

PACIFIC REGION TECHNICAL NOTES

83-011 April 6, 1983

Experiment in Forecasting Without Numerical Models
(Verification - Public Forecasts, Temperatures)

Peter Haering, Chief Meteorologist Pacific Weather Centre, Vancouver, B.C.

INTRODUCTION

This is the fourth in a series of five Technical Notes dealing with the verification of a forecast experiment that was conducted at the Pacific Weather Centre during the period from November 29th to December 10th, 1982. For further information dealing with this experiment see Pacific Region Technical Notes 83-007, 83-008, 83-009, and 83-010.

PROCEDURE

During the period of the experiment all 10 AM Public Temperature forecasts issued by the Pacific Weather Centre and the experimental team were examined and verified using the following methods:

- 1. All forecast regions (coastal and interior) were used.
- 2. The following stations were used for the various regions:

Coast

Greater Vancouver - Vancouver Airport
Greater Victoria - Victoria Airport
Lower Fraser Valley - Abbotsford
Howe Sound/Whistler - Squamish, Alta Lake
Sunshine Coast - Powell River
East Coast Vancouver Island - Comox
North and West Vancouver Island - Port Hardy, Amphitrite
Northern Mainland - Prince Rupert, Terrace
Queen Charlottes - Sandspit

Interior

Thompson - Kamloops Okanagan - Penticton Columbia - Revelstoke Kootenay - Castlegar, Cranbrook Chilcotin Cariboo - Williams Lake Central Interior - Prince George

3. If a forecast read "highs near 5" then 5 was used as the forecast temperature.

- 4. If a forecast read "highs 3 to 5" then the middle value was used as the forecast temperature (i.e. in this case 4).
- 5. If the forecast read "highs 1 to 4" the lowest whole temperature nearest the middle value was used (i.e. in this case 2) as the forecast temperature.
- 6. Conventions 3 to 5 were also used for the forecast low temperatures.
- 7. If a forecast used different temperatures for the same region (i.e. Howe Sound/Whistler highs 3 near coast and minus 3 inland) conventions 3-6 were applied. However, if no such difference was indicated then in case of high temperatures, the highest temperature was used for the coast and the lowest for the interior. Similar methods were used for the north and west of Vancouver Island, Northern Mainland, and the Kootenay Regions.
- 8. The available FMs (computer produced temperature guidance from the Canadian Meteorological Centre) based on the 00 GMT data was also verified for a number of stations for comparison.
- 9. Verifications were carried out for the MAXIMUM TEMPERATURE TODAY, THE MINIMUM TEMPERATURE TONIGHT, and the MAXIMUM TEMPERATURE THE NEXT DAY.
- 10. Ten temperature forecasts were made for each region and the mean absolute error (in °C), the bias and the number of cases of errors greater or equal to 5°C were tabulated in Figures 1, 2, and 3 for the experimental team and the official forecasts. The available FMs were also verified and compared to the results of the office and the experimental team (Figures 4, 5, and 6). Since the experiment stretched over two weeks one of which was relatively cloudy and the other primarily clear, the data was broken into these groupings. See legend below figures for explanation.

COMMENTS AND OBSERVATIONS

- 1. For the maximum temperature for Day-1, the mean absolute error is about $1\frac{1}{2}$ degrees for both experimental team and the official forecast.
- 2. For the maximum temperature for Day-2, the mean absolute error ranged from about 2-3°C.
- 3. For the minimum temperature, the mean absolute error ranged from about $2-3\,^{\circ}\text{C}$.
- 4. In general terms the official forecasts were somewhat better than those of the experimental team. In particular, the number of errors greater than 5°C on the minimum temperatures, and the second day maximum temperatures in favour of the official forecasts by 29 to 47.
- 5. The official forecast seemed to have the following bias; under cloudy conditions the temperatures are forecast too cold, and under clear conditions the temperatures are forecast too warm.

- 6. The experimental team appears to have a bias of forecasting temperatures too low, although this too is cloud dependent.
- 7. The FMs appear to do a much better job on cloudy days than on clear days.
- 8. There is also considerable evidence in the data that variations in temperatures within a region are significant and should be forecast (in particular the Kootenay region).

Figure 1

Maximum - Today

•			Exper	iment					Off	ice ,		
•	Mea Absol Erro	lute	Ві	as	Err ≥		Mea Absol Erro	ute	Bias		Error ≥ 5°C	
Greater Vancouver	1.6	1.4	02	2		0	1.0	.9	2 + .8	+ .3		0
Greater Victoria	1.4	1.6	6 -1.4	-1.0		0	1.4	1.2	-1.0 2	6		0
Lower Fraser Valley	1.6 3.0	2.3	+ .4	-1.1		0	.6 1.6	1.1	2 4	3		0
Howe Sound	2.4	2.3	+ .4	5	1 0	1	1.4	1.2	2 +1.0	+ .4		0
Whistler	1.8	2.2	+ .2 -1.8	8		0	2.0	1.3	+1.2	+ .5		0
Sunshine Coast	1.6	1.3	+ .2	1		0	1.4	1.0	-1.4 + .6 8	4	1	1
East Vancouver Island	1.2	1.2	4	4		0	1.2	1.2	+ .8	0		0
North Vancouver Island	2.8	1.7	2	-1.5		0	1.0 1.2	.8	6 -1.2	6		0
West Vancouver Island	.8 2.2 .6	1.5	+ .4 -2.2 + .2	9		0	2.4	1.8	-2.0 2	-1.6		0
Northern Mainland - Coast	1.6	1.1	8	3		0	2.8	1.7	+1.2	+ .5		0
Northern Mainland - Interior	1.8	1.3	+ .2	1		0	2.4	2.3	+2.0	+ .9	1	1
Queen Charlottes	1.2	1.2	-1.2 + .1	0	1	0	.6 1.0	.8	6 5	0	0	0
Coast	1.9	1.6	-1.1	5	0	1	1.6	1.3	+ .3	1	2	2
Thompson	2.0	1.3	+2.0	+ .8	i	0	1.6	1.6	+1.2	+ .2		0
Okanagan	1.4	1.6	6 4	-1.0		1	1.0	1.3	+ .2	3		0
Columbia	1.8	1.1	0	7		0	1.2	1.7	06	-1.7		0
Kootenay - West	1.6	1.4	0 -1.6	0	1 2	3	1.0 2.4 1.4	1.1	-2.0 +1.4	3	1	1
Kootenay - East	2.6	2.1	+2.2 +.2 +2.0	+ .3	2	0	1.0	1.4	2 +1.4	+ .6		0
Chilcotin/Cariboo	1.4	1.1	-1.0	4		0	3.0	1.4	8	4	1	1
Central Interior Interior	1.0	1.5	7 + .7	0	2 2	4	1.4	1.5	8 + .2	3	0 2	2

Mean Absolute	Error °C	Bias	°C	Error ≥	
Mean Absolute Error for Cloudy Conditions		Bias for Cloudy Conditions	Total Bias	Number of Errors on Cloudy Days	Total Number of Errors
Mean Absolute Error for Mostly Cloudy Conditions		Bias for Mostly Cloudy Conditions	·	Number of Errors on Mostly Clear Days	

Figure 2 Minimum - Tonight

	 		Exper	iment			 		Off	ice		
	Mea Abso	lute	Bi		Err ≥	or 5°C	Me Abso Err	lute	Bias		Error ≥ 5°C	
Greater Vancouver	2.0	1.8	-1.6 + .4	6		0	1.8	1.6	6 +1.4	+ .4		0
	3.2	2.2	-3.2 + .4	-1.4	2	2	2.0	1.4	8 + .8	0		0
Greater Victoria	2.0	2.2	-2.0	8		0	1.6	1.5	-1.2 + .6	3		0
Lower Fraser Valley	2.4		+ .4				1.6		+1.2			0
Howe Sound	1.2	1.5	2 -1.4	+ .3		0	1.0	1.3	+ .6	+ .9		
Whistler	2.4	2.7	+2.8	+ .7	2	2	2.2	2.5	+4.0	+1.9	1	2
Sunshine Coast	3.0	2.4	-1.2 -2.6	-1.4	1	0	1.2	1.7	+ .4 4	7		1
East Vancouver Island	2.2	2.6	-1.0 2	-1.8		1	1.0	1.3	+ .6	+ .1		0
North Vancouver Island	1.8	1.4	2 -1.2	2		0	1.8	1.9	+1.0	+1.1		0
West Vancouver Island	5.2	3.2	-4.8 0	-3.0	3	3	2.8	2.1	-2.0 +1.0	9	1	1
Northern Mainland - Coast	2.2	2.1	6 -1.2	3	1	0	1.8	1.8	+1.0	+1.0		0
Northern Mainland - Interior	2.8	2.4	-1.2	-1.2	1	2	2.4	2.2	+1.2	+ .4	1	1
Queen Charlottes	1.6	1.3	+ .2	3		0	2.2	2.0	+ .2	+ .8	1	0
Coast	2.5	2.2	-1.1 5	8	6	10	1.8	1.8	+ .8	+ .4	4	5
Thompson	2.8	2.0	+2.0	+ .8	1	1	2.8	2.0	+2.8	+ .8	1	1
Okanagan	4.0	2.8	-1.6 8	-1.2	3	3	2.4	1.8	-1.2 + .8	2		0
Columbia	3.8	3.2	-2.6 6	-1.6	2	2	3.0	2.7	-3.0 0	-1.5		0_
Kootenay - West	2.6 5.8	4.2	-2.6 -5.8	-4.2	4	5	1.2	1.8	-2.4 -1.2	-1.8		0
Kootenay - East	3.0	2.2	6 +2.6	+1.0	1	1	3.8	3.3	-1.6 +3.8	+1.1	2	3
Chilcotin/Cariboo	3.2	2.5	+1.8	+2.3	1 2	3	4.0	3.2	+2.0	+3.0	1	2
Central Interior	1.0	1.7	6 -1.2	9		0	1.8	1.9	6 -1.2	9	1	1
	1.8	2.7	9 1	5	2 13	15	2.1	2.4	-1.3 +1.3	0	2 5	7
Interior	1 2.0	2./	<u> </u>	٠	1	1.5				·	-	

Mean Absolute	Error °C	Bias	°C	Error ≥	
Mean Absolute Error for Cloudy		Bias for Cloudy Conditions	Total Bias	Number of Errors on Cloudy Days	Total Number of
Conditions Mean Absolute Error for Mostly Cloudy	Error	Bias for Mostly Cloudy Conditions		Number of Errors on Mostly Clear	Errors
Conditions				Days	

Figure 3

‡	Experiment						Office					
	Mes Absol Erro	ute	Ві		Err ≥	or 5°C	Mean Absolute Error		Bias		Error ≥ 5°C	
	2.4		4		1		2.4		-1.2		1	
Greater Vancouver	1.0	1.7	-1.0	7		1	1.0	1.7	+1.0	1		1
Greater vancouver	2.0		-1.2		1.		2.4		-2.0		1	
Greater Victoria	2.0	2.0	-1.6	-1.4		1	2.0	2.2	+ .4	8		1
OTCACCT VICCOTIO	2.6		2		2		3.0		-1.8		1	1
Lower Fraser Valley	2.4	2.5	-2.4	-1.3	1	3	2.0	2.5	0	9	1	
	2.8		+ .4		1		1.8		6 +1.8	+ .6		1
Howe Sound	2.0	2.4	-1.2	4		1	2.2	2.0	6	T .0		
	2.4		4		1	1	2.8	2.3	+2.8	+1.1	1	1
Whistler	2.6	2.5	2	3	1		2.0	2.3	-1.8		$-\frac{1}{1}$	_ -
	2.2		+ .2		t	1	1.6	1.9	+ .8	5		1
Sunshine Coast	1.4	1.8	-1.0	4	1		1.8		-1.4		1	
	2.4	1.7	-1.0	7		1	1.4	1.6	+1.0	2		1
East Vancouver Island	1.0	1./	4		1	-	1.0		-1.0			
	3.0	1.9	-3.0	-1.7		1	1.0	1.0	2	6		0
North Vancouver Island	1.4	1.,	+ .2				1.8		-1.8		1	
	2.8	2.1	-1.2	5		0	2.8	2.3	-2.0	-1.9		1
West Vancouver Island	1.4		+ .6				.4		4			
	3.0	2.2		4		0	1.8	1.1	+ .6	+ .1		0
Northern Mainland - Coast	2.4		8	<u>-</u> -			3.2		+ .8		1	
Northern Mainland - Interior	.8	1.6	0	+ .4		0	3.0	3.1	+2.2	+1.5	1	2
Northern Mainiand - Intellor	2.6		+2.6		1		1.0		+ .6			1
Queen Charlottes	1.6	2.1	-1.6	+ .5		1	.8	.9	4	+ .1		0
Queen Charlottes	2.1		0		10		1.9		9		8	١
Coast	2.0	2.0	-1.3	6	1	11	1.8	1.9	+ .7	1	2	10
COASE	1.8		6		1		2.4		-2.0		1	↓ .
Thompson	2.0	1.9	+2.0	+ .5		1	2.2	2.3	+1.8	1		1
111000000	2.6		-1.8		2		2.4		-2.4		1	1
Okanagan	2.0	2.3	0	9		2	1.0	1.7	+1.0	7		+
	1.4		-1.4	1.		1 .	1.8	١.,	-1.8	-1.6		٠ ا
Columbia	2.2	1.8	-1.4	-1.4	<u> </u>	0	1.8	1.8	-1.4	-1.0	1	 "
	2.6		-1.8		1	١.	2.4	2.2	-1.2	-1.6		1
Kootenay - West	2.8	2.7	-1.2	-1.5	1	2	3.6	2.2	-3.6	1.0	2	<u>├</u>
	3.2		8	1 .	2	١,	2.2	2.9	+2.2	7	<u> </u>	1 2
Kootenay - East	2.6	2.9		+ .7	1	3	1 .8	2.3	4	 		+
	2.0		+ .4	4		2	1.8	1.3	+1.0	+ .3		1 0
Chilcotin/Cariboo	3.6	2.8		+ .4	2	+	1.4	+	-1.4	1	 	
	1.8	٠.	+ .2	3	1	1	3.0	2.2	+ .6	14	2	2
Central Interior	2.8	2.3	8	 ,	6	+	2.1		-1.9	—	5	1
	2.2	l	8	_i	5	111	2.0	2.0	+ .6	17	2	7 7

				E 0 C
Mean Absolute Error	°C Bi	as ,°C	Error ≥	
Mean Absolute Error for Cloudy Conditions Mean Absolute Error for Mostly Cloudy Conditions	Bias for Cloudy ute Conditions	Total Bias	Number of Errors on Cloudy Days Number of Errors on Mostly Clear Days	Total Number of Errors

Figure 4 Maximum - Today

			FMs	04Z			Me	an Abso	lute Er	ror
	Abso:	lute	Bi	as	Err ≥	or 5°C	Experi	M ~ mental am	-	M -
Greater Vancouver	1.6	1.0	+ .8	+ .4		0	08	4	+ .6	+ .
Greater Victoria	1.2	.8	+ .4	4		0	-1.0 6	8	-1.0 +.2	
Lower Fraser Valley	2.0	2.0	8 8	8		0	+ .4 -1.0	3	+1.4	+.
Howe Sound										
Whistler										
Sunshine Coast										
East Vancouver Island	1.0						+ .4		+ .4	
North Vancouver Island	1.6	1.3	+ .6	+ .7		0	-1.2	4	+ .6	+ .
West Vancouver Island	1.0		2				+ .4		+ .4	
Northern Mainland - Coast	2.2	1.6	+1.0	4	1	1	+ .6	+ .5	6 2	<u>-</u> .
Northern Mainland - Interior	3.2 N/A	2.6	+2.8 N/A	+1.6		0	+1.4	+1.3	+ .8	+ •
*Queen Charlottes	.8	1.0	4	0		0		2		+ .
Coast	1.6	····	+1.6				+1.0		0	
Thompson	3.2	2.4	+2.4	+2.0	1	1	+1.2	+1.1	+1.6	+ .
Okanagan	2.2	1.7	+1.8	+1.3		0	+ .8	+ .1	+1.2	+.
Columbia	1.0 N/A	1.2	2 N/A	+ .2		0	8 N/A	+ .1	-1.2 N/A	
*Kootenay - West	1.4	1.7	+1.4	+1.7		0	6	+ .3	+ .4	+ .
Kootenay - East	1.6 N/A	1.4		+1.4	1	0	-1.0	6	0	
*Chilcotin/Cariboo	1.4	4.3	+4.2	+4.3	3	4	0	+3.2	+ .6	+2.
Central Interior	2.2	1.8	+1.8	+1.6	1	1	+ .4	+ .2	+ .2	+ .
Interior										L

^{*} Note: 6 cases only (1 cloudy, 5 clear) N/A: not available

Mean Abbotute lotal bias for	Difference in Average	Difference in Average
Cloudy Absolute Conditions Cloudy Days of Errors Mean Absolute Error Mostly Cloudy Errors on Mostly Cloudy Conditions Mostly Clear	Mean Absolute Error Cloudy Conditions Difference in Mean Absolute Error Mostly Cloudy	Mean Absolute Error Cloudy Conditions Difference in Mean Absolute Error Mostly Cloudy

Figure 5 Minimum - Tonight

			FMs (04Z					lute Eri	or
	Mea Absol Erro	ute	Bia	as	Error ≥ 5°C		FM - Experimental Team		Office	
	2.4		4				+ .4		+ .6	
Greater Vancouver	2.6	2.5	+2.6	+1.1		0	+1.0	+ .7	+1.2	+ .9
	1.8		-1.4			_	-1.4		2	+1.1
Greater Victoria	3.2	2.5	+3.2	+ .9	1	1	+2.0	+ .3	+2.4	+1.1
	2.8		-2.8	ا ،		0	+ .8	2	2	+ .5
Lower Fraser Valley	1.2	2.0	+1.2	8			1.2			
		1						Ì		
Howe Sound										
Whistler	-	t								
MITACIET	 									
Sunshine Coast										
East Vancouver Island									1 2	
	.8		0				+2.2	+1.0	+2.2	+ .5
North Vancouver Island	4.0	2.4	+4.0	+2.0	3	3	+2.2	+1.0	72.2	T .J
West Vancouver Island	2.2		-1.4		1		+ .2		+ .4	
	3.4	2.8	+2.6	+ .6	2	3	+1.2	+ .7	+1.6	+1.0
Northern Mainland - Coast	1.6	2.0	+1.2				-1.2		4	
Northern Mainland - Interior	2.4	2.0	+2.4	+1.8	1	1	+ .4	4	0	2
Notthern Marinand Interior	N/A		N/A							_
*Queen Charlottes	1.8	1.5	+1.0	+ .8		0		+ .2		5
						1				
Coast							 		+ .4	
	1.6		-1.6		1	1	+ .4	+ .1	2	+ .1
Thompson	2.6	2.1	+2.6	+ .5	1 1	 	0	· · · ·	+ .4	
	2.0	1.8	+1.6	+ .6	- i -	1	-2.0	-1.0	4	0
Okanagan	1.2	1.8	+1.0	 ' ''	 	 	-1.4		-1.8	
Columbia.	5.2	3.2		+3.2	3	3	+1.4	0	+2.8	+ .5
Columbia	N/A		N/A							
*Kootenay - West	1.6	1.7	4	1 0		7 0		-2.5		1
Rootellay nest	1.6		0			1	+ .2		-1.2	
Kootenay - East	5.2	3.4		+3.0	4	4	+2.2	+1.2	+1.4	+ .1
	N/A		N/A	٠	<u></u>	4		+2.8		+2.1
*Chilcotin/Cariboo	5.8	5.3		+5.0	1	+ 4	+2.0	74.0	+1.2	··
	3.0		6	2		1 2	+ .6	+1.3		+1.1
Central Interior	3.0	3.0	 ∠	+	+	 	1	1		
		ł	-	1		†		1		1
Interior					+	+		•		

^{*} Note: 6 cases only (1 cloudy, 5 clear) N/A: not available

	<u> </u>	°C	Error ≥	5°C	FM - Experime	ntal Team	FM - Off	
Mean Absolute Error for Mean Absolute Error for Mean Absolute Error for Mostly Cloudy Conditions	Bias for Cloudy Conditions Bias for Mostly Cloudy Conditions	C Total Bias	Number of Errors on Cloudy Days Number of Errors on Mostly Clear Days	Total Number of Errors	Difference in Mean Absolute Error Cloudy Conditions Difference in Mean Absolute Error Mostly Cloudy Conditions	Average Differ- ence	Difference in Mean Absolute Error Cloudy Conditions Difference in Mean Absolute Error Mostly Cloudy Conditions	

Figure 6

Maximum - Next Day

			FMs	04Z	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				lute Er	ror
	1	an lute or	Bi	as	Eri ≥	or 5°C	Experi	M - mental am	1	M - ice
Greater Vancouver	1.0	1.1	0	+ .1		0	-1.4 + .2	6	-1.4 +.2	6
Greater Victoria	1.4	1.2	-1.0 2	6		0	6 -1.0	8	-1.0 -1.0	-1.0
Lower Fraser Valley	3.0	2.6	-1.8 6	-1.2	1	1	+ .4 2	+.1	+ .2	+ .1
Howe Sound										
Whistler										
Sunshine Coast										
East Vancouver Island										
North Vancouver Island	1.2	.9	+ .2	+ .7		0	2	-1.0	+ .2	1
West Vancouver Island										
Northern Mainland - Coast	2.6	1.7	0 +1.4	+ .7	1	1	6	5	+ .4	+ .6
Northern Mainland - Interior	3.6	2.3	+ .2	+1.9	2	2	+2.8	+ .7	-2.2 + .6	8
*Queen Charlottes	N/A .6	.7	N/A 2	3		0		-1.4		2
Coast										
Thompson	3.8	3.2	+ .2	+2.0	2	3	+ .8	+1.3	+ .2	+ .9
0k anagan	1.8	2.2	-1.8 +1.8	0	1	1	2	1	+ .2	+ .5
Columbia	1.6	1.6	+ .4	+1.0		0	+ .2	2	2 2	2
*Kootenay - West	N/A 1.8	1.7	N/A +1.4	+1.3		0		-1.0		4
Kootenay - East	4.6	3.4	+4.6	+2.8	2	2	+2.0	+ .5	-1.4 +2.4	+ .5
*Chilcotin/Cariboo	N/A 2.2	1.8	N/A +1.8	+1.7	1	1	2	-1.0		+ .5
Central Interior	1.6	3.0	+ .8	+2.4	3	3	+1.6	+ .7	+ .2	+ .8
Interior										

^{*} Note: 6 cases only (1 cloudy, 5 clear) N/A: not available

Mean Absolute Error for Cloudy Absolute Error for Conditions Mean Absolute Error for Mean Absolute Error for for Mean Absolute Error for for for for for for for for for	Mean Absolute	Absolute Error °C Bias °C		Error ≥,5°C			FM - Experime		FM - Office		
Conditions Conditions	Mean Absolute Error for Cloudy Conditions Mean Absolute Error for	Total Mean Absolute Error	Bias for Cloudy Conditions Bias for Mostly Cloudy		Errors on Cloudy Day Number of Errors on Mostly Clo	ys	Number of	Mean Absolute Error Cloudy Conditions Difference in Mean Absolute Error Mostly Cloudy	Differ- ence	Mean Absolute Error Cloudy Conditions Difference in Mean Absolute Error Mostly	Differ-