerships amongst civil society groups.

Canada should invite the President of Indonesia to Canada and plan Ministerial and provincial visits and exchanges to Indonesia. Canada needs to support Indonesia's change process and cement positive outcomes of change. The fundamental key to supporting Indonesia's transition is a strengthened civil society with a broader involvement in Indonesia's future development.

Report written by Dawn McLean
Consultant

**APPENDIX 1
ROUNDTABLE ON INDONESIA**

**March 13, 2000
Victoria, British Columbia**

Indonesian civil society groups (suggested by roundtable participants (BRACKETS))

- N.U. – Nahdlatul
(DAVIDMacDUFF)

- Muhammadiyah GHANDI (Gerakan Anti Disleriminasi
- Solidaritas Perempuan
(IWAN SUWANDI)

- SBSI – headed by Mochtan Pakpahan
- AMAN – Aliansi Masgarakat Adat Nusantara
(Alliance of Indigenous Peoples)
- YTM – Yayasan Tarah Merdeka, Sulawesi Tengah
- YAPPIKA
(DAVID WEBSTER)

- West Papua national Youth Awareness Team
(CATHERINE SPARKS NGENGE)

- LBH: Legal Aid Foundation
- YAYASAN OBOR
- Independent Association of Legal Practitioners
- Academics and Student Societies
(JOE KNOCKAERT)

- MPR/DP
- election observation/civic education groups
(SARAH TAYLOR)

- I.H.R.S.T.A.D. – Institution for Huan rights, Society, Technology and Development
contact: ohn Rumbiak

- Focus on the Global south (Bangkok)
Re: Globalization/Human Security
- Council for Alternative Security in Asia-Pacific (CASAP)
(PATTI WILLIS)

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS
ROUNDTABLE ON INDONESIA**

**March 13, 2000
Victoria, British Columbia**

KEN SUNQUIST
CANADIAN AMBASSADOR IN INDONESIA
Tel: 62-21 525-0709
Fax: 62-21 571-2251
ken.sunquist@dfait-maeci.gc.ca

CO-CHAIRS:

SARAH TAYLOR
DEPARTMENT OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS
Tel: 613 996 - 8194
Fax: 613 944 -1604
sarah.taylor@dfait-maeci.gc.ca

RANDALL GARRISON
CAMOSUN COLLEGE
Tel: 250 - 370-3336
garrison@camosun.bc.ca

PARTICIPANTS:

WILLOW ALLEN
STUDENT
Tel: 250 - 384-4494
kallen@pacificcoast.net

JEFFREY ALLPORT
STUDENT
jeffreyallport@yahoo.com

DR. JIM BOUTILIER
MARITIME FORCES PACIFIC-POLICY ADVISOR
Tel: 250 - 363-7412
Fax: 250 - 363 - 5845/7434
boutilier@ampsc.com

DR. LESLIE BUTT
UNIVERSITY OF VICTORIA
Tel: 250 - 721 - 6647
Fax: 250 - 721 - 7219
lbutt@uvic.ca

TAMMY CONLIN
CANADA WORLD YOUTH
Tel: 604 - 732 - 5113
Fax: 604 - 732 - 9141
tcon-bc@cwj-jcm.org

AARON GAIRDNER
MARITIME FORCES PACIFIC
Tel: 250 - 363 - 4606
Fax: 250 - 363 - 7434
Aaron_Gairdner@hotmail.com

MARIO GARIEPY
DEPARTMENT OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS
Tel: 613 - 996 - 7350
Fax: 613 - 944 - 1604
mario.gariepy@dfait-maeci.gc.ca

JOE KNOCKAERT
CIDA VANCOUVER OFFICE
Tel: 604 - 666 - 9952
Fax: 604 - 666-0954
knockaert.joe@ic.gc.ca

FRANCIS KIEM
HUMAN RIGHTS INTERNATIONAL
Tel: 604 - 951 - 9687
Tel: 604 - 951 - 9001
kiem11282@home.com

JESSIE LLOYD
MARITIME FORCES PACIFIC
Tel: 250 - 363 - 7435
Fax: 250 - 363 - 7434
jessielloyd@hotmail.com

DAVID MACDUFF
ASIA PACIFIC FOUNDATION
Tel: 604 - 684 - 5986
Fax: 604 - 681 - 1370
david.macduff@apfc.apfnet.org

DR. PETER MAIDSTONE
CAMOSUN COLLEGE
Tel: 250 - 370 - 3369
Fax: 250 - 370 - 3417
maidstone@camosun.bc.ca

DREW PENLAND
EAST TIMOR OBSERVER
Tel/Fax: 250 - 940 - 2034
drewpenland@hotmail.com

IWAN SUWANDI
VANCOUVER FORUM
Tel: 604 - 951 - 9687
Fax: 604 - 951 - 9001
vanforum@usa.net

CATHERINE SPARKS-NGENGE
PACIFIC PEOPLE'S PARTNERSHIP
Tel: 250 - 592 - 2077
sparks@islandnet.com

MUTANG URUD
PACIFIC PEOPLE'S PARTNERSHIP
Tel: 250 - 381 - 4131
Fax: 250 - 388 - 5258
sppf@sppf.org

DAVID WEBSTER
UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
davidweb@interchange.ubc.ca

PATTI WILLIS
PACIFIC CAMPAIGN FOR DISARMAMENT
AND SECURITY (PCDS)
Tel/Fax: 250 - 335 - 0351
pcdsres@island.net

CANADIAN CENTRE FOR FOREIGN POLICY DEVELOPMENT

NAO YOKOYAMA
Tel: 613 - 944 - 8278
Fax: 613 - 944 - 0687
Naohisa.Yokoyama@dfait-maeci.gc.ca

DAWN McLEAN
CONSULTANT
Tel/Fax: 250 - 592 - 4901
dawnmclean@pinc.com



March 10, 2000

Dear Friends,

We are pleased to invite you to a roundtable on Indonesia to be held **March 13, 2000, in Victoria, from 8:30am to 4:30pm, Ocean Pointe Hotel, 45 Songhees Road, Executive Lounge**. The Canadian Ambassador in Indonesia, Ken Sunquist, will participate.

An informal reception with a no-host bar will be held on Sunday (March 12, 2000) in the Executive Lounge at the Ocean Pointe Hotel from 7-9pm and is an opportunity for participants to meet each other before the roundtable. Parking is available at the hotel.

This roundtable, organized by the Canadian Centre for Foreign Policy Development and the Southeast Asia Division of the Department of Foreign Affairs, will seek your views and advice on current issues especially in the context of the many changes that have taken place in Indonesia since President Soeharto's fall in May 1998 and, more recently, since the general elections in June 1999. The main objective is to share information on the present situation and think together about Canadian policy development.

Topics for discussion include:

- The current situation and the political and economic reform process in Indonesia - Challenges and opportunities for Canadian Foreign Policy
- The role of Indonesian civil society in democratization and change
- The role of Canadian civil society and government in furthering bilateral relations

We hope to assemble experts from a number of sectors including; universities, NGOs, government and youth. Attached you will find the draft agenda, list of invitees, as well as information regarding your travel and reimbursement.

Sincerely,

Steve Lee
Executive Director

AGENDA
ROUNDTABLE ON INDONESIA

March 13, 2000
Victoria, British Columbia

- | | |
|---------------|--|
| 8:30 - 9:00 | Coffee and Donuts (Executive Lounge) |
| 9:00 - 9:20 | Welcome, Roundtable Introduction (Randall Garrison and Sarah Taylor) |
| 9:20 - 9:35 | Presentation
H.E. Ken Sunquist, Canadian Ambassador to Indonesia |
| 9:35 - 11:30 | Part 1: Discussion
The current situation and the political and economic reform process in Indonesia - Challenges and opportunities for Canadian Foreign Policy

Opening comments |
| 11:30 - 12:30 | Lunch |
| 12:30 - 14:15 | Part 2: Discussion
The role of Indonesian civil society in democratization and change

Opening comments |
| 14:15 - 14:30 | Break |
| 14:30 - 16:15 | Part 3: Discussion
The role of Canadian civil society and government in furthering bilateral relations

Opening comments: |
| 16:15 - 16:30 | Policy Options for Canada / Conclusion |