

DEPT
OF JUSTICE

FEB 19 1920

52-21-6-1115
CANADA

IN THE MATTER OF a Commission dated
the 23rd day of June, 1919, appointing
the Honorable William Botsford Chandler
a Commissioner to investigate and report
upon complaints concerning the treatment
of certain women passengers, being
soldiers' dependents, who were passengers
on the S. S. "Scandinavian" in January, 1919

To the Honorable Charles J. Doherty,
Minister of Justice.

I beg to report that
acting under the commission above mentioned I have examined
a number of witnesses at various times between the 19th day of
August, 1919, and the 17th day of September, 1919. In order
fully to investigate the matters into which I was directed to
inquire it would be necessary to take the evidence of several
persons having knowledge of the facts in connection with this
matter, such as a soldier named Rosenberg, the husband of one
of the patients on the "Scandinavian", Lieutenant-Colonel Harrison,
a passenger on the ship, and other persons who were either passen-
gers or were on the ship at the time of her arrival in the port of
St. John in the month of January last, but it seems impossible to
secure the attendance of any of these witnesses, as they are no
longer under the control of the military authorities at Ottawa,
and I am therefore compelled to close the inquiry into this matter,
after hearing only some of the witnesses having knowledge of the
facts into which I am directed to inquire.

144

It appears that a Mrs. Rosenberg and a Mrs. Drennan, wives of Canadian soldiers, came out on the S. S. "Scandinavian", which arrived at the City of St. John on the 10th day of January, last. When the steamer arrived at St. John these two women were in hospital on the ship and were suffering from influenza. They were removed from the ship under the circumstances hereinafter mentioned, to the quarantine station on Partridge Island, in the harbor of St. John, on the evening of the 10th day of January last. Mrs. Rosenberg died in the hospital at the quarantine station within about twenty-four hours after her arrival, and Mrs. Drennan died two or three days after her arrival. There were other sick people on the steamer when it arrived at St. John, some of them being officers and some being soldiers' dependents, who were removed to the quarantine station, but no complaints so far as I am aware have been made by or on behalf of these persons. Complaints have been made with regard to the treatment received by Mrs. Rosenberg and Mrs. Drennan both on the voyage and while they were waiting to be removed to the quarantine station after arrival at St. John, and my inquiry has been chiefly devoted to ascertaining the facts, so far as possible, with regard to the treatment which these women actually received.

In the first place it certainly does appear that the "Scandinavian" was sent away hurriedly from Liverpool, England, without adequate preparation and without a proper number of nurses and stewardesses to attend upon the passengers. There were some first class passengers on the ship, officers and others, but nothing has transpired as to them. The soldiers on board went as steerage passengers, and the soldiers' dependents were placed in the third class accommodation. There were only two nursing sisters on the ship on this voyage, and only one stewardess for each deck, and some of these stewardesses were making their first trip on a steamer, and they themselves became seasick and

were unable to render very much assistance to those under their care. The ship encountered pretty rough weather on the voyage over, and the dependent women and children suffered considerably owing to this cause. There was, of course, very poor ventilation in the ship in the quarters which they occupied, and there were not enough attendants to look after them properly, and their sufferings in many cases must have been severe. When the ship was within a couple of days of St. John, New Brunswick, influenza of a somewhat violent type broke out on the ship, and spread rapidly and many of the soldiers' dependents were attacked by this disease, among them being Mrs. Rosenberg and Mrs. Drennan.

From the very first of this somewhat unfortunate voyage there was a conflict between the ship's surgeon, Doctor Taft, and the military doctor, Major Fyshe. They did not get along together at all, and throughout the voyage there was constant friction between them, and questions seem to have arisen as to the duties of these two men with respect to the soldiers' dependents on board the ship. However, according to a letter from Major Fyshe which was put in evidence, Major Fyshe's instructions before leaving England were that in his capacity as S. M. O. he would have charge of the military and civilian list of passengers in so far as professional care was concerned, and would also be responsible for the general sanitation of the quarters occupied by them. This letter is dated February 19, 1919.

I found it difficult to discover from the evidence of the witnesses knowing anything about the matter, just who was responsible for the care of the soldiers' dependents on the ship, but my opinion is that the military authorities on the ship were responsible for the care of these dependents from the time of the sailing of the vessel until the dependents either left the ship at St. John or were taken off by the quarantine officials at St. John. I examined Colonel Hadley

B. Tremaine, who was in command of the party on the ship, and Captain Robert H. Morris, who was adjutant on board the ship. No other officers who were actually on the ship on this voyage were available for examination. While Colonel Tremaine did not attempt to withhold information, I found it somewhat difficult to ascertain from him just what was the position of these soldiers' dependents on the ship, and who was responsible for their care, and I did not get very much information from Captain Morris on this point, as neither he nor Colonel Tremaine seemed to have any very definite idea as to just what was the position of these dependents on board ship. However, in view of the instructions received by Major Fyshe before leaving England, I am of opinion that the military authorities on the ship were responsible for the care of these dependents, as stated above. It appears that charges were made by Doctor Taft, the ship's surgeon, against Major Fyshe, that he (Major Fyshe) was drinking during the voyage and unable properly to perform his duties, and there seems to have been throughout the voyage a great deal of difficulty between these two doctors. However, both Colonel Tremaine and Captain Morris say that Major Fyshe was not drinking during the voyage, and there is no direct evidence given before me as to Major Fyshe being under the influence of liquor at any time during the voyage. Very serious charges are made against him by persons on the ship during the voyage, being soldiers and soldiers' dependents and others, as to the condition of Major Fyshe during the voyage, as to his neglecting his duties and failing to look after the passengers properly, but none of these persons gave evidence before me or were available for that purpose, and I therefore make no finding in regard to these charges against Major Fyshe.

Serious charges were made against Doctor Taft, the

ship's surgeon, as to his drinking during the voyage and as to his being incapacitated for some reason or other and unable to properly discharge his duties as ship's surgeon, but as I do not consider that Doctor Taft had any duties to perform with respect to the soldiers' dependents on the ship, I have not inquired into these charges, and make no finding with regard to them.

There were 1199 passengers on the ship on this voyage, 434 being cabin passengers and 765 being third class passengers. The cabin passengers consisted of 125 civilians, 120 military officers and staff, 136 adults, 38 children, 15 infants, making a total of 434. In the third class there were 44 civilians, 157 of other ranks, 342 adults, 177 children and 45 infants, making a total of 765. There is no doubt that after influenza broke out on board the ship the sufferings of many of the passengers were extreme, and that there were not enough nurses and orderlies to look after them, and that some of the passengers received very scant attention, but this may of course have been to some extent unavoidable owing to the ship being short-handed and the stewardesses and other attendants being inexperienced persons. The chief difficulty arose after the ship arrived at the port of St. John. The vessel arrived at about 7:30 in the morning, the weather being very cold. It was proved by the director of the Observatory at St. John that the maximum temperature on the 10th day of January last was 6 above zero, and the minimum was 2.3 above zero. At 9 o'clock in the morning it was 3 above, at 11 o'clock it was 3 above, at 1 o'clock it was 3 above, at 3 o'clock it was 3 above, at 9 o'clock at night it was 6 above, and by 11 o'clock at night it had risen to 10 above. In the morning at 9 o'clock the wind was from the northwest, 36 miles an hour. By 11 o'clock it was 32 miles, and at 1 o'clock 30 miles, so that the weather was certainly somewhat severe.

The question which I am called upon to decide it seems to me is whether or not the military authorities were responsible for looking after sick dependents until they were actually removed from the ship by the quarantine officials, or whether it was the duty of the quarantine officials to look after these sick dependents from the moment that the quarantine officers went on the ship on the morning of the 10th January. A good many witnesses were examined as to the condition of the two women mentioned above, viz., Mrs. Rosenberg and Mrs. Drennan, during the day of the ship's arrival, but outside of Lieutenant Ponton and Doctor Heagerty none of the witnesses called seemed to have actually seen these sick passengers or inquired into their condition and as to the treatment which they received. It certainly does appear to me that these two women were very much neglected on the day of the ship's arrival in port. They were both very sick and it appears that both were suffering from pneumonia when the ship arrived in port. Neither Colonel Tremaine nor Major Fyshe seemed to have paid very much attention to these sick passengers after the ship arrived at the dock in St. John. Colonel Tremaine seemed to think that he had nothing more to do with these dependents after the quarantine officer came on board ship in the morning, his contention being that these sick passengers were taken charge of by the quarantine officer on the arrival of the ship at St. John, and that he had nothing more to do with them, and he certainly seems to have acted upon this view.

I examined both Doctor Ruddick and Doctor Heagerty, the quarantine officers at St. John at this time, and after hearing them and other witnesses I am of the opinion that the view taken by Colonel Tremaine was entirely erroneous, and that he as commanding officer of the party on board the ship, was bound to look after and take care of these sick passengers until they

were actually removed from the ship by the quarantine officials. I think that both Colonel Tremaine and Major Fyshe very much neglected their duty in connection with these matters. Colonel Tremaine admittedly paid no attention whatever to these sick dependents after the ship arrived at the dock, and Major Fyshe seems to have paid very little attention to them.

The only witness who threw very much light upon the situation, so far as these sick passengers were concerned, was Lieutenant Ponton, who gave evidence before me. Lieutenant Ponton was a subaltern in the Army Service Corps, and on the 10th day of January last he was assistant to the Assistant Director of Supplies and Transport at St. John. He went on board the "Scandinavian" on the morning of its arrival to superintend the issuing of transportation, and he was also detailed there through the G. O. C. to collect complaints regarding conditions on ships when they arrived. Lieutenant Ponton made a report, a copy of which, dated January 11, 1919, is submitted herewith as Exhibit B. This report is full, and I think deserves considerable attention. According to his evidence some of the dependents who were sick on board were not receiving proper attention. Lieutenant Ponton detailed an interview which he had with Private Rosenberg, the husband of one of the sick women. This man Rosenberg claimed that his wife was freezing, that she had not received any attention since early in the morning, neither food nor water, and that she was very cold. Lieutenant Ponton says that he asked for the ship's doctor, but was not able to find him. He then got in touch with Major Fyshe, and asked him to take him down to the hospital, so that he could see these sick women. On the way to the hospital an officer of the ship very improperly attempted to stop Lieutenant Ponton, and to prevent him from going into the hospital. Lieutenant Ponton talked with Mrs. Rosenberg, and she said that since half past seven or eight o'clock in the morning

she had not received any attention, and she claimed that she was not properly protected from the cold until her husband put blankets and a great coat over her while she lay in her berth. At the suggestion of Lieutenant Ponton, Mrs. Rosenberg was put down in the lower bunk to protect her from the cold, the port in the upper bunk being open.

The hospital in which these patients were did not seem to be in very good condition, but perhaps this was unavoidable under the circumstances. Owing to the efforts of Lieutenant Ponton some attention was given to these sick women, and instructions were given to provide them with food and drink. Lieutenant Ponton says that at one o'clock in the day he found two of the influenza patients had been sitting in the first class cabin, mingling with the passengers. He called Major Fyshe's attention to this fact, and asked him to see that they were taken out of the cabin, and Major Fyshe did secure a first class cabin and put these two sick persons into it. At this time Major Fyshe claimed that the patients had been taken over by the Immigration medical authorities in the morning. At 4:30 on the same day Lieutenant Ponton inquired for Major Fyshe, but could not find him on the ship, his reason for inquiring being that the sick women were still on the ship, and had not been removed by the quarantine officials. Eventually, between five and six in the afternoon of the tenth day of January, these two sick women and other sick passengers on the ship were removed to the quarantine station. The quarantine officer, who was Doctor Heagerty, says that he boarded the "Scandinavian" on the morning of the 10th January last, while she was in the harbor. Doctor Heagerty seems to have received no direct information that the Scandinavian was coming into port and he says that he had to depend for information as to the arrival of steamers upon pilots and the captain of the tugboat used by the quarantine authorities. Owing to the condition of the weather on

this morning, Doctor Heagerty did not go outside the harbor to board the vessel, but boarded it before the vessel had actually arrived at the dock. He boarded the ship about seven o'clock, and gave the clearance at about 7:15, with instructions that the ship would be permitted to dock but must not lower any gangways until he gave the word. Doctor Heagerty went on board and met Doctor Taft, the ship's surgeon. He called for the military doctor, but he did not come for some few minutes. Doctor Heagerty says that when Doctor Fyshe did come he was very much dishevelled, and was irritable and surly, and he (Doctor Heagerty) was of the opinion that Doctor Fyshe was then getting over a drunk. Doctor Heagerty made inquiries as to the deaths on the ship, the cause of the deaths and the number of cases of sickness on board. It appears that there has been two deaths on the ship among the passengers before its arrival at St. John. Doctor Heagerty says that he found the hospital dirty, and that he was going to examine Mrs. Rosenberg but Major Fyshe said there was no necessity to examine her, she had pneumonia. Doctor Heagerty says it struck him that she was very seriously ill at the time. He then went with Doctor Fyshe to see Mrs. Drennan and her child. After examining these patients he went back to the purser's office. He asked Doctor Fyshe if he had a stretcher on board but he said they did not have one. After making some inquiries as to the best way to get the passengers off, Doctor Heagerty told the purser and Doctor Fyshe that he would go to the Island (meaning Partridge Island, the quarantine station) and get a stretcher and come back and take off the passengers. He says that when he went to the tug boat used by the quarantine officials, which was then lying at the end of the wharf, and spoke to the captain of the tug about procuring a stretcher and removing the sick, the captain told him it was impossible to do so, as the tide was then too low. It was then between 8:30 and 9 o'clock in the morning. He then went back to the ship and informed the purser that he would

not be able to take off the sick until the tide was suitable. At 3:30 that afternoon he boarded the "Scandinavian" in order to remove the sick persons. Doctor Heagerty claims that the quarantine officials are not responsible for the removal of the sick from the steamer to the tug-boat.

It may be said just here that the quarantine station on Partridge Island is extremely difficult of access, and that persons can only be landed there with any degree of convenience and safety at all at or about high water. There is no low water wharf, and it would be impossible to remove sick people from the little tug-boat used by the quarantine officials to the wharf at any time but at high water. Doctor Heagerty said that it took a long time after he boarded the ship at 3:30 before he could procure stretchers for the removal of the sick, and that the ship's people took very little interest in the matter. Doctor Heagerty had a stretcher on the tug-boat, which is an ordinary tug-boat used for the towing of vessels in the harbor of St. John and has no particular facilities for looking after sick people. I have seen the tug-boat myself and it is about the last thing in the world to use for removing sick passengers from the docks in West St. John to Partridge Island. The distance to be travelled is between two and three miles and there is no accommodation on this tug-boat other than in the galley and the room used as a dining room by the crew of the tug-boat. It certainly does seem to me almost inhuman to put sick people on a boat such as this in the dead of winter in order to remove them to Partridge Island, but this is all the provision made for the removal of sick passengers to quarantine at the port of St. John, so far as I can discover. The tug made two trips to Partridge Island on this occasion and two stretcher cases were placed in the galley of the boat, one of the women lying on the floor and the other being placed on the table in the galley. This galley is a small place, and it must have been

a very difficult matter indeed to get the stretcher - there was only one - into the galley at all, but at all events this was the way in which these unfortunate women were taken from the ship to Partridge Island, and there does not seem to have been any other way provided for getting them there. Doctor Fyshe was present when these patients were removed to the quarantine station, but Doctor Heagerty says that he appeared to be slightly under the influence of liquor at the time. The last trip was at or shortly after six o'clock in the evening. After the tug arrived at Partridge Island the patients were removed from the tug and placed in a truck or wagon drawn by a horse and taken some little distance, about a quarter of a mile I should think, along a rough and steep road to the hospital on the island. When the patients arrived at the hospital they received, so far as I can discover, every attention, but it does seem dreadful that there should be no other means provided for getting patients from the ship at the dock to the hospital at the quarantine station than those mentioned above. The wagon used for taking the patients to the hospital is an ordinary farm wagon with a rough board box placed on it. Mattresses and blankets were put in this box, and the patients seem to have been protected from the cold, but the trip must have been a hard one for them and there must necessarily have been much exposure for the patients during the transit from the ship to the hospital. There is an ambulance on Partridge Island, but the authorities there claim it is too heavy to be used, and that the road from the dock on the island to the hospital is dangerous and icy in the winter, and no doubt this last claim is correct. Doctor Heagerty himself says that the tug was far from being suitable for the removal of these patients under the circumstances, but no other vessel seems to have been available for their removal, as the quarantine officials have no steamer belonging to the station, but have to hire tugs at St. John when they are required for the removal of sick persons. Doctor

Heagerty says that he had no right to treat anybody on board the ship, and I think his claim that the quarantine authorities are not responsible for the care of sick persons until they are actually off the ship and handed over to the quarantine officer is correct, and in my judgment the responsibility for the care of these sick persons while on the ship in this particular instance was placed upon the commanding officer in charge of the party on the ship and upon the military doctor, Major Fyshe. Both of these persons in my opinion failed signally in the performance of their duty on this occasion, and as a result these two unfortunate women were very much neglected while the ship was lying at the dock and until they were removed to the hospital at the quarantine station. I cannot of course say that these two women would not have died in any event, but it does seem to me a very serious matter that they should have been left as they were for nearly a whole day on board this ship with very little care and attention during that time. Had Lieutenant Ponton not interfered on their behalf I doubt very much if they would have received any attention whatever from anybody on board the ship or from the military officials in charge of the dependents. Colonel Tremaine in the report which he made, an extract of which appears at page 109 of the evidence in this matter, says -

" With reference to the voyage of the "Scandinavian" on which
" I was officer commanding troops, I desire to state that upon
" arrival of the ship at the port of St. John the quarantine
" medical officer came on board and took over from my medical
" officer, Major Fyshe, all infectious cases on the ship."

This statement is altogether incorrect. While the quarantine medical officer did come on board he did not in my judgment take over upon arrival the infectious cases on the ship, among which these two women would be included. These cases were not really taken over by the quarantine officer until late in the afternoon of that day, and until that time Colonel Tremaine was in my

judgment responsible for these sick dependents and was bound to provide them with sufficient care and attention. These remarks apply as well to Major Fyche as to Colonel Tremaine.

All of which is respectfully submitted.

William B. Chandler

Commissioner.

November 13, 1919.

Supplementary Report.

Since writing the above, owing to action taken by the Department of Militia, ~~which~~ provided money for the expense of taking evidence of witnesses in Western Canada, the evidence of certain witnesses has been taken under Commission. I have carefully considered this additional evidence, but I cannot find anything in it to induce me to change the opinion with regard to this matter which I have already formed, and the view which I have taken in this matter has been very much strengthened, by a perusal of the evidence taken under Commission as above mentioned.

The evidence of Doctor Fyshe was taken at the City of Edmonton under Commission, and this evidence throws considerable light upon the incidents of the voyage of the Scandinavian, and upon what took place on the arrival of the steamer at St. John in January, 1919. In the first place, according to the evidence of Doctor Fyshe, there was not enough stewardesses, nurses or orderlies, to look after the soldiers' dependents on the vessel. At page 17 of his evidence Doctor Fyshe says that he did not consider that the medical subordinates provided were sufficient to look after the women and children. He states that the orderlies were obliged to look after the women, as the nurses were very seasick, and able to do very little for four days from the commencement of the voyage. Doctor Fyshe says that he was practically on duty all the time, as his assistant was absolutely useless and unable to give him any help; that his assistant, Captain Greenspon, was unable to do any work during the voyage, as his temperament did not allow of his facing the hardships of the voyage, and he could not rely on him for any assistance. Doctor Taft, the ship's surgeon, did not give any assistance to Doctor Fyshe apparently, and it seems that it was not his duty to

look after the dependents on the ship, this duty devolving entirely upon Major Fyshe under the instructions given to him before leaving England. Doctor Fyshe also states that there were not enough nurses on the boat to look after the women and children. It also appears from the evidence of Doctor Fyshe that there were two or three doctors at least on the boat as passengers, but so far as I can discover from the evidence they did not give Doctor Fyshe any help during the voyage, and he was left alone to look after the soldiers and dependents. Doctor Fyshe denies that he was drinking to excess during the voyage, but he does say that he occasionally used stimulants and that he had to do so in order to keep up to his work. Doctor Fyshe's attention was called to a report made by Colonel Tremaine on his arrival at St. John, which statement is set out in part at the end of the foregoing report. Doctor Fyshe in giving his evidence maintained that this statement was correct, but as I have already stated, I think that Doctor Fyshe was entirely mistaken as to the sick dependents on the boat, who had to be taken to quarantine at St. John, having been taken over by the quarantine medical officer upon the arrival of the ship at the port of St. John. These patients were not in my opinion taken over by the quarantine medical officer upon the arrival of the ship at the port of St. John, and I do not think he was responsible for them or for looking after them, until they were actually removed from the ship. The removal of these patients did not take place until late in the afternoon of the day on which the steamer arrived at St. John. Unfortunately Doctor Fyshe took an entirely erroneous view of his duties with regard to these sick persons upon the arrival of the ship at St. John. He seems to have told Colonel Tremaine that the sick dependents destined for quarantine had been taken over by the quarantine medical doctor, and Colonel Tremaine apparently acted upon this

information without further enquiry and paid no more attention to the sick dependents on the boat. I have already referred to the evidence of Doctor Heagerty as to Doctor Fyshe's appearance when he (Doctor Heagerty) first went on board the vessel at St. John, and as to the impression which his appearance made upon him. Doctor Fyshe seems to have made one or two visits to the sick dependents on board the ship during the day of the ship's arrival at St. John, but only apparently when he was asked to go and see them and try to do something for these patients, by other people. Doctor Fyshe confirms the evidence given by other persons that there was no heat in the ship, or at all events in that part of it where these sick dependents were during the day of the ship's arrival, and there is no doubt that these sick persons suffered acutely while they were waiting to be removed to quarantine.

The evidence of John Hyslop, a medical orderly on the Scandinavian on this voyage, which was taken under Commission, shows that there were only two medical orderlies on the vessel, and that the situation was very bad on the ship during the voyage, principally due I think to bad weather and the overcrowding of the vessel, and these conditions were of course very much aggravated when the influenza broke out on the ship. According to Hyslop he was not on duty on the day the ship arrived at St. John. He says that most of the morning he was waiting in the saloon to get his transportation to Winnipeg, and that Chamberlain, the other medical orderly, was on duty. He says that the hospital that morning was cold. He also says that there seemed to be a misunderstanding as to who should take care of the two women who were in the hospital, meaning I presume Mrs. Drennan and Mrs. Rosenberg. He also says that he would not like to say that Doctor Fyshe was drunk but that he was often under the influence of liquor, and therefore was not as efficient as he would have been.

He gives evidence as to the terrible conditions on board the vessel on the voyage over, so far as the quarters of the dependents were concerned.

Percy Herbert Chamberlain, the other hospital orderly on the ship, gave evidence under Commission. He says that two orderlies were not nearly enough and that they had to depend on voluntary help. He says that no nurse helped them until there was a birth on the vessel, when it was about five days out. He says that Doctor Fyshe worked hard running around, but he didn't seem to accomplish anything, except on one occasion, when the birth took place. He says that in his opinion Doctor Fyshe was under the influence of drink quite a lot, and he relates an incident with regard to Doctor Fyshe and the language he used to a dying woman, which if truly stated, is a most severe reflection upon Doctor Fyshe and upon his character as a man. Chamberlain says that on the day the ship arrived at St. John, he was on duty in the hospital for the morning, and he says that Mrs. Rosenberg was in the hospital all day, and that there were two other women there who were dressed and taken out in the morning. The hospital was very cold and there was no heat at all in it. He says - "I didn't have to look after Mrs. Rosenberg, her husband was with her. I was on guard at the door. I don't remember any Red Cross nurses being there. Our own nurses were there in the morning. I remember seeing them there about nine o'clock. They did not stay long. To keep Mrs. Rosenberg warm we got as many blankets as we could. Her husband complained of her being cold. He was very much upset. I went to see a staff officer, a lieutenant from shore (probably Lieutenant Ponton who gave evidence before me) to see if she could be moved. He said he would do his best as it was disgraceful to have her left there, particularly as we were cleaning out the hospital and packing the medicines and so forth. Doctor Fyshe visited her in the morning just once as far as I

know. We were taken off duty in the morning by the landing officer about ten or eleven o'clock and told we were under his charge. It was the officer who was taking the names of the medical staff. There were no orderlies on duty in the afternoon, but all three of us, Sergeant Johnston and two orderlies, went back several times during the afternoon to see if we could do anything for Mr. and Mrs. Rosenberg. He complained bitterly and said he was going to have an inquiry as to why his wife had not been taken off immediately the ship arrived. The noise of the crane troubled her a lot as her head was very bad, and her husband continually complained she could not keep warm. She got everything she could eat as far as I know. I heard no complaint as to that. My opinion of the whole voyage was that it was disgraceful." Chamberlain adds - "My experience as a medical orderly was not much. I was in the C.A.M.C. as a sergeant cook and this was my first experience as medical orderly. I consider it a crime that so many people had to rely on two men like Fyshe and Taft."

I quote somewhat fully from the evidence of these two men, Hylop and Chamberlain, as they were the only ones who seem to have actually given any attention to Mrs. Drennan and Mrs. Rosenberg on the day of the ship's arrival at St. John.

According to the evidence of Vincent Cunliffe, a soldier who gave evidence under Commission, it was impossible to get much assistance on the vessel or to get proper food or drink for the sick persons after the ship arrived at St. John, as there did not seem to be anybody on board able or willing to provide for these sick persons. Cunliffe says that Rosenberg, the husband of one of the sick women in the hospital, told him that the hospital was like a refrigerator, and that he had to put his great-coat over his wife. He says that Rosenberg was very upset, and said his wife was more or less unconscious, and that he

could not get any hot stimulant for her or medical attendance.

Harry William Rosenberg, the husband of one of the women who died on Partridge Island, gave evidence under Commission. He says that his wife was taken ill on the morning of the 8th January, and that up to that time she had been in the very best health and spirits. On the morning of the 8th January his wife was taken sick and had to go back to bed. He had considerable difficulty in getting Doctor Fyshe to come and see his wife. He states that Doctor Fyshe was unpleasant about it when he asked him to come, and told him, Rosenberg, he had nothing to do with looking after the dependents, but that the ship's doctor was looking after them. If Doctor Fyshe made this statement it was entirely contrary to the truth, as the ship's doctor had nothing to do with the dependents. Doctor Fyshe, when he did see Mrs. Rosenberg, told her husband her temperature was 103, and to keep his wife in bed. Rosenberg states that all the persons below deck were ordered up on deck when the influenza broke out, the object of this being apparently to enable them to ventilate below decks. Rosenberg took his wife up on deck, where she suffered very much from the cold. She had to remain on deck 3 1/2 hours, and did not get down to her berth until the evening. That same evening, Rosenberg with considerable difficulty got Doctor Fyshe to come and see his wife, and when he did come he said she was very sick and would have to go to hospital. Rosenberg says, speaking of his wife, "I went to see her next about seven o'clock that night (January 9th). Just at that time a woman had died in the hospital and they were busy getting her in shape to carry her out. My wife was delirious and kept talking about the woman who had died, and about them putting the Union Jack over her. Doctor Fyshe seemed excited and kept yelling for men to carry the dead woman out. This all seemed to bother my wife. I believe this was the second woman carried out while she was there, and it seemed to bother my wife quite a lot.

I heard Doctor Fyshe say in a loud voice so that nearly all the women in the hospital could hear it - 'Come on, let's get her to hell out of here and throw her overboard.' Four or six men carried her out. I was with my wife and was asked by the sergeant to help, but would not leave my wife. There was no nurse there at the time - just a corporal. During all that evening there was just this corporal in charge - no nurse and no Doctor Fyshe."

Rosenberg says that early on the morning of the 10th January he went in to see his wife, when she appeared to be quite a bit better. Rosenberg was told to get his wife dressed, as the patients would be taken off first and rushed to hospital. Rosenberg says that his wife was too ill to be dressed at this time. After the ship docked the Immigration doctor came down to the hospital with Doctor Fyshe. Heagerty asked Fyshe if Mrs. Rosenberg had been examined, and in fit shape to go to the Island. He (Doctor Fyshe) stated that she was quite fit and nothing much wrong with her, that he had examined her and she was all right. Rosenberg remained on the ship trying to get his wife taken to quarantine. He says that about ten o'clock he asked Doctor Fyshe to get his wife away. Doctor Fyshe told him he had turned his wife over to the civil authorities and that he could not do anything. He states that the doors were taken down and the hatchways opened, that a winch was working right over the hospital and the hospital was very cold; that his wife complained of cold and about half past three in the afternoon she got delirious; that she had nothing to eat, and that he put some blankets and his overcoat over her; that about noon he induced some staff officers on the vessel to come to the hospital and see his wife, but that nothing was done; that after a while Doctor Fyshe came down and said that he could do nothing for Mrs. Rosenberg, and said "As a matter of fact I should not be looking after your wife - it is up to the ship's doctor to

look after her." Doctor Fyshe told Rosenberg that it was up to the purser to get his wife some nourishment. Rosenberg did speak to the purser, but without any result. Rosenberg says that in the afternoon there were no orderlies there at all, and he did not see any nurse there all day; that an orderly sergeant brought his wife after a while some soup in a jug. It was poor stuff and his wife took a drink of it, but that was all she had from early morning till she got to the Island. That about two o'clock Doctor Fyshe said good-bys to them and they did not see him again. About four o'clock in the afternoon Doctor Heagerty, the quarantine medical doctor, came on board, and after a while Mrs. Rosenberg was put on a stretcher and carried off to the tug boat through the sheds, a distance of some five hundred yards. Mrs. Rosenberg was put on a table, still on the stretcher, in a room on the tug, and that a woman and child were in a corner on the floor. Rosenberg says this room was back of the wheel-room, and he means, I presume, the galley on the tug-boat. The other woman must have been Mrs. Drennan and her child. Mrs. Rosenberg was removed to the tug from the steamer between five and six o'clock that evening. She was taken to the Island and died on Sunday the 12th day of January, 1919. Rosenberg says that the tug on which his wife was removed to Partridge Island was draughty and very cold. That he did not consider the one horse wagon which was used for conveying the sick woman from the tug-boat to the hospital to be a reasonable means of conveyance for sick people. He says that he saw a load of manure on the wagon on the morning of the 12th January, and that the wagon was used as a general purpose wagon on the Island. Rosenberg adds that in his opinion Major Fyshe was either drunk or doped the whole voyage.

Other witnesses were examined under Commission, some of whom spoke very highly of Doctor Fyshe and of his conduct during the voyage.

Not having heard the witnesses who gave evidence under

Commission, I cannot of course say anything as to the manner in which their evidence was given, but it does seem to me that the conditions on board the Scandinavian on the day that the ship arrived at St. John, were deplorable, so far as these sick women were concerned; that no attention whatever was paid to them by Colonel Tremaine and very little attention was given to them by Doctor Fyshe, who apparently acted upon his opinion that he was no longer responsible for these women, and that they had been taken charge of by the quarantine official. There was in my judgment no foundation whatever for the view entertained by Doctor Fyshe, as I have already stated.

I think the whole difficulty, so far as these unfortunate women were concerned, was due to the mistaken view taken by Doctor Fyshe and Colonel Tremaine as to their duties with regard to these dependents. They simply jumped at a conclusion, without any foundation for so doing, and acting upon this mistaken opinion, they left these two unfortunate women to themselves and allowed them to get along the best way they could. The result was that the sufferings of these women were very much aggravated, and it is altogether probable that the sufferings which they endured on board the ship, the want of proper nourishment and the conditions under which they were removed from the ship to Partridge Island, very much lessened any chance of recovery they may have had. The military authorities on board the ship are not, of course, responsible for the conditions under which these women were removed to the quarantine station, but they are responsible in my judgment for neglecting these women while they remained on the ship and while they were under the care of the officer commanding, and the medical doctor. I do not see how these two persons can escape responsibility for neglect of duty under the circumstances detailed

Dated this twenty-fourth day of January, 1920.

All of which is respectfully submitted.

William B. Chandler
Colonel

February 9 - 1920

Quebec, 24th. April 1919

To The Honorable J.A.Calder,
Minister of Immigration & Colonization
Ottawa, Ont.,

Sir:-

In compliance with the Order-in-Council P.C. 793 passed at your request on the 12th. instant appointing me a Commissioner under the Enquiries Act to investigate certain complaints concerning women passengers, being soldier's dependents, who arrived at the Port of St. John, N.S. on the ss "Scandinavian" on or about January 10th. 1919, I was in St. John from the 14th. to 18th. instant for the purpose above mentioned.

Having previously gathered from statements furnished me by the Department, that several passengers were removed to the Quarantine Station at Patridge Island, under conditions most unsatisfactory and that two women subsequently died, wholly or partly due to the negligence of Government employees connected with the Quarantine Station and also that the same passengers appeared to have suffered undue exposure on the ship from the time of arrival in the morning until their landing late in the afternoon, the "Scandinavian" on which they had come being in Port, I thought important that I should get evidence from the ship first, with a view to establish, if possible, the respective share of responsibilities of the parties concerned.

Unfortunately the two Medical Officers, Military and Ship's Surgeon, the Purser, a number of Stewards & Stewardesses, who had probably the most to do with the sick during the January voyage of the Scandinavian, had not returned this time.

CONDITIONS ON SHIP DAY OF ARRIVAL.

Edward Griffiths, Captain in Command of the S.S.Scandinavian, being the first examined, to the question as to whether all these changes in his staff were made on grounds of inefficiency or inattention to passengers on the preceding voyage, he said that

these

18

changes were made owing to the ship being in port for repairs for two months, and it is customary when a ship arrives in port that all members of the crew are discharged, with the exception of the official staff. The only officer on board whose resignation was called for was the Medical Officer of the ship Dr. Taft. Although Captain Griffiths and the four or five other witnesses who had more or less to do with the Ship's Surgeon, and remaining on board, all swore that they never saw him under the influence of liquor, nor that he failed in any way to give proper attention and care to his patients. Similar evidence is given with regard to Major Fyshe.

As to the complaints of exposure to cold, through the steam being turned off the heating apparatus for the purpose of running the steam winches or through hatchways, Captain Griffiths declares that in the first place, the hospital is away from the hatchways, there being bulkheads between and further that the steam could not be turned off because in the event of anybody doing so the pipes are liable to burst, owing to frost, the temperature being ten above zero on the morning of the 10th. January and dropped to six towards noon. This is corroborated by the Chief Engineer, James Ernest Thearle, who moreover establishes the fact that the steam-winches are operated by a system entirely independent from the heating system.

Questioned regarding Quarantine Service facilities, particularly on the morning of the 10th. of January first, declares that it was high tide, 7:30 A.M. when he entered the harbor, and that the weather was fairly rough so that with the kind of tug at the disposal of the Quarantine Officer the latter could not board the Scandinavian in the bay but had to do so inside where the sea was not rough.

He thinks that the Quarantine Officer could have

boarded the ship in the bay had he been provided with a suitable boat such as they have at the Quarantine Station on the St. Lawrence.

The Captain goes on to say:-

"With reference to the quarantine service and improvements, I would certainly say that much improvement could be made in that direction. In fact I think the facilities for the quarantine doctor for boarding the ship and removing sick passengers off the ship is simply appalling. I have not yet in my time seen a quarantine tender that was in any way suitable for the removal of sick passengers off this steamer or any other steamer, and I have now been coming in and out of this port for the last twenty years, and I fail to see why the harbor of St. John, which is equally as important to Canada, should suffer in this respect as not to have proper facilities to enable the quarantine officer to carry out this work, and at least to remove people in a humane and respectable manner, and not have to remove them through sheds and down a stairway into small boats and then to the hospital which is on the Island in a temperature sometimes which is below zero, especially with the patients having high temperature. This does not seem to me to be the correct method of doing things. The little boat which the doctor comes off in for the purpose of removing people to the hospital seems to be entirely too small and accommodation very very poor. I might compare conditions with Grosse Isle in the River St. Lawrence. This station has for the purpose a couple of very fine steamers with splendid accommodation, and it would be very interesting to know what these two steamers are doing after the season in the St. Lawrence is closed from December to the month of April when the season opens again. It would seem to me the correct thing that at least one of these steamers should be equipped and be placed at the disposal of the quarantine officer at the port of St. John. Having such a steamer would eliminate the necessity of having to take people on to the wharves and then take them down staircases, etc., which also takes up much time. The fact of having the steamer would enable such steamer to come alongside of ships to a gangway, where the passengers could be moved immediately from the ship to the steamer in comfort. I would also recommend that a proper landing place be built in the quarantine station. In fact the whole situation attached to this quarantine business at the Port of St. John is being sadly neglected in my estimation. One has only to draw a very slight comparison between the quarantine station on the River St. Lawrence and the port of St. John, and especially now when the Military people are now returning and may hope to expect conditions of the worst kind, no special arrangements have been made really as far as I can see to meet the situation."

188.

Under the present conditions Captain Griffiths is of the opinion that the Quarantine Officer is operating the transfer in as satisfactory a manner as can be expected.

According to James Jones, the hospital steward, Major Fyfe and the Ship's Surgeon saw the patients at least three times the day of arrival and ascertained if they could do something for them. Jones cannot say at what time the stretcher cases were landed he is even evidently not sure how many there were. The Military orderlies were then on duty.

The Chief Steward, Archibald Stewart, like the preceding witness seems somewhat deficient in memory, he has nothing of any importance to say.

The newly-appointed Ship's Surgeon, Dr., Albert William Mosely, seems to be familiar with the requirements of our Immigration Act. He has received his instructions from Dr. Murdock of Liverpool, Eng., the Chief Medical Officer of the Company. He understands that the Military Medical Officer has full responsibility of the troops and dependents; as for himself, he is responsible for the ordinary civilian passengers only. Though if through courtesy from one medical man to another, the Military medical officer would ask him to go for a consultation, he would do so, but only as a courtesy, or unless otherwise ordered by the Captain.

Dr. Mosely, contrarily to the views held in certain Military quarters, is of the opinion that he is not relieved from his duty by the fact that the ship has received "clearance" from the Quarantine Officer, but that he has to remain in attendance until such time as the patients are transferred.

In the hope that I might get some interesting information regarding the medical history and treatment of the two deceased women in the ship's surgeon log-book, I asked the Captain for it, but he declared that it was left in Liverpool as it is customary after the return of the ship to the point of departure.

However, it appears that both women already suffered from

184 pneumonia

at the time of landing according to Dr. Ruddick who examined them as soon as they reached the isolation hospital.

Mrs. Mary Agnes Wynne, Chief Stewardess, did not give any personal attention to Mrs. Rosenberg or Mrs. Drennan during the voyage but she did during the day of the arrival and she declares most positively that the rooms they occupied were warm and that they received all the care due to their condition and that they were lying down. She saw two of the stretcher cases being landed but did not know their names. They appeared to her as the worst cases. She saw herself that they were sufficiently protected with the best blankets from the ship and in addition they had blankets supplied by the Quarantine Officer.

Mrs. Wynne is the only one of her staff remaining from the January voyage. She states that both Military and Ship's Surgeon were not in attendance when the quarantine cases were landed. The only instructions she then received were from the Purser and the Chief Steward.

QUARANTINE MEDICAL SERVICE

Dr. Robert C. Ruddick, the Medical Superintendent at Patridge Island looks after the hospital cases and the general administration.

Dr. John J. Hengerty does the boarding of ships, inspects the passengers and attends to the transfer of the Quarantine cases to the Station on Patridge Island, moreover he is liable at all times to give such assistance to Dr. Ruddick as may be required.

Dr. William Leonard Ellis, Immigration Medical Inspector at St. John temporarily replaced the Medical Superintendent during months of July and August 1918. He explains that the only favorable time to land stretcher cases on the Island is high tide and even walking cases, as at low tide they ^{would} have to climb up ladders, there being no wharf at present time for landing at low tide. Thus the cases have to be held aboard the steamer hospital until tide suits, which involves a delay sometimes of several hours,

according to tide and weather.

In the meantime the ship is allowed to dock in the case of minor contagious diseases, but in the event of major contagious diseases, such as small pox or cholera, the ship would have to anchor off the dock until the Quarantine Officer has dealt with it according to the requirements of Quarantine Regulations.

In order to have a more effective service, such as would insure the general welfare and comfort of the sick, Dr. Ellis suggests first, that a boat specially adapted for the transfer of patients and contact cases in number ~~be~~ provided, as well as such wharf facilities that cases could be landed at all times. He points out that the recent influenza epidemic like in the case of the "Scandinavian" of January 10th. ult., had sadly demonstrated the necessity of being well prepared for any emergency.

As to his personal opinion of the whole subject, owing to such rise and fall of the tide from twenty to thirty feet and severe winter conditions Dr. Ellis would like to see the Quarantine Station transferred on main land from a standpoint of economy and efficiency. He suggests the Old Dufferin Fort, is a Federal property, as a desirable site for the purpose, situated as it is at hardly a mile from the city.

On being asked as Port Immigration Inspector if he had experienced any difficulty with the Ship's Surgeon of the

"Scandinavian"

182

of last January, which might have caused any delay in the landing of the passengers, as insinuated by Capt., Griffiths, Dr. Ellis answered in the affirmative, explaining that the "Bill of Health" on which are to be recorded all cases of sickness and death occurring during the voyage and which is to be remitted to the Port Medical Officer before the passengers can be allowed ashore was not ready, not a single name of sick dependents, who were quite numerous, were mentioned. Dr. Ellis quite rightly expected that this requirement provided by the Immigration Regulations under penalty of a fine, be fulfilled, before he would give the ship's clearance, which through the ship's surgeon's fault ~~only~~ only, occasioned a delay of between half and three-quarters of an hour.

The next to give evidence was Dr. Heagerty. Graduate of McGill in 1905. Dr. Heagerty holds also a degree of D.P.H.

Dr. Heagerty was appointed a Quarantine Officer first, as bacteriologist, at the Grosse Isle Quarantine Station, where he has served ever since during navigation season on the St. Lawrence. For the last four consecutive winters he has been transferred to the Port of St. John.N.B.

As aforesaid Dr. Heagerty is the officer responsible for the manner in which the Quarantine cases were transferred the day of the tenth of January under conditions which he describes himself quite accurately. The Doctor begins by establishing a comparison between the Quarantine at St. John and that of Grosse Isle, proceed-

ing as follows:-

" With the exception of the hospital at Grense Isle
 " the station is otherwise quite well equipped, and
 " we are able to carry out the quarantine work with
 " justice to ourselves and to the travelling public.
 " Here at St John we are, owing to rudimentary and
 " absolute equipment, apart from serious tidal and
 " weather conditions, unable to carry on our work with
 " any degree of satisfaction to ourselves, the public
 " or the shipping interests. To make this a modern sta-
 " tion, the following requirements are absolutely ne-
 " cessary:-

1. First, a proper quarantine boat
2. A low water wharf
3. A new disinfecting plant
4. A larger number and more modern baths
5. A new third class detention building to re-
 place the one which was destroyed by fire
6. General improvements to the building which are
 in a state of disrepair.

With regard to the landing of the Scandinavian cases Dr.

Heagerty continues:-

" In view of the abnormal conditions under which we are
 " working, and the lack of facilities, I do not find it that
 " remarks of a derogatory nature should have been made.
 " This was the first opportunity the people of St. John had
 " to see for themselves the consequences of the neglect
 " which this port had been left in for years regarding qua-
 " rantine matters. Following are the facts:---I boarded the
 " steamer Scandinavian in quarantine at about seven a.m.--
 " before daylight (See quarantine Bill of Health (appendix 12))
 " I was informed by the Ship's Surgeon, Dr. Tuft, and the Mi-
 " litary Doctor, Major Pyche, that there were a number of ca-
 " ses of influenza for transfer to the quarantine hospital,
 " which I saw with Major Pyche. Among the latter there was
 " some stretcher cases. As it was impossible for me to take
 " these off the quarantine grounds, I permitted the stea-
 " mer to proceed to her dock. I remained on board the steamer.
 " On arrival at the dock I left the steamer to consult with
 " the Captain of the tug boat as to the best time for the
 " removal of the sick, and then I returned to the steamer and
 " notified the Purser that I would be unable to remove these
 " cases before high tide in the afternoon--at about 4'30
 " o'clock, p.m. Then I returned to the steamer and began the
 " removal of the sick. I was obliged to make two trips to the
 " Island. On the first trip I took one stretcher case and a
 " number of others who were able to walk. On the second trip
 " I took two stretcher cases. As a matter of fact there is
 " room for one stretcher case only with decency--but on account
 " of the fact that the tide was falling fast, I was obli-
 " ged to squeeze the other two stretcher cases into the galley.
 " I placed one on the dining table and one on the floor, which
 " I would like to have avoided by making a third trip had it
 " been possible."

If there was no stretcher on board the tug when the quarantine
 Officer first boarded the "Scandinavian" it was because he
 knew then he could not use it on account of rough sea and

nevertheless

moreover the tide would have already fallen too much to permit the safe landing of the sick to Partridge Island, the tide being high that morning at 5.44-~~5.45~~ (see official tide Table for St. John attached hereto as appendix II.) and there is ample evidence to show that the interval during which the disembarkation at Partridge Island can be operated satisfactorily is one hour before and one after high tide.

So the tide and weather conditions being such on the morning of the 10th of January the Quarantine Officer had no alternative but to wait for the afternoon tide. As soon as it was found favourable there was no time lost. The first trip was completed at 5.30 and the second at 6.45.

For my personal information I made the trip on the quarantine tug while in St. John in the course of the present investigation, from the decks to the quarantine station and have figured out that the two hours of favourable tide for the transfer of the sick to the Island leaves barely time for two trips, as it takes at the very least twenty minutes to prepare patients on board the ship and transfer them to the tug boat, fifteen minutes for the trip to the Island, ten minutes to land them there and fifteen minutes to take patients to hospital and return to tug boat with stretchers.

Dr Heagerty gives instructions personally to the Purser of the Ship for the proper delivery to him of the quarantine cases, at the foot of the gangway where there, early, his responsibilities begin. The Ship's Surgeon being articulated by the Board of Trade of London, has full charge and responsibility of the cases until then. He supervises and helps personally the transfer of the patients. Besides what he states himself to have done in the case of the stretcher cases of the "Scandinavian", the evidence of the chief stewardess and principally that of Mrs Candie who is looked

upon

upon in St. John as one of the most competent as well as intelligent and effective Social Workers of the locality. every care was taken to provide against danger of possible chill. As to the danger of breathing cold air Mrs Oendie had no fear so long as the bed was well protected. She "has always understood and in fact seen pneumonia patients treated with fresh air by opening the windows." As to what she has seen of the transfer of patients from ships to the tug boat on several occasions she never saw anyone handled carelessly by the Government employees.

The present boat is not the property of the Government, it is hired for the service. It is a first class boat as a tug for which it is used in the interval between bearding steamers and daily trips to the Island. This dual use of the boat is not without inconvenience. For example one day Dr Heagerty had removed some sick from the steamer to the wharf with the object of transferring them to the Island. On looking around for the boat he found that it had left him and was then towing a steamer off the harbour. He was then obliged to call to his assistance a gasoline launch to transport the sick to the Island.

In that occasion, Dr Heagerty said that he was so disgusted with the boat service that he wrote himself a letter of protest to his immediate superior, Dr. Riddick, for presentation to the Department.

Upon request I have obtained copy of that letter which will be found attached to this report as appendix III. It shows clearly that Dr. Heagerty fully realizes the sense of his responsibilities and that he resents keenly the fact that he is not properly equipped to do justice to the service and himself.

Dr. Riddick also recognises the fact that they are

are not provided with a suitable ambulance to convey the patients from the Quarantine wharf to his hospital, a distance of about 300 yards and that for this reason the stretcher cases of the "Scandinavian" were transported from the wharf to the hospital in one horse lumber wagon. The best he could do was to provide same with a good heavy mattress and blankets quite sufficient in his estimation to protect his patients from exposure to cold.

Dr. Ruddick lost no time to examine Mrs Rosenberg, Drennan and others as soon as they were placed in hospital when he found that they were both suffering from double pneumonia.

While in the statements received at the Department concerning these two women in particular, there are only words of praise and gratitude for the treatment they received in the quarantine hospital, Dr. Ruddick is convinced that the fatal termination was nothing but what could be expected considering the seriousness and the nature of the disease. In the recent epidemic of influenza similar complications brought almost invariably the same results. He does not think for a moment that in view of the great care taken by Dr. Heagerty to effect the transport of the patients the evolution of the disease has been materially affected otherwise than depriving them temporarily from the rest and tranquility which is most desirable at all times in such cases.

Before concluding I wish to state that after a very extensive survey of the various organizations, the heads of each having been seen by me, and who are endeavouring so earnestly to assist the soldier's dependents in every possible way, I found it impossible to locate anyone who was an eyewitness as to what occurred on the "Scandinavian" after arrival nor of the transfer of the sick to the Quarantine Station except Mrs Candie of the Salvation Army

whose

whose evidence would lead one to believe that every precaution and care was taken in so far as Government Officials are concerned.

Conclusion. Doctor Heagerty appears to me to be as good a man as can be found in the Canadian Quarantine Service, and I have no hesitation to take his evidence as accurate and reliable in every respect.

As far as the Medical Superintendent of the Quarantine Station is concerned there being no complaint against him whatever as to the part he has taken in the treatment of patients in question, I cannot but exonerate in the most absolute manner these two Government Officials of any blame or accusation for the manner they dealt with the cases of the "Scandinavian", considering the absolute lack of facilities to do better.

While the regrettable aspect of the incidents which has given origin to the complaints that has brought about this investigation could have been foreseen and avoided with timely instructions from the Authorities, I think they deserve credit for having taken personally the initiative in seeing that the troops at least should be taken care of in the Military Hospital in the city and since the incident of the "Scandinavian", that the same privilege be extended to dependents. Although they feel not only that their action should have received official sanction before to-day, but that steps should be taken immediately so that civilian passengers who may have to be carried on stretchers at time of landing, would be treated in some city hospital until such a time as the Government have done their share in providing the St. John's N.B. Quarantine Station with adequate modern equipment which has been too long delayed.

I do not deem it necessary to insist further on this point otherwise than to quote from Dr. Ruddick's evidence that "he has repeatedly requested the Ottawa Authorities for

176

a better boat, wharf accommodation and other facilities, and while the answers received were always hopeful and many thousands of dollars were even voted at different times, the improvements still have to be made".

In case arrangements could not be made with the city hospital proper, when the Military hospital ceases to exist as such, for sick civilians passengers, I would suggest that the least that could be done immediately for the greatest possible comfort of the patients and to avoid such spectacular scenes as have taken place on the occasion of the s.s. "Scandinavian" of January last, the practice might be adopted after providing a suitable boat, whether by the transfer of one from Grosse Isle Quarantine Station for the winter months or any other, to approach the ship with such a boat on the opposite side of the wharf after docking of the ship, when by lowering the companionway down on to the boat the sick could be taken on the latter quietly, when the tide suits for their landing at quarantine.

As to the desirability of transferring the quarantine on main land on the site of the Old Fort Dufferin as suggested by Dr. Ellis if it is as easy of access as he claims and would not meet any serious objections from the financial standpoint, I would see no objection as to the principle. This point is also quite well illustrated in the evidence of Dr. McGearty when he says:—"There is no danger whatsoever of the spread of infection from such a station. In the days before we had an accurate scientific knowledge of the cause and mode of transmission of diseases, it was a wise precaution to remove the sick as far as possible from human habitation, but we knew that such extreme precautions are unnecessary and inadvisable. A quarantine station on the main land can be operated at much less expense and less disturbance to the travelling public than one situated

"situated on an island, and without the slightest danger
"to the inhabitants of the neighborhood. There is no dif-
"ference between a quarantine hospital and an ordinary
"infectious disease hospital such as is found in most
"every city. Our ideas with regard to the mode of infec-
"tion and spread of diseases are undergoing radical chan-
"ge due as I have said to a fuller knowledge and more
"scientific methods now at our disposal for combatting dis-
"eases. The enlightened public no longer looks upon disease with
"superstition and dread but places confidence in those who are
"responsible for the control of such diseases and are willing
"to co-operate with them everywhere."

But I am not prepared to express an opinion as to the
practicability of this plant. However, I consider it should
be carefully looked into by the Government before attempting to
remedy the several important difficulties of the present plant
at a cost of many thousands of dollars, which the upkeep of same
should also be the object of serious consideration.

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your obedient servant,

J. S. Wright
Commissioner.

174