94.02

## The Case For Research on The Effects of Zebra Mussels in Lake Erie: Summary of Information From August and September 1993

# Murray N. Charlton Lakes Research Branch, NWRI. January 18, 1994 






# The Case for Research on The Effects of Zebra Mussels in Lake Erie: Summary of Information From August and September 1993 

By<br>Murray N. Charlton<br>Lakes Research Branch National Water Research Institute<br>Environment Canada<br>January 14, 1994

Recent concern about the effects of Zebra mussels has centred on potential loss of fish production and potential loss of fish edibility. The mussels are thought to cause these effects by diversion of energy flow and alteration of contaminant processing. Because management options are limited to controls on nutrients and fish harvest/stocking it is important to determine the extent and degree of Zebra Mussel effects. Some effects of the mussels are obvious in sheltered shallow areas but the effects on the whole ecosystem are not known.

A series of research surveys done in 1993 is reported in this paper. The effects of the mussels seem to result in a loss of about $25 \%$ of the standing algal biomass in some areas. Although an attempt was made to visit many areas of the lake, more extensive work is needed to find whole ecosystem effects. The difficulty in delineating the effects of the mussels is caused by the coincidental achievement of nutrient loading goals. Because the distribution of zebra mussels is uneven their effects may be found through extensive spatial surveys.

A coordinated series of experiments is planned for 1994 encompassing partners in Universities (GLURF) and DFO and Ontario Region of EC and Ontario MNR.

## Introduction

Since the discovery of Zebra Mussels in 1988 there has been much speculation about the effect of the mussels on water quality and potential fish production. Lake Erie is afflicted with contaminant loads in the west basin. These loads are largely sedimented out of the water in the west basin. By affecting particle dynamics the mussels may affect the sedimentation of contaminants and therby threaten the edibility of the fish. Effects are expected to be most intense in Lake Erie. Results to date indicate that the mussels filter enough material to cause a marked clearing effect where there are many mussels and the water is shallow. The areal extent of the clearing effect is not known yet. It is important to discem between the water quality improvements caused by the nutrient load reductions begun in the early 70s and the effect of the mussels. This may be done by comparing present conditions with those predicted from nutrient load models but a realistic estimate of present conditions requires an extensive set of surveys. This report presents two preliminary surveys in 1993.

## Methods

Water samples were taken from the CSS LIMNOS during Aug-18-19 and Sept 20-24, 1993. Samples collected with a "Rosette" sampler ( 2 m and 1 m from bottom) or a $0-10 \mathrm{~m}$ integrator were either placed in bottles immediately for total phosphorus (TPUF) or filtered immediately for phosphorus forms such as soluble reactive phosphorus (SRP) and chlorophyll (Chla). Chlorophyll samples were frozen and chemical samples were stored at $4^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ until analysis. Chemical analyses of samples were conducted at the National Laboratory for Environmental Testing (Environment Canada, 1979). Oxygen, transparency, temperature, and conductivity were measured with a Seabird profiling apparatus (Charlton et al. 1993). Contour maps and vertical profile isopleths were plotted with the "RAISON" GIS system developed at NWRI.

Sampling was conducted at a series of stations (Fig. 1) chosen in consultation with $\mathbf{O}$. Johanssen of Department of Fisheries and Oceans. These stations were chosen to be compatible with ongoing work which will be closely coordinated with Universities and Environment Canada Ontario Region in 1994. Locations of the stations are shown in tables later in this report. A subset of these stations was used to produce isopleth plots of temperature, oxygen, transparency and conductivity along an east west transect.

## Resuilts

...- Analytical results for Chla, Particulate organic carbon (POC), particulate organic nitrogen (PON), Transmission of white light (TRANS \%), Soluble reactive phosphorus (SRP), filtered total phosphorus (TPF), (TPUF), ammonia $\left(\mathrm{NH}_{3}\right)$, nitrate plus nitrite $\left(\mathrm{NO}_{3}+\mathrm{NO}_{2}\right)$ and particulate phosphorus (Part.P) are shown in the following figures and tables. Contour maps provide a visual means to gain an impression of the geographical scale and extent of variability.


Figure 1: Stations visited in 1993

Contouring programs are dependent on adjustments to the algorithms used and the areal coverage of the station pattern. Therefore, the areal patterns generated are somewhat arbitrary. Although the number of stations visited here is barely adequate for contouring, the derived maps are reasonable representations of the data. The data ranges shown in the map legends are calculated by the contouring algorithm and thus do not present the lowest or the highest values.

## August

Figure 2 shows the distribution at 2 m and $0-10 \mathrm{~m}$ (Chla, POC, TPUF) of particulates which may relate to potential fish production. There was a general west-east gradient with some tendency for maxima in the south west area of the central basin. The ranges of Chla, Secchi, and TPUF values in the central basin are similar to those found up to ten years ago (Charlton 1993). The ranges of soluble nutrients were relatively less than for particulates and this caused gradients in soluble nutrients to be less pronounced (Fig. 3). West basin total phosphorus seemed to be consistent with an annual mean of about $20 \mathrm{ug} / \mathrm{L}$ achieved some years ago. Some Secchi depths (Fig.2) were at or above the upper limit (3m) of historic readings. These values illustrate the problem of finding out just how much effect Zebra Mussels have had. Secchi readings varied $1-2 \mathrm{~m}$ between stations only a few km apart (table A1). Thus, it is impossible to support blanket statements about the ecosystem effect of the mussels without more extensive surveys.


Figure 2 Distribution of Chla, Secchi, POC, and TPUF in August


Figure 3 Distribution of temperature and soluble nutrients in August


#### Abstract

September Chlorophyll was lower in the west basin in September compared to August. At the same time, however, Secchi readings were lower and TPUF was higher (Fig.4, table A2). These are symptoms of resuspended sediment which seemed to be prevalent over the entire lake at this time. Chlorophyll increased in the central basin and the position of particulate maxima moved slightly east to be near Cleveland. Soluble reactive phosphorus was generally higher in September and this was reflected in TPF and to some extent $\mathrm{NO}_{3}+\mathrm{NO}_{2}$ (Fig.5). These results indicate north south gradients as well as east west gradients.


## Vertical Profiles

The Raison Limnological plots provide a convenient way to quickly display vertical profile data from a transect of stations. Again, the graphic results are somewhat arbitrary as they depend on the choice of stations and the adjustments to the contouring algorithm.


#### Abstract

August The central and east basins were strongly stratified as usual (Fig.6). There was an upwelling area in the western part of the central basin. The lowest oxygen concentrations were higher then normal but this may have been caused by the thickness of the hypolimnion layer. As expected, transmission was least at shallow stations in the west basin. Although the range of values was not large it is interesting that there was lower conductivity in the west basin than elsewhere. Higher conductivity near the bottom in the central basin may have been due to dissolved nutrients present under low oxygen conditions.

\section*{September}

By mid September the central basin was unstratified but stratification remained in the east basin (Fig. 7). Oxygen values in the east basin reflect the typical degree of oxygen depletion from $12-13 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{L}$ in the spring. Light transmission distribution was influenced strongly by high turbidity at station 255 . High turbidity was also apparent at shallow stations in the east and west basins. Conductivity was also lowest again in the west basin. The west-east gradient in conductivity was larger than can be expected from any errors in the profiling system.


## Spatial/Temporal

Contour maps portray well the spatial variations in a survey but for graphical trend displays a consistent set of category ranges is needed. An example of this is the AugustSeptember comparison of light transmission at 2 M in Fig. 8. Although the two maps show quickly the difference between the surveys, the spatial variation shown in Fig. 7 is lost in the August map in Fig. 8. The variation shown in the September survey is likely related to sediment resuspension and increased chlorophyll.


Figure 4 Distribution of Chla, Secchi, POC, and TPUF in September


Figure 5 Distribution of temperature and soluble nutrients in September

Figure 6 Vertical profile isopleths of conductivity, temperature, dissolved oxygen, and light transmission in August.

$9$


Figure 8 Distribution of light transmission at 2m in Auguṣt and September.

## Data Summaries

Data gathered in 1993 are summarized as basin means for each survey in fig. 9 and tables in appendix 1. Figure 9 shows that the main differences between the surveys was in the form of regenerated nutrients in the central basin and west basin and a decrease in chlorophyll in the west basin. Because the east basin remained stratified in September little change was expected there. In the shallow west and central basins, however, seasonal effects are profound. For this reason assessment of lake productivity must have a seasonal component. Obviously the lake is fundamentally different during most of the year when it is nor stratified and the water has full contact with the sediments.

## General Discussion

Phosphorus loadings to Lake Erie have decreased to $50 \%$ of loads in the early 1970s. A corresponding decrease in phosphorus concentrations has occurred in the west basin with a less dramatic change in the central and east basins. The zebra mussels then are influencing the lake after a large and deliberate reduction in potential productivity. One of the main questions is how much has potential productivity been reduced?

Figure 10 shows relationships between Secchi depth and chlorophyll as well as the data on TPF and PP where the As and Ss represent August and September values respectively. The expected relation between Secchi and Chla is disrupted somewhat in September by nonchlorophyll turbidity (panel A). The relationship improved in panel B with TPUF which is a less specific indicator of particulates. Panel C shows that there was regeneration of both soluble and particulate phosphorus bearing material in September.

Historic Secchi readings west of Pelee Island are shown in Fig. 11. These results show that, prior to the late 1980s, typical high readings were 2.5 m . In the late 1980 s high readings of about 3 m were obtained. Beginning in 1990 high readings of 4 m and more were obtained. At the same time however as these highs were recorded other sites had Secchi depths in the more traditional range of $2-3 \mathrm{~m}$. Judging from Fig. 10 , a change of Secchi depth from 3 to 4 m is consistent with a loss of about $25 \%-35 \%$ of the particulate matter including chlorophyll at some stations. Thus, if the scattered Secchi depths of 4 m and more are caused by zebra mussels their effect on productivity may be less than expected when the entire basin is considered seasonally. Clearly, the effect of the mussels must be considered in the context of changes expected from nutrient reductions. While the nutrient loads seemed to reach target around 1986 the full effects may confused by the appearance of the mussels a few years later. A long term data set on algal biomass suggests that the effects of nutrient reductions were most important in the west basin (Nicholls and Hopkins 1994). Nevertheless, the mussels have a large effect on water quality where and when conditions are suitable. An ecosystem assessment requires intensive surveys covering areas with varying mussel populations.addition, satellite images could be used both in a survey sense and a historic sense to add knowledge.

Figure 9 Cruise means for particulates (top) and solubles (bottom).




Figure 10 Relationship between Secchi, Chla, TPUF, TPF, and PartP.


Figure 11 Historic Secchi Depths west of Pelee IIsland.

The patterns of conductivity shown in the vertical profile transects may indicate a way to delineate water masses in the west basin. This may be important since it is known that relatively clean Lake Huron water occasionally is found in the west basin. Again, the need is for more information to be able to assess the ecosystem effects of the mussels.

A potentially important effect of zebra mussels may be their effect on the processing of contaminants. By filtering material from the water and producing faeces and pseudo faeces, zebra mussels can alter the particle dynamics. To test this I have compared the fraction of total $P$ which is particulate in 1970 and 1993. Table 1 shows that the fraction of total P which was particulate was somewhat lower in the central and east basins in August. The particulate P fraction was significantly lower in the west and east basins in September. This is an example of data which are available and the meaning of the comparison will not be clear until all the data are used. If there has been some shift due to zebra mussels the sedimentation : of contaminants may be affected and this may translate into a threat to the edibility of the fish.

Table 1: Percent Particulate $P$ of Total $P$

|  | August |  | September |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1970 | 1993 | 1970 | 1993 |
|  | 65 | 64 | 62 | 47 |
| West Basin | 67 | 59 | 64 | 58 |
| Central Basin | 68 | 50 | 56 | 49 |

## Conclusions

1) More work is required to determine the effects of zebra mussels on water quality in Lake Erie.
2) Although effects on chlorophyll may be on the order of $25 \%$ in one end of the lake this, combined with other effects such as changing species composition of producers and consumers, may constitute a threat to fish production.
3) Preliminary results indicate that there may have been some shifts in particle dynamics coincident with the achievement of nutrient load goals and arrival of zebra mussels.
4) The impact of zebra mussels on contaminants through alteration of particle dynamics needs to be determined.

## Acknowledgements:

Win Booth, Jacqui MIlne, Robin Lesage and staff of Technical Operations assisted in field sampling and data prepatation. D. Kay provided help in implementing RAISON software.

Bibliography:
Burns, N.M. 1976. Temperature, Oxygen and Nutrient Distrbution Patterns in Lake Erie, 1970. J.Fish.Res Board Can.33:485-511.

Charlton, M.N. 1993. Lake Erie Offshore in 1990: Restoration and Resilience in the Central Basin. J. Great Lakes Res. 19(2):291-309.

Nicholls, K. H. and Hopkins, G. J. 1994. Recent Changes in Lake Erie (North Shore) Phytoplankton: Cumulative Impacts of Phosphorus Loading Reductions and the Zebra Mussel Introduction. J. Great Lakes Res. In Press.
Table A1. Surface Water Quality August; Lake Erie 1993

Table A2. Surface Water Quality September; Lake Erie 1993

Table A3. Bottom Water Quality August; Lake Erie 1993
STN Lat. N Lon. W TRANS. SRP TPF TPUF $\mathrm{NH}_{2} \quad \mathrm{NO}_{3}+\mathrm{NO}_{2}$


Table A5. Surface Water Quality averages in August 1993.

| Basins of Lake Erie | Secchi | Chla | POC | PON. | trans. | $\mathrm{T}^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | AP | TPF | PUF | $\mathrm{NH}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{NO}_{2}+\mathrm{NO}_{2}$ | Part. P | Part. $P$ (\%)( |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | (m) | Integrated sample ( $\mu \mathrm{g} / \mathrm{L}$ ) |  |  | (\%) | Sampling depth 2 m ( $\mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{LL}$ ) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| West Basin | 3.1 | 5.1 | 505 | 100 | 63 | 26 | 1 | 5 | 13 | 11 | 57 | 8.4 | 64 |
| West Central Basin | 3.8 | 6.3 | 523 | 102 | 64 | 24 | 1 | 6 | -14 | 16 | 187 | 8:0 | 57 |
| Central Basin | 6.7 | 2.6 | 386 | 70 | 73 | 24 | 1 | 3 | 9 | 8 | 217 | 5.3 | 59 |
| East Basin | 6.1 | 1.7 | 270 | 49 | 77 | 25 | 1 | 3 | 7 | 8 | 226 | 3.4 | 50 |

Table A6. Surface Water Quality averages in September 1993

Table A7. Bottom Water Quality averages in August 1993

Table A8. Bottom Water Quality averages in September 1993.



