



Western Economic
Diversification Canada

Diversification de l'économie
de l'Ouest Canada

Evaluation of the Centenaries Program

WESTERN ECONOMIC DIVERSIFICATION CANADA

Audit and Evaluation Branch

March 2010

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

Funded under the program authority of the Western Diversification Program (WDP), the Centenaries Program was a one-time initiative commemorating the 100th anniversaries of the Provinces of Alberta (September 1, 2005) and Saskatchewan (September 4, 2005). The objectives of the Centenaries Program were to:

- Increase community participation in celebrating the achievements of Saskatchewan and Alberta and their contributions to Confederation;
- Enhance and strengthen community economies and community competitiveness by supporting lasting legacy capital projects;
- Increase government and community collaboration to strengthen the federal presence in Western Canada and at the centenary celebrations; and
- Increase economic activity to improve competitiveness in western Canadian communities.

The Government of Canada allocated a total of \$100M for the Centennials. Western Economic Diversification Canada (the department) delivered \$92M for capital legacy projects and Canadian Heritage delivered up to \$8M for commemorative and celebratory events under their Celebration, Commemoration and Learning Program.

The department allocated \$55.2M (60% of \$92M) to Alberta to fund seven commemorative capital legacy projects. The department also funded four projects (called Alberta branded centennial projects) from its core funding rather than through Centenary Program funding. The department transferred the implementation of two of the Alberta Capital Legacy Projects to other departments for implementation. As of July 2009, one of the Alberta capital legacy projects was complete and all four Alberta branded centennial projects were complete. With the exception of the Royal Alberta Museum, all projects are expected to be complete by March 31, 2010. Construction on the Royal Alberta Museum project is expected to begin in 2011.

The department allocated the remaining \$36.8M (40% of \$92M) to Saskatchewan. Saskatchewan's funds were divided into two streams: 1) six strategic capital initiatives located in Regina or Saskatoon; and 2) a community-based initiative, Canada Celebrates Saskatchewan (CCS), providing per capita contributions to all Saskatchewan communities except Regina and Saskatoon. As of July 2009, four of the six Saskatchewan strategic capital projects were complete and all CCS projects were complete. All Saskatchewan projects are expected to be complete by December 2010.

The centenaries program, funded using the WDP authority, was evaluated based on the Performance Measurement Framework of the WDP. The evaluation assessed the achievement of intended objectives and progress towards the ultimate outcome of increased economic activity and competitiveness in western Canadian communities. The evaluation methodology included document, literature, file and database reviews, a community survey, 29 key informant interviews and 6 case studies. The evaluation assessed the cost-effectiveness and success of the

program, and covered the fiscal years 2004-05 to 2008-09. This was a one-time program not being renewed and therefore the evaluation only assessed the initial, and not the ongoing, relevance of the program.

There is a need for a similar program to attend to the upgrading of cultural and arts infrastructure in the region, although this is outside the department's current mandate. When the program began in 2005, its purpose and objectives aligned with WD's strategic outcome of Community Economic Development and the federal priority of Strong Economic Growth. During its lifetime, the program filled an important funding gap; without departmental funding, most projects would not have proceeded or would have been reduced in scale and required more time for completion.

Success of Centenaries Activities and Projects

The completed projects achieved their performance targets and most of the in-progress projects made promising progress towards their targets.

Both of the Centenaries Program and Canadian Heritage's Celebration, Commemoration and Learning Program (CCLP) aimed to increase visibility and participation in the centenaries and therefore it is difficult to quantify the individual effect of each program. Survey findings, conducted as part of the evaluation of the CCLP, reported heightened local awareness and participation in the centennials and strengthened national pride and belonging.

The expected outcomes of the Centenaries Program were to:

- foster community participation through grassroots community involvement, engagement of diverse elements of Canadian society (urban and rural communities, Aboriginal and ethno-cultural Canadians), greater access to learning opportunities and visibly linking projects to centenaries celebrations;
- enhance and strengthened community economies by enhancing community services and facilities, increasing attendance and revenue flowing to projects or community events and increasing capacity within community organizations; and
- promote coordination and collaboration among all three levels of government and the community through collaborative funding and increased federal visibility.

Many of the projects have made promising progress towards achieving their expected outcomes. The ultimate outcome of the Centenaries Program was increased economic activity that improved competitiveness in western Canadian communities. Some of the projects have positively affected their community economies although the full impact of the program will take a longer time to assess. The 45 largest community projects (more than \$20,000) reported greater success with respect to engaging diverse elements of Canadian society in the centennial and the project, creating opportunities for community and government coordination and collaboration, increasing capacity in the organization, and improving competitiveness in the participating communities. Among the large projects, three have been particularly successful in expanding the tourism, technology and culture sectors of their community economies. Other large projects have great

potential to contribute in important ways to the community economy once they are open and operational.

Not every aspect of the program was successful. The extended timelines for several of the large projects has diminished their association with the actual centennial dates. Furthermore, construction on Alberta's flagship centennial project, the Royal Alberta Museum, is slated to start in 2011 with the facility opening in 2015, ten years after the centennial.

The ability to measure the success of a project and to quantify other funding leveraged is dependent on accurate performance and financial data. The evaluation noted gaps in some of the performance and financial data on file. The department's project database was new, requiring staff to process a large volume of projects within tight timelines. In the interests of efficiency, the department decided to document due diligence in the files but not in the database.

Cost-effectiveness

The Centenaries Program was well structured to accomplish its objectives and the delivery structure was cost-effective. Overall, the program leveraged \$3.37 from other funding sources for every departmental dollar spent, which compares favourably with the leveraging related to the WDP program (\$1.82) and with other federal grants and contributions programs (ranging from \$1.5 to \$2.3).

Recommendation

The evidence gathered in the evaluation suggests the following recommendation.

1. The department should ensure its corporate database captures relevant project performance and financial information in a timely manner.

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1.1 Acknowledgement | 1 |
| 1.2 Background | 1 |
| 1.3 Evaluation Mandate | 6 |
| SECTION 2: METHODOLOGY | 7 |
| 2.1 Scope of Work | 7 |
| 2.2 Evaluation Study Activities | 8 |
| 2.4 Limitations of the Methodology | 11 |
| SECTION 3: RELEVANCE | 13 |
| 3.1 Need for Program | 13 |
| 3.2 Consistency with Federal Roles and Responsibilities | 13 |
| SECTION 4: PERFORMANCE: ACHIEVEMENT OF EXPECTED OUTCOMES | 14 |
| 4.1 General Findings | 14 |
| 4.2 Performance: Outputs of the Centenaries Program Activities | 14 |
| 4.3 Expected Outcome: Community Participation | 16 |
| 4.4 Expected Outcome: Enhanced and strengthened community economies | 20 |
| 4.5 Expected Outcome: Collaboration and coordination activities | 22 |
| 4.6 Ultimate Outcome: Improved community economic activity and competitiveness | 25 |
| 4.7 Unintended Impacts | 26 |
| SECTION 5: PERFORMANCE: DEMONSTRATION OF EFFICIENCY & ECONOMY | 28 |
| 5.1 Cost-effectiveness | 28 |
| 5.2 Alternatives | 30 |
| 5.3 Key Factors Affecting the Success of the Program | 31 |
| SECTION 6: RECOMMENDATION | 33 |

Section 1: Introduction

1.1 Acknowledgement

Western Economic Diversification Canada (the department) would like to thank all of the key informants, case study participants and survey participants who generously gave of their time and knowledge to take part in the *Evaluation of the Centenaries Program*. Without their participation and their insights, this report would not have been possible. The evaluators also acknowledge the work done by Ference Weicker & Company in collecting key informant interview and survey data.

1.2 Background

1.2.1 Western Diversification Program

The Western Diversification Program (WDP) is the department's major program and provides support to projects that develop, strengthen and diversify the Western Canadian economy. The WDP facilitates the department's collaborative opportunities and responses to economic priorities.¹

As an umbrella program authority, the WDP has a number of sub-components operating under its authority. One of these sub-components, the Centenaries Program, was a one-time program commemorating the 100th anniversaries of Alberta (September 1, 2005) and Saskatchewan (September 4, 2005). These shared centenaries offered the federal government the opportunity to recognize the economic, social and cultural contributions of the Provinces of Alberta and Saskatchewan, strengthen the common heritage of Canadians within confederation and contribute to community economic development in the two provinces.

1.2.2 The Centenaries Program

The Government of Canada allocated a total of \$100M for the Centennials in recognition of the provinces' achievements and contributions to Confederation. Western Economic Diversification Canada was responsible for delivering \$92M for capital legacy projects and Canadian Heritage (PCH) was responsible for delivering up to \$8M for commemorative and celebratory events.

The \$100M in funding was allocated as follows:

- \$40M for Saskatchewan with the department delivering \$35.9M for capital legacy projects and PCH delivering \$3.1M for commemorative and celebratory events. The remaining \$1M was for operating costs of the department and PCH to deliver their respective initiatives.

¹ Western Economic Diversification Canada (n.d.) Western Diversification Program.
<http://www.wd.gc.ca/eng/301.asp>

- \$60M for Alberta with the department delivering \$54M in federal funding for capital legacy projects and PCH delivering \$3.1M for commemorative and celebratory events. The balance of \$2.9M was for operating costs of the department and PCH to deliver their respective initiatives.

Projects were chosen to fit with the following criteria:

- Fit with federal strategic priorities of:
 - Regional and rural economic development including small and medium-sized enterprises.
 - Social development and strengthening Canada's social foundations.
 - Cities and sustainable communities, including Aboriginal and rural communities.
 - Address western alienation.
- General use and enjoyment:
 - Grass roots community involvement.
 - Engage diverse elements of Canadian society – rural and urban communities, aboriginal and ethno-cultural Canadians, official language minorities.
- Long term federal visibility and recognition:
 - Commemorative capital projects that will provide lasting federal visibility and recognition.
 - Long term learning and awareness products.
- Link to other levels of government and national celebrations.
- Incrementality:
 - Clear and visible link to centenaries and contributes to their impact.
- Leveraging of other funds:
 - Other levels of government.
 - Non-governmental organizations, private sector, project proponents.

Centenaries funding was approved in December 2004. The Minister of Western Economic Diversification was responsible for project approval; the provinces and the Department of Canadian Heritage were consulted as needed. Funding was in the form of non-repayable transfer payments.

The initial funding for the program is shown below.

Table 1-1 Initial Centenary Funding (Millions \$)

| Year | Operating | Grants & Contributions | Total |
|------------------------|------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------|
| 2004-05 | \$0.25 | \$9.75 | \$10.0 |
| 2005-06 | \$2.05 | \$79.95 | \$82.0 |
| Total Resources | \$2.3 | \$89.7 | \$92.0 |

The commemorative or legacy project criteria targeted the department's strategic outcome of Community Economic Development, linking to the Community Economic Planning, Development and Adjustment Program Activity by:

- bringing together private sector, non-profit sector and other levels of government to create near term business opportunities for local small and medium-sized enterprises;
- generating lasting economic benefits by building and enhancing facilities to attract additional tourists; and
- enabling facilities to compete for large world-class events, and improve the quality of life in surrounding communities.

1.2.3 The Alberta Region

The funding allocated to the department's Alberta Region for the capital component of the federal centenaries initiative was based on \$55.2M (60% of \$92M) in grants and contributions and operating costs.

Seven commemorative capital legacy projects and four branded centennial projects were funded in Alberta. Branded projects were projects labelled as Centenary, but funded through the department's core funding rather than through the Centenary Program.

The department's most recent update in September 2008 reported that all projects were now committed and that all but two, the Royal Alberta Museum and the Alberta Gallery of Art, were complete. Construction costs for the Alberta Gallery of Art had increased from \$48M to \$88 M, requiring additional contributions from the City of Edmonton (\$21), the Province of Alberta (\$27M) and the federal government (\$10M); the additional \$10M brought the total federal contribution up to \$20M. The department's contribution to the Royal Alberta Museum increased from \$28.5M to \$30.0M, of which only \$3.8M had been disbursed by July 2009 because construction had halted while the organization undertook a visioning exercise. The following tables summarize the department's contributions and total costs by project. The current contributions/costs are as of July, 2009, from the file review. According to the database, only one Alberta Capital Legacy Project, the Healing Gardens – Alberta Children's Hospital, was complete as of July 2009. Table 1-2 summarizes departmental contributions and disbursements (if less than contributions) and total costs for each of the Alberta capital legacy projects. All of the Alberta Branded Centennial projects were complete and final departmental contributions and total costs are outlined in Table 1.3.

Table 1-2 Costs and Contributions - Alberta Capital Legacy Projects (Millions \$)

| Project | WD Contribution | | Total Cost | |
|---|-----------------|------------------------|-----------------|------------------|
| | Initial | Current (Disbursed) | Initial | Current |
| Royal Alberta Museum | \$28.5M | \$30.0M (\$3.8M) | \$180.0M | Unknown |
| Art Gallery of Alberta | \$10.0M | \$10.0M | \$48.0M | \$88.0M |
| Glenbow Museum | \$5.0M | \$5.0M (\$4.4M) | \$9.0M | \$9.0M |
| Heritage Park Pavilion | \$3.0M | \$3.0M | \$18.6M | \$18.6M |
| Museum of the Regiments Expansion | \$3.0M | \$3.0M | \$15.0M | \$15.0M |
| Healing Gardens – Alberta Children’s Hospital | \$2.0M | \$2.0M | \$4.25M | \$4.4M |
| Lieutenant Governor’s Arts Awards Program | \$1.0M | \$1.0M | \$3.0M | \$3.0M |
| TOTAL | \$52.5M | \$54M (\$27.2M) | \$277.9M | \$318.0M* |

NOTE: Two projects, Lieutenant Governor’s Arts Awards Program and Museum of the Regiments, were transferred to PCH and National Defence, respectively, for implementation. Initial costs and contributions were assumed to be the same as final/current amounts.

*Current estimated value based on \$180.0M for Royal Alberta Museum.

Table 1-3 Costs and Contributions - Alberta Branded Centennial Projects (Millions \$)

| Project | WD Contribution | | Total Cost | |
|--|-----------------|---------------|----------------|----------------|
| | Initial | Final | Initial | Final |
| 2005 World Masters Games – Edmonton | \$4.0M | \$4.0M | \$14.7M | \$13.6M |
| 2005 World Half Marathon Championship – Edmonton | \$0.3M | \$0.2M | \$2.2M | \$1.9M |
| Alberta Centennial World Cup – Canmore | \$0.1M | \$0.1M | \$1.4M | \$1.2M |
| Development of Phase III at Rotary Challenger Park | \$1.0M | \$1.0M | \$3.5M | \$3.5M |
| TOTAL | \$5.4M | \$5.3M | \$21.8M | \$20.2M |

1.2.4 The Saskatchewan Region

The department’s Saskatchewan region received \$36.8M (40% of \$92M). The funding was divided into two streams:

1. **Strategic capital initiatives:** applicable to projects in Regina and Saskatoon. Initial and current funding and costs by project are presented in Table 1.4. The department's September 2008 update reported that all of the funds had been committed and all projects were expected to be complete within the next 2 fiscal years. According to the database, two projects were incomplete as of July 2009 – Wanuskewin Heritage Park and the RCMP Heritage Centre (close to completion with final claim approved). Key informants noted that the opening of Wanuskewin Park is scheduled for January 2010 and the completion of the RCMP Heritage Park is expected in May 2010. Key informants also indicated that Riverfront River Landing is incomplete. However departmental staff in Saskatchewan revealed that the Centenaries funding assisted the construction of particular facilities included in a larger riverfront development, and those facilities are complete, funding fully disbursed and final reports filed. The department continues to fund other aspects of the Riverfront development through Infrastructure programs.

Table 1-4 Costs and Contributions - Saskatchewan Strategic Capital Projects (Millions \$)

| Project | WD Contribution | | Total Cost | |
|--|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|----------------|
| | Initial | Current | Initial | Current |
| Globe Theatre – Regina | \$0.15M | \$0.15M | \$1.6M | \$1.6M |
| Establish the RCMP Heritage Centre - Regina | \$23.5M* | \$18M | \$29M | \$22.2M |
| Persephone Theatre - Saskatoon | \$2.5M | \$3M | \$11M | \$11.5M |
| Construct a trade show and exhibition building - Saskatoon | \$4M | \$4M | \$5M | \$5M |
| The Riverfront River Landing – Saskatoon | \$3M | \$3M | \$4M | \$4.2M |
| Wanuskewin Heritage Park - Saskatoon | \$1M | \$1M | \$1.5M | \$5.1M |
| TOTAL | \$34.15M | \$29.15M | \$52.1M | \$49.6M |

*Included \$5.5M from WDP funds

2. **Canada Celebrates Saskatchewan (CCS):** A community-based centennial initiative that provided per capita contributions to all Saskatchewan communities except Regina and Saskatoon. Although the department funded all of the projects, the community survey found that 71% of the projects received additional funding from other sources. The additional funding was not recorded in the files. According to Saskatchewan staff, the department assisted 100% of costs up to pre-determined maximum amount for each community and if the community spent more, it was assumed to be outside of the project. Departmental funds were allocated over the period from January 1, 2005 to March 31, 2006. Under this initiative, 887 Saskatchewan communities were eligible for \$13.38M of funding. By March 31, 2006, 723 communities had been allocated a total of \$12.2M. The program provided one-time contributions of up to 100% of total project costs to the maximum approved for the community.

Funding was on a per-capita basis (based on the 2001 census and the 2001 Aboriginal Peoples Survey) of \$20 per person for communities of over 300 people. Communities of less than 300 people could be awarded up to \$2000 (communities with populations of 100 people or less), \$4000 (communities with populations of 101-200 people) or \$6000 (communities with populations of 201-300 people). The department's September 2008 update indicated that all funds had been committed and project completion was expected within the ensuing fiscal year. This is supported by the database, which recorded 694 completed projects. The remaining 29 communities had lost their funding (i.e. funding was declined or withdrawn). However, the community survey reported that 3% (four out of the sampled 202) of the community projects were incomplete (as of October/November 2009) due to harsh weather conditions and lack of other sources of funding. Saskatchewan staff suggests the discrepancy in project completion status may stem from the fact that Centenaries funding addressed one portion of a larger facility improvement project that may still be ongoing. The department's portion of the project, as defined in the contribution agreement, is complete.

1.2.5 Program Objectives

The objectives of the program were to:

- Increase community participation in celebrating the achievements of Saskatchewan and Alberta and their contributions to Confederation;
- Enhance and strengthen community economies and community competitiveness by supporting lasting legacy capital projects;
- Increase government and community collaboration to strengthen the federal presence in Western Canada and the centenary celebrations; and
- Increase economic activity to improve competitiveness in western Canadian communities.

1.3 Evaluation Mandate

The implementation plan for the Alberta centenary program specified that, as a sub-component of the WDP authority, a summative evaluation of the Centenaries initiative should be factored into Western Economic Diversification Canada's corporate Evaluation Plan.

The centenaries program was evaluated based on the Performance Measurement Framework of the WDP. The evaluation focused on the degree to which projects achieved their intended objectives and contributed to increased economic activity and competitiveness in western Canadian communities. The seven Alberta commemorative capital legacy projects and six strategic capital initiatives in Saskatchewan were all examined as part of the evaluation. The centennial projects in Alberta were evaluated as a group and the community-based projects in Saskatchewan were evaluated as a group. The evaluation assessed the cost-effectiveness and success of the program, and covered the fiscal years 2004-05 to 2008-09.

This was a one-time program not being renewed and therefore the evaluation addressed the initial, rather than the ongoing, relevance of the program.

Section 2: Methodology

2.1 Scope of Work

This evaluation of the Centenary Program included various data collection methods outlined below. The scope of the evaluation focused primarily on assessing success and cost-effectiveness. The objectives of the evaluation and the core evaluation issues are presented in Table 2-1.

Table 2-1 Core Evaluation Issues for the Centenaries Program

| | Evaluation Issues |
|-------------------------------------|--|
| Relevance | 3.1 To what extent do the specific needs that the program was intended to address persist? 3.2 Does the program duplicate or overlap with other programs, policies or initiatives delivered by other stakeholders? |
| Achievement of Outcomes | <i>Strategic Outcome</i> In what manner and to what extent has the Centenaries program increased community economic development and led to economically viable western Canadian communities? <i>Expected Outcomes</i> 4.1 To what extent did projects achieve their performance targets? 4.2. To what extent did the projects increase community participation? 4.3. To what extent did the projects enhance and strengthen community economies? 4.4. To what extent did the projects create opportunities for community and government coordination and collaboration? <i>Ultimate Outcome</i> 4.5. To what extent did the projects increase economic activity that improved competitiveness in western Canadian communities? <i>Unexpected Outcomes</i> 4.6 Were there unexpected positive and/or negative outcomes from the Centenaries activities? |
| Demonstrated Efficiency and Economy | 5.1 To what extent have the program activities of the Centenaries Program been cost effective? 5.2 Are there other more cost-effective/ efficient approaches or alternatives to be considered that would achieve the objectives? 5.3 What factors facilitated or hindered the success of the Program |

2.2 Evaluation Study Activities

2.2.1 Preliminary Consultations

Preliminary consultations were conducted with departmental officers in the development of the evaluation framework and the interview guides and also to discuss data availability. The officers were also consulted in developing the list of key informant interviewees and case studies. Through these consultations, some preliminary evaluation information was also obtained.

2.2.2 Documents and Literature Review

The evaluation included the review of documents and literature containing information relevant to the Centenaries Program. The review was used primarily to assess program impact.

Three main types of documents were assessed and analyzed during the evaluation:

- General Background documentation (e.g. TB Submissions, documents that describe Centenary Program history, rationale, theory, etc.);
- Program & Policy Documentation (e.g., Departmental Performance Reports, departmental database, project files); and
- Literature on other Centennial celebrations.

Two different but overlapping samples of Saskatchewan communities contributed to the evaluation of the community-based portion of the program:

1. **File review sample:** a representative sample of 99 Saskatchewan communities was chosen for file review during fieldwork in Saskatchewan (see section 2.2.3 below).
2. **Community sample:** representatives from 202 of the 723 Saskatchewan communities funded under the community-based initiative were interviewed to obtain outcome information. This sample was to include all 99 communities from the file review however only 69 communities agreed to participate (see section 2.2.4 below).

2.2.3 Centenaries Project File Review and Data Analysis

Using a customized data extraction template, the evaluation team analysed all Centenary project data available through the department's database (Info-Quest/Project Gateway) and any other departmental data collection system including files. The database review and the Alberta file review were completed in July 2009. Fieldwork, including Saskatchewan file review, was completed in August 2009. All of Alberta's projects and Saskatchewan's strategic capital initiatives linked to the community development sub-activity under the community economic planning, development and adjustment activity. The database connected the community development sub-activity to 682 of Saskatchewan's community-based projects while the physical

assets sub-activity applied to the remaining 12 communities. To confirm the accuracy of the physical assets sub-activity, files for 11 of the 12 communities were reviewed during fieldwork in Saskatchewan and were found to agree with the database. Table 2-2 indicates the community type by project status for the community-based Saskatchewan projects. Community-based funding ranged from \$680 to \$685,820. Half of the funded communities received \$8,720 or less.

Table 2-2 Number, Funding and Status of Saskatchewan's community-based projects by Community Type

| | Community Type | | Total |
|---------------------------|----------------|-------------|------------|
| | Aboriginal | Francophone | |
| Total Number | 51 | 8 | 723 |
| Project Status | | | |
| Assistance Withdrawn | 17 | 0 | 29 |
| Project Complete | 34 | 8 | 694 |
| Funding Level (\$) | | | |
| ≤ 2,000 | 1 | | 101 |
| 2,001 – 4,000 | 1 | 1 | 87 |
| 4,001 – 6,000 | 2 | 1 | 71 |
| > 6,000 | 30 | 6 | 435 |
| | | | |

Note: Community type was identified from project officer lists; communities that fall under two categories (i.e. aboriginal and rural) are counted in both categories in the table, but only once in totals.

The evaluation team reviewed all database and file information related to the 7 Alberta Capital Legacy Projects, the 4 Alberta Branded Centennial Projects and the 6 Saskatchewan Strategic Capital Initiatives. The database information on all 723 Saskatchewan community-based projects was reviewed. 99 Saskatchewan communities were then chosen for file review during fieldwork in Saskatchewan. The sample of 99 community-based projects was chosen to explore database inconsistencies² and to provide a representative sample of communities. Specifically, the sample included 11 communities citing “physical assets” as the activity, 13 first nations communities, 4 francophone communities and a stratified random sample of 71 communities selected based on funding level using proportional allocation³. The First Nations and francophone community samples were also chosen based on funding level. The sample of 71 communities included 13 communities allocated up to \$2,000, 10 communities allocated \$2,001 to \$4,000, 9 communities allocated \$4,001 to \$6,000, and 67 communities allocated more than \$6,000.

² WD database inconsistencies included: 1) 12 communities funded under the physical assets sub-activity instead of the community development sub-activity and 2) 33 first nations communities not identified as aboriginal under the horizontal impact assessment

³ Percentages were calculated as: $101/694 = 15\%$ of communities receiving up to \$2000.00; $87/694 = 13\%$ of communities receiving \$2001.00-\$4000.00; $71/694 = 10\%$ of communities receiving \$4001.00-\$6000.00; $435/694 = 63\%$ of communities receiving >\$6000.00.

2.2.4 Community Survey

A representative sample (based on funding level) of 202 of the 723 Saskatchewan communities funded under the community-based initiative was interviewed. Estimates resulting from a sample of size 202 are expected to be accurate to within 7%, 19 times out of 20. The survey included ten Aboriginal and two francophone communities, with an emphasis on the 99 communities for which a review of project files had been completed (as outlined in section 2.2.3 above). Of the 202 interviews, 62 were completed with respect to projects that were also included in the review of the 99 project files.

Consultants developed and pre-tested the interview guide and conducted the 202 interviews. All interviews were administered via telephone between October and November of 2009. Where existing contact information was not available or current, the consultants used general directories to find the contact information for the sampled municipalities and asked for the person or persons who managed or have been involved in the Centenaries funded projects. Participants were former or current employees of the municipalities who were directly involved in the project activities and felt confident about their knowledge of the project. Only one interview was conducted per project; therefore, each interview represents a unique municipality and a single project. The community project representatives were asked to rate the contribution of their projects to a range of potential impacts using a scale of 1 to 5, where 1 is no impact at all, 3 is a somewhat of an impact, and 5 is major impact.

2.2.5 Interviews with Internal and External Key Informants

A target population of 45 key informants was selected, from which we were able to complete 29 interviews (64% participation). These key informants included:

- 10 departmental staff responsible for the Centenaries Program and members of the department's management;
- 11 Proponents of the major Centennial projects funded in Alberta (3 Branded Centennial Projects and 8 Capital legacy projects);
- 5 Proponents of strategic capital projects in Saskatchewan; and
- 3 other representatives of government departments involved in the Centenaries Program.

The key informant analysis aimed to include at least one representative from each major project. Some of the major proponents of the Royal Alberta Museum, Persephone Theatre and Saskatoon Prairieland Park were unavailable for key informant interview. Since they had been interviewed for the case studies, their case study responses were used in the key informant analysis to complete the dataset. Combining the 16 key informant interviews with the 3 case study interviews yielded a total of 19 project proponent interviews representing all large projects implemented in Alberta and Saskatchewan with the exception of the Calgary Rotary Challenger Park that declined participation. Key informant results presented in Section 4 of this report combine all 19 proponent interviews. The results reported in Section 4 include the average participant rating of the contribution of their projects to a range of potential impacts using a scale of 1 to 5, where 1 is no impact at all, 3 is a somewhat of an impact, and 5 is major impact. Steps followed in interviewing key informants included:

Step 1: Developing and reviewing interview guides and contact lists. Separate interview guides were prepared for each respondent group.

Step 2: Pre-testing interview guides.

Step 3: Interviewing 29 WD staff and stakeholders.

Step 4: Tabulating the interview results by type of respondent.

Table 2-3: Description of Respondents

| Type of Respondent | Number | % of Total |
|---|-----------|-------------|
| WD staff | 10 | 34% |
| Other government staff | 3 | 10% |
| Proponents of major projects funded under program | 16 | 55% |
| Total | 29 | 100% |

2.2.6 Case Studies

Case studies for the evaluation were selected by the program officers to profile the range of projects funded and provide detailed information on the success of the program and challenges/obstacles encountered. A total of six case studies of projects were completed, comprising three of seven Alberta capital legacy projects and three of six Saskatchewan strategic capital initiatives. Each case study consisted of a file and document review plus telephone or in-person interview. For each case study, one or two stakeholders were interviewed. The list of case study projects is listed below.

| Project | Region | City | Number Interviewed |
|----------------------------|--------------|-----------|--------------------|
| Saskatoon Prairieland Park | Saskatchewan | Saskatoon | 2 |
| Wanuskewin Heritage Park | Saskatchewan | Saskatoon | 1 |
| Persephone Theatre | Saskatchewan | Saskatoon | 2 |
| Glenbow Museum | Alberta | Calgary | 1 |
| Art Gallery of Alberta | Alberta | Edmonton | 2 |
| Royal Alberta Museum | Alberta | Edmonton | 2 |

2.3 Limitations of the Methodology

- **Project File Review:** There were some discrepancies between the information captured in the database and the files, which hampered the reporting of accurate financial and performance information. Financial information contained in the file and the database differed for one Alberta legacy project and important interim or final reports were missing for six Saskatchewan strategic capital initiative projects. In addition, 101 of the 694 Saskatchewan community projects lacked a performance indicator and the database lacked information on

whether performance met expectations for the remaining 593 projects. However, results for these projects were captured in the files that were reviewed. The department's project database was new, requiring staff to process a large volume of projects within tight timelines while at the same time learning how to use the database. In the interests of efficiency, the department decided to document due diligence in the files but not in the database.

- **Community Survey:** The representatives of more successful projects as well as projects that were relatively bigger in size and budget were more likely to agree to participate in the interviews compared to representatives of the less successful and smaller size projects with limited budgets. To control the potential effects of this limitation, major findings of the interviews were compared across funding amounts and differences presented. In addition, the funding distribution of the sample was similar to that of all municipalities. Because many of the projects were complete by 2006, many community contacts for those projects had moved to different organizations, retired and/or could not precisely remember the project outcomes. Every effort was made to obtain updated contact information and reach the representatives at their new locations. Finally, some project participants had difficulties recalling the project outcomes due to relatively small budgets and the long period of time that had passed since the project was implemented. If needed, participants were allowed to refresh their memories or see old documents. Interviews were not conducted with participants who could not remember the projects well. Survey participation rates were low (29%).
- **Case Studies:** Case studies enable in-depth analyses that are otherwise impossible. Given the expense and time involved in completing a case study, the goal was to purposefully select cases for contextual descriptive potential. While quantitative samples aim to be representative and generalizable, case study sample selection was non-random and intended to provide insight into the complex processes underlying a small number of projects. The case study interviews relied on respondent perception and recall at the time of the evaluation and results may be biased accordingly. In addition to recall bias, there is the potential for measurement error related to using questionnaires that were not tested for validity or reliability. For example, the meaning of a number of terms, such as community economic development, community competitiveness and community capacity, were open to respondent interpretation. Furthermore, questions had to be reworded to apply to future outcomes for projects that were incomplete. To compensate for potential bias, the case studies in this evaluation serve as one line of evidence to complement the other lines of evidence.
- **Key Informant Interviews:** Outdated contact information limited the ability to complete key informant interviews. A great majority of the branded projects in Alberta had been completed by 2006. Many proponents of those projects had moved to different organizations, retired and/or did not precisely remember the project outcomes. Only 29 key informant interviews were completed, including 16 with contacts external to the department.
- **Estimating the net impacts of the department's activities is challenging** because comparable baseline data is lacking and, over the long term, it is difficult to disentangle the contributions of the Centenary Program from that of its funding partners and the many other factors influencing the outcomes over a large number of years. This evaluation uses contribution-focused analysis to ascertain whether the Centenary program's activities contributed to the

achievement of objectives. Contribution-focused analysis is not intended to establish the unique impacts of the program's activities, but instead to indicate whether and to what extent they played a role in achieving strategic outcomes.

Section 3: Relevance

3.1 Need for Program

Although the Centenaries Program will not be continued, the focus group pointed to a need for similar programs to attend to the backlog of cultural and arts infrastructure in the region. A majority of the infrastructure was built from 1950 to 1960 and needs to be upgraded. This is outside of the department's current mandate.

3.2 Consistency with Federal Roles and Responsibilities

When the program began in 2005, its objectives fell under the department's mandate and linked to the department's strategic outcome of Community Economic Development. The program's outcomes and activities aligned with the federal priority of Strong Economic Growth.

The program was unique in funding projects ineligible for funding from other sources. The community survey reported that half of the projects (48%) were developed in response to availability of departmental funding. The average likelihood of the community projects going ahead without departmental support was minor (27%). Most projects that would have gone ahead without departmental funding (32%) would have been reduced in scale and would have required more time for completion.

Key informants claimed that none of the major projects in Alberta and Saskatchewan were developed in response to availability of funding from the department. Instead, most had been planned for several years and were attempting to fund-raise to proceed with their plans. Less than a quarter had a strong likelihood of going ahead without the departmental funding. The department's support was critical in projects leveraging funding from the other sources. In addition, all projects that may still have gone ahead (24%) would have been reduced in scale and would have required more time for completion in the absence of departmental funding.

Section 4: Performance: Achievement of Expected Outcomes

4.1 General Findings

The Centenaries program was to highlight the achievements of the provinces of Alberta and Saskatchewan, recognize their contributions to Confederation and afford all Canadians the opportunity to celebrate a shared national heritage. It was expected that funded projects would have lasting economic and social impact on community development and the centenary celebrations would strengthen national pride and cohesion.

The completed projects have achieved their intended outputs (Table 3-1) and most of the incomplete projects have made promising progress towards their targets. Many of the projects have also made significant progress towards achieving their short-term outcomes of fostering community participation and community-government collaboration, and strengthening community economies. It is too early to objectively measure the program's ultimate outcome of increased economic activity that improves competitiveness in western Canadian communities. However, the importance of short-term success in government accountability should not be discounted: "it is inefficient and unfair to hold ministers and departments accountable for eventualities over which they have limited control. A robust performance-based approach to accountability based on measured outputs and intermediate outcomes should not be ridiculed as second-rate because the valid attribution of outcomes in society to government actions will remain an elusive goal."⁴

4.2 Performance: Outputs of the Centenaries Program Activities

Table 4-1 summarizes the performance indicators used to assess Centenary program activity output. The PAA indicators derive from the department's Program Activity Architecture (PAA). For example, the centenaries projects linked primarily to the community development sub-activity and one of its associated performance indicators: the "number of enhanced community services or facilities". The unique indicators listed in Table 4-1 are non-PAA indicators but are common to several of the projects. There were other project-specific indicators that are not listed in table 4-1.⁵ Performance and outcome information on the four ongoing Alberta legacy projects is missing from the database and files. Two of the nine Alberta capital legacy/branded centennial projects and four of the six Saskatchewan strategic initiatives met or exceeded performance expectations.

⁴ Thomas, P.G. (2006). Performance measurement, reporting, obstacles and accountability: Recent trends and future directions. (p 64).

⁵ Project specific indicators include the following. Alberta Capital Legacy Projects: hiring of a child life therapist; staff, family of patients and visitors use the garden; economic impact report; misc. admission revenue; retail revenue; food and banquet sales; educational programming. Alberta Branded Centennial Projects: hosting sporting events; economic impact report; visitors being persons with disabilities. Saskatchewan strategic capital initiatives: number of days the facility is booked; funds raised through sponsorship. Canada Celebrates Saskatchewan: complete construction; completion of the path, boardwalk and reflection area; completion of improvements to River Park.

One of the Saskatchewan projects was missing performance expectation information. One hundred and one of the 694 community-based projects lacked a performance indicator and the remaining 593 identified one performance indicator but no information as to whether performance met expectations or not.

Table 4-1 Performance of Centenaries Projects

| Community Economic Planning, Development and Adjustment | Performance Indicators | | Number of Projects With Indicator | Number of Projects Achieving Target |
|---|------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| | Type of Indicator | Indicator | | |
| Alberta Capital Legacy Projects¹ | PAA | # of enhanced community services or facilities | 5 | 1 |
| | Unique | Public consultations and input ² | 8 | 3 |
| | | Number of annual school visits | 3 | 0 |
| | | Annual visitor revenue | 4 | 0 |
| | | Annual attendance | 3 | 0 |
| | | Responsiveness to public input | 2 | 0 |
| Alberta Branded Centennial Projects | PAA | # of instances of increased capacity in community organizations | 1 | 1 |
| | | # of enhanced community services or facilities | 1 | 1 |
| | Unique | Additional dollars spent in Alberta | 3 | 3 |
| | | Average extended stay | 3 | 2 |
| | | Increased economic activities to local businesses | 3 | 1 |
| Saskatchewan Strategic Capital Initiatives | PAA | # of enhanced community services or facilities | 6 | 5 |
| | Unique | Annual visitors | 3 | 0 |
| Canada Celebrates Saskatchewan³ | PAA | # of enhanced community services or facilities ⁴ | 593 | N/A |

¹The Lieutenant Governor of Alberta Art Awards and the Museum of the Regiment Expansion were transferred to PCH and DND, respectively, for implementation and were not included as capital legacy projects

² “Public consultation and input” includes all indicators related to consultation and public involvement; some projects had multiple indicators regarding consultations

³ Of the 593 projects with indicators, 23 were projects where the offer of assistance had been withdrawn. Results were not available for any of the project indicators.

⁴ Also recorded as “1 enhanced service or facility” on project reports

The results for the Saskatchewan community-based projects were missing from the WD database but were captured in the files. The results for the sample of 99 communities could be grouped into one of four broad categories:

- New or improved community facility or increased use of facility;
- Extended life of a facility requiring upgrading;
- Increased community pride; and
- Preserved community history.

These results generally agree with the three most common objectives cited by respondents of the community survey. Specifically, community project representatives viewed the three most common key objectives of the Centenaries program to be:

- improvement of facilities to better serve community members (76%);
- preservation and upgrading of community culture and heritage (14%); and
- enhancement of community visibility (6%).
- almost all community project proponents (99%) believed that their projects were successful in achieving the objectives.

Similarly, the major project proponents viewed the key project specific objectives to be creating, building and expanding on various community facilities as well as hosting international events. There is a general agreement among key informants that the Centenaries Program has been successful in achieving its objectives.

4.3 Expected Outcome: Community Participation

The Centenaries Program fostered community participation

The Centenaries Program funded the capital legacy projects while Canadian Heritage delivered the celebratory component as one of the commemorative activities under its Celebration, Commemoration and Learning Program (CCLP). The objectives of the two programs overlapped with regards to increasing visibility and participation in the centennials and therefore it is difficult to quantify the individual impact of each program. A poll, conducted as part of the evaluation of the CCLP, revealed heightened local awareness and participation in the centennials and strengthened national pride and belonging.⁶

⁶ The poll of 2046 Canadians reported:

1. Awareness of Alberta and Saskatchewan centennials: Alberta (89% awareness) and Prairies (69% awareness);
2. Participation levels among those aware of centennials: 58% (Alberta) and 50% (Prairies);
3. Participants in the centennials felt an increased sense of pride about being Canadian (70%), belonging to Canada (45%) and shared citizenship with other Canadians (32%).

For its part, the Centenaries Program fostered community participation through grassroots community involvement, engagement of diverse elements of Canadian society (urban and rural communities, Aboriginal and ethno-cultural Canadians), greater access to learning opportunities and visibly linking projects to centenaries celebrations.

Grassroots community involvement

Focus group members stated that the funding provided to small communities was expected to increase community participation and the community survey rated the projects as very successful in involving the community in the project (3.7 out of 5).

The key informants rated the projects as successful in involving the community (rating of 4 out of 5). According to some key informants, all projects in Alberta and the capital projects in Saskatchewan were predetermined by the department and the provincial governments and included limited community consultation and involvement. However, representatives of the communities were engaged in the design and implementation of the projects at various stages. Many capital projects conducted consultations with the members of their communities and aboriginal groups to design their projects and implement activities. In addition, increased capacity enabled projects to engage more volunteers in delivery of their current services. All four branded projects in Alberta involved volunteers for project implementation. Volunteers were part of the branded project organizing committees and key in implementing project activities.

Engagement of diverse elements of Canadian society

The file review revealed that all communities were rural although 32 were erroneously identified as urban. The database lacked horizontal impact information; however, data from the project officers indicated that, among the 694 funded Saskatchewan communities, there were 34 (5%) aboriginal communities, 8 (1%) francophone communities and 664 (96%) rural communities (Table 2-2). The community survey participants rated their projects low (rating of 2.3 out of 5) in terms of successfully engaging diverse elements of Canadian society, although projects funded at the highest level (>\$20,000) more successfully engaged diverse elements of Canadian society than those receiving less funding (ratings of 2.2 vs 2.8 out of 5). Despite the low rating, the focus group members pointed out that the community-based projects in Saskatchewan were supported based on the per capita population of the communities, in an effort to treat all of the minority communities equally and that the inclusion of minority groups was not adequately promoted and monitored with the projects. Nevertheless, many projects included Aboriginal and French language components in their activities.

Among the nine Alberta projects, the file review indicated one had major and four had secondary aboriginal impacts; five had secondary francophone impacts. None of the six Saskatchewan strategic initiatives had francophone impacts and one had major aboriginal impact. The key informants rated their projects as somewhat successful in engaging diverse elements of Canadian

Source: Summative Evaluation of the Celebration, Commemoration and Learning Program:
<http://www.pch.gc.ca/pgm/em-cr/evaltn/2007/2007-05/2007-05-eng.pdf> (pages 26-30). Accessed September 1, 2009

society (rating of 3.4 out of 5): ten of 18 proponents of major projects mentioned some degree of engagement of aboriginal art, culture, history or traditions in their work (e.g. aboriginal art displays etc.). Three proponents mentioned that the interests of the Francophone community were considered in their projects by having French language included in their final results (e.g. multilingual documentation, signs etc.). Some participants, however, raised the issue that engaging diverse elements of Canadian society was not necessarily one of the project priorities. departmental staff members also mentioned that although many projects had aboriginal components, aboriginal engagement was not the priority for the program. Two staff members mentioned that French language was equally represented in all project final results.

Greater access to learning opportunities

According to the files, none of the file review sample of community projects had a long term educational component. Departmental representatives from Saskatchewan confirmed that educational opportunities were not the objective of their community-based projects. However, the community project representatives rated their projects as somewhat successful (rating of 2.6 out of 5) in generating on-going learning opportunities for students and others.

Four of the Alberta legacy projects, one of the branded projects and four of the Saskatchewan strategic projects had some long term educational component. When interviewed, all major project proponents mentioned some degree of project contribution in creating learning opportunities for their communities (rating of 3.9 out of 5). The representatives of large capital projects, museums, theatres, art galleries, and parks mentioned that many of their new facilities are part of the provincial educational curriculum and offer a great opportunity for students to learn about the history and the culture of the region. Proponents mentioned that a large number of students volunteered for the Alberta branded centennial events and that the arts awards assisted the young generation of artists in pursuing an arts profession.

Visibly linking projects to centenaries celebrations although the link has diminished with time:

Six (6%) of the 99 file review sample of community projects indicated a visible link to the centenaries celebrations, usually in the form of an article in the newspaper, a sign or a plaque. Despite the low numbers in the file review, the focus group members noted that the funding provided to small communities was expected to engage community members in celebrating the Centennial; departmental representatives from Saskatchewan also mentioned that funding across all Saskatchewan communities enabled the rural communities to celebrate the Centennial. The community survey rated community projects as very successful in contributing to the impacts of the Centennial in Saskatchewan (rating of 4.2 out of 5).

The key objective of the Centenaries Program as viewed by department and the other government representatives was the Federal Government's contribution to celebrating and building a lasting memory of the Centennials in Alberta and Saskatchewan. There was general agreement that the Centenaries Program was successful in achieving this. All of the Alberta projects and four of the Saskatchewan strategic projects linked to the celebration of the centenaries. Key informant participants rated the large projects as quite successful (rating of 4 out of 5) and mentioned that the projects had strong visibility in the communities and the general

public was aware that the project buildings were constructed due to the Centennials. Some large projects organized official openings and celebratory events, which marked the Centennials. On the other hand, three major project proponents and one government representative mentioned that the projects were only announced in 2005 (the centennial year). However, the completion of the projects was much later and therefore reduced the effect of the projects on celebrating the Centennials. It would have been much better if those projects were completed by 2005. In addition, some departmental staff rated this outcome relatively low because one of the projects, the Royal Alberta Museum, experienced significant delays in its implementation.

Wanuskewin Park is an example of a project that invited significant community and aboriginal participation.

WANUSKEWIN PARK

A meeting place of nomadic tribes for over 6000 years, this 760-acre site was designated a national historic site in 1986 and continues to be of significant cultural importance to Northern Plains Peoples today. The park, officially opening in 1992, is among the top 30 Canadian Aboriginal heritage sites and is an important Saskatchewan tourist attraction. In representing seven tribal nations, Wanuskewin was the only First Nations project among Saskatchewan's strategic capital initiatives. The Centenaries funding was intended to pay for the expansions to the restaurant and exhibit space and for vignettes. The expansion construction began in October 2007 and the park's reopening was scheduled for the spring of 2009. A number of funding, management and construction challenges delayed the park reopening and it was still closed as of September 2009.

The project promotes community participation through its volunteers and its twelve board members that include a city councillor, superintendent of the public school board, local business people, and dean of law at the University of Saskatchewan. It involves a long-term educational component in linking to the provincial school curriculum. The visible link to the centenaries celebrations was made through media announcements and advertising.

Although the building was closed during construction, the park contains a series of hiking trails that remain open and attract people daily. The project has also contributed to the community economy by hiring local trades and labour and hiring a First Nations company to create the vignettes.

4.4 Expected Outcome: Enhanced and strengthened community economies

Projects funded under the Centenaries Program contributed to growing and strengthening community economies

The Centenaries Program proposed to enhance and strengthen community economies by enhancing community services and facilities, increasing attendance and revenue flowing to projects or community events and increasing capacity within community organizations.

Enhanced community facilities:

As discussed in Section 3.1, the file review indicated this output was achieved for most of the projects.

In the focus group, it was mentioned that funding a large number of communities contributed significantly to enhancing community facilities across the province and this was supported by the community survey reporting that the community projects very successfully enhanced community services and facilities (rating of 4.5 out of 5).

Similarly, the large projects were rated as very successful on this outcome by the key informants (rating of 4.3 out of 5). The proponents of the large projects as well as departmental staff members mentioned that the major construction and infrastructure enhancement work on projects considerably improved the ability of those facilities to serve the members of their communities. The proponents of the legacy projects mentioned that upgraded and modern facilities lead to more funding for operating, hiring of skilled staff and increasing overall service quality.

Increased attendance and revenue flowing to projects or community events

As summarized in Table 4-1, several projects were expected to increase revenue, attendance, tourist or school visits. At this point, the branded centennial projects appear to have been most successful in this regard. For example, an economic impact report on the World Masters Games found that the games lead to: creation of 1,419 jobs in Canada, 913 of which were in Alberta; monetary impact of approximately \$44.9 in Alberta and \$66.2M nationally; other economic impacts such as increased credibility, marketing value, civic pride and international exposure.

The community survey reported that a majority of the projects also brought significant economic benefits to their communities in terms of increased attendance at community facilities (62%), employment during the implementation of the project (47%), spin-off benefits for local businesses (40%), increased tourism (37%), and increased revenues (35%).

In terms of the large projects, key informants claim the Centenaries Program has had a significant impact in terms of generating economic outcomes such as increased attendance at cultural facilities and centres (89%), increased employment during the implementation of the project (89%), spin-off benefits for local businesses (88%), follow-on investments (73%),

increased revenues (78%), increased tourism and visits (65%), ongoing employment (63%), and the attraction of national and international scale events and exhibitions (56%).

Increasing capacity within community organizations

Most projects, by enhancing community buildings and services, increased community capacity in their communities.⁷ Departmental representatives from Saskatchewan mentioned that department funding in the community-based projects has increased capacity in those communities. In the community survey, the Centenaries Program was rated as having some impact on community capacity (rating of 2.4 out of 5). The Centenaries Program had a greater impact on community capacity when projects: were already planned (as compared to projects developed in response to available funding) (rating of 2.2 vs. 2.8 out of 5); had high funding levels (>\$20,000) (ratings of 2.3 vs 3.2 out of 5); leveraged funding from other sources (ratings of 2.5 vs. 2.8 out of 5).

Key informants rated the impact of the program on community capacity as moderately high (rating of 3.7 out of 5). All major project proponents agreed that the projects increased the capacity of their organizations and/or other organizations in their communities. Several proponents specifically noted that the projects enabled them to offer better and more services (e.g. rental space for arts, exhibitions, better facilities) to community groups. Other key informants indicated that their events increased the activity and involvement of community sports organizations or created opportunities to pursue a career in the arts.

The Art Gallery of Alberta is an example of a project with the potential to grow and strengthen the Edmonton economy.

ART GALLERY OF ALBERTA

The new art gallery is expected to open in downtown Edmonton in January 2010. The project proceeded in three phases: 1) construction of the collection services facility containing 18,000 square feet of off-site storage space with environmentally controlled storage vaults for the gallery's 7000 artworks; 2) opening of an interim gallery and administration offices at Enterprise Square in collaboration with the University of Alberta; and 3) construction of the new gallery. Departmental funding developed the initial design, secured permanent off site storage for artwork and contributed to new building construction.

Exhibition space will increase from 16,000 sq. ft. to 30,000 sq. ft. The building will increase

⁷ Definition: "Capacity building is defined as the "process of developing and strengthening the skills, instincts, abilities, processes and resources that organizations and communities need to survive, adapt, and thrive in the fast-changing world." Source: <http://www.nonprofitcongress.org/?q=ncbi>, accessed August 18, 2009.

from 50,000 sq. ft to 85,000 sq. ft. with an additional 18,000 sq ft of art storage space off-site. It will have a theatre, restaurant, meeting halls, catering kitchen, redesigned shop and art rental/sales galleries to promote increased sales.

Comparing before to after construction: there will be double the number of: classrooms (four), annual student visits (12000) and revenues. It is expected that tourist visits and paid attendance will triple. The improved museum standards will attract international exhibits; the meeting rooms and restaurant will allow the gallery to host events.

The most significant results to date pertain to the first two phases. Phase one, the collection services facility, has increased the security and safety of the gallery's 7000 permanent artworks and provided the gallery with space to grow over the next 15 years. Phase two, the interim gallery, has enabled the gallery to stay in business, which maintains public interest and provides a source of revenue.

4.5 Expected Outcome: Collaboration and coordination activities

The Centenaries Program created opportunities for community and government coordination and collaboration

The Centenaries Program promoted coordination and collaboration among all three orders of government and the community through collaborative funding and strengthening federal visibility.

Collaborative Funding

Although it was possible to allocate funding from one community to another, the department intended to be the sole funder of the portions of the Saskatchewan community-based (CCS) projects defined under the contribution agreements. The database provided the information summarized in Tables 4-2 and 4-3. In addition to client funding, most projects also included some level of government funding. For the Alberta capital legacy projects, the department funded approximately 50-55% of the Glenbow and Healing Gardens projects and 12-17% of the other Alberta capital legacy projects (Table 4-2). For the Saskatchewan strategic capital projects, departmental funding proportions ranged from 10% (Globe Theatre) to 81% (RCMP Heritage Centre). The key informants from the following four projects noted they had other funding sources in addition to those listed in the department's database: Glenbow Museum (municipal funding), Healing Gardens (Alberta lottery funds), RCMP Heritage Centre (municipal funding) and Riverfront Landing (private and provincial funding).

Reasons for the discrepancy between the key informants and the database are unclear; however, for example, Riverfront Landing is a multi-phase activity that started before the centenaries program and is still ongoing so the additional funding may pertain to phases other than that funded by the centenaries program. Similar reasons may apply to the other three projects and therefore Tables 4-2 and 4-3, based on the database information, may underestimate the actual

partner funding for the Glenbow Museum, Healing Gardens, RCMP Heritage Centre and Riverfront Landing.

Table 4-2 Alberta Project Partnership Contribution

| Project | Partner Funding Contribution (\$, % of total cost) | | | | |
|--|--|------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|---------------------------|
| | Other Federal | Provincial | Municipal | Client | Total partner funding (%) |
| Alberta Capital Legacy Projects* | | | | | |
| Royal Alberta Museum | | 150,000,000 (83.3%) | | | 83.3** |
| Art Gallery of Alberta | 10,000,000 (11.4%) | 27,000,000 (30.7%) | 21,000,000 (23.9%) | 20,000,000 (22.7%) | 88.7 |
| Glenbow Museum | | 4,000,000 (44.4%) | | | 44.4 |
| Heritage Park Pavilion | | 3,000,000 (16.1%) | 4,500,000 (24.2%) | 8,100,000 (43.0%) | 83.3 |
| Healing Gardens | | | | 2,250,380 (50.7%) | 50.7 |
| Alberta Branded Centennial Projects | | | | | |
| 2005 World Masters Games | | 4,000,000 (29.4%) | 2,210,000 (16.3%) | 3,386,343 (24.9%) | 70.6 |
| 2005 World Half Marathon Championship | | 500,000 (38.8%) | 313,935 (24.4%) | 291,137 (22.6%) | 85.8 |
| Alberta Centennial World Cup | 288,000 (23.7%) | 425,000 (34.9%) | | 398,145 (32.7%) | 91.3 |
| Rotary Challenger Park Phase III | | 1,027,000 (29.1%) | | 1,501,676 (42.6%) | 71.7 |

*The Lieutenant Governor of Alberta Art Awards and the Museum of the Regiment Expansion were transferred to PCH and DND, respectively, for implementation and were not included as capital legacy projects

**Based on initial cost of \$180.0M

Table 4-3 Saskatchewan Strategic Capital Partnership Contribution

| Project | Partner Funding Contribution (\$, % of total cost) | | | | |
|------------------------------------|--|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|
| | Other Federal | Provincial | Municipal | Client | Total partner funding (%) |
| Globe Theatre | 462,795 (29.7%) | 533,000 (34.1%) | 400,000 (25.6%) | 15,000 (1.0%) | 90 |
| RCMP Heritage Centre | | 2,680,851 (12.1%) | | 1,531,915 (6.9%) | 19 |
| Persephone Theatre | | 2,500,000 (21.7%) | 1,000,000 (8.9%) | 5,017,148 (43.6%) | 74.2 |
| Trade Show and Exhibition Building | | | | 1,000,000 (20.0%) | 20 |
| Riverfront Landing | | | 1,213,116 (28.8%) | | 28.8 |
| Wanuskewin Heritage Park | 2,381,050 (46.4%) | 1,090,488 (21.3%) | | 655,412 (12.8%) | 80.5 |

The Community Survey found the projects achieved moderate success in creating opportunities for community and government coordination and collaboration (rating of 3.0 out of 5).

Furthermore, projects funded at the highest level (>\$20,000) were more successful in creating opportunities for community and government coordination and collaboration (rating of 2.9 vs. 3.6 out of 5) than projects receiving less funding.

Key informants rated the projects as fairly successful in creating opportunities for government and community collaboration (rating of 3.7 out of 5). All major project proponents mentioned that the Centenaries Program was an excellent example of cooperation between local, provincial, and federal governments. According to the key informants, all projects received funding from three orders of government as well as local business and community organizations. One proponent mentioned that after the Centenaries Program was completed, they were able to continue their partnership with the department and received additional funding for other infrastructure projects. Several departmental representatives also noted that all major projects involved intense dialogue and negotiation with the provincial governments which helped them to open lines of communication and built trust.

Strengthening federal visibility

Eighty percent of the community file review sample listed some form of federal recognition, usually in the form of a media announcement, a newspaper article or a plaque. The community survey reported that projects generated somewhat of an impact in providing lasting federal visibility and recognition (rating of 3.3 out of 5). The focus group indicated that a majority of community projects installed plaques at the project sites to recognize the Federal Government's contribution; however, due to the small size of many of the projects, it is hard to expect much federal recognition.

The database recorded five Alberta legacy projects, one of the branded centennial projects, and five of the Saskatchewan strategic projects as providing lasting federal recognition, usually in the form of a plaque. The key informants rated the projects as quite successful in providing lasting federal recognition and visibility (rating of 4 out of 5). According to departmental representatives and major project proponents, all capital projects in Saskatchewan and Alberta as well as all community-based projects in Saskatchewan provided some degree of visibility and recognition for the Federal Government. Large capital projects described the Federal Government's role and contribution in their 'Donor Walls', named some of their rooms and facilities after the government, included the government's name and logo in their publications and webpage, and mentioned the government's role at grand openings. However, key informants highlighted delays in implementation of the Royal Alberta Museum as a major challenge to federal recognition and that despite all efforts it is very hard to get the general public to recognize and witness the federal government's role in the projects at an adequate level.

4.6 Ultimate Outcome: Improved community economic activity and competitiveness

Some progress has been made towards increasing economic activity and competitiveness in western Canadian communities but it is too early to assess the full impact of the Centenaries Program

4.6.1 Literature on the role of centenary celebrations in promoting community economic development and competitiveness

The centenaries program was evaluated according to the Performance Measurement Framework of the WDP. Ultimate outcomes of the WDP include increased economic activity and competitiveness in western Canadian communities. Consistent with the broader objectives of the WDP, the centenaries program aimed to increase economic development and competitiveness in western Canadian communities. There is little evidence, in the literature or the evaluations of comparable programs, to support a link between centenary investment and economic improvement. For example, the evaluations of two similar or related programs - Atlantic Canada Cultural and Economic Partnership (ACCEP) and the Celebration, Commemoration and Learning Program (CCLP) - were unable to demonstrate positive long term economic impacts⁸ or alignment with federal priorities such as social cohesion.^{8,9}

⁸ The ultimate outcomes of the Atlantic Canada Cultural and Economic Partnership (ACCEP), designed to celebrate the 400th anniversary of l'Acadie, included economic growth and social cohesion. The evaluation concluded: "it is too early to determine the longer-term impact of the Acadian festivities in terms of economic growth and social cohesion" and "the literature on social cohesion indicates that these types of impacts are difficult to discern." Source: Summative Evaluation of Atlantic Canada Cultural and Economic Partnership (ACCEP): http://www.acoa-apeca.gc.ca/English/Accountability/AuditsAndEvaluations/Documents/ACCEP-Evaluation_EN.pdf (Page 22). Accessed September 1, 2009.

⁹ The activities of the Celebration, Commemoration and Learning Program (CCLP) that funded the celebratory component of the centenaries were expected to align with the federal priority of social cohesion. The program evaluation concluded: "although there is little evidence to confirm the role of celebrations and commemorations in supporting social cohesion, there is evidence to suggest that Program activities and outcomes are compatible with

4.6.2 Evidence that the Centenary celebrations increased community economic development and competitiveness

Evidence of long term success would require a longer follow-up period than the present and the costs of long-term follow-up might be difficult to justify given the one-time nature of the program. These sentiments were reiterated by the focus group in observing that changes to the level of competitiveness are very hard to observe, measure, and report. Relatively small amounts of investment in several infrastructure projects would not improve the competitiveness of the communities significantly. Nevertheless, infrastructure development in the communities can contribute to the competitiveness of the communities to a certain degree.

Although the community survey rated communities as low in improving competitiveness in participating communities (rating of 2.2 out of 5), projects funded at the highest level (>\$20,000) were more successful than other projects (rating of 2.0 vs 3.0 out of 5).

Key informants rated the large projects as somewhat successful in improving competitiveness (rating of 2.9 out of 5). Major project proponents and departmental representatives noted that the large world class facilities in their cities have increased the capacity of their communities to compete in the global and national arena. Museums and art galleries now have the ability to host international scale events and invite more visitors to cities.

4.7 Unintended Impacts

The Centenaries Program had some unintended impacts

The Centenaries Program generated a number of unexpected outcomes. The community survey reported increased community pride and satisfaction as well as increased levels of community participation extending well beyond the project activities. The following unexpected outcomes were highlighted in the focus group:

- Most of the major projects both in Saskatchewan and Alberta have contributed to raising the profile of arts and the culture in the region through enhancing and supporting the cultural facilities, services, and the infrastructure. According to representatives, the art and culture infrastructure in the Western provinces are not as developed as in some other areas of Canada. This program played a key role in shortening the infrastructure gap. Having large art and culture related infrastructure has increased the communities' awareness of it, and has increased the usage by different community groups.

social outcomes thought to support social cohesion.” Source: Summative Evaluation of the Celebration, Commemoration and Learning Program: <http://www.pch.gc.ca/pgm/em-cr/evaltn/2007/2007-05/2007-05-eng.pdf> (page 10). Accessed September 1, 2009

- The rapid development of the infrastructure has also created some negative outcomes in terms of stress on management to increase the capacity of the organization to catch up with the infrastructure and operate it adequately. Nevertheless, these types of problems happen only in the early stages of the project implementation and are quite manageable with adequate planning.
- Increased capacity of the department to deliver such projects. The Centenaries Program has definitely contributed to the department's capacity in delivering such infrastructure projects in a very short period of time.
- The Centenaries Program facilitated the development of a community-based program by the government of Saskatchewan. The implementation of the departmentally funded community projects in Saskatchewan was closely followed by the provincial government. Consequently, the government of Saskatchewan developed a provincial program called Building Communities, aimed at providing funding support for small communities. The provincial government consulted the department's office in Saskatchewan regarding the development of this program.
- Arranging construction work in the small communities in Saskatchewan was very hard as there was a shortage of labour. Many contractors did not want to travel to the small communities because there was very high demand for their services in big cities like Saskatoon and Regina. The lack of contractors created significant obstacles to the success of the projects in Saskatchewan

Section 5: Performance: Demonstration of Efficiency & Economy

Due diligence reports and project approval records were completed for all the Alberta projects and the Saskatchewan strategic capital projects. Due diligence reports for the community based Saskatchewan projects were completed for high risk projects. Three of our sample of 99 community files contained due diligence reports and 97 contained project approval records; two files were missing both documents.

5.1 Cost-effectiveness

5.1.1 The leveraging ratio for the Centenaries Program compared favourably with that from other federal grants and contributions programs.

The costs, contributions and disbursed amounts (if different from the contributions) are displayed in Table 1-2, Table 1-3 and Table 1-4. Although leveraging was a project selection criteria, the project agreements did not specify limits on the leveraging of funds, creating wide variation in the dollars leveraged across projects. Table 5-1 displays the department's total and percent contribution to the total project costs along with the dollars leveraged (defined as the number of dollars contributed by other funders per one dollar of departmental contribution) as of July 2009. For the Alberta projects, the department paid \$59.3M (18%) of the \$338.2M cost of the Alberta projects or, alternatively, every departmental dollar was matched by \$4.7 from other contributors (based on costs recorded in the departmental database for the Royal Alberta Museum). Since construction on the Royal Alberta Museum has been delayed, removing it from the leveraging calculation leaves \$3.7 leveraged for every departmental dollar spent.

The community-based projects were not included in Saskatchewan's leveraging calculation because the department intended to be the sole funder. However, the community survey estimated 71% of projects obtained additional funding: approximately \$3.1 million¹⁰ was invested in the community projects that received \$1.2 million from the Centenaries Program or, alternatively, for every dollar invested by the department, an additional \$1.51 was contributed from other sources in the form of cash and in-kind support. For the Saskatchewan strategic capital projects, the department contributed \$29.15M (59%) of the total cost of \$49.6M; for every departmental dollar contributed, \$0.7 came from other contributors. The high leveraging in Alberta (\$4.7) compared to Saskatchewan (\$0.7) may be partially explained by differences in provincial contributions: Alberta's centenary contributions totalled \$300M while Saskatchewan's added up to \$140M (\$20M for community based centenary programs and \$120M spent on centennial preparations).

¹⁰ This number is only true for the 77 community projects that could provide concrete numbers and, even then, some numbers are very approximate and also include the cost of in-kinds investments.

Table 5-1 Departmental Contributions and Leveraging Ratios for the Centenary Projects as of July 2009

| Project | Total WD contribution (% of total cost) | Total Cost of Projects | Dollars Leveraged Per WD Dollar |
|---|--|-------------------------------|--|
| Alberta Legacy Projects | 54 (17) | 318* | 4.9* |
| Alberta Branded Projects | 5.3 (26) | 20.2 | 2.8 |
| Total Alberta Projects | 59.3 (18) | 338.2* | 4.7* |
| Saskatchewan strategic capital projects | 29.15 (59) | 49.6 | 0.7 |
| Canada Celebrates Saskatchewan projects | 12.2 (100) | 12.2** | 0.0** |
| Total Saskatchewan Projects | 41.4 (67) | 61.8** | 0.5** |
| Total | 100.65 (23) | 440 | 3.37 |

*Based on the total cost estimate contained in the departmental database for the Royal Alberta Museum

**Based on the department's intention to be the sole funder of the portion of the project defined under the contribution agreement.

The \$3.37 leveraged by the Centenaries program overall compares favourably with the \$1.82 leveraged by its umbrella program, the WDP program.¹¹ Although the dollars leveraged by the Centenaries program is most meaningful when compared to leveraging in programs with similar objectives, we found only one relevant comparison. The Atlantic Canada Cultural and Economic Partnership (ACCEP) was a \$10M program created to commemorate the 400th anniversary of l'Acadie in 2004. The ACCEP program leveraged \$2.5, which, in the ACCEP program evaluation, was compared to other federal grants and contributions programs including the Canada Foundation for Innovation (\$1.5 leveraged), CANARIE (\$1.5 leveraged) and Precarn (\$2.3 leveraged).¹² In terms of total dollars spent, the Centenaries program funding of \$100M fell between the ACCEP funding (\$10M) and total federal contributions to the 400th anniversary of Quebec City (\$110M¹³).

5.1.2 The Program was structured to accomplish its objectives and Program delivery was cost-effective

The community survey revealed almost all of the community project proponents (97%) thought that the Centenaries Program was well structured to accomplish its objectives because it made funding easily available, did not require unnecessary paperwork, operated with high levels of transparency, provided clear and precise instructions over the use of funds, and employed straight-forward and user-friendly application procedures. The community project participants

¹¹ Evaluation of the Western Diversification Program, October 2008 (p 50).

¹² Summative Evaluation of Atlantic Canada Cultural and Economic Partnership (ACCEP), March 2006 (p. 24)

¹³ Source: Quebec City's 400th Anniversary – 2008 – Overview. Accessed at <http://www.quebec400.gc.ca/apercu-overview-eng.cfm> Accessed December 31, 2009.

viewed the delivery structure of the Centenaries Program as cost-effective overall (with a 4.5 average rating out of 5). The Program enabled participating municipalities to implement projects and make a difference in their communities. Program funding flowed directly into project activities while requiring very little administration. Finally, the Program provided an opportunity for the communities to make funding decisions and select the most important projects and employed quick approval and funds transfer methods.

Almost all of the key informants (100% of departmental staff and other government representatives, and 88% of major project proponents) thought that the Centenaries Program was well structured to accomplish its objectives and goals because it allowed the development of large legacy and infrastructure projects in a very short period of time, achieved the expected results, provided necessary funding and support, and did not require unnecessary administrative work. The key informants viewed the delivery structure of the Centenaries Program as cost-effective overall (4.5 for other government representatives, 4.3 for departmental staff, and 4.3 for major project proponents on a five point scale) because it had low overhead costs, generated significant outcomes for the amount of funding allocated, employed a simple application process with minimal bureaucracy, leveraged significant additional funding, and ensured that taxpayer money was wisely spent. Nevertheless, key informants also noted several aspects that may have reduced the cost-effectiveness of the program, including delays in implementation of the major project - the Royal Alberta Museum.

5.2 Alternatives

Given alternatives, was the Centenaries Program the most cost-effective way to fund centenary projects?

Although the focus group did not reach any conclusions, the following alternative approaches were discussed:

- **Regional focus.** Distributing some portion of funding across small communities in Saskatchewan is effective in the province because the population of Saskatchewan primarily resides in many small, scattered communities and it was very important to include those communities in the celebrations. However, the same idea would not have worked as effectively in Alberta because the majority of the province's population resides in the metropolitan areas of Edmonton and Calgary. Furthermore, the provincial government of Alberta already had a community funding program in the province during the Centennials. Thus, implementation of a community level approach by the department in Alberta, would have overlapped with the provincial program.

- **Contribution agreements vs. grants.** The representatives mentioned that although grants have some advantages over the contribution agreements regarding the amount of efforts required for administering and providing working capital for the projects, contribution agreements are a better alternative to deliver similar programs. Contribution agreements allow the department to have leverage over monitoring the project implementation and ensure that public money is being spent efficiently and effectively. It also allows the department to mitigate the risk, increase federal visibility, and ensure accountability. Furthermore, the structure of the Centenaries Program allowed for projects to receive some portion of funding in advance maintaining the capital required for the operations, and many projects received such advances. In order to obtain funding advances, the project representatives had to demonstrate a need for advanced funding. The representatives of the major projects who were not able to justify such need were not able to receive advances. In addition, the community projects did not receive advances due to the small size of the funding and potential difficulties in monitoring the usage of it. It was agreed that contribution agreements that allow flexibility over funding distributions and better project monitoring is the better option for such initiatives and the programs.
- **Joint implementation with the provincial governments.** Focus group participants mentioned that it would have been nice to implement some activities jointly with the provincial governments as the celebrations were around the Centennials of the two provinces. Nevertheless, there are differences in mandates and priorities of the governments, as well as program delivery mechanisms, which did not allow for effective implementation of the program jointly. Joint implementation would have limited the department's ability to monitor the process of program delivery and the expenditures, as well as incorporating the federal government's priorities and visibility in the results.

5.3 Key Factors Affecting the Success of the Program

The success of the program was facilitated by strong leadership and partnership and challenged by economic instability and political change.

The community survey noted that the ability to engage community members, availability of funding, opportunities to hire skilled employees and contractors, and cooperation between the community and government were the main contributors to success in reaching objectives. Meanwhile, project related issues such as good planning, hiring skilled contractors, shortages in available funding, and delays in receiving departmental contributions were the most frequently mentioned obstacles to success.

Key informants listed political and project leadership and commitment, availability of funding and the ability to raise necessary resources, develop partnerships, achieve open dialogue, engage multiple stakeholders, apply sound program management skills, hire skilled staff members and contractors were among the key factors contributing to the success of the Centenaries Program in reaching its objectives. Focus group participants agreed that engaging departmental staff members in early design and delivery of similar programs is a critical part of the program success. Meanwhile, factors related to economic instability such as rapid economic boom and

recession, lack of adequate leadership, political interference and bureaucracy, shortage of funding and resources, late timing for the Program as well as departmental funding structure served as obstacles to achievement of the program objectives. Focus group findings concurred. Two of the most significant project obstacles were: 1) the 20% increase in cost of materials and labour in both provinces during the year of the project implementation and 2) the changes in leaderships in the provincial governments of Alberta and Saskatchewan. Provincial priorities tend to change with changes to the political leadership, which can cause project delays. The focus group participants mentioned that staff turnover in the department, as well as in partner organizations, was an obstacle to the success of the program.

The six case studies demonstrate the importance of strong leadership and support. Despite facing similar economic challenges, the case study projects are now in various stages of completion and the more successful projects (in terms of completion) tended to have the support of a strong management team with a unified vision of the final project. This strong support and vision was not apparent in the other case study projects.

The Royal Alberta Museum is a centenary project that was delayed while the organization undertook a visioning exercise. Because construction start on the Royal Alberta Museum is now tentatively scheduled for 2011, the department is seeking re-profiling of the unspent \$26.2M to 2010-11 (\$6.2M), 2011-12 (\$16M) and 2012-13(\$3.74M).

ROYAL ALBERTA MUSEUM

In 2003, Alberta revealed its flagship centennial project in celebration of Alberta's 100th birthday would be an expansion and revitalization of its provincial museum. The project was expected to cost \$200M, \$170M of which would come from the province and the remaining \$30M from Centenary funding.

The museum renovations were to proceed in three phases: 1) underground parking for 300 vehicles; 2) a 250,000 square foot addition to house new galleries, storage, office and lab space; 3) renovations to the existing building. Planning began in April 2003; phases 1 and 2 were to be completed by March 2009 at which time phase 3 would begin. However, demolition was delayed until July 2007, pushing completion dates for phases 1 and 2 back to 2010 and phase 3 to 2011. By 2007, escalating construction costs had forced a scaling down of the project. Rising construction costs have delayed construction and the museum is now undergoing a review to refine the project scope. Future construction will use the \$30M Centenary funding.

Section 6: Recommendation

The evidence gathered in the evaluation suggests the following recommendation.

Recommendation #1: The department should ensure its corporate database captures relevant project performance and financial information in a timely manner.

- The ability to measure the success of a project and to quantify other funding leveraged is dependent on accurate performance and financial data. The evaluation noted gaps in some of the performance and financial data on file. The department's project database was new, requiring staff to process a large volume of projects within tight timelines. In the interests of efficiency, the department decided to document due diligence in the files but not in the database.