

Catalogue 11-528E Occasional

## Environmental Perspectives 1993

## Studies and Statistics



## Data in Many Forms . . .

Statistics Canada disseminates data in a variety of forms. In addition to publications, both standard and special tabulations are offered on computer print-outs, microfiche and microfilm, and magnetic tapes. Maps and other geographic reference materials are available for some types of data. Direct access to aggregated information is possible through CANSIM, Statistics Canada's machine-readable data base and retrieval system.

## How to Obtain More Information

Inquiries about this publication and related statistics or services should be directed to:
System of National Accounts,
National Accounts and Environment Division,
Statistics Canada, Ottawa, K1A OT6 (Telephone: 613-951-3765, Facsimile number: 613-951-3618) or to the Statistics Canada reference centre in:

| St. John's | $(772-4073)$ | Winnipeg | $(983-4020)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Halifax | $(426-5331)$ | Regina | $(780-5405)$ |
| Montreal | $(283-5725)$ | Edmonton | $(495-3027)$ |
| Ottawa | $(951-8116)$ | Calgary | $(292-6717)$ |
| Toronto | $(973-6586)$ | Vancouver | $(666-3691)$ |

Toll-free access is provided in all provinces and territories, for users who reside outside the local dialing area of any of the regional reference centres.

| Newfoundland and Labrador | $1-800-563-4255$ |
| :--- | :--- |
| Nova Scotia, New Brunswick |  |
| $\quad$ and Prince Edward Island | $1-800-565-7192$ |
| Quebec | $1-800-361-2831$ |
| Ontario | $1-800-263-1136$ |
| Manitoba | $1-800-542-3404$ |
| Saskatchewan | $1-800-667-7164$ |
| Alberta | $1-800-282-3907$ |
| Southern Alberta | $1-800-472-9708$ |
| British Columbia (South and Central) | $1-800-663-1551$ |
| Yukon and Northern B.C. (area served <br> $\quad$ by NorthwesTel Inc.) |  |
| Northwest Territories (area served by <br> $\quad$ NorthwesTel Inc.) | Zenith 0-8913 |

## How to order Publications

This and other Statistics Canada publications may be purchased from local authorized agents and other community bookstores, through the local Statistics Canada offices, or by mail order to Publication Sales, Statistics Canada, Ottawa, K1A OT6.

Telephone Number 1-613-951-7277
Facsimile Number 1-613-951-1584

National toll free order line 1-800-267-6677
Toronto
Credit card only 1-416-973-8018


## Statistics Canada

National Accounts and Environment Division
System of National Accounts

## Environmental Perspectives 1993

## Studies and Statistics

Published by authority of the Minister responsible for Statistics Canada

- Minister of Industry, Science and Technology, 1993

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission from Licence Services, Marketing Division, Statistics Canada, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1A OT6.

## March 1993

Price: Canada \$25.00
United States: US $\$ 30.00$
Other Countries: US\$35.00
Catalogue No. 11-528E

ISBN 0-660-14755-6
Ottawa
Version française de cette publication disponible sur demande ( $\mathrm{n}^{\circ} 11-528 \mathrm{~F}$ au catalogue).

## Note of Appreciation

Canada owes the success of its statistical system to a long-standing cooperation involving Statistics Canada, the citizens of Canada, its businesses and governments. Accurate and timely statistical information could not be produced without their continued cooperation and goodwill.

Printed on recycled paper.

## Canadian Cataloguing in Publication Data

Main entry under title:

Environmental perspectives, 1993 : studies and statistics

Issued also in French under title:
Perspectives environnementales, 1993 : études et statistiques.
ISBN 0-660-14755-6
CS11-528E

1. Environmental indicators -- Canada.
2. Environmental protection -- Canada.
3. Conservation of natural resources -- Canada.
I. Statistics Canada. National Accounts and Environment Division.
II. Statistics Canada. System of National Accounts Branch.
III. Title.

HC113.5 E58 1993 333.7'0971
C93-099317-9

# Environmental Perspectives 1993 <br> Studies and Statistics 

## Table of Contents

Introduction ..... 1

1. Energy Consumption ..... 3
2. Canadian Greenhouse Gas Emissions: An Input-Output Study ..... 9
3. Pulp and Paper Industry Compliance Costs ..... 19
4. Transportation of Dangerous Goods ..... 27
5. Land Use Change Around Riding Mountain National Park ..... 33
6. The 1991 Census of Agriculture: Land Management for Soil Erosion Control ..... 47
7. Household Activity, Household Expenditures and the Environment ..... 53
8. Pollution Abatement and Control Expenditures ..... 59
9. Packaging Use and Disposition ..... 63
10. Waste Management Industry Survey ..... 67
11. Local Government Waste Management Practices Survey ..... 69
12. Materials Recovery and Recycling by the Industrial Sector ..... 75
13. Preliminary Estimates of the Value of Crude Oil and Natural Gas Reserves in Alberta ..... 79

## Technical Information



## Introduction

Understanding changes in environmental quality in Canada demands a wide variety of information to portray environmental change, its causes and its impacts. Physical and biological data, compiled by scientific, environmental and natural resource agencies, contribute to the evaluation of water, air, land and biotic resources. Social and economic data on population, agriculture, manufacturing, transportation and energy are essential in describing the role human activities play in the process of environmental change.

Environmental Perspectives: Studies and Statistics is a new publication for disseminating the results of surveys and data development projects related to the environment. It brings together data from a variety of sources including surveys undertaken by Statistics Canada, the agency's Environmental Information System, and other government and non-government databases. The publication will appear between issues of the quinquennial Human Activity and the Environment which was last published in 1991 ${ }^{1}$.

Whereas Human Activity and the Environment is a comprehensive compendium of environmental data, this publication should be seen more as a selection of data and analysis that reflect the progress of Statistics Canada in developing a more complete set of environmental accounts and underlying data bases. The topics covered in this volume have not been chosen to provide a balanced view of environmental conditions and related activities, but rather to fill perceived gaps in the environmental information system.

This edition of the publication covers five general themes. Chapters 1 through 4 relate to the impact of industrial activity on the environment. The first two chapters present newly developed data on energy use and greenhouse gas emissions. The third brings together economic and environmental data in a cross-sectional analysis of the pulp and paper industry. In Chapter 4, the movement of dangerous goods by truck and rail is examined. Information on interprovincial movements by class of material is presented along with statistics on accidents.

Chapters 5 and 6 analyze land use and soil conservation. Chapter 5 presents a case study on the

[^0]changing use of land surrounding Riding Mountain $\mathrm{Na}-$ tional Park in Manitoba. More intensive land use around the park brings increased stress on park wildlife that use the surrounding area as part of their range. Chapter 6 contains results on soil conservation practices from the 1991 Census of Agriculture. Data on the prevention of soil erosion are presented on a provincial basis.

Chapter 7 combines data from the new Household Environment Survey with family expenditure information to provide an insight into environmental behaviour of households. Data pertaining to mode of travel to work, use of energy saving devices and many other practices having an environmental impact are examined in the context of various characteristics such as family income and dwelling type.

Chapters 8 through 12 deal with four new surveys related to recycling and pollution abatement. Chapter 8 presents pollution abatement and control expenditures by industry for 1989 as well as a six-year perspective on pollution abatement expenditures relative to total capital spending. Chapter 9 examines the 1990 survey of industrial packaging undertaken to provide benchmark data for the National Packaging Protocol which seeks to reduce packaging sent to disposal to $50 \%$ of the 1988 level by the year 2000 . Waste management is examined from the perspective of private contractors and local governments in Chapters 10 and 11 respectively. The results of the initial survey of private waste management reported in Chapter 10 depict a $\$ 1$ billion industry in 1989. Tables show financial data by province and firm size. Chapter 11 provides a preliminary look at the characteristics of waste management by local governments and the division of responsibilities for collection, disposal and recycling for those municipalities with a population greater than 50000 . Information is presented on recycling and hazardous waste programs as well as other aspects of waste management. Chapter 12 examines the prices of selected scrap and virgin materials in order to describe their respective behaviour in changing markets.

Finally, Chapter 13 reports on developmental work on resource accounting for oil and gas. Different valuation methods are compared and a series of estimates are provided for oil and gas reserves according to several assumptions about future prices and costs.

## Acknowledgements

This publication was prepared by the National Accounts and Environment Division, Philip Smith, Director and Kirk Hamilton, Assistant Director. The book was edited by Craig Gaston and major contributions to the overall content and presentation were made by Gylliane Gervais, Robert Smith and Hélène Trépanier. The authors were as follows:

## Alice Born

Craig Gaston
Alan Goodall
Kirk Hamilton
Marcia Santiago
Robert Smith
Douglas Trant
Michael Bordt, Jacques Delisle, Phillip Fong, Jeff Fritzsche, Yvan Gervais, Bruce Mitchell, Michel Pascal, René Piché, Philippe Rhul, Michel Vallières, Sylvain Venne and Robert Loggie all provided valuable advice. The authors are also indebted to Mitzi Ross as marketing coordinator and advisor, and Susie Boyd for technical help.

# 1 Energy Consumption 

by Kirk Hamilton

Energy in general, and fossil fuel in particular, plays an important role in the interaction between human activities and the environment. Each stage in the production, transport, refining, transformation and consumption of energy commodities has actual or potential consequences for the state and quality of the environment.

The production of energy commodities often requires gross physical changes in the environment, in the form of open-pit mines for coal or oil sands, or flooding of large areas to provide reservoirs for hydro-electricity. The transport systems for these commodities may entail physical changes such as above-ground pipelines, or may produce undesirable side-effects such as spills. Refining of energy commodities carries with it the risk of emissions of noxious or poisonous substances to the environment. And their transformation (for example, burning fossil fuels or the fission of nuclear materials to produce electricity) and consumption produces a full range of possible environmental consequences: release of noxious substances, emissions of oxides of carbon, sulphur and nitrogen, and accumulations of solid wastes requiring disposal.

As a result of energy conservation policies and rapid price increases until 1986, the efficiency with which energy is used has changed considerably in recent years. An aggregate indicator of this change is the primary energy/GDP ratio, which declined from 17.3 megajoules (MJ) per constant 1986 dollar in 1981 to 15.5 MJ per dollar in 1986, a fall of over 10\% (Statistics Canada, 1991). This study aims to characterize energy use in Canada and to examine the macro-level changes that determine the overall efficiency of energy use.

To explore key aspects of the relationship between energy use and economic activity, detailed energy disposition accounts have been developed as part of the new National Accounts Environmental Component at Statistics Canada. These energy accounts measure the use of 9 major types of energy (coal, crude oil, natural gas, fuel oil, aviation gasoline, motor gasoline, liquefied petroleum gases, electricity and coke) for each of the 216 producing industries and 136 categories of final demand employed in the national input-output accounts (Statistics Canada, 1992a). A summary of the distribution of energy consumption by broad categories, based on these accounts, is shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Distribution of Energy Consumption

| Sector | 1971 |  | 1986 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | petajoules | percent | petajoules | percent |
| Business (excl. transport) | 2737 | 52.4 | 3199 | 53.3 |
| Transport | 931 | 17.8 | 1139 | 19.0 |
| Household | 1551 | 29.7 | 1654 | 27.6 |
| Total | 5219 | 100.0 | 5992 | 100.0 |

Source:
Statistics Canada, Industry Division.
The organization of energy data in Table 1 requires some explanation. Household energy includes that consumed in rented dwellings. Transport energy use includes for-hire transportation industries and energy for the operation of private vehicles, but excludes energy used for ownaccount transport (e.g. delivery vans) in the business sector. Business energy use spans all energy used in agriculture, mining, manufacturing and services, but excludes energy converted from one form to another (e.g. coal to electricity) and energy products used as feedstocks. In this accounting scheme, use of own product by energy producers is included in energy use. Table 1 sums to total private energy consumption.

Table 1 shows that household energy use as a proportion of the total declined by $2 \%$ between 1971 and 1986, because of stronger growth in the energy used in the business sector and transport. Energy use in the business sector is highly concentrated, as seen in Table 2. In 1986 the five largest energy using industries accounted for $31 \%$ of total business sector energy use.

## Table 2: Large Industrial Energy Consumers, 1986

| Industry | petajoules |
| :--- | ---: |
| Pulp and paper | 344 |
| Iron and steel | 216 |
| Non-ferrous metals | 175 |
| Industrial chemicals | 148 |
| Petroleum refineries | 114 |
| Total | $\mathbf{9 9 7}$ |
| Source: |  |
| Statistics Canada, Industry Division. |  |

## PRICES

Price is an obvious determinant of the demand for energy. It is worth examining two levels of prices. One is the international and domestic price for crude oil, the former reflecting worldwide demand and scarcity (or cartel pricing in the case of crude oil) and the latter reflecting this as well as domestic energy policy. The second is the price paid by Canadian residential consumers for delivered energy commodities, which reflects local market conditions as well as taxes. In Figures 1 and 2 these prices are expressed in dol-
lars per gigajoules so that they can be compared on a common basis of the energy content of the commodity.

As can be seen in Figure 1, crude oil prices have varied widely since the first OPEC oil shock in 1973. This figure compares imported crude oil, domestic crude oil and domestic natural gas prices. The striking feature of Canadian energy policy prior to 1984 was the establishment of a crude oil price substantially lower than the world price. These prices converged in 1984, but are not exactly equal because Figure 1 compares a domestic price that is weighted towards the well-head price in Alberta with the delivered price (including freight) of imported crude in Montreal. Natural gas prices at the field gate generally tracked the trends in crude oil prices but at a significantly lower level per unit of energy.

Figure 1: Crude Oil and Natural Gas Prices, 1971-1991


Source:
Canadian Petroleum Association, 1990.
Figure 2 compares the per-gigajoule prices (including taxes) of electricity, fuel oil and natural gas sold to households over the period 1980-1991. Electricity showed a steady increase in price over this period, whereas natural gas displayed both the lowest level and a virtually constant price. Fuel oil prices were much more erratic, falling sharply in 1986 (in step with crude oil prices), levelling off, then increasing in 1990 and 1991. It is noteworthy that electricity prices reached a level roughly 5 times those of natural gas by 1991 .

While Figures 1 and 2 display current or nominal prices, the movement of energy prices relative to other prices is also of interest. Table 3 shows the nominal prices of imported crude oil and residential electricity and fuel oil, for 1981 as well as 1991. In addition, this table shows the movement in each of these prices relative to other prices since 1981. Over this decade, the price of imported crude
oil declined substantially relative to other prices, while that of electricity showed a significant relative increase.

Figure 2: Residential Energy Prices, 1980-1991


Source:
Statistics Canada, 1992b

Table 3: Energy Prices and Indices

| Commodity | 1981 | 1991 | 1991 |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | dollars per gigajoule |  |  | index |
|  | 6.93 | 4.18 | 0.41 |  |
| Imported crude oil | 10.14 | 20.11 | 1.23 |  |
| Residential electricity | 6.36 | 11.45 | 1.12 |  |
| Residential fuel oil |  |  |  |  |

## Note:

The index is relative to changes in the general price level since 1981. In the case of crude oil the GDP implicit price index is used to measure the price level, while for the residential energy prices the consumer price index, excluding energy and food, is used. For example, an index of 1.0 for imported crude oil would indicate that imported crude prices moved at the same rate as the general price level from 1981 to 1991. Source:
Statistics Canada, Industry Division.

## ENERGY INTENSITY OF BASIC MATERIALS

The energy intensiveness of a good or service is the total energy required in production directly (in the producing sector) and indirectly (by the producers of the inputs to the producing sector) per unit of output. For example, the energy intensity of an automobile consists of the energy consumed on the production line plus the energy required to make the steel, rubber, plastic and other component materials making up a car, divided by the dollar value of the car - this gives a measure in joules of energy per dollar of product. The data in the energy flow accounts and the in-put-output accounts to which they are linked permit straightforward energy intensity calculations (see, for instance, Hamilton, 1988).

By combining energy intensity in joules per dollar with producer prices it is possible to estimate direct and indirect energy requirements per physical unit of product. This is a particularly useful way to examine the changing energy intensiveness of basic materials over time. Because so much of buildings, other infrastructure and manufactured products are made up of lumber, steel, non-ferrous metals, paper products and cement, the energy intensiveness of these basic materials has a profound influence on the requirements for energy in the economy as a whole. Table 4 presents the estimated energy intensity of these products in 1971, 1981 and 1986.

## Table 4: Energy Intensity of Basic Materials

| Material | 1971 | 1981 | 1986 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Decrease } \\ \text { 1971-86 } \end{array}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | megajoules per tonne |  |  | percent |
| Lumber | 1554 | 1669 | 1454 | 6.4 |
| Puip and paper | 24215 | 20921 | 17329 | 28.4 |
| Iron and steel | 23430 | 22035 | 18711 | 20.1 |
| Non-ferrous metal | . | 26757 | 20424 | 23.7 |
| Cement | 6567 | 5045 | 4373 | 33.4 |

Source:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.
The figures in Table 4 and subsequent tables measure total use of energy commodities, exclusive of the amounts used as feedstocks or converted into other forms of energy (e.g. when burning coal to produce thermal electricity). Imported products used as inputs into the production of these materials are assumed to have the same energy intensity as if they were produced in Canada. The figures therefore represent a pure measure of the energy required along the chain of production from extraction or harvest to final product.

When the materials are heterogeneous, changes in the product mix of the producing sector may influence the estimation of energy intensity ${ }^{1}$. Classification changes did not permit estimation of the energy intensity of non-ferrous metals in 1971, and so the percentage decrease shown in Table 4 for this material is from 1981 to 1986.

What emerges from this table is a striking drop in energy intensity for basic materials. Lumber shows an anomalous rise in 1981. However, lumber is generally low in energy intensity, and few opportunities exist for energy conservation in its production because it is a relatively unprocessed raw material. Pulp and paper and cement show substantial declines in energy intensity, while metals declined more moderately (although this is a fall over 5 years rather than 15 in the case of non-ferrous metals).

[^1]
## ENERGY INTENSITY OF FINAL EXPENDITURE

Another useful way to summarize energy intensiveness and its change over time is to examine the energy intensiveness of the different categories of final expenditure. This is shown in Table 5.

## Table 5: Energy Intensity of Final Expenditure, 1981-1986

| Category | 1981 | 1982 | 1983 | 1984 | 1985 | 1986 |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Consumer <br> expenditure | 10.1 | 9.8 | 10.0 | 9.3 | 10.0 | 9.8 |
| Investment in <br> fixed capital | 12.7 | 11.5 | 11.7 | 10.9 | 11.5 | 10.9 |
| Government <br> current <br> expenditure | 3.9 | 3.8 | 3.9 | 3.7 | 4.0 | 3.9 |
| Exports | 21.5 | 19.4 | 20.0 | 18.1 | 18.3 | 17.7 |
| Imports | 17.9 | 16.8 | 18.7 | 16.0 | 16.9 | 16.2 |

Source:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.
It must be emphasized that this table presents not the energy consumed directly by (for instance) households, but rather the energy required to produce one dollar's worth of the whole spectrum of goods and services consumed by households. The energy consumed directly by households was shown in Table 1.

These figures reveal a consistent ranking of energy intensiveness by category of expenditure, with exports leading, followed closely by imports, then investment in fixed capital, consumer expenditure, and far behind, government current expenditure (which is largely wages and salaries and so does not entail significant energy use).

Notable declines in energy intensity from 1981 to 1986 include one of $14 \%$ for investment in fixed capital, $18 \%$ for exports and $10 \%$ for imports. The energy intensity of exports decreased by about $3.5 \%$ per year over this period, echoing the declines in energy intensiveness of basic materials measured earlier.

Some explanation is required for the row labelled "imports" in Table 5. The values reported in this row do not represent the actual energy intensities of our imports but rather, the energy intensities of these goods as if they were produced in Canada. The assumption implicit in these estimates is that foreign industries are exactly as energy intensive in the production of a particular commodity as are Canadian industries.

The results in Table 5 indicate that Canadian exports were approximately $20 \%$ more energy intensive than imports in 1981. By 1986 this gap had shrunk to $9 \%$. Dollar

Table 6: Direct Energy Intensity by Industry, 1981-1986

| Industry | 1981 | 1982 | 1983 | 1984 | 1985 | 1986 | 1986 | Annual change |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | megajoules per constant 1981 dollar of output |  |  |  |  |  | rank | percent |
| 1 Agriculture | 8.1 | 7.4 | 10.5 | 7.3 | 7.5 | 7.2 | 14 | - 4.6 |
| 2 Fishing and trapping | 19.6 | 19.6 | 17.7 | 20.3 | 16.6 | 15.9 | 6 | -3.6 |
| 3 Logging and forestry | 6.6 | 5.4 | 5.3 | 4.4 | 5.5 | 6.7 | 15 | -3.5 |
| 4 Mining | 16.4 | 14.4 | 15.9 | 14.2 | 14.3 | 14.1 | 8 | -3.5 |
| 5 Crude oil and natural gas | 2.1 | 1.9 | 2.2 | 2.0 | 2.1 | 2.2 | 37 |  |
| 6 Quarries and sand pits | 13.0 | 16.3 | 12.8 | 11.8 | 11.5 | 12.1 | 9 | -2.1 |
| 7 Service related to mineral extraction | 10.5 | 10.5 | 9.4 | 9.6 | 9.8 | 9.7 | 11 | -1.2 |
| 8 Food processing | 3.1 | 3.2 | 3.0 | 2.9 | 3.5 | 3.8 | 28 | 1.2 3 |
| 9 Beverages | 5.7 | 5.6 | 5.0 | 4.8 | 5.7 | 5.9 | 21 |  |
| 10 Tobacco products | 1.0 | 1.1 | 1.1 | 1.1 | 1.5 | 1.5 | 44 | 8.7 |
| 11 Rubber products | 5.2 | 3.7 | 4.9 | 4.5 | 5.0 | 5.3 | 24 |  |
| 12 Plastic products | 3.2 | 3.4 | 3.1 | 3.0 | 3.3 | 3.4 | 30 |  |
| 13 Leather products | 1.7 | 1.7 | 1.8 | 1.9 | 2.6 | 2.4 | 36 | 8.8 |
| 14 Textiles | 6.6 | 6.5 | 5.9 | 6.0 | 6.1 | 6.0 | 19 | -1.7 |
| 15 Clothing | 0.9 | 0.9 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 1.3 | 1.3 | 45 | -1.7 |
| 16 Wood products | 5.2 | 5.5 | 5.0 | 4.9 | 4.6 | 4.2 | 26 | -3.9 |
| 17 Furniture | 2.0 | 2.5 | 2.2 | 2.2 | 3.1 | 2.8 | 32 | -3.1 |
| 18 Paper products | 23.8 | 18.1 | 22.2 | 22.0 | 21.3 | 20.6 | 4 | -2.7 |
| 19 Printing and publishing | 1.1 | 1.2 | 1.2 | 1.1 | 1.5 | 1.6 | 42 | -2.7 8.0 |
| 20 Primary metals | 25.4 | 26.1 | 24.9 | 21.7 | 23.3 | 22.7 | 3 | -2.6 |
| 21 Fabricated metals | 2.8 | 3.0 | 3.1 | 3.3 | 3.7 | 3.8 | 29 | -2.6 6.6 |
| 22 Machinery | 1.9 | 2.5 | 2.4 | 2.3 | 2.8 | 2.6 | 33 | 6.4 |
| 23 Transport equipment | 1.8 | 1.9 | 1.7 | 1.5 | 1.9 | 2.0 | 38 |  |
| 24 Electrical products | 1.8 | 2.1 | 1.6 | 1.5 | 1.8 | 1.7 | 41 |  |
| 25 Non-metallic mineral products | 25.6 | 26.0 | 23.8 | 23.7 | 24.2 | 24.8 | 2 | $\ldots$ |
| 26 Refined petroleum products | 7.5 | 8.2 | 7.9 | 7.9 | 8.1 | 6.6 | 17 | $\cdots$ |
| 27 Chemical products | 16.0 | 16.9 | 17.4 | 15.3 | 14.9 | 6.6 14.2 | 17 | -3.0 |
| 28 Other manufacturing | 1.9 | 1.9 | 1.8 | 1.8 | 2.3 | 2.6 | 34 | 6.3 |
| 29 Construction | 2.1 | 2.0 | 1.8 | 1.9 | 1.9 | 1.8 | 40 | 6.3 -2.1 |
| 30 Transport | 19.2 | 18.0 | 18.5 | 17.4 | 17.7 | 1.8 17.4 | 40 | -2.1 |
| 31 Pipeline transport | 42.4 | 37.7 | 27.4 | 34.4 | 41.8 | 36.0 | 1 | -2.1 |
| 32 Storage | 6.0 | 6.3 | 5.4 | 7.8 | 8.3 | 7.6 | 12 | 8.1 |
| 33 Communication | 2.1 | 2.2 | 1.9 | 1.9 | 2.1 | 7.6 1.8 | 12 | 8.1 |
| 34 Electric power and other utilities | 11.4 | 12.8 | 12.4 | 11.7 | 12.3 | 12.0 | 10 |  |
| 35 Wholesale trade | 5.4 | 5.3 | 4.7 | 4.9 | 4.7 | 4.1 | 27 | -4.2 |
| 36 Retail trade | 6.1 | 6.4 | 5.7 | 5.9 | 6.3 | 6.0 | 20 |  |
| 37 Finance and real estate | 6.0 | 7.0 | 6.8 | 6.2 | 7.4 | 7.3 | 13 | 4.1 |
| 38 Insurance | 1.3 | 1.1 | 0.9 | 0.7 | 0.7 | 0.7 | 46 | 4.1 -13.3 |
| 39 Government royalties on resources | . | . | . | . | 0.7 | 0.7 | 46 | -13.3 |
| 40 Owner occupied dwellings | - | - | - | . | - |  | 47 |  |
| 41 Business services | 1.5 | 1.4 | 1.4 | 1.4 | 1.6 | 1.6 | 43 |  |
| 42 Educational services | 5.9 | 6.1 | 5.5 | 5.9 | 7.4 | 6.6 | 16 | $\cdots$ |
| 43 Health services | 2.7 | 2.8 | 2.4 | 2.7 | 2.6 | 2.6 | 16 35 | 4.2 |
| 44 Accommodation and food | 6.0 | 6.3 | 6.0 | 6.5 | 7.1 | 6.6 | 18 | 3.0 |
| 45 Amusement and recreation | 3.5 | 3.7 | 3.4 | 3.2 | 3.4 | 3.3 | 31 |  |
| 46 Personal services | 6.1 | 6.0 | 5.1 | 4.9 | 4.7 | 4.8 | 25 | -1.0 |
| 47 Other services | 4.5 | 4.6 | 4.5 | 5.0 | 5.3 | 4.8 5.3 | 25 | -4.9 |
| 48 Operating supplies | . | . | . | . | 5.3 |  | 23 | 4.0 |
| 49 Travel, advertising and promotion | 7.2 | 6.6 | 6.3 | 6.7 | 5.8 | 5.7 | 48 | -4 |
| 50 Transport margins | . | . | . | 6.7 | 5.8 | 5.7 | 22 | -4.4 |

Note
Industries 48, 49 and 50 are fictive industries used for estimating the use of groups of commodities whose precise content is unknown.
Source:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.
for dollar, therefore, Canada was a significant net exporter of energy embodied in the goods and services it traded.

## DIRECT ENERGY INTENSITY BY INDUSTRY

Underlying the energy intensities presented in the preceding sections is the energy use per dollar of output of each of the 216 industries comprising the business sector of the input-output accounts. These direct energy intensities are presented for the years 1981 to 1986 at the level of 50 industries (see Table 6).

Although this table shows the rank of industries by energy intensiveness only for 1986, the ranking is remarkably stable over the years shown. Pipeline transport, with its high energy input and low value of output, ranks first, followed by the non-metallic mineral products industry (whose energy use is dominated by cement producers). These are followed in the top 5 by primary metals, paper products and the transport industry.

The annual changes in industry direct energy intensiveness were calculated over this period. Only those industries showing a significant trend appear in Table 6. While there are many instances of positive change (i.e. increasing energy intensiveness), these occur only for industries ranked very low in energy intensiveness. The majority

Table 7: Fuel and Electricity Shares by Industry, 1986

| Industry | Coal | Natural Gas | Gasoline | Fuel oil | LPG | Electricity | Coke | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | ercent |  |  |  | terajoules |
| 1 Agriculture | 1.7 | 10.3 | 29.2 | 37.5 | 3.1 | 18.2 | - | 179243 |
| 2 Fishing and trapping | -- | 2.7 | 46.8 | 49.9 | -- | 0.6 | -- | 16704 |
| 3 Logging and forestry | -- | 1.1 | 17.6 | 79.3 | 0.7 | 1.3 | -- | 37688 |
| 4 Mining | 4.6 | 25.1 | 0.9 | 29.2 | 2.0 | 36.1 | 2.0 | 152067 |
| 5 Crude oil and natural gas | -- | 19.4 | 20.2 | 7.5 | 5.9 | 47.0 | -- | 47015 |
| 6 Quarries and sand pits | - | 10.9 | 7.0 | 67.2 | -- | 14.7 | -- | 10621 |
| 7 Service related to mineral extraction | - | 13.4 | 24.6 | 46.9 | -- | 15.1 | -- | 30362 |
| 8 Food processing | -- | 70.6 | 4.1 | 9.9 | 1.2 | 14.0 | - | 114441 |
| 9 Beverages | -- | 79.2 | 3.9 | x | x | 10.3 | -- | 23526 |
| 10 Tobacco products | -- | x | $x$ | x | ${ }^{\mathrm{x}}$ | 25.4 | -- | 1770 |
| 11 Rubber products | x | 67.7 | $\times$ | X | 0.6 | 21.0 | .- | 12816 |
| 12 Plastic products | x | 54.1 | 2.2 | 3.8 | x | 38.7 | -- | 12562 |
| 13 Leather products | $\times$ | $x$ | $\times$ | $x$ | x | 21.6 | -- | 2825 |
| 14 Textiles | x | x | 0.6 | x | 0.6 | 17.6 | -- | 32082 |
| 15 Clothing | -- | 59.5 | x | 7.0 | $\times$ | 27.8 | -- | 7190 |
| 16 Wood products | -- | 42.1 | 4.0 | 16.9 | 2.3 | 34.6 | - | 44321 |
| 17 Furniture | $x$ | 68.5 | 3.7 | 5.1 | x | 21.3 | -- | 8962 |
| 18 Paper products | x | 26.4 | 0.1 | 20.8 | 0.2 | 50.6 | x | 358294 |
| 19 Printing and publishing | -- | 60.4 | 5.0 | 2.6 | 2.0 | 30.0 | -- | 12680 |
| 20 Primary metals | 2.5 | 26.5 | $\times$ | $\times$ | 0.2 | 38.1 | 28.6 | 420190 |
| 21 Fabricated metal | -- | 76.6 | 2.7 | 3.2 | 1.7 | 15.8 | -- | 48451 |
| 22 Machinery | $x$ | 72.3 | 3.7 | 3.5 | x | 19.2 | $x$ | 17565 |
| 23 Transport equipment | x | x | x | $x$ | x | 20.4 | x | 68253 |
| 24 Electrical products | x | $x$ | $\times$ | x | $\times$ | 26.7 | ${ }^{\mathrm{x}}$ | 25379 |
| 25 Non-metallic minerals | 18.6 | $\times$ | 0.6 | 7.6 | 0.7 | 11.1 | 1.7 | 129473 |
| 26 Refined petroleum | $x$ | 41.1 | $x$ | $\times$ | 0.4 | 12.3 | $x$ | 3529 |
| 27 Chemical products | $\times$ | 68.7 | $x$ | 3.8 | 0.5 | 25.9 | $\times$ | 242535 |
| 28 Other manufacturing | -- | 69.7 | x | $\times$ | $\times$ | 20.9 | -- | 12309 |
| 29 Construction | x | x | 60.0 | 29.8 | 2.4 | 3.9 | -- | 105298 |
| 30 Transport industry | 0.1 | 5.2 | 10.7 | 79.1 | 2.1 | 2.8 | - | 497737 |
| 31 Pipeline transport | $\times$ | 92.9 | -- | 1.1 | $\times$ | 6.0 | -- | 84349 |
| 32 Storage | -- | 17.9 | 6.9 | 56.7 | 2.8 | 15.8 | -- | 6713 |
| 33 Communication | -- | 18.7 | 28.8 | 26.9 | 4.3 | 21.3 | -- | 24879 |
| 34 Electric power and other utilities | -- | 7.3 | 6.9 | 0.7 | 0.2 | 84.9 | -- | 164023 |
| 35 Wholesale trade | x | 13.9 | 54.9 | 14.8 | 4.2 | 11.9 | $\times$ | 118028 |

Table 7: Fuel and Electricity Shares by Industry, 1986

| Industry | Coal | Natural Gas | Gasoline | Fuel oil | LPG | Electricity | Coke | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | percent |  |  |  |  |  |  | terajoules |
| 36 Retail trade | -- | 37.8 | 24.4 | 10.1 | 0.4 | 27.3 | -- | 201296 |
| 37 Finance and real estate | -- | 50.3 | 4.7 | 20.8 | 0.6 | 23.6 | -- | 294158 |
| 38 Insurance | -- | 24.4 | 19.8 | 20.9 | 2.2 | 32.6 | -- | 4370 |
| 39 Government royalties | - | -- | -- | -- | -- | -. | -* | -- |
| 40 Owner occupied dwellings | - | -- | -- | -- | - | -- | -- | -- |
| 41 Business services | - | 22.8 | 42.4 | 20.0 | 1.8 | 13.0 | -* | 28918 |
| 42 Educational services | $x$ | 55.1 | x | 14.8 | -- | 29.1 | -- | 7395 |
| 43 Health services | X | 19.2 | 30.1 | 35.5 | $x$ | 12.9 | -- | 22068 |
| 44 Accommodation and food | -- | 47.6 | 1.3 | 23.9 | 0.7 | 26.5 | -- | 95703 |
| 45 Amusement and recreation | - | 26.0 | 4.9 | 23.6 | 0.8 | 44.7 | -- | 15399 |
| 46 Personal services | -- | 10.8 | 12.2 | 52.2 | 2.7 | 22.1 | -- | 19837 |
| 47 Other services | - | 16.1 | 52.7 | 19.2 | 1.5 | 10.6 | -- | 30173 |
| 48 Operating supplies | -- | -- | -- | -- | - | .- | -- | -- |
| 49 Travel, advertising and promotion | -- | - | 98.9 | -- | 1.1 | -* | -- | 69151 |
| 50 Transport margins | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- | -- |

Industries 48, 49 and 50 are fictive industries used for estimating the use of groups of commodities where the precise commodity content is unknown
of the most energy intensive industries showed declines between $2.1 \%$ and $3.5 \%$ per year.

## FUEL AND ELECTRICITY SHARES BY INDUSTRY

The analysis to this point has concentrated on total use of energy and not on the fuels that constitute this total. Table 7 shows the percentage share of each type of energy in total use, by industry, in 1986. In total, the dominant energy type is natural gas with a share of nearly $33 \%$, followed by electricity at roughly $25 \%$ and fuel oil at $24 \%$.

Coal shows up as only $2.5 \%$ of energy use in the primary metals industry because most of it is converted to coke before use - coke in turn constitutes $28.6 \%$ of the energy used in this sector. Natural gas is the major energy input to pipeline transport, but is also important in beverages and fabricated metals. Gasoline is the dominant energy source in wholesale trade, to power fleets of delivery vehicles. Fuel oil, which includes diesel and aviation gasoline, is the chief energy source for the transport industry and logging and forestry. Finally, electricity is the major energy input to the paper products industry.

## SUMMARY

The distribution of energy consumption across broad sectors has changed little since 1971, and the use of energy in the business sector remains highly concentrated in a few large industries. Crude oil and natural gas prices have been extremely volatile since 1973, while residential energy prices, particularly for electricity, have risen faster than
the general price level since 1981. There is an overall trend towards increasing energy efficiency evident in the decreasing energy intensiveness of basic materials and in the direct use of energy per dollar of output in the major energy consuming industries. Among categories of final expenditure, exports, investment in fixed capital and imports, all showed marked declines in energy intensiveness from 1981 to 1986.

## REFERENCES

Canadian Petroleum Association. Statistical Handbook. Calgary, 1990.
Hamilton, K.E. "Energy Intensiveness and Economic Performance Since 1971" in Canadian Economic Observer, 1: 12. Catalogue 11-010. Statistics Canada, Ottawa, 1988.

Statistics Canada. Human Activity and the Environment 1991. Catalogue 11-509, Ottawa, 1991.
----. The Input-Output Structure of the Canadian Economy. Catalogue 15-201, Ottawa, 1992a.
----. Energy Statistics Handbook. Catalogue 57-601, Ottawa, 1992 b .

# 2 Canadian Greenhouse Gas Emissions: An InputOutput Study 

by Robert Smith ${ }^{1}$

## INTRODUCTION

Statistics Canada has recently initiated development of a set of accounts that will form an environmental component for the Canadian System of National Accounts. Four accounts will comprise this component: a natural resource stock account, a natural resource use account, a waste and pollutant output account and an environmental expenditure account.

The work presented below has been undertaken as a pilot study for the waste and pollutant output account. This account will integrate information on the types, quantities and destinations of waste material generated by economic activity into a framework based on the Canadian input-output tables published annually by Statistics Canada. In the present study information on the types and quantities of greenhouse gases released from Canadian production and consumption activity have been analyzed using an augmented version of the 1985 input-output tables (Statistics Canada, 1989). The general method for augmenting the in-put-output tables used here is based on the work of Victor (1972). ${ }^{2}$

Greenhouse gas emissions have been chosen for this pilot account for two reasons. First, greenhouse gas emissions are currently under scrutiny in Canada and elsewhere because of the likelihood that increased atmospheric concentrations of these gases will create an enhanced greenhouse effect (see below). The federal government, for its part, has committed Canada to the stabilization of greenhouse gas emissions at 1990 levels by 2000 (Government of Canada, 1990). It is hoped that the work presented here will aid in the effort to meet this goal. Second, in contrast to many categories of waste emissions, a good deal of data are available for estimating greenhouse gas emissions. Thus, it is possible to present a very complete pilot account of these emissions.

[^2]
## THE GREENHOUSE EFFECT

The atmosphere surrounding the earth consists almost entirely of nitrogen and oxygen, with the remaining portion comprised of a variety of gases found in very low concentrations. A certain group of these trace gases are responsible for what has come to be known as the "greenhouse effect", which can be briefly explained as follows.

Short wave solar radiation passes relatively unhindered through the earth's atmosphere to the surface of the planet. Objects on the surface absorb this incoming radiation and are warmed. The warmed objects, in turn, re-emit longer wavelength (infrared) radiation back into the atmosphere. The atmosphere is less transparent to infrared radiation than it is to short wave radiation however. Trace quantities of water vapour, carbon dioxide $\left(\mathrm{CO}_{2}\right)$, methane $\left(\mathrm{CH}_{4}\right)$, nitrous oxide $\left(\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}\right)$ and a few other gases absorb some of the out-going infrared radiation, re-radiating it back to the earth's surface. In this way they act like the glass covering on a greenhouse. By preventing a portion of the infrared radiation from escaping to space, these "greenhouse gases" keep global temperatures much warmer than would be the case in their absence.

It is worth noting that the greenhouse effect is a naturally occurring phenomenon; it has not been created by human activity. However, there is concern that humaninduced changes in the atmospheric concentrations of the greenhouse gases may significantly enhance the naturally occurring greenhouse effect. Although some evidence of the expected increase in global mean temperature has already been noted, an unequivocal demonstration of the enhanced greenhouse effect is not expected for at least another decade (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 1992). Studies have demonstrated conclusively, however, that the atmospheric concentrations of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}, \mathrm{CH}_{4}$ and $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ have significantly increased from their pre-industrial values as a result of anthropogenic emissions (ibid.). ${ }^{3}$ Humankind has also introduced a new and extremely powerful set of greenhouse gases into the atmosphere. Known collectively as the chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs), each of these has thousands of times the ability of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ to absorb infrared radiation.

## ESTIMATED 1985 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BY ECONOMIC SECTOR

Table 1 lists the greenhouse gases that are included in this study. Emissions of these gases result from the activities of businesses, households ${ }^{4}$ and governments. All three sectors purchase and consume commodities that either contain greenhouse gases that are released upon use

[^3](paints and solvents, for example) or that are converted to greenhouse gases as a result of use (fossil fuels are the most important example of the latter type of commodity). Using the emissions data discussed at the end of this chapter in combination with data from the 1985 input-output tables, it has been possible to estimate the 1985 greenhouse gas emissions from 49 industries and 4 categories of household and government expenditure. These estimates are shown in Table 2.

Table 1: Greenhouse Gases Included in this Study

| Name | Formula / Acronym |
| :--- | ---: |
| Carbon dioxide | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ |
| Methane | $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ |
| Nitrous oxide | $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ |
| Volatile organic carbon compounds | $\mathrm{VOCs}^{2}$ |
| Nitric oxide and nitrogen dioxide | $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ |
| Carbon monoxide | CO |

The data presented in Table 2 show that the electric power and other utilities industry (34) was the largest industrial emitter of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ in 1985. This industry also rates as the largest industrial emitter when ranked in terms of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions. ${ }^{1}$ The transportation industry (30), primary metals industry (20), agriculture industry (1), and chemical products industry (27) make up the remainder of the top five industrial emitters in terms of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalents.

The concentration of industrial greenhouse gas emissions is highlighted by the fact that these five industries alone accounted for almost $58 \%$ of total $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions from industries in 1985. The top ten emitters accounted for $76 \%$ of total industrial $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions.

A direct cause and effect relationship exists between fossil fuel consumption and greenhouse gas emissions. It is not surprising, then, that four of the top five $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emitting industries also rank among the five largest industrial consumers of fossil fuels. The agriculture industry stands out as something of an anomaly in this regard. It ranks fourth in terms of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions, but eighth in terms of fossil fuel consumption. The reason for the relatively high ranking of the agriculture industry in

1. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions are calculated using the concept of global warming potential (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 1992). Global warming potential (GWP) is the potential contribution to global warming over a specified time period (usually 20 or 100 years) of a given greenhouse gas relative to that of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$, which is assigned a GWP of 1 . When 100 years is the considered time period, methane is calculated to have a GWP of 11, and nitrous oxide to have a GWP of 270. This means, for example, that the emission of one tonne of $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$, considered over a period of 100 years from the date of emission, is equivalent to the emission of 11 tonnes of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ in terms of its potential contribution to global warming.
No GWP values exist for VOCs, $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ and CO. Thus, it is not possible to include these gases in $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emission estimates. The reader is cautioned to keep this exclusion in mind when interpreting the $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emission data presented here.

Table 2: Greenhouse Gas Emissions by Sector, 1985

|  | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ | $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ | $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | VOC | $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ | CO | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sector | kilotonnes |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | rank |  |
| Business sector |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 Agriculture | 9525 | 24663 | 973 | 16 | 64 | 127 | 610 | 8 | 4 |
| 2 Fishing and trapping | 1134 | 1187 | -- | -- | 10 | 14 | 96 | 29 | 29 |
| 3 Logging and forestry | 2076 | 2151 | -- | -- | 10 | 30 | 88 | 21 | 21 |
| 4 Mining | 6563 | 8220 | 140 | -- | 7 | 48 | 81 | 14 | 12 |
| 5 Crude oil and natural gas | 7845 | 16459 | 779 | -- | 33 | 184 | 143 | 11 | 6 |
| 6 Quarries and sand pits | 474 | 488 | .- | -- | 1 | 7 | 10 | 35 | 35 |
| 7 Services related to mineral extraction | 2303 | 2381 | -- | - | 14 | 29 | 136 | 20 | 20 |
| 8 Food processing | 4773 | 4816 | -- | -- | 10 | 9 | 33 | 15 | 16 |
| 9 Beverages | 1054 | 1064 | -- | -- | 2 | 3 | 8 | 30 | 30 |
| 10 Tobacco products | 63 | 63 | -- | -- | .- | -- | .. | 46 | 46 |
| 11 Rubber products | 511 | 514 | -- | -- | 5 | 2 | 1 | 34 | 34 |
| 12 Plastic products | 350 | 353 | -- | -- | 1 | -- | 2 | 40 | 40 |
| 13 Leather products | 126 | 127 | -- | -- | .. | .. | -- | 45 | 45 |
| 14 Textiles | 1263 | 1269 | -- | -. | 2 | 2 | 6 | 27 | 28 |
| 15 Clothing | 231 | 233 | -- | -- | -. | -- | 2 | 43 | 43 |
| 16 Wood products | 1796 | 1815 | .- | -- | 48 | 10 | 860 | 23 | 23 |
| 17 Furniture | 315 | 318 | -- | -- | 4 | -- | 2 | 42 | 42 |
| 18 Paper products | 9985 | 10046 | -- | -- | 19 | 38 | 96 | 7 | 9 |
| 19 Printing and publishing | 423 | 427 | .- | -- | 1 | 1 | 4 | 38 | 38 |
| 20 Primary metals | 24492 | 25060 | -- | 2 | 15 | 35 | 449 | 3 | 3 |
| 21 Fabricated metals | 2002 | 2017 | -- | -- | 12 | 2 | 8 | 22 | 22 |
| 22 Machinery | 760 | 766 | -- | -- | 3 | 1 | 4 | 33 | 33 |
| 23 Transport equipment | 2772 | 2791 | -- | -- | 28 | 4 | 11 | 19 | 19 |

Table 2: Greenhouse Gas Emissions by Sector, 1985

|  | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ | $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ | $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | VOC | $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ | CO | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sector | kilotonnes |  |  |  |  |  |  | rank |  |
| 24 Electrical products | 989 | 995 | - | -- | 4 | 1 | 7 | 31 | 31 |
| 25 Non-metallic minerals | 12678 | 12721 | -- | -- | 5 | 27 | 62 | 4 | 7 |
| 26 Refined petroleum | 8201 | 8302 | -- | -- | 51 | 39 | 240 | 10 | 11 |
| 27 Chemical products | 12612 | 16903 | -- | 16 | 233 | 29 | 31 | 5 | 5 |
| 28 Other manufacturing | 450 | 454 | -- | -- | 3 | 1 | 3 | 36 | 36 |
| 29 Construction | 7511 | 7848 | 1 | 1 | 132 | 93 | 841 | 12 | 13 |
| 30 Transport industry | 33713 | 34874 | 14 | 4 | 98 | 259 | 614 | 2 | 2 |
| 31 Pipeline transport | 4519 | 4891 | 32 | -- | -- | -- | -- | 16 | 15 |
| 32 Storage | 418 | 423 | -- | -- | -- | -- | 3 | 39 | 39 |
| 33 Communication | 1417 | 1453 | -- | -- | 8 | 7 | 63 | 25 | 26 |
| 34 Electric power \& other utilities | 84540 | 85300 | 16 | 2 | 15 | 272 | 142 | 1 | 1 |
| 35 Wholesale trade | 7239 | 7537 | 1 | 1 | 60 | 48 | 418 | 13 | 14 |
| 36 Retail trade | 8760 | 8983 | 1 | 1 | 44 | 34 | 305 | 9 | 10 |
| 37 Finance and real estate | 11444 | 11540 | -- | -- | 9 | 10 | 66 | 6 | 8 |
| 38 Insurance | 161 | 165 | -- | -- | 1 | 1 | 5 | 44 | 44 |
| 39 Government royalties on resources | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | ... | ... |
| 40 Owner occupied dwellings | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | $\cdots$ | $\ldots$ |
| 41 Business services | 1412 | 1456 | -- | -- | 9 | 7 | 66 | 26 | 25 |
| 42 Education services | 330 | 332 | -- | - | -- | - | 1 | 41 | 41 |
| 43 Health services | 1258 | 1290 | -- | -- | 6 | 4 | 41 | 28 | 27 |
| 44 Accommodation and food | 4331 | 4361 | - | -- | 1 | 2 | 10 | 17 | 18 |
| 45 Amusement and recreation | 440 | 445 | - | -- | 1 | 1 | 4 | 37 | 37 |
| 46 Personal services | 946 | 961 | -- | -- | 21 | 2 | 14 | 32 | 32 |
| 47 Other services | 1673 | 1736 | -- | -- | 13 | 9 | 90 | 24 | 24 |
| 48 Operating supplies | - | - | - | - | 47 | - | - | 47 | 47 |
| 49 Travel, advertising \& promotion | 4300 | 4536 | 1 | 1 | 55 | 39 | 386 | 18 | 17 |
| 50 Transportation Margins | - | - | - | - | - | - |  | ... | ... |
| Sub-total, business sector | 290181 | 323596 | 1962 | 48 | 1106 | 1432 | 6060 |  |  |
| Household sector |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Motor fuels \& lubricants | 40694 | 44709 | 11 | 14 | 374 | 251 | 2514 | ... | ... |
| Home heating fuels | 48719 | 48986 | 2 | 1 | 111 | 41 | 641 | ... | ... |
| All other goods | 3007 | 3061 | 0 | 0 | 101 | 7 | 55 | ... | ... |
| Government - current expenditures | 17859 | 18225 | 2 | 1 | 59 | 52 | 289 | ... | ... |
| Sub-total, household and government sectors | 110278 | 114980 | 15 | 17 | 645 | 351 | 3499 | ... | ... |
| Total, whole economy | 400459 | 438576 | 1977 | 65 | 1750 | 1783 | 9559 | ... | ... |

## Notes:

Readers familiar with input-output accounting will note that the format of this table does not correspond exactly to that of the national input-output tables. Specifically, the following categories of final demand have been excluded: fixed capital formation, inventory change, imports and exports. These have been excluded because they do not result in direct greenhouse gas emissions and because their exclusion simplifies the presentation.
Industries 48,49 and 50 are fictive industries used for estimating the use of groups of commodities whose precise content is unknown.
${ }_{1} \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions include $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions plus $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ and $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions expressed as equivalent $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions.
terms of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalents is found in its very large emissions of $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ and $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$. Farm animals, cattle in particular, release a great deal of $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ during their digestion processes. This accounts for almost all of the $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions from the agriculture industry. Nitrification processes in soils to which nitrogenous fertilizers have been applied account for the very large emissions of $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$. The agriculture industry is estimated to have accounted for $50 \%$ of total industrial $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions and $33 \%$ of total industrial $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ emissions in $1985 .{ }^{1}$

Table 2 shows an estimated 114980 kt of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions from households and governments in 1985, which represents more than $26 \%$ of the economy-wide emissions. The majority ( $93 \%$ ) of household and govern-

1. Had it been possible to include landfill $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions in this study, other industries would have shown higher $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions in Table 2 to the extent that they contribute to bio-degradable material in landfill sites. Since landfill $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions represent $38 \%$ of total $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions as estimated by Environment Canada (Jaques, 1992, p. xviii), this exclusion puts the agriculture industry in an unfairly poor light in comparison to other industries.
ment $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions come from the consumption of motor and heating fuels.

The conventional wisdom that industry, especially heavy manufacturing, is the major polluter in the economy is borne out by the results presented in Table 2, at least in terms of greenhouse gas emissions. It should not be left unsaid, however, that households account for more $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions than any single industry.

## GREENHOUSE GAS INTENSITY OF PRODUCTION

It is possible, using an input-output model, to estimate the greenhouse gas emissions associated with the delivery of $\$ 1000$ of a given commodity (that is, a good or a service) to final consumption. ${ }^{1}$ The nature of input-output models is such that both the direct and indirect emissions associated with commodity production can be included in these estimates. Direct emissions are defined as the emissions from the commodity producing industry. Emissions

1. Final consumption includes household consumption expenditure, investment in fixed capital, inventory change, government current expenditure and net exports.
from those industries that supply the producing industry with the inputs used in the commodity's production are defined as indirect emissions. Table 3 shows the direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions associated with the delivery to final consumers of $\$ 1000$ worth of each of 92 unique commodities.

The first value in Table 3 indicates that in 1985 each $\$ 1000$ worth of grain purchased by final consumers resulted in the emission of an estimated 0.8963 t of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ from Canadian industries. The other values shown in Table 3 can be similarly interpreted.

It is interesting to compare the greenhouse gas intensity of various commodities but, before doing so, a note of caution is in order. In many cases, more than one commodity is produced by a given industry. For example, both grains and live animals are produced by the agriculture industry. In these cases, the greenhouse gas intensity of the co-produced commodities will be identical, and will reflect the average intensity of one unit of "production" from the industry regardless of what commodities comprise this production. The reader is warned, then, not to take the rankings of co-produced commodities as absolute, but in-

Table 3: Greenhouse Gas Intensity of Commodities, 1985

| Commodity | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ | $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ | $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | VOC | $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ | CO | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | tonnes per thousand dollars |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | rank |
| 1 Grains | 0.8963 | 1.7768 | 0.0555 | 0.0010 | 0.0054 | 0.0087 | 0.0386 | 28 | 12 |
| 2 Live animals | 0.8963 | 1.7768 | 0.0555 | 0.0010 | 0.0054 | 0.0087 | 0.0386 | 27 | 11 |
| 3 Other agricultural products | 0.8968 | 1.7707 | 0.0549 | 0.0010 | 0.0053 | 0.0087 | 0.0384 | 26 | 13 |
| 4 Forestry products | 0.7561 | 0.8194 | 0.0033 | 0.0001 | 0.0037 | 0.0080 | 0.0255 | 34 | 43 |
| 5 Fish landings | 1.1486 | 1.2268 | 0.0022 | 0.0002 | 0.0091 | 0.0134 | 0.0859 | 19 | 25 |
| 6 Hunting \& trapping products | 1.1486 | 1.2268 | 0.0022 | 0.0002 | 0.0091 | 0.0134 | 0.0859 | 20 | 26 |
| 7 Iron ores \& concentrates | 1.0858 | 1.2866 | 0.0158 | 0.0001 | 0.0019 | 0.0068 | 0.0136 | 23 | 24 |
| 8 Other metal ores \& concentrates | 1.2093 | 1.3826 | 0.0133 | 0.0001 | 0.0020 | 0.0063 | 0.0165 | 17 | 20 |
| 9 Coal | 1.0859 | 1.2867 | 0.0158 | 0.0001 | 0.0019 | 0.0068 | 0.0136 | 22 | 23 |
| 10 Crude mineral oils | 0.4835 | 0.7761 | 0.0266 | 0.0000 | 0.0017 | 0.0071 | 0.0082 | 66 | 46 |
| 11 Natural gas | 0.4871 | 0.7775 | 0.0264 | 0.0000 | 0.0018 | 0.0071 | 0.0083 | 65 | 45 |
| 12 Non-metallic minerals | 0.8894 | 1.0660 | 0.0136 | 0.0001 | 0.0026 | 0.0079 | 0.0134 | 29 | 28 |
| 13 Services incidental to mining | 0.8305 | 0.8795 | 0.0020 | 0.0001 | 0.0042 | 0.0075 | 0.0329 | 30 | 41 |
| 14 Meat products | 0.7083 | 1.0286 | 0.0193 | 0.0004 | 0.0033 | 0.0046 | 0.0198 | 40 | 30 |
| 15 Dairy products | 0.7091 | 1.0272 | 0.0191 | 0.0004 | 0.0032 | 0.0046 | 0.0197 | 39 | 34 |
| 16 Fish products | 0.7115 | 1.0285 | 0.0190 | 0.0004 | 0.0032 | 0.0047 | 0.0201 | 36 | 31 |
| 17 Fruit \& vegetable preparations | 0.7051 | 1.0188 | 0.0187 | 0.0004 | 0.0032 | 0.0046 | 0.0196 | 42 | 36 |
| 18 Feeds | 0.7050 | 1.0165 | 0.0185 | 0.0004 | 0.0032 | 0.0046 | 0.0196 | 43 | 37 |
| 19 Flour, wheat, meal \& other cereals | 0.7093 | 1.0274 | 0.0191 | 0.0004 | 0.0032 | 0.0046 | 0.0197 | 38 | 32 |
| 20 Breakfast cereal \& bakery products | 0.6905 | 0.9618 | 0.0173 | 0.0003 | 0.0032 | 0.0044 | 0.0189 | 45 | 40 |
| 21 Sugar | 0.7093 | 1.0274 | 0.0191 | 0.0004 | 0.0032 | 0.0046 | 0.0197 | 37 | 33 |
| 22 Miscellaneous food products | 0.7061 | 1.0209 | 0.0188 | 0.0004 | 0.0033 | 0.0046 | 0.0197 | 41 | 35 |
| 23 Soft drinks | 0.6271 | 0.6816 | 0.0025 | 0.0001 | 0.0019 | 0.0025 | 0.0092 | 49 | 52 |
| 24 Alcoholic beverages | 0.6270 | 0.6815 | 0.0025 | 0.0001 | 0.0019 | 0.0025 | 0.0092 | 50 | 53 |
| 25 Tobacco, processed unmanufactured | 0.4016 | 0.5012 | 0.0066 | 0.0001 | 0.0017 | 0.0023 | 0.0100 | 78 | 69 |
| 26 Cigarettes \& tobacco, manufactured | 0.4016 | 0.5012 | 0.0066 | 0.0001 | 0.0017 | 0.0023 | 0.0100 | 79 | 70 |
| 27 Tires \& tubes | 0.5814 | 0.6486 | 0.0012 | 0.0002 | 0.0045 | 0.0022 | 0.0053 | 55 | 54 |

Table 3: Greenhouse Gas Intensity of Commodities, 1985

| Commodity |  | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ | $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ | $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | VOC | $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ | CO | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | tonnes per thousand dollars |  |  |  |  |  |  | rank |  |
| 28 | Other rubber products | 0.5595 | 0.6300 | 0.0015 | 0.0002 | 0.0041 | 0.0021 | 0.0054 | 57 | 58 |
| 29 | Plastic fabricated products | 0.6252 | 0.6957 | 0.0015 | 0.0002 | 0.0045 | 0.0022 | 0.0067 | 51 | 51 |
| 30 | Leather \& leather products | 0.3737 | 0.4205 | 0.0018 | 0.0001 | 0.0017 | 0.0015 | 0.0050 | 81 | 77 |
| 31 | Yarns \& man made fibres | 0.6046 | 0.6437 | 0.0011 | 0.0001 | 0.0025 | 0.0018 | 0.0052 | 52 | 55 |
| 32 | Fabrics | 0.5893 | 0.6273 | 0.0010 | 0.0001 | 0.0023 | 0.0017 | 0.0051 | 54 | 59 |
| 33 | Other textile products | 0.5931 | 0.6311 | 0.0010 | 0.0001 | 0.0024 | 0.0018 | 0.0052 | 53 | 56 |
| 34 | Hosiery \& knitted wear | 0.2678 | 0.2788 | 0.0010 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0010 | 0.0038 | 86 | 86 |
| 35 | Clothing \& accessories | 0.2773 | 0.2883 | 0.0010 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0010 | 0.0039 | 85 | 85 |
| 36 | Lumber \& timber | 0.6619 | 0.7076 | 0.0017 | 0.0001 | 0.0067 | 0.0046 | 0.0937 | 46 | 48 |
| 37 | Veneer \& plywood | 0.6588 | 0.7045 | 0.0017 | 0.0001 | 0.0067 | 0.0046 | 0.0951 | 47 | 49 |
| 38 | Other wood fabricated materials | 0.6567 | 0.7024 | 0.0017 | 0.0001 | 0.0065 | 0.0045 | 0.0888 | 48 | 50 |
| 39 | Furniture \& fixtures | 0.4607 | 0.4976 | 0.0009 | 0.0001 | 0.0028 | 0.0017 | 0.0140 | 69 | 71 |
| 40 | Pulp | 1.2551 | 1.3041 | 0.0020 | 0.0001 | 0.0034 | 0.0056 | 0.0192 | 13 | 21 |
| 41 | Newsprint \& other paper stock | 1.2516 | 1.3006 | 0.0020 | 0.0001 | 0.0034 | 0.0056 | 0.0193 | 15 | 22 |
| 42 | Paper products | 1.1080 | 1.1559 | 0.0019 | 0.0001 | 0.0034 | 0.0048 | 0.0167 | 21 | 27 |
| 43 | Printing \& publishing | 0.4115 | 0.4203 | 0.0008 | 0.0000 | 0.0014 | 0.0018 | 0.0068 | 75 | 78 |
| 44 | Advertising \& print media | 0.4024 | 0.4112 | 0.0008 | 0.0000 | 0.0014 | 0.0017 | 0.0067 | 77 | 80 |
| 45 | Iron \& steel products | 1.7957 | 1.8849 | 0.0032 | 0.0002 | 0.0020 | 0.0042 | 0.0296 | 9 | 9 |
| 46 | Aluminum products | 1.8807 | 1.9710 | 0.0033 | 0.0002 | 0.0020 | 0.0044 | 0.0311 | 7 | 7 |
| 47 | Copper \& copper alloy products | 1.8711 | 1.9614 | 0.0033 | 0.0002 | 0.0020 | 0.0044 | 0.0309 | 8 | 8 |
| 48 | Nickel products | 1.8991 | 1.9905 | 0.0034 | 0.0002 | 0.0020 | 0.0045 | 0.0314 | 5 | 6 |
| 49 | Other non ferrous metal products | 1.7604 | 1.8496 | 0.0032 | 0.0002 | 0.0023 | 0.0042 | 0.0287 | 10 | 10 |
| 50 | Boilers, tanks \& plates | 0.6995 | 0.7452 | 0.0017 | 0.0001 | 0.0020 | 0.0020 | 0.0096 | 44 | 47 |
| 51 | Fabricated structural metal products | 0.9377 | 0.9856 | 0.0019 | 0.0001 | 0.0021 | 0.0026 | 0.0139 | 25 | 38 |
| 52 | Other metal fabricated products | 0.7413 | 0.7870 | 0.0017 | 0.0001 | 0.0021 | 0.0021 | 0.0105 | 35 | 44 |
| 53 | Agricultural machinery | 0.4295 | 0.4383 | 0.0008 | 0.0000 | 0.0012 | 0.0013 | 0.0064 | 72 | 74 |
| 54 | Other industrial machinery | 0.5271 | 0.5684 | 0.0013 | 0.0001 | 0.0016 | 0.0017 | 0.0080 | 63 | 64 |
| 55 | Motor vehicles | 0.3313 | 0.3379 | 0.0006 | 0.0000 | 0.0015 | 0.0010 | 0.0046 | 84 | 84 |
| 56 | Motor vehicle parts | 0.3430 | 0.3496 | 0.0006 | 0.0000 | 0.0015 | 0.0011 | 0.0047 | 82 | 82 |
| 57 | Other transport equipment | 0.4242 | 0.4330 | 0.0008 | 0.0000 | 0.0017 | 0.0018 | 0.0064 | 73 | 75 |
| 58 | Household appliances \& receivers | 0.4106 | 0.4194 | 0.0008 | 0.0000 | 0.0014 | 0.0013 | 0.0063 | 76 | 79 |
| 59 | Other electrical products | 0.3807 | 0.3884 | 0.0007 | 0.0000 | 0.0013 | 0.0012 | 0.0059 | 80 | 81 |
| 60 | Cement \& concrete products | 2.7703 | 2.8237 | 0.0024 | 0.0001 | 0.0023 | 0.0072 | 0.0168 | 3 | 3 |
| 61 | Other non-metallic mineral products | 2.5183 | 2.5706 | 0.0023 | 0.0001 | 0.0024 | 0.0066 | 0.0158 | 4 | 4 |
| 62 | Gasoline \& fuel oil | 0.7634 | 0.9730 | 0.0166 | 0.0001 | 0.0037 | 0.0063 | 0.0163 | 33 | 39 |
| 63 | Other petroleum \& coal products | 0.8114 | 1.0458 | 0.0164 | 0.0002 | 0.0052 | 0.0061 | 0.0136 | 32 | 29 |
| 64 | Industrial chemicals | 1.2530 | 1.5681 | 0.0041 | 0.0010 | 0.0151 | 0.0044 | 0.0097 | 14 | 14 |
| 65 | Fertilizers | 1.0299 | 1.5340 | 0.0311 | 0.0006 | 0.0057 | 0.0073 | 0.0237 | 24 | 16 |
| 66 | Pharmaceuticals | 1.2420 | 1.5582 | 0.0042 | 0.0010 | 0.0158 | 0.0043 | 0.0091 | 16 | 15 |
| 67 | Other chemical products | 1.2023 | 1.5218 | 0.0045 | 0.0010 | 0.0148 | 0.0043 | 0.0095 | 18 | 17 |
| 68 | Scientific equipment | 0.4344 | 0.4735 | 0.0011 | 0.0001 | 0.0021 | 0.0016 | 0.0069 | 70 | 73 |
| 69 | Other manufactured products | 0.5485 | 0.5953 | 0.0018 | 0.0001 | 0.0023 | 0.0019 | 0.0083 | 59 | 60 |
| 70 | Residential construction | 0.5311 | 0.5724 | 0.0013 | 0.0001 | 0.0035 | 0.0033 | 0.0231 | 61 | 62 |
| 71 | 1 Non-residential construction | 0.5311 | 0.5724 | 0.0013 | 0.0001 | 0.0035 | 0.0033 | 0.0231 | 60 | 61 |
| 72 | 2 Repair construction | 0.5311 | 0.5724 | 0.0013 | 0.0001 | 0.0035 | 0.0033 | 0.0231 | 62 | 63 |
|  | 3 Pipeline transportation | 1.8972 | 2.0501 | 0.0139 | 0.0000 | 0.0004 | 0.0018 | 0.0024 | 6 | 5 |
| 74 | 4 Transportation \& storage | 1.3950 | 1.4776 | 0.0026 | 0.0002 | 0.0044 | 0.0101 | 0.0258 | 11 | 18 |
|  | 5 Radio \& television broadcasting | 0.2085 | 0.2129 | 0.0004 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0010 | 0.0064 | 91 | 91 |
| 76 | 6 Telephone \& telegraph | 0.2085 | 0.2129 | 0.0004 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0010 | 0.0064 | 90 | 90 |
|  | 7 Postal services | 0.2085 | 0.2129 | 0.0004 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0010 | 0.0064 | 89 | 89 |
|  | 8 Electric power | 4.7870 | 4.8338 | 0.0018 | 0.0001 | 0.0012 | 0.0157 | 0.0098 | 1 | 1 |
|  | 9 Other utilities | 4.7827 | 4.8295 | 0.0018 | 0.0001 | 0.0012 | 0.0156 | 0.0098 | 2 | 2 |
|  | 0 Wholesale margins | 0.4793 | 0.5250 | 0.0017 | 0.0001 | 0.0030 | 0.0027 | 0.0167 | 68 | 66 |
|  | 1 Retail margins | 0.4904 | 0.5025 | 0.0011 | 0.0000 | 0.0018 | 0.0021 | 0.0117 | 64 | 68 |
|  | 2 Imputed rent, owner occupied dwellings | 0.0337 | 0.0348 | 0.0001 | 0.0000 | 0.0002 | 0.0002 | 0.0013 | 92 | 92 |

Table 3: Greenhouse Gas Intensity of Commodities, 1985

| Commodity |  | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ | $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ | $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | VOC | $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ | CO | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | tonnes per thousand dollars |  |  |  |  |  |  | rank |  |
| 83 | Other finance, insurance \& real estate | 0.4206 | 0.4305 | 0.0009 | 0.0000 | 0.0009 | 0.0012 | 0.0049 | 74 | 76 |
| 84 | Business services | 0.2149 | 0.2204 | 0.0005 | 0.0000 | 0.0012 | 0.0011 | 0.0068 | 88 | 88 |
| 85 | Education services | 0.5570 | 0.5658 | 0.0008 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0016 | 0.0050 | 58 | 65 |
| 86 | Health services | 0.2173 | 0.2217 | 0.0004 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0009 | 0.0056 | 87 | 87 |
| 87 | Amusement \& recreation services | 0.3333 | 0.3399 | 0.0006 | 0.0000 | 0.0010 | 0.0012 | 0.0055 | 83 | 83 |
| 88 | Accommodation \& food services | 0.5609 | 0.6308 | 0.0039 | 0.0001 | 0.0011 | 0.0019 | 0.0068 | 56 | 57 |
| 89 | Other personal \& miscellaneous services | 0.4794 | 0.5163 | 0.0009 | 0.0001 | 0.0028 | 0.0021 | 0.0119 | 67 | 67 |
| 90 | Transportation margins | 1.3543 | 1.4099 | 0.0026 | 0.0001 | 0.0042 | 0.0098 | 0.0250 | 12 | 19 |
|  | Operating, office, lab. \& food supplies | 0.4329 | 0.4863 | 0.0024 | 0.0001 | 0.0046 | 0.0020 | 0.0084 | 71 | 72 |
|  | Travel, advertising \& promotion | 0.8121 | 0.8622 | 0.0021 | 0.0001 | 0.0054 | 0.0056 | 0.0350 | 31 | 42 |

${ }^{1} \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions include $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions plus $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ and $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions expressed as equivalent $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions.
stead as general indicators of their greenhouse gas intensity relative to other commodities.

When either $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ or $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emission intensity is considered, electric power (78) was the most polluting commodity produced in the Canadian economy in 1985. "Other utilities" (79) (mainly natural gas and water supply) ranked second. Note that commodity 79 is co-produced with electricity by the electric power and other utilities industry (industry 34 in Table 2). Cement (60) and other nonmetallic mineral products (61) were ranked next. Pipeline transportation (73) and the primary metals - iron and steel (45), aluminum (46), copper (47), nickel (48) and other non-ferrous metals (49) - round out the list of the ten most highly $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ intensive commodities produced in 1985.

The agricultural and food commodities (1-3 and 14-22) show significant increases in intensity when ranked in order of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalents. This change is expected given the large emissions of $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ and $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ from the agriculture industry shown in Table 2 above.

## INDUSTRIAL EMISSIONS BY FINAL DEMAND CATEGORY

Production activity takes place to meet the demand for commodities from final consumers. It is reasonable, then, to ask what portion of total industrial greenhouse gas emissions are attributable to the production required to meet the demand from different final consumption categories. Table 4 shows such a breakdown of industrial greenhouse gas emissions. ${ }^{1}$ As one might expect, production to meet the demand for commodities from households is responsible

[^4]for the greatest portion of industrial greenhouse gas emissions.

Some explanation is required for the row labelled "imports" in Table 4. The emissions reported in this row are not the actual emissions that occurred in other countries during the manufacturing of Canada's imported commodities. Rather, they represent the emissions that would have obtained had we produced domestically, instead of importing, this group of commodities. The assumption implicit in these estimates is that foreign industries emit the same quantities of greenhouse gases in producing one unit of a particular commodity as do Canadian industries.

The results reported in Table 4 indicate that Canada exported a more greenhouse gas intensive set of goods and services than it imported in 1985. Put another way, Canada was a net exporter of greenhouse gas emissions as a result of its international trade.

## $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ EMISSIONS PER UNIT OF ENERGY CONSUMPTION, 1970-1990

It was noted above that greenhouse gas emissions are causally related to fossil fuel consumption. In particular, anthropogenic $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions result mainly from the combustion of fossil fuels.

The magnitude of fuel combustion-related $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions is a function of two variables. Most obviously, the quantity of fossil fuels burned has a direct impact on the magnitude of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions. Less obvious is the effect of the variability of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions per unit of energy across fossil fuel types. Since each fuel type results in different $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions per unit of energy, the composition of overall energy consumption will affect aggregate $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions. A shift in consumption from coal to natural gas, for example, would result in lower $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions, other things equal, since natural gas combustion results in only $55 \%$ as

Table 4: Industrial Greenhouse Gas Emissions by Demand Category, 1985

| Final Demand Category | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equiv. ${ }^{1}$ | $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ | $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | VOC | $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ | CO |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | kilotonnes |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Household expenditure | 127299 | 142198 | 839 | 21 | 402 | 586 | 2060 |
| Investment in fixed capital | 39423 | 41829 | 96 | 5 | 238 | 226 | 1502 |
| Exports | 98433 | 113259 | 906 | 18 | 358 | 502 | 2044 |
| Imports | 69088 | 78550 | 492 | 15 | 298 | 288 | 1105 |
| Government current expenditure | 21685 | 23320 | 75 | 3 | 94 | 103 | 383 |

Note:

1. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions include $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions plus $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ and $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions expressed as equivalent $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions.
much $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ per unit of energy as does the combustion of coal (Jaques, 1992, p. xX).

Figure 1 shows the effect on total fossil fuel combus-tion-related $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions of the changing composition of Canadian energy consumption during the period 19701990. It is clear from this figure that the trend in Canada since 1970 has been toward a less $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ intensive energy mix. $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions per unit of total energy consumption declined at an annual rate of $0.29 \mathrm{t} / \mathrm{J}$ over this period.

Figure 1: Direct $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ Emissions per Unit of Energy Consumption, 1970-1990


The reasons for the decline in the $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ intensity of energy consumption can be seen in Figure 2, which shows the composition of total energy consumption during the period 1970-1990. During the past two decades, the share in Canadian energy consumption of both natural gas and primary electricity (hydro and nuclear) has increased, entirely at the expense of petroleum-based fossil fuels. ${ }^{1}$ Since nat-
ural gas is the least $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ intensive fossil fuel (ibid.), and primary electricity does not result in any direct $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions, this change in energy mix results in the decreasing trend shown in Figure 1. The percentage of consumption met by coal also increased during this period, but not enough to offset the reduction in $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ intensity resulting from the increased share of natural gas and primary electricity.

Figure 2: Composition of Total Energy Consumption, 1970-1990


[^5]
## CONCLUSION

Several useful pieces of information have emerged from the results presented above. Perhaps most important is the highly concentrated nature of industrial greenhouse gas emissions. When considered in terms of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions, the five largest industrial sources accounted for almost $58 \%$ of 1985 industrial emissions. Particularly noteworthy is the fact that the electric power and other utilities industry alone was responsible for $26 \%$ of all industrial emissions. The very large emissions from this industry meant that electricity was the most greenhouse gas intensive commodity in the Canadian economy in 1985. Each $\$ 1000$ worth of electricity delivered to final consumers resulted in the emission of nearly 5 tonnes of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalents.

The importance of transportation activity in total greenhouse gas emissions is also clear from the above analysis. The transportation industry (which includes for-hire land, air and marine transportation services) is the second largest source of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent gas emissions among all industries. This is so even though the emissions from transportation activity undertaken by firms, households or governments on own-account are not included in the estimated emissions from the transportation industry. All told, transportation is a significant source of greenhouse gas emissions.

Households also appear as very important sources of greenhouse gas emissions. The consumption of commodities by households contributed almost $22 \%$ of economywide $1985 \mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions. On top of this are the 142 Mt of $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ equivalent emissions, or $44 \%$ of total industrial emissions (see Table 4), that are associated with the production of commodities ultimately purchased by households. This is not meant to imply that households are solely responsible for the greenhouse gases emitted during the production of the commodities they purchase; the responsibility for these emissions must be shared between the consumers who demand the commodities and the industries that meet this demand. Nonetheless, it serves to highlight the importance of household consumption in overall greenhouse gas emissions.

To conclude, it can be said that the input-output accounting and modelling frameworks have proven to be useful tools for the analysis of greenhouse gas emissions. The majority of anthropogenic greenhouse gas emissions have been included in the input-output model used here and some interesting results have followed. However, where the nature of emissions is such that there exists no linear and constant relationship to annual economic activity, specifically in the cases of CFCs and landfill methane emissions, the input-output framework alone is inappropriate. Future work will require the development of extensions to the framework that will allow the incorporation of emissions that are sporadic, stock driven or otherwise related in an non-linear way to human activity.

## DATA SOURCES AND EMISSION ESTIMATION METHOD

The gases considered in this study include carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide, volatile organic compounds (VOC), nitric oxide and nitrogen dioxide (collectively, $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ ) and carbon monoxide (CO).

Chlorofluorocarbons are notable for their absence in this list. The reason for this absence is explained briefly a few paragraphs below. Also missing from the list is tropospheric ozone $\left(\mathrm{O}_{3}\right)^{1}$, another powerful greenhouse gas. Tropospheric ozone has been excluded because it is not emitted to an appreciable extent as a by-product of economic activity. Instead, it is formed in the troposphere through chemical reactions involving the precursor gases VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ and CO, all of which are emitted in large quantities as by-products of economic activities.

The method and coefficients used in the estimation of the 1985 emissions of carbon dioxide, methane and nitrous oxide have been adopted from an Environment Canada report titled Canada's Greenhouse Gas Emissions Estimates for 1990 (Jaques, 1992). The $\mathrm{CO}_{2}, \mathrm{CH}_{4}$ and $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ emission estimates reported here are, with some important differences, directly comparable with those published for 1990 by Environment Canada.

The first, and most obvious, difference between the estimates reported here and those reported by Environment Canada is that the former are for the year 1985, while the latter are for the year 1990. It was not possible to use 1990 as the base year for this study as no input-output tables for that year are yet available. 1985 was chosen instead, because of the availability of a good inventory of VOC, NOx and CO emissions.

More significant than the choice of a different base year is the exclusion of CFC emissions in the present study. This exclusion is due in part to a lack of data to establish the link between CFC emissions and economic activity at the detailed level represented in the input-output tables. It is also a function of the somewhat inflexible nature of the input-output structure which only allows the modelling of greenhouse gas emissions with constant and linear relationships to annual economic activity. Many types of CFC emissions do not meet this criterion. In any given year CFC emissions are, to a large extent, determined by the stock of the chemicals that has accumulated in prior years and, therefore, bear little relationship to economic activity in that year. ${ }^{2}$

A third departure is the exclusion here of several emission sources included in the Environment Canada report. These have been excluded mainly because of the afore-

[^6]mentioned lack of data and/or inflexibility of the input-output framework. With respect to $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$, emissions from nonenergy uses of petroleum products other than ammonia production (1990 estimate: approximately 10000 kt ) have been excluded, as well as all biomass related $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions. ${ }^{1}$ The following sources of $\mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions have also been excluded: waste incineration (<2 kt), landfill sites (1 405 kt ) and slash burning ( 38 kt ). As already noted, landfill sites account for $38 \%$ of the total $1990 \mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions estimated by Environment Canada (Jaques, 1992; p. xviii). Thus, the estimated total $1985 \mathrm{CH}_{4}$ emissions reported here are significantly lower than Environment Canada's 1990 estimate. Finally, the emissions of $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ from nitric acid production, anaesthetics, propellants and high-voltage transmission lines have all been excluded here. These sources account for less than one percent of total 1990 $\mathrm{N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ emissions estimated by Environment Canada.

The last departure from Environment Canada's 1990 greenhouse gas inventory is the inclusion of VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ and CO . Only $\mathrm{CO}_{2}, \mathrm{CH}_{4}, \mathrm{~N}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ and CFC emissions are estimated in the former. The inclusion VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ and CO yields more complete information and is not without precedent. A major international body engaged in research on global warming, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, includes these gases in its list of greenhouse gases (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, 1992), as does the International Energy Agency of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (International Energy Agency, 1991). For the sake of completeness and because of the international precedents, it was decided that VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ and CO should be included in this study.
. The estimated total VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ and CO emissions reported in this study match those reported in the Canadian Emissions Inventory of Common Air Contaminants (1985) (Kosteltz and Deslauriers, 1990 and Deslauriers, Personal communication) with, again, some important differences. The most significant of these is the exclusion of the following emission sources in the present study: forest fires (201 kt VOC, 37 kt NO ${ }_{x}, 1141$ kt CO); slash burning ( 96 kt VOC, $20 \mathrm{kt} \mathrm{NO} \mathrm{x}_{\mathrm{x}} 1134 \mathrm{kt} \mathrm{CO}$ ); structural fires ( 6 kt VOC, 12 kt CO ); and municipal and industrial incineration ( 6 kt VOC, 2 $\mathrm{kt} \mathrm{NO}_{x}, 9 \mathrm{kt} \mathrm{CO}$ ). These sources have been excluded because they are not related in a linear and constant way to identifiable economic activity.

Another difference with the Environment Canada study, of less importance, is the modified procedure for es-

1. Biomass emission sources include the combustion of wood and spent pulping liquor wastes at pulp and lumber mills; slash burning; forest fires; fuelwood combustion; municipal and industrial waste incineration; and landfill sites. Environment Canada excludes these emissions from the estimated total $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions reported in Canada's Greenhouse Gas Emissions Estimates for 1990 because of uncertainty in estimating the magnitude of the corresponding natural sink for $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ (such as growing forests). Because it did not have a reliable estimate of both the biomass sink and source terms, Environment Canada felt it misleading to include only biomass $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ sources in its estimated total emissions. The estimated magnitude of biomass $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ emissions in 1990 is 109 Mt
(Jaques, 1992, p. xviii).
timating VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ and CO emissions from heavy duty road vehicles (trucks and buses) used in this study. In spite of this, the estimated emissions from these vehicles are in good agreement in the two studies. Furthermore, since heavy duty road vehicles contribute a relatively small proportion of the total emissions of these three gases, the differences in these estimates have little effect on the estimated total emissions. The estimated emissions of VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{x}}$ and CO from government activities are higher than those reported in the other study, also because of a different estimation method. Again, the effect of this difference on total emissions is very small.

It should be emphasized that, the exclusion of the major emission sources mentioned above notwithstanding, the estimated total 1985 VOC, $\mathrm{NO}_{x}$ and CO emissions reported here agree closely with those published in the Canadian Emissions Inventory of Common Air Contaminants (1985).

## APPENDIX

The input-output accounts published by Statistics Canada contain detailed information on annual production and consumption activities in the Canadian economy. The accounts consist of three tables. A "make" table lists the dollar values of all commodities produced by each Canadian industry. A "use" table details the purchases of these same commodities by industries for use as inputs in the production of other commodities. These purchases are referred to as intermediate commodity use. A "final demand" table lists the dollar values of commodities purchased by households and governments, investment in fixed capital, inventory change and net exports (exports less imports). The structure of the input-output accounts is such that there exists an identity between total commodity production (from the make table) and intermediate plus final consumption (from the use and final demand tables).

Using the three tables of the input-output accounts, and given two assumptions regarding the structure of production activity, it is possible to derive linear models (called input-output models) of the relationship between final commodity use and the levels of production activity required to meet this use.

A useful quality of input-output models is their ability to capture both the direct and indirect impacts of final demand on production activity. The impact of the demand for automobiles on the output of the automobile industry is a good example. As the demand for automobiles changes, the output of the automobile industry will adjust to reflect this change. This is an example of a direct impact of demand on production activity. There are, however, further impacts that will result from a change in the demand for cars. The steel industry, for instance, will also see the demand for its product affected by such a change. The change in demand for steel is an example of an indirect impact of demand on
production activity. Such indirect demands can propagate through many industries of as a result of a change in the demand for just one commodity. Input-output models capture all these changes automatically, estimating the effect of a change in the demand for one or more commodities across the entire spectrum of economic activity.

There are some limitations on input-output modelling that should be noted. Most significant are the "snapshot" representation of the economy in the input-output accounts, and the assumption of fixed proportionality between the inputs employed in production processes and the outputs of these processes. To the extent that technological change is present in the economy, the first assumption limits the capacity of input-output models for accurately predicting future economic activity. Thus, the technique is most useful for studying the impact of demand changes in a given year or, at most, a few years into the future. The second assumption limits the accuracy of input-output models for impact analysis in any time period, as the capacity for input substitution that exists in the actual economy is not captured in the constant-proportion input-output framework.

Beyond purely economic analysis, input-output modelling can also be used to study the relationship between economic activity and the use of raw materials and generation of wastes. To do so requires two modifications to the standard conception of the input-output accounts. First, it is necessary to introduce physical quantities into the inputoutput framework. Second, the framework must be expanded beyond its normal market-activity boundary to include the non-marketed inputs and outputs of economic activity. Once these changes to the accounting framework are made, the incorporation of environmental inputs and outputs into the framework is conceptually no different than the incorporation of any marketed input or output. Just as industries produce commodities for the marketplace, they also produce waste materials that can be released into the environment. Similarly, just as industries purchase commodities for use in their production processes, they also make use of non-marketed inputs from the environment, air and water for example. It is possible to incorporate tables showing the inputs and outputs of these environmental commodities, in physical quantities, into the standard inputoutput framework. Assuming that these environmental commodities are produced and consumed in fixed proportion to the production and consumption of marketed commodities, a set of input-output accounts so modified can be used to study the relationship between production, consumption and the use of the environment as a source of raw materials and a sink for wastes.

## REFERENCES

Deslauriers, M. Personal communication. October, 1991.
Government of Canada. Canada's Green Plan for a Healthy Environment. Ottawa, 1990.

Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. 1992 IPCC Supplement (Draft). In press. 1992.

International Energy Agency. Greenhouse Gas Emissions: The Energy Dimension. Paris: Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development/International Energy Agency. 1991.

Jaques, A. P. Canada's Greenhouse Gas Emissions: Estimates for 1990. Environment Canada Report EPS 5/AP/4, Ottawa, 1992.

Kosteltz, A. and M. Deslauriers. Canadian Emissions Inventory of Common Air Contaminants (1985). Environment Canada Report EPS 5/AP/3, Ottawa, 1990.
Statistics Canada. The Input-Output Structure of the Canadian Economy, 1985. Catalogue No. 15-201, Ottawa, 1989.
Victor, Peter A. Pollution: Economy and Environment. United Kingdom: George Allen and Unwin Ltd. 1972.

# 3 Pulp and Paper Industry Compliance Costs 

by Craig Gaston

## INTRODUCTION

The pulp and paper industry is currently under considerable scrutiny by environmentalists, regulators and the general public. This resource based industry is the main livelihood for over 76,000 Canadians and has a long history as one of Canada's most important economic activities. The industry has made significant progress over the last 20 years in reducing pollution but as the volume of production has increased and our ability to study the composition and the effects of the pollutants has improved, regulations have become more stringent. The increased concern over pollution comes at a time when U.S. customers are demanding a higher recycled fibre content in newsprint and European buyers are beginning to give preference to paper that has not been bleached with chlorine. These pressures translate necessarily into expensive capital expenditures and coincide with a period of weak demand and increasingly strong competition.

## BACKGROUND

Canadian mills are often criticized for being old and inefficient. Fifty-eight percent of Canadian newsprint machines commenced operation prior to 1950 compared to $28 \%$ in the U.S. and $7 \%$ in Scandinavia. Also, $15 \%$ of annual production capacity is greater than 400 tonnes a year in Canada compared to $30 \%$ in the U.S., $80 \%$ in Sweden, $40 \%$ in Finland and $20 \%$ in Norway (Sinclair, 1990). Industry analysts claim that Canadian companies must modernize, shift to higher value products such as fine papers, and invest in pulp and paper mills outside of Canada (Headlam and Stevenson, 1990, p. 43).

This study examines the estimated cost of compliance to the 1992 federal regulations on traditional pollutants. How do compliance costs vary according to the type of treatment facility in place? What effect does the age of a mill have on estimated expenditures? How do these costs vary according to region, type of product, capacity, profitability, recent investment or foreign control? The aim of this chapter is to shed light on the nature of the pulp and paper pollution problem in Canada and on how the industry will be affected by certain federal regulations which take effect this year.

## Economic Importance of Pulp and Paper

The pulp and paper industry comprised 82 firms which operated 147 mills in 1989. Although concentrated in Quebec, Ontario and British Columbia, plants are located in every province with the exception of Prince Edward Island. In terms of value added, the industry ranks first among all manufacturing industries in Canada, followed by the automobile industry. The industry has declined in relative importance since the fifties, when it accounted for $5.3 \%$ of GDP, to $1.4 \%$ of GDP in 1989. Canada ranks second in the world in terms of wood pulp production, and first in terms of exports of this commodity. Pulp and paper products accounted for $15 \%$ of total exports and $0.6 \%$ of employment in 1990.

The industry is currently under considerable financial pressure due to a combination of economic and environmental factors. The recent recession has resulted in many temporary mill shutdowns and several permanent closings. Environmentally, U.S. customers' increasing insistence upon recycled paper content and stricter pollution regulations portend large capital expenditures for de-inking mills and pollution abatement equipment.

## Environmental Concerns

The pulp and paper industry is the focus of considerable attention due to its environmental impact. In 1987, waste discharges from the pulp and paper industry were the major industry-related environmental concern in British Columbia and New Brunswick according to provincial environmental authorities (Sinclair, 1990, p. 177). In Ontario and Quebec, the industry ranked third amongst polluting industries and only the chemical industry (a major supplier to the pulp and paper industry) and the mining industry were rated as high as the pulp and paper industry Canada-wide (Sinclair, 1990, p. 177). The industry has, however, made substantial environmental improvements over the last 20 years.

Water pollution has received most of the attention accorded to pulp and paper mills. The industry is not "... a significant contributor to global air pollution problems, such as acid rain or warming. Its [air pollution] problems are very localized and most likely nuisance odour-type problems" (Paul Shepson in Jamieson, 1991, p. 12). Pollution discharged to water consists mainly of wood particles too small to be filtered, organic material (mainly lignin) from the wood and waste chemicals used in the pulping and bleaching process. The wood particles, measured as total suspended solids (TSS), upset the aquatic habitat and ruin fish spawning beds. The dissolved organic material decomposes and in the process uses oxygen thereby reducing the ability of the water to support life. This potential is generally measured as biochemical oxygen demand (BOD) expressed in kilograms per tonne of product. Other organic materials such as resins, fatty acids and sulphur com-
pounds are acutely toxic to fish. Mills that use elemental chlorine for bleaching have also been identified as a significant source of dioxins and furans, which are discharged in the wastewater (Environment Canada, 1991, p. 14-19). Environment Canada considers these substances to be highly toxic.

## Regulation

The pulp and paper industry is currently faced with new federal regulations governing the release of various pollutants. From 1971 until 1991 only new mills or mills that underwent significant expansion were subject to restrictions under the Fisheries Act. The new constraints, introduced in 1992 and effective in December 1992, apply to all mills (although the criteria are somewhat different for mills discharging their effluent to off-site treatment facilities). The 1992 federal regulations, under the authority of the Fisheries Act, apply to the discharge of BOD, TSS, and effluents acutely lethal to fish. New regulations were also established under the authority of the Canadian Environmental Protection Act (CEPA) requiring the elimination of dioxins and furans from the effluent of pulp and paper mills performing chlorine bleaching. Regulations controlling defoamers and wood chip insecticides were also implemented under CEPA. Some provinces have also passed regulations limiting or banning organochlorines, a whole class of compounds which result from chlorine bleaching and which include dioxins and furans. This study examines the costs related to the abatement of TSS, BOD, and toxicity. Only mills that discharge effluent directly to receiving waters are examined here.

## Treatment Facilities for Traditional Pollutants

Primary treatment facilities remove from 80 to $90 \%$ of the settleable portion of the suspended solids, usually by means of gravity clarifiers or settling basins. Secondary treatment is designed to remove BOD associated with the dissolved organic materials in the effluent, and normally uses a biological process. In Canada, aerated lagoons are most often used for secondary treatment. The objectives of this process are to reduce the BOD by $70 \%$ to $95 \%$ and to
render the effluent non-toxic to fish. Although these facilities do reduce toxicity they are not effective in eliminating dioxins and furans.

The estimated capital cost to pulp and paper mills to be in compliance with the 1992 regulations is $\$ 2.2$ billion ( 1990 dollars) or about $\$ 23$ million per mill. This cost can vary from over $\$ 100$ thousand to $\$ 100$ million depending upon the circumstances of an individual establishment (Department of Fisheries and Oceans, 1991). By way of comparison, the average annual investment from 1978 to 1989 by mills in this study was $\$ 16.8$ million per mill in 1989 dollars.

Table 1 shows that most pulp and paper mills in this study had primary treatment facilities in 1989 (84\%). In 1989, only $30 \%$ of the mills in the sample had secondary treatment facilities. On average, mills without secondary treatment produced over 34 kg of BOD per tonne whereas those with these facilities generated effluent containing 8.8 kg per tonne, just over the 1992 federal limit of 5 kg per tonne. On average, the mills considered here generate 11.4 kg of TSS per tonne while the new limit is 7.5 kg per tonne.

Table 1: Treatment Facilities, 1989

| Treatment facilities | Mills | TSS | BOD | Capacity |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| None | number | kg per tonne |  | tonnes per day |
|  | 20 | 19.3 | 17.2 | 379 |
| Primary only | 67 | 8.9 | 34.2 | 600 |
| Primary and secondary | 37 | 9.9 | 8.8 | 784 |
| All direct discharge mills | 124 | 11.4 | 23.9 | 619 |

The variation in BOD factors by region reflects, to a large degree, the use of secondary treatment. Table 2 shows that only $13 \%$ of Quebec mills had secondary treatment facilities in 1989 and the BOD factors were highest in this province. Similarly, Prairie province mills had the lowest average BOD factor and the highest incidence of secondary treatment.

Table 2: Attributes of Mills by Region

| Region | Mills | Mills with treatment facilities |  | Effluent |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Primary | Secondary | TSS | BOD | TSS | BOD |
|  | number | percentage |  | kg per tonne per mill |  | thousand tonnes per day (all mills) |  |
| Atlantic Provinces | 19 | 81 | 25 | 13.6 | 24.5 | 118 | 215 |
| Quebec | 49 | 82 | 13 | 11.9 | 28.5 | 220 | 888 |
| Ontario | 27 | 96 | 27 | 4.6 | 19.1 | 75 | 304 |
| Prairie Provinces | 6 | 100 | 85 | 27.9 | 12.2 | 88 | 304 39 |
| British Columbia | 23 | 81 | 52 | 12.6 | 21.9 | 234 | 383 |
| Canada | 124 | 84 | 30 | 11.4 | 23.9 | 735 | 1829 |

Environment Canada, Regulatory Affairs and Program Integration Branch.

The inverse relationship between BOD factors and the incidence of secondary treatment is not perfect, however, as shown by British Columbia where the BOD factor is almost the same as the Canadian average and more than half the mills have secondary treatment facilities. Process type is another important variable in explaining BOD factors.

## COST OF COMPLIANCE TO RECENT FEDERAL REGULATIONS ${ }^{1}$

It is possible to assess the financial impact of the 1992 federal pollution regulations on pulp and paper mills by examining the estimated compliance costs ${ }^{2}$ in the light of historical investment and earnings.

Traditionally, measures related to the pulp and paper industry are expressed in terms of a tonne of final product. This measure is widely understood by industry experts but it does not provide an intuitive appreciation for the actual impact of the required expenditures in relation to a mill's earnings. In this study we will examine the compliance costs relative to average annual investment in new plant and equipment and to average annual surplus ${ }^{3}$. In both cases we have calculated averages over time to avoid the cyclical variation which is inherent in data pertaining to this industry. The averages are based upon 12 years of data in the case of investment and 9 years for surplus. The data have been recalculated in 1989 dollars.

We will examine two ratios. The first is the capital cost of compliance per dollar of average investment by each mill. This ratio can be thought of as the number of years of average equivalent investment (AEI). The second ratio is the annualized capital cost plus operating cost per dollar of average surplus ${ }^{4}$, hereafter referred to as the annualized cost ratio (ACR). The AEI is interesting in that it shows the impact of the estimated pollution abatement costs in terms of recent historical investment but it is incomplete since the investment in a mill does not reflect a mill's profitability. Table 3 shows that the ratio of average investment to average surplus increases with decreasing surplus suggesting that there is a minimum amount of investment required for a mill to remain competitive and that more profitable mills can distribute a larger proportion of profits as dividends. Of the

[^7]two ratios, the ACR is perhaps the best measure of the impact of the regulations on a mill.

The AEI seems to be independent of the level of the ACR. However, it is clear that the overall compliance costs per dollar of surplus are inversely proportional to the ACR.

The average capital cost of compliance per mill is estimated at $\$ 25.7$ million in 1989 dollars compared to $\$ 17.0$ million of average investment. This is equal to 1.5 years of average equivalent investment (AEI). Average estimated annualized cost per mill is $\$ 4.4$ million or $7.9 \%$ of the average annual surplus of $\$ 55.3$ million.

## Presence of Treatment Facilities

One of the most important factors determining compliance costs is whether a mill has already invested in treatment facilities. Twenty one mills already equipped with primary and secondary facilities must invest, on average, almost $\$ 13$ million. This amount represents about half of a year's average equivalent investment. In comparison, 13 mills with no treatment facilities must invest almost $\$ 27$ million or 2.2 years of AEI. This difference results from the combination of higher capital costs and lower average investment for mills without facilities. In terms of the ACR, mills with both types of facility must spend $3 \%$ of surplus annually compared to $14 \%$ for mills with no facilities. The majority of the mills considered here have primary treatment facilities only.

## Capacity

Mill capacity does not seem to be a factor in terms of the years of AEI needed to comply with the regulations except for the smallest mills for which the AEI is 4.69 years. However, there is a clear correlation between mill size and the ACR which ranges from $6 \%$ for mills producing more than 1000 tonnes per day to $19.5 \%$ for the smallest mills producing less than 200 tonnes per day.

Although there are important economies of scale in this industry, they do not seem to be related to mill capacity. It is the size of the pulp and paper machines that matters: the total output can be produced by one large machine or two or more small ones. From Table 3 it can be seen that mills producing fewer than 300 tonnes per day were substantially less profitable than average yet so were the mills producing between 620 and 800 tonnes per day. The best performing mills had a daily capacity of between 300 and 620 tonnes per day. These mills had an average surplus of $\$ 247$ per tonne compared to only $\$ 232$ per tonne for mills producing over 1000 tonnes per day. Mills producing in the range of 620 to 800 tonnes per day are particularly notable, given their size, their relatively high compliance costs and low profitability representing an ACR of $13 \%$.

Table 3: Cost of Compliance and Other Measures

|  | Mills | Capacity | BOD | Mills with secondary utilities | Average Average investment surplus |  | $\begin{array}{rr}\text { Investment } & \begin{array}{r}\text { Surplus } \\ \text { over } \\ \text { over }\end{array} \\ \text { surplus production }\end{array}$ |  | Compliance costs |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Capital |  | Annualized |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  | Operating | Over production | A.E.I. | A.C.R. |
|  | number | tonnes <br> per day | kg per tonne | percent | millions of | dollars |  | dollars per dollar | dollars per $\qquad$ | millions | of dollars | dollars per tonne | years | percent of surplus |
| All mills | 86 | 721 | 30.2 | 24.4 | 17.0 | 55.3 | 0.31 | 227 | 25.7 | 2.3 | 18.0 | 1.51 | 7.9 |
| Treatment |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| None | 13 | 504 | 21.5 | ... | 12.3 | 35.5 | 0.35 | 223 | 27.2 | 2.8 | 31.4 | 2.22 | 14.1 |
| Primary only | 52 | 693 | 40.6 | ... | 15.9 | 53.5 | 0.30 | 226 | 30.5 | 2.6 | 21.7 | 1.92 | 9.1 |
| Primary \& sec. | 21 | 925 | 9.8 | 100.0 | 22.5 | 72.1 | 0.31 | 230 | 12.8 | 1.1 | 6.8 | 0.57 | 2.9 |
| Capacity (tonnes per day) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Over 1000 | 17 | 1428 | 24.0 | 41.2 | 27.9 | 111.1 | 0.25 | 232 | 38.3 | 3.5 | 13.8 | 1.37 | 5.9 |
| 800 to 1000 | 14 | 885 | 33.9 | 28.6 | 23.4 | 66.2 | 0.35 | 210 | 28.7 | 2.3 | 14.7 | 1.23 | 7.0 |
| 620 to 800 | 9 | 706 | 43.4 | 44.4 | 24.2 | 46.9 | 0.52 | 198 | 39.0 | 3.1 | 26.8 | 1.61 | 13.5 |
| 300 to 620 | 34 | 478 | 32.3 | 14.7 | 11.4 | 40.0 | 0.29 | 247 | 21.0 | 1.9 | 22.1 | 1.84 | 13.5 |
| 200 to 300 | 8 | 273 | 21.1 | 12.5 | 5.7 | 16.7 | 0.34 | 207 | 7.9 | 1.4 | 25.6 | 1.39 | 12.3 |
| Under 200 | 4 | 136 | 13.8 | 0.0 | 1.3 | 6.6 | 0.20 | 228 | 6.2 | 0.8 | 44.4 | 4.69 | 19.5 |
| Year built |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Before 1900 | 8 | 365 | 14.0 | 0.0 | 8.6 | 30.3 | 0.28 | 256 | 13.8 | 1.1 | 193 | 1.61 |  |
| 1900 to 1971 | 64 | 769 | 35.6 | 18.8 | 18.8 | 59.6 | 0.32 | 226 | 29.4 | 2.7 | 19.2 | 1.61 1.56 | 7.5 8.5 |
| After 1971 | 7 | 619 | 9.0 | 100.0 | 15.2 | 49.2 | 0.31 | 232 | 5.1 | 0.4 | 3.9 | 0.34 | 1.7 |
| Product |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Integrated kraft | 15 | 1127 | 16.2 | 46.7 | 21.2 | 89.5 | 0.24 | 241 | 29.9 | 2.7 | 13.7 | 1.41 |  |
| Market kraft | 19 | 746 | 18.1 | 47.4 | 17.6 | 58.9 | 0.30 | 222 | 20.3 | 1.6 | 13.7 | 1.41 <br> 1.15 | 5.7 |
| Mechanical | 5 | 457 | 11.9 | 20.0 | 17.1 | 27.9 | 0.61 | 176 | 12.5 | 2.0 | 18.8 | 1.15 | 5 |
| Newsprint | 29 | 757 | 36.2 | 6.9 | 17.8 | 62.2 | 0.29 | 237 | 30.4 | 2.6 | 19.6 | 1.70 | 10.7 |
| Other paper and board | 9 | 250 | 10.7 | 11.1 | 3.2 | 16.3 | 0.19 | 227 | 4.5 | 2.6 0.5 | 11.8 | 1.43 | 8.2 5.2 |
| Sulphite, semichemical and dissolving | 9 | 497 | 89.2 | 11.1 | 19.4 | 22.9 | 0.85 | 159 | 43.2 | 4.0 | 52.5 | 2.23 | 33.1 |
| Region |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Atlantic Provinces | 11 | 713 | 31.8 | 27.3 | 17.7 | 47.3 | 0.37 | 190 | 25.2 | 2.0 | 16.4 | 1.42 | 8.6 |
| Quebec | 36 | 615 | 35.1 | 8.3 | 15.7 | 49.3 | 0.32 | 242 | 27.3 | 2.1 | 21.4 | 1.74 | 8.9 |
| Ontario | 17 | 635 | 27.2 | 11.8 | 11.6 | 52.5 | 0.22 | 250 | 19.7 | 2.2 | 18.4 | 1.74 | 8.9 |
| Prairie Provinces | 4 | 633 | 14.5 | 75.0 | 26.5 | 53.5 | 0.49 | 211 | 10.2 | 2.2 1.2 | 18.2 | 1.70 | 7.3 |
| B.C. coastal | 9 | 1214 | 40.8 | 33.3 | 29.2 | 99.8 | 0.29 | 229 | 55.0 | 5.1 | 8.1 | 0.39 | 3.8 |
| B.C. interior | 9 | 865 | 10.5 | 77.8 | 14.9 | 50.6 | 0.29 | 193 | 8.6 | 5.1 | 22.1 | 1.89 | 9.7 |
| Investment |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Capital > average | 31 | 1052 | 32.8 | 32.3 | 32.0 | 84.3 | 0.38 | 230 | 38.5 | 3.5 | 18.2 | 120 |  |
| Capital < average | 55 | 535 | 28.7 | 20.0 | 8.5 | 39.0 | 0.22 | 224 | 18.5 | 1.6 | 17.7 | 2.20 | 7.9 |
| Control |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Canadian | 54 | 661 | 34.3 | 16.7 | 15.0 | 48.0 | 0.31 | 221 | 26.5 | 22 |  |  |  |
| Foreign | 32 | 823 | 23.2 | 37.5 | 20.2 | 67.7 | 0.30 | 234 | 24.2 | 2.3 | 20.4 14.9 | 1.20 | 9.2 |
| Surplus (dollars per tonne) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Over 250 | 22 | 709 | 28.1 | 36.4 | 17.1 | 75.7 | 0.23 | 299 | 26.1 | 23 |  |  |  |
| 200 to 250 | 21 | 953 | 23.0 | 19.0 | 19.0 | 78.1 | 0.24 | 237 | 28.6 | 2.7 | 17.4 | 1.52 1.50 | 5.8 |
| 160 to 200 | 22 | 696 | 35.8 | 18.2 | 17.9 | 46.8 | 0.38 | 196 | 26.9 | 2.7 2.3 | 15.3 | 1.50 | 6.5 |
| Under 160 | 21 | 528 | 33.6 | 23.8 | 13.8 | 20.1 | 0.69 | 132 | 21.0 | 2.3 | 18.8 | 1.51 | 9.6 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.
Environment Canada, Regulatory Affairs and Program Integration Branch.

## Age and Modernization

The year that a mill was built does not necessarily dictate its efficiency or its pollution abatement except for mills which were built since 1971 when the first federal regulations came into effect. This fact is illustrated by the very low ACR (2\%) for milis built since 1971 compared to $8.5 \%$ for mills built between 1900 and 1971. Those built prior to 1900 must spend, on average, $7 \%$ of annual surplus to be in compliance. It is interesting to note that the surplus per tonne of capacity was almost the same for recent mills and older mills, confirming that the actual age of the mill is not an important variable in profitability.

On the other hand, if modernization can be equated to a high level of investment averaged over the last 12 years then mills with above average investment might be expected to perform better and generate less pollution. This tendency exists to some extent as the surplus per tonne of capacity was $\$ 230$ for high investors compared to $\$ 224$ for low investors. The latter group of mills have a much smaller capacity ( 535 tonnes compared to 1052 tonnes per day). Although the mills with above average investment have a higher percentage of secondary treatment facilities (32\% compared to $20 \%$ ) their BOD factors are slightly higher. This reflects the fact that the smaller mills are less likely to produce their own pulp. Both groups of mills must spend $8 \%$ of their surplus annually to comply with the regulations, indicating that higher investment did not generally put mills in a better position with respect to compliance costs.

## Product

The indicators by product category are very uneven, reflecting the underlying production processes and the presence of secondary treatment facilities. This latter variable, however, seems to be linked to the type of process. For instance, half of the producers of market kraft pulp in this sample have secondary treatment facilities yet their capital costs per tonne of product are higher than those of other paper and board mills, $11 \%$ of which have secondary facilities. Since the latter generally do not produce their own pulp, their BOD factors are low.

Although the AEI is much below average for mechanical pulp mills, these mills have one of the highest ACRs due to relatively high operating costs and a lower than average surplus per tonne of product. By far the highest compliance costs per doliar of surplus have been estimated for mills producing sulphite, semi-chemical or dissolving pulps. These mills generate a very high level of BOD and have a lower than average percentage of secondary facilities. Their required capital costs per tonne of product are three times the average and their surplus per tonne is $30 \%$ less than the average. These factors result in an ACR of $33 \%$ for the 9 mills in this category. These milis have an important impact on other characteristics in Table 3.

## Region

Regionally, Quebec producers face the highest absolute compliance costs but they also produce more pulp and paper than those in other regions. Quebec mills account for $44 \%$ of the total capital costs of compliance but in terms of costs per dollar of surplus, mills on the Pacific coast ${ }^{1}$ are the most affected. Average capital costs per mill in Quebec are estimated at $\$ 27$ million, or about 1.7 years of $A E 1$ compared to 1.9 years for British Columbia coastal mills and only 0.4 years for mills in the Prairie provinces.

For the ACR, the pattern is similar although the differences between the regions are less marked. Mills in the Prairie provinces and the interior of British Columbia must spend $3 \%$ of surplus annually while mills on the Pacific coast must devote $10 \%$. According to this measure there is little difference between mills in Eastern Canada despite the fact that Quebec has the lowest percentage of mills already equipped with secondary treatment facilities. The relatively low average surplus per tonne of product during the eighties in the Atlantic provinces and in the British Columbia interior mills increases this measure compared to other regions. In contrast, the above average surplus in Ontario reduces the relative impact of compliance costs in this province.

## Control

The average capital and operating compliance costs are much the same for Canadian and foreign controlmd mills yet the former were somewhat less profitable and thus had higher compliance costs relative to surplus. The 54 Canadian controlled mills had an AEl of 1.8 compared to 1.2 for the 32 foreign controlled mills.

The ratio of average investment to average surplus is very similar for both groups despite the higher surplus per tonne of product for the foreign controlled mills. (As shown in Table 3 for all mills considered here, there is generally an inverse relationship between level of surplus and this ratio). Average investment is indeed larger for foreign controlled mills but they are also larger and the investment per tonne of capacity is similar. There is no indication, therefore, that foreign controlled mills are less inclined to reinvest their earnings. On the other hand, the higher percentage of secondary treatment in foreign controlled establishments does not necessarily reflect a higher expenditure on pollution abatement. It would be necessary to examine the historical ownership records to determine this.

[^8]
## Mills in Compliance

The mills that are deemed to have no costs resulting from the 1992 federal regulations on traditional pollutants are smaller, less profitable and had a higher investment per tonne of production than those for which such expenditures were assessed (Table 4). The low surplus per tonne of these mills seems to be mainly related to their product. These mills do not, by and large, produce newsprint or kraft pulp, products that generated a relatively high surplus per tonne during the eighties.

## Table 4: Characteristics of Mills With and Without Compliance Costs

|  | With <br> compliance <br> costs | Without <br> compliance <br> costs |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| Number of mills | 86 | 25 |
| Average capacity (tonnes per day) | 721 | 408 |
| Average surptus (dollars per tonne) | 210 | 169 |
| Average investment (doliars per tonne) | 64 | 104 |
| Number with secondary facilites (percent) | 24 | 48 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.
Environment Canada, Fegulatory Affairs and Program Integration Branch.

## CONCLUSIONS

On average, mills not in compliance with the new federal regulations must spend an estimated $8 \%$ of operating surplus annually to purchase and operate the required treatment facilities. This percentage is inversely correlated with the production capacity of the mill and is strongly related to the type of product and the amount and type of pollution abatement equipment already in place. Although Eastern Canadian mills are often singled out as being old and less efficient, of the mills considered it is the British Columbia coastal mills that must devote the largest percentage of their surplus to this type of expenditure. For mills built before 1971, neither the age of the mill nor the level of investment over the last 12 years explains much of the variation in this percentage. Foreign controlled mills tended to perform better than Canadian controlled mills and had a higher percentage of secondary facilities already operational in 1989. These factors resulted in the former mills having a lower compliance cost per dollar of surplus.

Using average surplus as a denominator in the above measure gives an interesting perspective on the relative burden of compliance costs. Clearly, however, the performance of mills during the eighties is not necessarily a good predictor of their performance during the nineties, when the expenditures will have to be made. The high price of market pulp contributed substantially to surplus in the latter part of the decade. According to McCubbin (1990, p. 68), "the highest concentration of vuinerable mills is in the province of Quebec. All such mills are typified by high produc-
tion costs, dated equipment vintage and high compliance costs." We have shown, however, that Quebec mills performed better than average during the eighties and invested a proportion of surplus equivalent to the average of all mills considered. The ACR in Quebec was only one percentage point higher than the general average. This potential contradiction illustrates one of the hazards of comparing estimated future costs to actual historical financial data. In the final analysis, however, there is no significant difference in the average surplus per tonne of product for mills that have both primary and secondary facilities, those that have only primary facilities or those that have none, a fact that suggests that pollution abatement costs have not detracted from the performance of pulp and paper mills in the past.

## DATA SOURCES AND MEASUREMENT PROBLEMS

The following data files were used for this study:

## Pollution Data

Information on BOD factors and treatment facilities came from the Pulp and Paper Mill Profile System described in Statistics Canada (1992, p. 96). The data pertain to 1989. This database contains information on 124 direct discharge mills.

## Estimated Compliance Costs

As noted in the text, these data come from a report prepared for Environment Canada by N. McCubbin Consultants Inc. The report states that:

> "The approach of calcuiating estimates for each mill was selected as the best way of estimating the total costs for each industry sector and geographic region. Clearly, such estimates can never be as reliable as those based on detailed engineering analysis, flowsheets, site layout, soils studies and contractors bid prices. Several capital cost estimates were checked against independent estimates based on detailed studies, and were found to be within $20 \%$ of the latter costs. Some extreme mills are bound to exist where the individual costs estimated for this report are either excessive or inadequate. However, it is considered that the aggregate of any reasonably sized sub-set of mills (such as Quebec newsprint mills) is accurate within $20 \%$ " (McCubbin, 1990, p. 56 ).

## Manufacturing Data

Records from the manufacturing survey for individual mills classified to SIC 271 were processed to obtain 1989 production figures by type of product. Surplus was calculated for the period 1981-1989 by subtracting the cost of materials, fuel and labour from the value of shipments. As noted in the text, this value is equivalent to operating profit
before depreciation and depletion allowances except that it includes head office expenses. Since the study considers individual milis, it was not possible to derive a net profit estimate at this level. A weighted average of the annual surplus was calculated using the GDP implicit price deflator.

## Investment Data

It was possible to obtain investment data dating back to 1979 from the Capital and Repair Expenditure Survey conducted by Statistics Canada. Although data exist prior to this year, it would have been difficult to match individual mills. Averages were computed using the price indexes for capital expenditure on plant and equipment for paper and allied industries.

## Record Matching

The matching of company names by location was relatively straightforward, especially with the help of the Pulp \& Paper Canada Annual for 1989. In some cases one source reported data on a combined basis whereas other sources reported on the individual establishments. Mills for which all data were not available were omitted from parts of the analysis. This problem explains the variance in the number of mills reported. For instance, in Table 4 only 111 of the 124 direct discharge milis could be matched to combine information on surplus and investment. In Table 3 only 86 of the 94 mills reported as having compliance costs could be matched to show all the variables.

## Variance

The variance about the mean is quite high in many cells of the tables presented in this study. Although excluding the outliers would have an effect on the mean in some cases, the difference is not large enough to change the conclusions. It should be noted, however, that the measures for a mill in any given category may be quite different from the average.

## REFERENCES

Department of Fisheries and Oceans. "Pulp and Paper Effluent Regulations." Canada Gazette, Part I, December 14, 1991.

Environment Canada. The State of Canada's Environment. Ottawa, 1991.
Headlam, B. and M.Stevenson. "Winning the Paper Chase." Canadian Business, June 1990, p. 43.

Jamieson, Scott. "Airing Some Concerns: The Next Wave in Pollution Control." Pulp \& Paper Canada, 92, 10 (October 1991): 12-13.
McCubbin, Neil. "Economic Impact of Proposed Regulation of Pulp and Paper Industry." (Unpublished.) Prepared for

Regulatory and Economic Affairs Division, Environment Canada, June, 1990.

Pulp \& Paper Canada. 1989 Annual and Directory. Southam Business Publications. St.-Laurent, Quebec, 1989.

Sinclair, William F. Controlling Pollution from Canadian Pulp and Paper Manufacturers: A Federal Perspective. Environment Canada, 1990.
Statistics Canada. Databases for Environmental Analysis: Government of Canada. Occasional, Catalogue 11-527, Ottawa, 1992.

# 4 Transportation of Dangerous Goods 

by Marcia Santiago

## INTRODUCTION

Cargo transportation is an essential element of economic activity. The transportation system itself - roads, railways, pipelines and seaways - is a tangible link between industrial production and the consumer population.

Many aspects of transportation are associated with some level of environmental impact, including fossil fuel consumption, land use change and pollution from both the vehicles and people that use the transportation network. These may be measured in terms of either energy and material consumed or substances released into the environment. Other aspects of transportation, such as environmental risk, are not so easily quantified. This is because risk to the environment is quite different in nature from impact. The potential for impact is substantially more difficult to describe than an actual or realized effect. It is, nonetheless, a dynamic element of the relationship between the human and physical environments.

This chapter examines the regulation concerning the transport of dangerous goods in Canada. This is followed by the presentation and discussion of a variety of data on the tonnage of dangerous goods moved by various modes of transport, and on accidents involving dangerous goods. These two sets of data are used to estimate some simple indicators of the risk of accidental release of material associated with transportation of dangerous goods.

## TRANSPORT REGULATIONS

In a practical sense, risk in transportation is usually understood in terms of human safety. Transportation is regulated on two levels: in the economic or competitive context, as well as in terms of safety. Safety is one of the main objectives of the National Transportation Policy (National Transportation Act 1987).

Dangerous goods are encountered in many economic activities, notably in many basic resource industries. In various forms, they are involved in virtually all types of manufacturing. Many are not intrinsically dangerous to the physical environment. In fact, most are regulated on the basis of their potential danger to transportation safety and human health. The term "dangerous goods" may, as such,
be misleading in an environmental context but it is used in this chapter because it is the regulatory term of reference.

In Canada, the movement of dangerous goods is largely controlled through the federal Transport of Dangerous Goods Act (1985) and its associated Regulations $(1985,1989)$. This legislation applies to all domestic and international movements of dangerous goods by Canadian carriers.

Within this context, dangerous goods are those commodities recognized by the Act as "any product, substance, or organism included by its nature or by the regulations in any of the classes listed in the Schedule" to the Act. This schedule contains over 3000 commodities, which are classified by United Nations Product Identification Numbers (PIN). These dangerous goods are aggregated into nine classes which form the basis of specific regulatory measures. Dangerous goods are controlled at all stages of transport: labelling of shipments, identification of hazardous substances on bills of lading and cargo manifests, and marking of vehicles. These regulations also stipulate training of anyone handling, offering to transport, or transporting dangerous goods.

## THE ECONOMIC CONTEXT

Table 1: Dangerous Goods Transported, by Mode of Transport, 1986

| Class | Rail | Road | Marine |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  | thousand tonnes |  |  |
| 1. Explosives (potentiafly explosive <br> material) | 51 | 115 | 14 |
| 2. Compressed or liquefied gases | 5647 | 1158 | 246 |
| 3. Flammable and combustible liquids | 3748 | 18186 | 10283 |
| 4. Flammable and combustible solids | 117 | 359 | 283 |
| 5. Oxidizers and organic peroxides | 645 | 1562 | 155 |
| 6. Poisonous and infectious substances | 99 | 246 | 111 |
| 7. Radioactive materials | - | 34 | 17 |
| 8. Corrosive materials | 3435 | 1372 | 921 |
| 9. Miscellaneous dangerous | 2047 | 401 | 99 |
| $\quad$ substances or articles |  |  |  |
| Total | 15790 | 23433 | 12129 |

Sources:
Transport Canada and Statistics Canada (OECD, 1988)
Table 1 shows that, overall, road transport accounts for $46 \%$ of the dangerous cargo tonnage shipped ${ }^{1}$. Shipments by rail and by marine carriers account for $31 \%$ and

1. The refative importance of various modes in dangerous goods movement varies with the method of estimating levels of activity. For example, the comparison between trucking and marine shipments may produce different resuits depending on whether or not the distance travelled is associated with the quantity of freight (i.e., tomne-kiometres vs. tonnes). Rail and road data are qualified in the following sections. For marine shipments, the figure shown is for international movements only; the tonnage of dangerous goods for domestic shipping is not available.

24\%, respectively. Flammable and combustible liquids (Class 3 substances) are the dangerous goods most commonly transported, representing $63 \%$ of the total weight of dangerous goods shipments. In terms of the mode of transport, flammable and combustible liquids represent $85 \%$ of international marine, $78 \%$ of for-hire trucking and $24 \%$ of rail shipments of dangerous goods.

## Rail Movements

Dangerous goods represented $9 \%$, by weight, of all commodities transported by rail within Canada and across the Canada-U.S. border in 1989. Domestic shipments of dangerous goods amounted to 11 million tonnes (or $68 \%$ of the total weight of dangerous goods shipments) and 181 thousand carloads (or $72 \%$ of total carloads shipped). Trans-border shipments contributed the remainder, at 5 million tonnes and 69 thousand carloads. These movements are summarized, by origin and destination, in Table 2.

Differences in unit weight (that is, the average weight per carload) across rail corridors may be attributed to a number of factors. High unit weights (e.g., 74 tonnes per car for domestic movements originating in Alberta) may indicate that the dangerous goods carried mainly consist of heavy, bulk materials. These would include crude petroleum oil or semi-refined petroleum products. Lower unit weights might suggest that the commodities being transported are more refined and less dense products. Low unit weights may also indicate that dangerous goods are being
carried in mixed carloads with other, non-regulated products.

One fifth of rail movements in dangerous goods (representing 4 million tonnes and 49 thousand carloads) took place within provincial boundaries. Interprovincial shipments totalled 7 million tonnes ( $42 \%$ ) and 195 thousand carloads. Alberta, Ontario and Quebec accounted for most of the activity.

Six products account for $44 \%$ of the dangerous goods tonnage transported by rail from the U.S. Ranked highest, in terms of tonnage, is sodium hydroxide ( 81 thousand tonnes, Class 8). In this group, there are also two Class 3 commodities: cyclohexane ( 74 thousand tonnes) and benzene ( 27 thousand tonnes). Isobutylene ( 71 thousand tonnes) and propylene ( 65 thousand tonnes) are both Class 2 substances. One commodity, ethylenediamine tetra-acetic acid (EDTA), is classified by Transport Canada as an environmentally hazardous substance (Class 9.2, 44 thousand tonnes).

Similarly, among rail shipments of dangerous goods from Canada to the U.S., five products account for half of the tonnage. Three of these are compressed or liquefied gases (Class 2): ammonia ( 902 thousand tonnes), isobutane ( 396 thousand tonnes), and propane ( 313 thousand tonnes). Asbestos ( 473 thousand tonnes, Class 9) and sulphuric acid ( 468 thousand tonnes, Class 8 ) are also substantial components of the activity.

Table 2: Rail Movement of Dangerous Goods, by Origin and Destination, 1989

|  | Destination |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Origin | Nova Scotia and New Brunswick | Quebec | Ontario |  | Alberta | British <br> Columbia and the Territories | United States | Total |
| Nova Scotia and New Brunswick | thousands of tonnes transported$\qquad$ carloads |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 278 | 24 | 55 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 12 | 375 |
|  | 4136 | 1035 | 2119 | 110 | 122 | 55 | 214 |  |
| Quebec | 289 | 577 | 227 | 57 | 65 | 51 | 737 | 2003 |
|  | 5985 | 8033 | 5361 | 1660 | 2086 | 1407 | 10137 |  |
| Ontario | 227 | 342 | 1323 | 209 | 318 | 254 | 1601 | 4875 |
|  | 7266 | 14223 | 17689 | 7313 | 10.396 | 7785 | 21653 | 86.325 |
| Manitoba and Saskatchewan | 16 | 5 | 181 | 257 | 8 | 36 | 172 | 676 |
|  | 215 | 151 | 2856 | 3907 | 233 | 588 | 2457 | 10407 |
| Alberta | 53 | 255 | 530 | 292 | 721 | 2329 | 2490 | 6668 |
|  | 813 | 3172 | 6404 | 4117 | 9775 | 28926 | 32094 | 86111 |
| British Columbia and the Territories | 2 | 5 | 12 | 7 | 32 | 577 | 47 | 679 |
|  | 2 | 200 | 4833 | 147 | 522 | 7794 | 672 | 9896 |
| United States | 2 | 183 | 342 | 29 | 121 | 82 | 62 | 821 |
|  | 94 | 4967 | 36821 | 507 | 1783 | 1026 | 785 | 14005 |
| Total | 865 | 1990 | 2670 | 853 | 1268 | 3331 | 5119 | 16097 |
|  | 18421 | 31781 | 39821 | 17761 | 24927 | 47581 | 68822 | 249114 |

## Source:

Statistics Canada. Rail in Canada 1989. Catalogue 52-216.

## Road Movements

As in other industrial economies, road transport accounts for most of the dangerous cargo shipments within Canada (OECD, 1988). This reflects, to a great extent, the prominence of for-hire trucking in local freight distribution.

Table 3 is a summary of interprovincial dangerous goods movement by for-hire trucking in 1989. Shipments between and within urban areas account for $40 \%$ ( 1.9 million) of the shipments and $23 \%$ ( 7.7 million tonnes) of the weight transported. About 244 thousand shipments are made within Toronto's Census Metropolitan Area (CMA), the greatest number of dangerous goods movements within an urban centre. The greatest concentration of tonnage is transported within the Vancouver CMA, which accounts for 1.7 million tonnes of dangerous goods. Transborder activity accounted for $2 \%$ of shipments and $5 \%$ of dangerous goods tonnage. Compared to transborder rail movements, this is a considerably lower proportion of activity.

## ACCIDENTS

Over time, the overall frequency of transportation accidents has tended simply to reflect the level of shipping activity. In 1991, the Transportation Safety Board reported a decrease in air and marine accidents compared to the previous year (TSB, 1992). In the same time period, there was
an increase in the number of rail accidents but the accident rate actually declined somewhat (TSB, June 1992).

The pattern of transportation accidents that involve dangerous goods is also tied to the level of activity. Overland shipments account for most of the dangerous tonnage transported and it follows that the road and rail modes also account for most of the accidents involving dangerous goods (Table 4).

The likelihood of an accident may also be expressed, for either overland mode of transport, in terms of the total shipments. Among rail movements, it is estimated that one accident occurs for every 545 carloads, or 36 thousand tonnes, of dangerous goods transported. In for-hire trucking, the probability of accident is estimated at one in 21 thousand truckloads, or 70 thousand tonnes, of dangerous goods transported.

Between classes of dangerous goods, the occurrence of accidents is only weakly correlated with the quantities transported. In rail shipments, Class 3 substances account for $24 \%$ of the tonnage and $29 \%$ of the accidents (one accident for every 29 thousand tonnes transported). In road movements, these commodities account for $78 \%$ of the tonnage and $43 \%$ of the accidents (one accident for every 90 thousand tonnes transported).

An important dimension of any accident involving dangerous goods is whether or not material release occurs as

Table 3: Dangerous Goods Handled in For-hire Trucking, by Origin and Destination, 1989

| Origin | Destination |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Newfoundland and Prince Edward Island | Nova Scotia and New Brunswick | Quebec | Ontario | Manitoba and Saskatchewan | Alberta | British Columbia and the Territories | United States | Total |
|  | thousands of tomnes thousands of truckioads |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Newfoundland and | 163 | 25 | 1 | -. | -- | 33 | - | - | 223 |
| Prince Edward island | 18 | 3 | -- | -- | - | 1 | - | $\cdots$ | 22 |
| Nova Scotia and | 50 | 2400 | 39 | 14 | - | -- | - | 220 | 2725 |
| New Brunswick | 7 | 195 | 5 | 5 | -- | 1 | 1 | 8 | 233 |
| Quebec | 9 | 107 | 3308 | 684 | 12 | 23 | 7 | 148 | 4299 |
|  | 4 | 32 | 495 | 335 | 11 | 14 | 11 | 11 | 913 |
| Ontario | 9 | 90 | 688 | 6632 | 71 | 56 | 20 | 546 | 8113 |
|  | 11 | 55 | 316 | 1735 | 39 | 34 | 27 | 41 | 2259 |
| Manitoba and Saskatchewan | -- | 4 | 5 | 176 | 2983 | 214 | 47 | 293 | 3721 |
|  | .. | 1 | 2 | 29 | 245 | 29 | 7 | 11 | 325 |
|  | - | - | 11 | 40 | 949 | 6810 | 924 | 284 | 8998 |
| Alberta | $\cdots$ | 1 | 3 | 9 | 62 | 402 | 68 | 13 | 557 |
| British Columbia and the Territories | - | 7 | 4 | 16 | 26 | 793 | 3392 | 124 | 4362 |
|  | -.- | 1 | 3 | 8 | 6 | 45 | 297 | 9 | 367 |
| United States | 2 | 19 | 139 | 492 | 53 | 73 | 60 | 8 | 845 |
|  | 1 | 4 | 21 | 75 | 9 | 11 | 9 | 2 | 131 |
|  | 234 | 2652 | 4195 | 8054 | 4094 | 8003 | 4450 | 1604 | 33287 |
| Total | 52 | 291 | 845 | 2196 | 372 | 372 | 419 | 96 | 4808 |

## Source:

Statistics Canada. For-hire Trucking (Commodity Origin-Destination) Survey.

Table 4: Transportation Accidents Involving Dangerous Goods, 1990

| Class | Total accidents |  |  |  |  | Accidents with material release |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Foad | Rail | Marine | Air | Total | Road | Rail | Marine | Air | Total |
| 1. Explosives (potentially explosive material) | 9 | 4 | - | - | 13 | 2 | 1 | - | - | 3 |
| 2. Compressed or liquefied gases | 63 | 193 | - | - | 256 | 44 | 105 | - | - | 149 |
| 3. Flammable and combustible liquids | 203 | 131 | 3 | 8 | 345 | 194 | 67 | 3 | 7 | 271 |
| 4. Flammable and combustible solids | 15 | 10 | - | 1 | 26 | 14 | 1 | * | 1 | 16 |
| 5. Oxidizers and organic peroxides | 11 | 15 | - | - | 26 | 8 | 4 | - | - | 12 |
| 6. Poisonous and infectious substances | 44 | 14 | 1 | 3 | 62 | 42 | 9 | 1 | 2 | 54 |
| 7. Radioactive materials | 4 | - | 1 | 1 | 6 | 1 | - | - | , | 1 |
| 8. Corrosive materials | 99 | 74 | 2 | 1 | 176 | 94 | 39 | 2 | ${ }^{*}$ | 13 |
| 9. Miscellaneous dangerous substances or articles | 13 | 4 | * | 1 | 18 | 12 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 136 16 |
| n.e.s | 16 | 7 | 1 | $\checkmark$ | 24 | 15 | 5 | 1 | - | 21 |
| Total | 477 | 452 | 8 | 15 | 952 | 426 | 234 | 7 | 12 | 679 |

Transport Canada. Dangerous Goods Directorate.
a result of the accident. With the data provided in Table 4, it is difficult to ascertain whether material release in accidents is related to mode of transport. Overall, $71 \%$ of all accidents that involve dangerous goods do result in material release. By relating the frequency of material release to the number of accidents, there would appear to be many more accidents with material release by road transport $(89 \%)$ than by rail ( $52 \%$ ). However, in terms of the tonnage of cargo transported, rail and road shipments have about the same probability of material release; there is about one accident in which material is released for every 70 thousand tonnes of material transported.

Simple frequencies cannot truly depict the magnitude of the impact that results from the accidental release of dangerous cargo. For example, in the summer of 1991 an accident provoked the derailment of twenty-five cars in St. Lazare, Manitoba (TSB 1992). Ten were carrying dangerous cargo and four of those ruptured. A toxic cloud was released, which contained methanol and acetic anhydride, and village residents were temporarily removed from the area.

## HAZARDOUS WASTE

Class 9 substances, which are described as miscellaneous dangerous substances or articles, constitute a very small proportion of the total shipments and accidents involving dangerous goods. This category also includes hazardous waste such as PCBs (Table 5). Despite their minimal contribution to the total shipments of regulated
substances, these commodities receive a great deal of public attention. Such a high profile is likely related to perceptions of the probability of accidents and spills, as well as the risks to health, safety and the environment that are believed to be associated with hazardous waste.

Table 5: Rail and Road Movements of Class 9 Substances, 1992

| Class | Movements |  |  |  | Average distance |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Rail |  | Road |  |  |
|  | thousand tonnes | cars | thousand tonnes | trips | km |
| 9.1 Miscellaneous dangerous goods | 1053 | 17824 | 485 | 67076 | 818 |
| 9.2 Environmentally hazardous substances | 496 | 7819 | 44 | 6573 | 620 |
| 9.3 Dangerous wastes | 2 | 42 | - | . | . |
| 9.9 Other | 977 | 38149 | ... | ... |  |
| Total | 2528 | 63834 | 530 | 73849 | 800 |
| Source: <br> Transport Canada. Dangerou | Goods Dir | ctorate |  |  |  |

Rail shipments of hazardous waste in 1992 were estimated at about two thousand tonnes or 42 cars, representing less than one tenth of one percent of Class 9 freight in this mode. Furthermore, Class 9 materials were involved in a very small proportion of the accidents involving dangerous goods. Among accidents involving dangerous goods
where material was released, only $2 \%$ involved Class 9 cargo.

There is a great deal of discussion regarding the risks associated with storing, handling, and transporting hazardous waste. Some perceive that the transport of hazardous waste poses a greater health and safety risk than that of other classes of dangerous goods. Others believe that accidents involving hazardous waste are more likely to occur in transportation than in storage and handling or after equipment failure. There is one study, for the province of Manitoba, where it has been shown that the risk of accident in transportation is no greater than in any other activity involving hazardous waste (Manitoba Environment, 1991). It is difficult, however, to compile complete, reliable data and, therefore, to arrive at firm conclusions.

The risks associated with hazardous waste transport are difficult to ascertain. Among rail movements, the likelihood of an accident involving a Class 9 substance is estimated at one in 16 thousand carloads, or one in 632 thousand tonnes. Compared to the accident rate among dangerous goods, in general, this probability is considerably lower. Among road movements, it is estimated that one accident occurs for every 6 thousand shipments, or 41 thousand tonnes, of Class 9 substances. Based on these data, there is one accident for every 33 thousand tonne-kilometres of dangerous goods transported by road. It should be noted, however, that the estimates of shipment frequency and tonnage for road movement are based only on forhire trucking whereas statistics on accidents cover all trucking. Thus, the probability of accidents may be overstated.

## DATA SOURCES

By law, dangerous goods movements are monitored through a system of permits but, despite this requirement, there is no central source of data.

Data for rail shipments are collected by the Dangerous Goods Directorate of Transport Canada from the Canadian National and Canadian Pacific Railways. Data for the period 1987-1989 were supplied by Transport Canada to Statistics Canada for special studies on dangerous goods movement, which appeared in Rail in Canada 1988 and 1989 (Catalogue 52-216).

The Transportation Division of Statistics Canada maintains databases on for-hire trucking. With the assistance of Transport Canada, commodities designated as being "dangerous" under the Act are identified on this database. A similar exercise is being undertaken with international shipping data. In all cases, estimates of dangerous goods shipments are based on bills of lading, cargo manifests or their equivalent; none are based on dangerous goods permits. At present, no data are available for the following types of shipments: own-account trucking, rail movements other
than CN and CP , domestic shipping and permits for exception in all modes.

The data derived from bills of lading are coded by either the Standard Trade Commodity Classification or the Harmonized Commodity Description and Coding System. Neither corresponds precisely to the PIN classification and the estimates of movements of dangerous goods require adjustments. For example, in rail movements, Class 9.9 was created for mixed cargoes of regulated and non-regulated commodities.

## REFERENCES

Manitoba Environment. State of the Environment: Report for Manitoba, 1991. Winnipeg, 1991.

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). Transporting Hazardous Goods by Road. Report prepared by an OECD Scientific Experts Group. Paris, 1988.

Transportation Safety Board of Canada (TSB). Annual Report 1991. Ottawa, 1992.
-...--. Summary of Railway Accidents/Incidents, Ottawa, June 1992.

## 5 Land Use Change Around Riding Mountain National Park

by Douglas Trant

## INTRODUCTION

Riding Mountain National Park has been described as:
"An island of natural environment surrounded by a sea of man-altered environment. The transition zone from farmlands is illustrated dramatically by the wheat fields and pastures abutting the natural environment."
(Parks Canada, 1987).
The park is a unique area of Canadian wilderness where habitats characteristic of eastern, western and northern Canada converge in a series of forests, grasslands, hills and valleys. Riding Mountain National Park's 3000 square kilometre area is home to 5000 elk, 4000 moose, and over 1000 black bears. Many other species such as wolf, beaver, cougar and osprey also inhabit this nature reserve. In summer months more than 30000 people visit the park each weekend.

Riding Mountain National Park is located on the Manitoba Escarpment, and can be described as an elevated boreal island surrounded by prairie. Because of its unusual combination of attributes it was designated as an International Biosphere Reserve, as part of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization's (UNESCO) Man-Biosphere Program. UNESCO established the ManBiosphere Program in 1971 to ensure the preservation of unique natural environments in each of the world's biogeographic regions. A Man-Biosphere reserve typically consists of a protected core of natural environment together with adjacent areas which collectively form a zone of cooperation. The Man-Biosphere Program recognizes that socio-economic activities and natural ecosystems must coexist in an effort to guarantee the survival of both. Some 266 Man Biosphere Zones have been selected globally to date.

In recent years the transition zone from park to agriculture has become narrower, making the likelihood of conflict between activities more probable. Close co-existence of agriculture and wilderness can induce conflict, as one interferes with the other. The survival of the nature reserve depends on careful organization, planning and management. The role of information to support decision-making in this
process is important. The findings of this analysis and the information that supports it will be added to a larger inventory of data supporting the Biosphere Reserve Program at Parks Canada.

This study will examine the changing mosaic of socioeconomic activity that surrounds Riding Mountain National Park. The inter-relation between park, biosphere reserve and beyond is explored from both spatial and temporal perspectives. Many Statistics Canada micro-databases have been tapped to generate a detailed profile of the area as it has evolved over the last twenty years. Most of these information bases are accessed through the National Accounts and Environment Division's Environmental Information System (EIS) which uses geo-referenced data within a geographic information system (GIS) framework.

This analysis is divided into three Sections. The first section provides background on the history of the park and focuses on issues that have emerged as human settlements and activities move closer to the park, placing more and more pressure on the nature reserve. This section will also describe the physical setting of Riding Mountain, by briefly looking at physiography, hydrology and important biotic communities.

The second section will look at changing population and land use trends around the park over the last twenty years. A detailed statistical profile consisting of a series of concentric zones around the park, will be used to indicate composite activity changes in relation to proximity to the park.

The third section examines changes in agricultural practices around the park. Trends in farm input levels and cropping practice changes will be examined over time to suggest potential effects on the park.

## PHYSIOGRAPHY AND HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF RIDING MOUNTAIN NATIONAL PARK

## History

In the early 1800's the land that comprises Riding Mountain National Park was exploited largely as a timber resource for the construction of railways and farm buildings. In 1895, in response to continued pressure from growing settlements, the Dominion Government chose to set aside today's park area as a forest reserve. The purpose of this reserve was to continue to provide lumber to developing communities at controlled rates in an effort to maintain a continual long term supply of wood (Tabulenas, 1983, p. 175). As a new forest reserve, Riding Mountain came under the jurisdiction of the Forestry Branch of the former Department of the Interior. Husbandry of the reserve became the responsibility of foresters who controlled forest harvest rates. By the early 1900's increased de-
mands for lumber and uncontrolled hunting access had diminished wildlife populations to dangerously low levels. In response to public concern, the Manitoba Government enacted legislation to make Riding Mountain into a game reserve (Tabulenas, 1983, p. 191).

Despite the economic depression of the 1920's and early 30 's, agriculture continued to expand and ultimately advanced to the very edge of the Riding Mountain Reserve. In response to this pressure, and a new public demand for leisure and recreational space, the Riding Mountain Preserve became a National Park in 1930. Since then two very different landscapes have evolved, and Riding mountain has become an island of wilderness within a sea of agricultural development (Tabulenas, 1983, p. 200).

## Physiography

Riding Mountain National Park straddles an upland plateau formed by the geologic fautting of the Manitoba escarpment and the subsequent deposition of glacial moraine landforms from the last glacial period some 12000 years ago. The bedrock geology underneath the park and sur-
rounding area is largely sedimentary, consisting of highly erodible shale types. The soils on Riding Mountain Plateau have developed from shale parent materials and are largely Grey Luvisols. These soils form in cool climates under woodland vegetation. (See map 1) The soils surrounding the Riding Mountain Plateau are largely Chernozems which form in cool climates under grassland vegetation. The Chernozems are quite fertile because of their high organic matter content and provide the soil base for a productive agricultural industry.

## Hydrology

The Riding Mountain Plateau is the origin for many streams and rivers including the Wilson River, the Vermillion River, the Ochre River and the Turtle River. Flooding problems in these watersheds are not uncommon and are exacerbated by the build-up of shales in the stream network (Krawchuk, 1990, p. 113). The shale build-ups are primarily from erosion of alluvial fan material which has been disturbed by the recent clearing of land for agricultural use.

## Map 1: Soil Types in Southern Manitoba



Notes:
Map 1 is from Agricuture Canada's $1: 1000000$ Soil Landscape Series. Riding Mountain National Park is outined in black and is surrounded by a series of radial buffers which will form the basis for a socio-economic data analysis in the section Population and Land Use Characteristics.
Sources;
Agriculture Canada, Centre for Land and Biological Pesources.
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.

## Natural Vegetation and Ecological Communities

There are three distinct ecological communities within the Riding Mountain Biosphere Reserve. These are: Mixedwood Forest, Aspen-Oak Woodland and Grassland. The rough fescue prairie grassland within the park is of international significance as there are few undisturbed examples left in the world. (Most former fescue grasslands are now producing grain crops.) The hardwood forest community on the southern slopes of the park is also unique. This forest is growing 1000 kilometres north of its traditional northern limit, and has survived because of the warm mi-cro-climate created along the south facing escarpment (Krawchuk, 1990, p. 124).

## POPULATION AND LAND USE CHARACTERISTICS

The land use and population study area is oval in shape and extends 250 kilometres in an east-west direction and 160 kilometres in a north-south direction. The study area represents more than 3.3 million hectares of park and surrounding farmland. A series of 10 km wide radial buffer zones have been developed to which micro-geographic data have been linked and aggregated ${ }^{1}$. Each radial zone around the central core represents an increasing area as the zones radiate away from the park. The 0-10 km zone is just under 320 thousand hectares while the 6070 km zone is just under 656 thousand hectares. (See zone areas in Table 2 and Map 1.)

Rural populations have been declining in Manitoba and Saskatchewan for some years now. Manitoba's rural population declined by $1.9 \%$ between 1971 and 1986 , while Saskatchewan's declined by $10.6 \%$. The Riding

1. See Data Limitations section

Mountain area has experienced even sharper declines in population. (See Table 1 and Map 2.)

Table 1 indicates that rural population has declined by more than $21.6 \%$, between 1971 and 1986. All zones showed a decline in rural population, zone 0-10 showed the smallest decline at $6.7 \%$, and zone $20-30$ showed the largest decline at $31.8 \%$. These patterns indicate a declining farm population and an increasing trend towards living in urban centres.

Urban populations in the study area are quite small and exist primarily in zone $10-20$ where the towns of Minnedosa and Dauphin are located. Zone $10-20$ showed an urban increase of slightly more than $10.3 \%$. Urban population for the study period grew by $16.4 \%$. (See Table 1)

Changing demographic patterns around Riding Mountain reflect changing farm economics. Farm populations have been declining on the prairies for some time now. World grain prices have in part contributed to this decline. For example, in 1914, a tonne of wheat was worth $\$ 468$ (1991 dollars) on the world market; in 1990, a tonne of wheat sold for an average of $\$ 113^{2}$. As the nature of farming changes in an intensely competitive international market, more and more rural dwellers move to urban areas. This trend is evident around Riding Mountain, as it is elsewhere in Canada.

Agriculture is the dominant land use activity around Riding Mountain National Park. Throughout the study period (1971-1986), agriculture has consistently occupied $80 \%$ of land around the park and directly provides almost a quarter of all employment in the study area. Table 2 describes farmland areas and changes in these areas as pro-
2. Statistics Canada, Canada Level Price Series, Agriculture Division, Farm income and Prices Section, 1992.

Table 1: Change in Population, 1971 and 1986

|  | Rural population |  |  | Urban population |  |  | Total population |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Radial zone | 1971 | 1986 | Change in population 1971-1986 | 1971 | 1986 | Change in population 1971-1986 | 1971 | 1986 | Change in population 1971-1986 |
|  | number |  | percent | number |  | percent | number |  | percent. |
| 0.10 km zone | 6090 | 5685 | -6.7 | 0 | 0 | 0.0 | 6090 | 5685 | -6.7 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 11920 | 8650 | -27.4 | 10415 | 11485 | 10.3 | 22335 | 20135 | -9.9 |
| 20.30 km zone | 8120 | 5540 | -31.8 | 0 | 1030 | . | 8120 | 6570 | -19.1 |
| $30-40 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 9000 | 7465 | -17.1 | 4375 | 4435 | 1.4 | 13370 | 11900 | -11.0 |
| $40-50 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 8620 | 6930 | -19.6 | 4450 | 4280 | -3.8 | 13073 | 11215 | -14.2 |
| $50-60 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 10030 | 8755 | -12.7 | 0 | 0 | 0.0 | 10030 | 8755 | -12.7 |
| $60-70 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 12530 | 8955 | -28.5 | 0 | 1160 | . | 12530 | 10110 | -19.3 |
| Total | 66310 | 51980 | -21.6 | 19240 | 22390 | 16.4 | 85550 | 74365 | -13.1 |

Notes:
10 kilometre radial buffers were used to classify data concentrically around Riding Mountain National Park.
Figures may not add to totals due to rounding.
Sources:
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Census of Population

Table 2: Change in Farmland Area, 1971-1986

|  | Farmland area |  |  | Proportion of zone area in farmland |  |  | Average farm size |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Radial zone | Zone area | 1971 | 1986 | 1971 | 1986 | Change in farmland area 1971-1986 | 1971 | 1986 | Change 1971-1986 |
|  | thousand hectares |  |  | percent |  |  | hectares |  | percent |
| $0-10 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 320 | 246 | 297 | 76.8 | 92.7 | 20.7 | 191 | 263 | 38.0 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 354 | 316 | 273 | 89.4 | 77.1 | -13.8 | 216 | 273 | 26.7 |
| $20-30 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 411 | 388 | 383 | 94.4 | 93.2 | -1.3 | 257 | 324 | 26.1 |
| 30.40 km zone | 471 | 343 | 340 | 72.7 | 72.1 | -0.9 | 238 | 314 | 32.2 |
| $40-50 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 535 | 443 | 420 | 82.8 | 78.7 | -5.0 | 292 | 360 | 23.5 |
| $50-60 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 595 | 411 | 455 | 89.0 | 76.5 | 10.8 | 264 | 354 | 34.4 |
| $60-70 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 656 | 487 | 467 | 74.3 | 71.2 | -4.2 | 288 | 374 | 29.8 |
| Total | 3341 | 2633 | 2634 | 78.8 | 78.8 | 0.3 | 249 | 323 | 29.8 |

Note:
10 kilometre radial buffers were used to ctassity data concentrically around Fiding Mountain National Park.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agricuture Division.

Map 2: Population Density, 1971 and 1986


## Note:

Municipalities making up the Piding Mountain Biosphere Feserve are outined around the park
Source:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.
portions of total area for the 7 radial zones between the 1971 and 1986 census years. (See Map 3.)

In brief, farmland area for the entire study area has essentially remained constant over the 15 year study period, showing an increase of less than $1 \%$. However, significant changes have occurred when individual radial zones are examined. The $0-10$ kilometre zone nearest the park shows the highest change where agricultural areas continue to expand. Farmland has increased by $20 \%$ in this zone, going from $77 \%$ of zone area to over $92 \%$, making it second only to zone $20-30$ at $93 \%$ agriculture. This trend indicates that the boundaries separating land use activities are becoming narrower and the likelihood of conflict between uses is therefore increased.

Idie land that used to form a cushion between activities is no longer there and the probability of having bears in farmers fields has increased as has the potential for animal poisoning by farm pesticides. ${ }^{1}$

Table 3 looks at the improved farmiand ${ }^{2}$ trends at varying distance from the park. Cropland trends are on the rise
in all of the radial zones. The entire study area shows a $27.8 \%$ increase in cropland area. Since farmland areas in Table 2 have remained stable, and cropland areas in Table 3 are on the rise, it is apparent that a larger proportion of farmland is being placed in production and that land use intensity is increasing. Map 4 shows the radial distribution of cropland area changes around the park. The $0-10$ zone shows the largest change with a $41.7 \%$ increase. Summerfallow areas are declining in all of the radial zones. The study area shows a decline of $43.8 \%$. This is positive from a soil salinization perspective since the rate at which salinization occurs is dependent on soil moisture levels as they are affected by summerfallowing (Dumanski, 1986, p. 206). Summerfallowing contributes to salinization by raising soil moisture levels, and causing migration of stored salts.

1. Riding Mountain National Park warden Mac Estabrooks indicated, in a telephone conversation, that bear and elk were entering surrounding fields with increasing regularity.
2. Farmland that is considered improved can be cropland, improved pasture, summerfallow, or other improved land.

Map 3: Change in Farmland Area, 1971-1986


[^9]Table 3: Change in Improved Farmland Area, 1971-1986

| Radial zone | Improved farmland |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Cropiand |  |  | Improved pasture |  |  | Summerfallow |  |  | Other improved land |  |  |
|  | 1971 | 1986 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1971-1986 \end{array}$ | 1971 | 1986 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1971-1986 \end{array}$ | 1971 | 1986 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1971-1986 \end{array}$ | 1971 | 1986 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1971-1986 \end{array}$ |
|  | thousand hectares |  |  | thousand hectares |  | percent | thousand hectares |  | percent | thousand hectares |  | percent |
| 0.10 km zone | 107 | 151 | 41.5 | 9 | 15 | 58.3 | 46 | 34 | -25.9 | 4 | 4 | 1.2 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 145 | 154 | 6.3 | 11 | 9 | -15.9 | 58 | 30 | -49.3 | 5 | 3 | -36.8 |
| $20-30 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 150 | 192 | 27.5 | 15 | 18 | 17.0 | 67 | 34 | -48.3 | 6 | 4 | -32.0 |
| $30-40 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 141 | 184 | 30.2 | 8 | 9 | 8.2 | 70 | 35 | -49.4 | 5 | 4 | -17.6 |
| $40-50 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 159 | 203 | 27.7 | 22 | 27 | 22.0 | 70 | 41 | -41.6 | 6 | 5 | -16.3 |
| $50-60 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 157 | 211 | 34.6 | 17 | 14 | $-15.7$ | 73 | 40 | -44.8 | 6 | 5 | -16.4 |
| 60.70 km zone | 177 | 224 | 26.7 | 16 | 17 | 6.5 | 80 | 42 | -47.6 | 6 | 5 | -9.4 |
| Total | 1035 | 1318 | 27.3 | 97 | 107 | 10.4 | 463 | 256 | -44.7 | 37 | 30 | -18.9 |

Note:
10 kilometre radial buffers were used to classify data concentrically around Riding Mountain National Park.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agricutture Division.

## Map 4: Change in Cropland Area, 1971-1986



## Notes:

Cropland change refers to change in proportion of zone in cropland. Municipalities making up the Fiding Mountain Biosphere Feserve are outined around the park Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and the Census of Agriculture.

Table 4 depicts trends in unimproved farmland. These areas, with the exception of unimproved pasture, are showing significant declines. Woodland which is important to wildife as cover, and as a food source, shows sharp declines in all of the radial zones. The zone closest to the park contains the highest proportion of farm woodland, of its 320000 hectares 8887 remained in farm woodland in 1986. (Some woodland still exists outside farmland areas but this amount must be less than $7.3 \%$ of the zone area, $92.7 \%$ of zone $0-10$ is farmland.) Map 5 portrays the extent to which farm woodland areas have been declining around the park.

As human activities intensify and move closer to the park the likelihood of conflict increases. Agriculture-wildlife conflict can manifest itself in many different ways. For example, species such as the burrowing owl and prairie chicken can lose habitat to agriculture and be reduced in numbers or even disappear. Other birds such as the brown headed cowbird, thrive in a cleared cropland environment. These birds displace other species, such as the yellow warbler by reproducing in a parasitic manner, reducing the breeding success of other species (Environment Canada, 1991, p. 6-6).

Expanding agricultural land use further limits not only the diversity and numbers of wild animals, but that of plant life as well. Native plant communities are displaced and replaced by crop monocultures. (See below.) Even when land is later withdrawn from agriculture, the original grasses and wild flowers tend to be supplanted by hardier opportunistic weed species (Environment Canada, 1991, p. 6-6).

## FARM INCOME, INPUTS AND AGRICULTURAL PRACTICES

The distribution of farm income per hectare of farmland around Riding Mountain appears to show a concentration of high income earners in the south on the black chernozemic soils, with lower incomes in the north on the luvisolic soils. (See Map 6 and Map 1.) Farmers in areas close to the park tend to have lower incomes, with the exception of some polygons ${ }^{1}$ along the northern park boundary which are on dark grey chernozemic soils.

Agricultural practices have changed significantly on the Prairies over the last twenty years. As previous tables have indicated, fewer farmers are operating more farm area. In an effort to increase production and stay competitive, more farm inputs such as fertilizers, chemicals and fuels are being consumed than ever before. Bigger, more costly equipment is being purchased to operate larger and larger farms. Farmers have expanded their operations and have begun to rely on labour saving, capital intensive technology to operate these bigger farms. The environmental cost of these new technologies is substantial (Dumanski, 1986, p. 205).

Agricultural production in Canada has quadrupled in the last 60 years (Statistics Canada, 1991, p. 186). Farming methods and cropping practices have changed. Farms have become highly productive and are specializing in a narrower range of activities than ever before. Farms are

[^10] point.

Table 4: Change in Unimproved Farmland Area, 1971-1986

| Radial zone | Unimproved farmland |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Unimproved pasture |  |  | Woodland |  |  | Other improved land |  |  |
|  | 1971 | 1986 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1971-1986 \end{array}$ | 1971 | 1986 | $\begin{gathered} \text { Change } \\ 1971-1986 \end{gathered}$ | 1971 | 1986 | Change 1971-1986 |
|  | thousand hectares |  | percent | thousand hectares |  | percent | thousand hectares |  | percent |
| $0-10 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 42 | 59 | 39.5 | 16 | 9 | -45.2 | 63 | 25 | -60.7 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 48 | 50 | 3.9 | 15 | 6 | -60.6 | 83 | 21 | -74.2 |
| 20.30 km zone | 93 | 104 | 12.0 | 18 | 6 | -64.8 | 132 | 25 | -81.4 |
| $30-40 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 59 | 74 | 25.2 | 12 | 5 | -59.0 | 108 | 29 | -73.1 |
| 40.50 km zone | 98 | 110 | 11.6 | 26 | 8 | -70.2 | 160 | 28 | -82.7 |
| $50-60 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 74 | 133 | 81.1 | 27 | 8 | -72.3 | 132 | 44 | -66.5 |
| 60.70 km zone | 129 | 136 | 5.2 | 24 | 7 | -69.7 | 185 | 36 | -80.7 |
| Total | 544 | 667 | 25.5 | 138 | 48 | -63.1 | 863 | 207 | -74.2 |

Note:
10 kilometre radial buffers were used to classify data concentrically around Riding Mountain National Park.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.


Notes:
Woodland change refers to change in proportion of zone tarmiand. Municipalities making up the Fiding Mountain Biosphere Reserve are outtined around the park.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and the Census of Agricultufe.
taking advantage of the economies of scale that result specialized functions. Increased production often implies modifying the natural environment, so that growth can take place unimpeded by environmental factors which might otherwise slow it. An extreme example of this is the use of a green house where natural conditions are so controlled that almost any crop can be grown at any latitude. A less extreme example is the growth of a typical field crop. Environmental factors such as moisture level, flora diversity, fauna variety, soil tilth, wind strength and nutrient availability are all controlled by man. Implementing these types of controls on a large scale (millions of hectares) has inevitable consequences for the natural environment. For example, agricultural production can change the water table level and may reduce the number of animal species present by limiting vegetational diversity which are food supplies to particular wildlife species.

The agricultural activity surrounding Riding Mountain is not the intense, high yielding type found in the mid-west-
ern United States. The range of crops that can be grown economically at such northerly latitudes is small, and consists mainly of grains and cereals, or close-row type crops. Table 5 summarizes how the majority of cultivated land is being utilized.

Close-row crops dominate the study area. In total they made up more than $85 \%$ of cultivated land in 1986, a decrease from more than $90 \%$ in 1971. The remainder of cropland in the study area is planted in forage type crops such as tame hay. Crop cover around the park is important because it influences food supply for wild animals, determines soil erosion rates, affects soil quality, affects water quality and influences ecological stability by limiting species diversity. The downward trend suggested by the data, away from completely close-row monoculture is positive because it indicates that crop rotation may be increasing and that the cropping base is becoming more diverse from an ecological perspective. Two crop types of

Map 6: Farm Revenue per Hectare of Farmland, 1986


Notes:
Farm revenues refer to farm sales in 1986 . Municipalities making up the Riding Mountain Biosphere Reserve are outined around the park. Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and the Census of Agriculture.

Table 5: Change in Close-Row Monoculture Cropped Area, 1971-1986

| Radial zone | Cultivated fand area |  |  | Close-row monoculture area |  |  | Close-row monoculture proportion of total cultivated land |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1971 | 1986 | Change 1971-1986 | 1971 | 1986 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1971-1986 \end{array}$ | 1971 | 1986 | Change 1971-1986 |
|  | thousand hectares |  | percent | thousand hectares |  | percent |  |  |  |
| $0-10 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 153 | 185 | 21.3 | 131 | 143 | 9.1 | 85.9 | 77.3 | -10.0 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 203 | 183 | -9.7 | 180 | 152 | -15.8 | 88.9 | 82.8 | -6. 8 |
| $20-30 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 217 | 226 | 4.2 | 192 | 185 | -3.7 | 88.4 | 81.7 | -7.6 |
| $30-40 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 211 | 219 | 3.8 | 195 | 198 | 1.7 | 92.6 | 90.7 | -2.1 |
| $40-50 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 229 | 244 | 6.4 | 202 | 203 | 0.6 | 88.3 | 83.4 | -5.5 |
| $50-60 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 229 | 251 | 9.5 | 210 | 217 | 3.5 | 91.4 | 86.4 | -5.5 |
| 60.70 km zone | 257 | 266 | 3.6 | 231 | 233 | 0.6 | 90.1 | 87.5 | -2.9 |
| Total | 1499 | 1574 | 5.1 | 1342 | 1331 | -0.8 | 89.5 | 84.6 | -5.6 |

Cultivated land refers to land under crops and land in summerfatiow.
Sources:
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agricuture Division.
note are oilseeds and specialty crops, which have both increased significantly over the study period.

The volume of agricultural fertilizers applied within 70 kilometres of Riding Mountain National Park has more than quintupled during the study period, from roughly 20000 tonnes in 1970, to almost 150,000 tonnes in 1985. The ap-
plication rate also increased from 65 kilograms per hectare to 145 kilograms per hectare. (See Table 6 and Map 7.)

These rates have increased sharply, but are still well below those found in eastern Canada which can exceed 2000 kilograms per hectare. Fertilized area around the park has gone up by $235 \%$ over the study period.

Table 6: Change in Commercial Agricultural Fertilizer Application, 1970-1985

|  | Commercial fertilizer tonnage |  |  | Area fertilized |  |  | Application rate |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Radial zone | 1970 | 1985 | Change 1970-1985 | 1970 | 1985 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1970-1985 \end{array}$ | 1970 | 1985 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1970-1985 \end{array}$ |
|  | tonnes |  | percent | thousand hectares |  | percent | kg per hectare |  | percent |
| 0.10 km zone | 1843 | 14382 | 680.3 | 28 | 106 | 279.1 | 66.13 | 136.12 | 105.9 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 2950 | 16533 | 460.4 | 43 | 119 | 175.3 | 68.52 | 139.47 | 103.5 |
| $20-30 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 2944 | 23258 | 689.9 | 47 | 147 | 215.0 | 62.98 | 157.95 | 150.8 |
| $30-40 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 2576 | 22059 | 756.3 | 43 | 154 | 257.3 | 59.68 | 143.00 | 139.6 |
| $40-50 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 2909 | 22022 | 636.9 | 46 | 157 | 237.6 | 64.28 | 140.33 | 118.3 |
| 50.60 km zone | 3009 | 25902 | 760.8 | 49 | 171 | 255.9 | 62.59 | 151.40 | 141.9 |
| 60.70 km zone | 3635 | 25076 | 589.8 | 53 | 179 | 236.6 | 68.47 | 140.33 | 104.9 |
| Total | 19947 | 349233 | 648.2 | 309 | 1032 | 234.7 | 64.65 | 144.55 | 123.6 |

10 kibometre radiad zones were used to classify data concentrically around Aiding Mountain National Park.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.
Map 7: Commercial Agricultural Fertilizer Application Rates, 1970 and 1985


Notes:
Fertilizer data for 1970 were estimated from expense data. These maps represent areas within 90 km raclius of the park. Municipalities making up the Riding Mountain Biosphere Reserve are
outined around the park.
Source:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.

Fertilizer tonnages for 1971 were estimated from fertilizer expense data. Changing commercial fertilizer tonnages do not fully account for increases in commercial nutrients applied. Fertilizer nutrient contents have been increasing steadily over time. The average nutrient content of fertilizers in 1971 was $48 \%$. By 1986 this value had increased to 58\% (Agriculture Canada, 1987).

Agricultural pesticide applications have also increased substantially in the study period. Pesticide expenditures indicate that there has been a $744 \%$ increase in pesticides applied. These increases are large but actual application rates are one third of those in eastern regions of Canada. The use of pesticide expense data does not directly indicate changing pesticide volumes or toxicity levels. (See Tables 7 and 8, Map 8.)

Table 7: Change in Agricultural Pesticide Expenditures and Application Rates, 1970-1985

|  | Agricultural pesticide expenditures |  |  | Cultivated land area |  |  | Value of pesticide per hectare of cultivated land |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Radial zone | 1970 | 1985 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1970-1985 \end{array}$ | 1970 | 1985 | Change 1970-1985 | 1970 | 1985 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1970 \text {-1985 } \end{array}$ |
|  | constant 1985 dollars |  | percent | thousand hectares |  | percent | dollars per hectare |  | percent |
| 0.10 km zone | 315053 | 2966482 | 841.6 | 153 | 185 | 21.3 | 2.1 | 16.0 | 676.4 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 480591 | 3350309 | 597.1 | 203 | 183 | -9.7 | 2.4 | 18.3 | 671.7 |
| 20.30 km zone | 422734 | 4009348 | 848.4 | 217 | 226 | 4.2 | 1.9 | 17.7 | 810.0 |
| $30-40 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 489741 | 4209813 | 759.6 | 211 | 219 | 3.6 | 23 | 19.2 | 727.8 |
| $40-50 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 522824 | 3666636 | 601.7 | 229 | 244 | 6.4 | 2.3 | 15.1 | 559.5 |
| $50-60 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 457376 | 4407643 | 863.7 | 229 | 251 | 9.5 | 2.0 | 17.5 | 780.4 |
| $60-70 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 516911 | 4444918 | 759.9 | 257 | 265 | 3.6 | 2.0 | 16.7 | 730.2 |
| Total | 3205230 | 27057210 | 744.2 | 1499 | 1574 | 5.1 | 2.1 | 17.2 | 703.6 |

Note:
0 kilometre radial zones were used to classify data concentrically around Riding Mountain National Park.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

Map 8: Agricultural Pesticide Application Rates, 1970 and 1985


Note:
These map represents areas within a 90 km radius of the park. Municipalities making up the Fiding Mountain Biosphere Reserve afe outined around the park
Source:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division

Table 8: Change in Areas Sprayed With Insecticides and Herbicides, 1970-1985

|  | Area sprayed for insects |  |  | Area sprayed for weeds |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Radial zone | 1970 | 1985 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1970-1985 \end{array}$ | 1970 | 1985 | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Change } \\ 1970-1985 \end{array}$ |
|  | nec |  | percent | he |  | percent |
| $0-10 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 3316 | 6124 | 84.7 | 41538 | 111147 | 167.6 |
| $10-20 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 5234 | 5043 | -3.6 | 63379 | 118755 | 87.4 |
| $20-30 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 6831 | 9309 | 36.3 | 64367 | 145373 | 125.9 |
| $30-40 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 3541 | 10591 | 199.1 | 62060 | 152467 | 145.7 |
| 40.50 km zone | 4595 | 15761 | 243.0 | 68747 | 150081 | 118.3 |
| $50-60 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 3250 | 15370 | 373.0 | 69604 | 184822 | 136.8 |
| $60-70 \mathrm{~km}$ zone | 4425 | 16330 | 289.0 | 72581 | 175276 | 141.5 |
| Total | 31191 | 78528 | 151.8 | 442276 | 1017921 | 130.2 |

Note:
10 kilometre radial zones were used to classify data concentrically around Piding Mountain National Park.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

The increase in agricultural inputs around the park does not imply that the park itself is receiving increased inputs. The transportation mechanisms bringing residual agricultural inputs into the park protect the park to some degree. Streamflow is downslope away from the park, keeping water soluble pesticides and fertilizer nutrients from entering the park in surface water. Ground water is a possible route of entry, but the extent too which this source contributes to loadings on the park is very difficult to quantify without detailed subsurface hydrology data. More probable entry routes are via the wind, and in birds and animals as they forage in fields around the park.

## CONCLUSIONS

Riding Mountain National Park has long been threatened by agricultural encroachment. The natural geographic barrier posed by the escarpment has always protected the park, and despite the changes that have occurred around the park, wildife continues to thrive.

However, agricultural activities around Riding Mountain National Park are still intensifying.

- Tilled land areas close to the park have increased by more than $20 \%$.
- Woodland areas close to the park have declined by more than $45 \%$.
- Pesticide use has increased markedly.
- Fertilizer application rates have more than doubled.
- Fertilized areas have more than tripled.

The land base used by agriculture is expanding to take up more and more land. At the same time, cultivation
activities are also increasing with higher proportions of farmland going into production. Farm pesticide and fertilizer application rates are also increasing, placing additional stress on natural systems. Reductions in biodiversity around the park brought on by large scale agricultural development and mono-cropping are potentially dangerous to established ecological balances within the park. Wildlife food supplies and subsequent population stabilities are as a result at higher risk.

These facts lead to important questions that will have to be answered if the relationship between the park and its surroundings is to remain stable in the long term. For example, what are the effects of current agricultural practices and what will further agricultural development do? Indeed, is the current relationship sustainable? What formula can be used to weigh environmental costs against the benefits of agricultural development? What measures can be taken to ensure a long term, viable co-existence? These and other related questions will have to be carefully considered by society in the years ahead.

## DATA LIMITATIONS

This type of analysis has limitations that should be described. Micro-data for the Census Enumeration Areas used in this study, are stored on a single geographic co-ordinate, otherwise known as a point. This information has to be "rolled up" or aggregated to larger areas representing large land surfaces. The accuracy of this point-polygon match is determined by the density of points per polygon and the spatial distribution of the data represented by the points. In brief, where point densities are too low results have to be suppressed or ground truthed using paper maps. (Hamilton, and Trant, 1989, p. 340) The Riding Mountain study has used large surface areas with high point densities to ensure statistical reliability. The area is
also more than $80 \%$ farmland, making the data distribution associated with the points quite homogeneous.

Other problems can arise when micro-data are aggregated to larger zones. Averaging of values can lead to under or over emphasis of certain characteristics for component smaller areas. The advantage of using composite concentric zones is that aggregate trends become discernible in contrast to the "noise" that is generated by individual data points.

## RERERENCES

Agriculture Canada. Statistics on Canadian Fertilizer Consumption 1985/1986. Ottawa, 1987.
Dumanski. et al. "Soil Conservation in Canada." Journal of Soil and Water Conservation, Soil Conservation Society of America, July/August, 1986.
Environment Canada, The State of Canada's Environment. Ottawa, 1991.
Hamilton, K.E, and Trant, D.F. "Statistical Aspects of the Application of Geographic Information Systems in Canadian Environment Statistics." Journal of Official Statistics, Statistics Sweden, 5,1989.
Krawchuk, W.A. "The Riding Mountain Biosphere Reserve: A Synthesis of the Natural Resource Databasen. Masters Thesis. University of Manitoba, 1990.
Parks Canada. Riding Mountain National Park Management Plan. Environment Canada, Ottawa, 1987.
Tabulenas, D.T. A Narrative Human History of Riding Mountain National Park and Area; Pre-history to 1980. Parks Canada, micro-fiche report series 102, 1983.

# 6 The 1991 Census of Agriculture: Land Management for Soil Erosion Control 

by Douglas Trant ${ }^{1}$

## INTRODUCTION

Soil erosion and land degradation in general are problems of increasing economic and environmental concern. The main economic concern relating to land degradation is the loss of soil productivity, while the air and water pollution resulting from wind and water erosion are the primary environmental quality issues. Until recently, soil productivity declines have been masked by technological advances in the agricultural chemical industry, by the development of higher yielding cultivars, and by a seemingly endless supply of land and water resources. Investigation indicates that the economic costs of these degradation problems exceed one billion dollars annually, in terms of lost production (Fox and Coote, 1986). The environmental costs of water and air pollution resulting from continued wind and water erosion may be even higher. Although no estimates are available for Canada, estimates based on an American cropland area four times that of Canada's indicate that the combined annual environmental and economic costs of the U.S. soil erosion problem range from 4 to 44 billion dollars (Steiner, 1990). The magnitude of this range demonstrates just how difficult it is to estimate the cost of soil erosion.

A new land management module was added to the 1991 Census of Agriculture to provide a first comprehensive look at soil conservation practices on farms in Canada. Farm operators were asked to respond to a series of questions, mostly with simple yes or no answers. Because the survey is new, some of the results must be interpreted cautiously. Nonetheless, these data provide an indication of how well soil erosion and land degradation are being addressed across Canada. This chapter summarizes soil erosion control practices on a provincial basis.

[^11]
## SOIL EROSION CONTROL PRACTICES

Soil erosion control practices on farms in Canada are shown in Table 1. More than a third of farms in Canada ( $36.9 \%$ ) used a forage based crop rotation system on some of their cropland. This type of crop rotation helps promote soil aggregate stability and improves soil structure while recharging soil nitrogen when legumes such as alfalfa or clover are used. The historical decline in forage based crop rotations has contributed to soil quality deterioration in Canada (Dumanski et al.,1986).Crop rotations with forage are more prevalent in Eastern Canada. Differences in farm types account for much of the regional variation.

Table 1: Farms Reporting Erosion Control, 1991

| Erosion control | Number of <br> farms | Percent of <br> farms |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| Crop rotation using torage | 103355 | 36.9 |
| Winter cover crop | 24289 | 8.7 |
| Grassed waterway | 31474 | 11.2 |
| Strip cropping | 22006 | 7.9 |
| Contour Cultivation | 25630 | 9.2 |
| Other practices | 61818 | 22.1 |

Note:
A farm may use more than one erosion control practice, or none at all.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

Figure 1: Potential Cropland Area in Forage Rotations and Strip Cropping, 1991


Note:
Not all cropland area on reporting farms is protected by a particular erosion control practice.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

Strip cropping is an erosion control method where crops are planted in strips, and are often laid out parallel to the slope contour. For example, a grain crop can be planted along the contour, with alternating strips of hay and grain. The hay crop checks water run-off from the grain crop. Wind erosion can also be prevented using strip cropping. One crop can protect the other from high wind during a particularly vuinerable growth or harvest stage. Table 1 and Figure 1 show that strip cropping is used on $7.9 \%$ of farms managing $14.8 \%$ of cropland in Canada. It is most prevalent in Western Canada.

Winter cover crops are used on $8.7 \%$ of farms manag. ing $10.5 \%$ of cropland. This practice serves mainly as protection against wind erosion in winter months. However, winter cover crops can also provide protection in spring when intense rainfall might erode unprotected soil surfaces (Figure 2).

Figure 2: Number of Farms Using Winter Cover Crops and Grassed Waterways, 1991


Note:
There are indications that the area of winter cover crops has been over reported by farmers responding to the Census.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.
Grassed waterways are an erosion control measure used to check overland flow and prevent gully erosion. Exposed soil surfaces on slopes can form gullies that may eventually grow in size to form ditches or ravines. Grassed waterways direct overland flow and protect soil surfaces.

Nationally, $11 \%$ of farms reported using grassed waterways. Alberta farms reported using this practice more than in any other province.

Another method of erosion control is to cultivate the soil parallel to the contour of the slope. This method traps soil particles between plough furrows rather than allowing water and soil particles to gain velocity and move down
slope. Across the country $9 \%$ of farms use this method and as much as $14 \%$ of cropland is protected by these measures. Figure 3 shows the proportions of cropland potentially protected by contour cultivation. Saskatchewan and Prince Edward Island top the list with over $16 \%$ of their cropland potentially protected by contour cultivation.

Figure 3: Cropland Potentially Protected by Contour Cultivation, 1991


Note:
The percentages above represent a maximum and tend to overestimate area under contour cultivation
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

Table 2 looks at farms by erosion control category, by province. Ontario farmers are more likely to use multiple soil erosion control practices. Seven percent of Ontario farmers used 4 or more erosion control practices.

Newfoundland has the smallest proportion of farmers using erosion control (Figure 4). This is due primarily to the types of agriculture found in Newfoundland. In 1991, Newfoundland had only slightly more than 2000 hectares that were prepared for seeding. In contrast, Saskatchewan has single farms with seeded areas larger than 2000 hectares. British Columbia and Nova Scotia have the second and third lowest percentages of participants in erosion control respectively. Both provinces have large tree fruit areas which contribute to their total cropland areas, and as such do not normally require tillage or substantial erosion control. The province with the highest percentage is Saskatchewan where almost $72 \%$ of all farmers use some form of erosion control. Sixty three percent of farms in Canada report employing one or more erosion control practices (Figure 4 ).

Table 2: Number of Farms Employing Erosion Control, 1991

| Number of erosion control practices | Nfld. | P.E.I. | N.S. | N.B. | Que. | Ont. | Man. | Sask. | Alta. | B.C. | Canada |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| No erosion control | 485 | 710 | 2401 | 1801 | 18769 | 21913 | 8742 | 17300 | 18025 | 12410 | 102556 |
| 1 erosion control | 160 | 1063 | 1059 | 978 | 15959 | 25237 | 8947 | 24160 | 22226 | 4846 | 104635 |
| 2 erosion controls | 44 | 260 | 317 | 267 | 1961 | 10474 | 4064 | 9745 | 8992 | 1237 | 37361 |
| 3 erosion controls | 29 | 209 | 126 | 110 | 892 | 6255 | 2610 | 6134 | 5343 | 492 | 22200 |
| 4 erosion controls | 6 | 68 | 44 | 63 | 268 | 3065 | 922 | 2396 | 1868 | 147 | 8847 |
| 5 erosion controls | 1 | 34 | 24 | 25 | 126 | 1256 | 305 | 823 | 616 | 57 | 3267 |
| 6 erosion controls | 0 | 14 | 4 | 7 | 96 | 345 | 92 | 225 | 136 | 33 | 952 |
| 7 erosion controls | 0 | 3 | 5 | 1 | 5 | 88 | 24 | 57 | 39 | 3 | 225 |
| All farms | 725 | 2361 | 3980 | 3252 | 38076 | 68633 | 25706 | 60840 | 57245 | 19225 | 280043 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agricutture Division.

Table 3: Erosion Control Practice by Farm Type, 1991

| Farm type | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Crop } \\ & \text { rotation } \end{aligned}$ | Cover crops | Grassed waterways | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Strip } \\ \text { cropping } \end{array}$ | Contour cultivation | Other practices |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | percentage of farms |  |  |  |  |  |
| Livestock operations | 43.4 | 10.0 | 12.7 | 7.2 | 9.9 | 21.3 |
| Wide-row cropping ${ }^{1}$ | 65.5 | 20.1 | 12.9 | 7.6 | 8.7 | 27.3 |
| Close-row cropping ${ }^{2}$ | 41.6 | 11.8 | 11.4 | 3.9 | 12.5 | 28.6 |
| Forage cropping | 57.6 | 8.0 | 11.9 | 3.4 | 6.4 | 19.7 |
| Speciaity farming and other | 27.3 | 8.7 | 8.0 | 5.8 | 8.3 | 20.6 |

## Notes:

Generalized farm types are derived by aggregating farm types from the Census of Agriculture. Ideally a land-based farm typing should be used here where farms are grouped according to land use rather than on sales. Agriculture Canada is proposing to analyse erosion control using land based farm types in the near future.
${ }^{i}$ Corn, scybeans, vegetables and other crops typically grown in wide rows more than 10 cm
${ }^{2}$ Wheat, oats, barley and other crops typically grown in narrow rows less than 5 cm apart.
Scurces: Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

Figure 4: Farms Using One or More Erosion Control, 1991


## Sources:

Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

Table 3 shows the association between farm type and erosion control practice. Wide-row crops are potentially the most erosive crop type (Wischmeier, 1978). The data indicate that wide-row croppers do in fact respond to higher erosion risk and are the most frequent users of erosion control in 4 out of 6 erosion control techniques. Close-row cropping, potentially the second most erosive farm type, employs more contour cultivation and "other" erosion control practices most frequently.

## SEED BED PREPARATION AND SOIL EROSION CONTROL

The 1991 Census of Agriculture asked farmers questions about their seed bed preparation techniques. Three broad practices were identified: conventional tillage, conservation tillage and no tillage. Conventional tillage actually turns soil over and buries crop residues, making the risk of soil erosion greater than with conservation tillage or no tillage. Conventional tillage methods are quite different from region to region. For example, equipment types vary, reasons for tillage vary, and the timing between tillages is often different. In conservation tillage, as the name implies,
fields are cultivated fewer times with implements that do not turn the soil over. This conserves beneficial crop residues on the surface. Finally, seed bed preparation may be done without any tillage. This is considered the most environmentally benign tillage method from a physical degradation standpoint ${ }^{1}$ (Wischmeier, 1978).

Most soil types suffer some degradation when tilled continually. Soil organic matter levels have a tendency to decline due to the increased oxidation caused by the turning and mixing action of cultivation. When organic matter levels decline most soils begin to deteriorate structurally. If a soil undergoes structural degradation and loses porosity and permeability, rain water does not infiltrate as quickly and water begins to run off. If this situation occurs on vulnerable soils, erosion becomes a definite risk. Another problem more commonly associated with conventional tillage is soil compaction. Compaction can lead to crop rooting problems by limiting the rooting zone and can also lead to water puddling in fields, which prevents cultivation until much later in the spring. One way of combating structural decline is to use a forage or legume in the crop rotation.

Seed bed preparation methods by province are shown in Figure 5. Conventional tillage is most prevalent in Prince Edward Island with more than $90 \%$ of seeded area cultivated with this method. Conservation tillage is most common in Manitoba at close to $30 \%$ of area prepared for seeding. No-tillage is also highest in the Prairies with a value approaching 10\% in Saskatchewan.

Table 4 describes the association between soil erosion control and seed bed preparation. This table provides an indication of the degree to which agricultural soils are being protected across Canada. Nationally, more than 29 million hectares were prepared for seeding in 1991 with conventional, conservation tillage or no tillage. Four and one half million hectares out of 29 million ( $15.3 \%$ ) had no erosion control applied and were not tilled using a conservation technique. Although not all require erosion control, these soils are potentially under the greatest stress, and could benefit the most from improved tillage practice or through the use of some erosion controls. Conversely, this implies that 24.5 million hectares $(84.7 \%)$ of the area prepared for seeding had at least one erosion control applied, or was cultivated using methods that do not promote soil erosion. This is a positive sign and indicates that Canadian farmers are indeed combating the erosion problem.

[^12]Figure 5: Seed Bed Preparation Methods, 1991


Note:
No till areas indicated are higher than actual due to respondent error.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

Table 4: Seed Bed Preparation Methods and Erosion Control Practices, 1991

| Number of erosion controf practices | Conventional tillage | Conservation village | No tillage | Total seeded area |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | thousand of hectares |  |  |  |
| No erosion control | 4447 | 1110 | 356 | 5913 |
| 1 erosion control | 8014 | 2592 | 773 | 11379 |
| 2 erosion controls | 3705 | 1582 | 407 | 5684 |
| 3 erosion controls | 2302 | 1026 | 234 | 3562 |
| 4 erosion controls | 1038 | 519 | 116 | 1673 |
| 5 erosion controls | 364 | 196 | 48 | 608 |
| 6 erosion controls | 95 | 49 | 12 | 158 |
| 7 erosion controls | 23 | 17 | 6 | 44 |
| Total seeded area | 19986 | 7091 | 1952 | 29029 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and Agriculture Division.

## CONCLUSIONS

The 1991 Census of Agriculture provides important baseline information on agricultural soil conservation practices in Canada. Data for a single year provide only a snapshot of soll conservation practices and obviously give no indication of whether the situation is getting better or worse. Nationally, the indications are generally encouraging, insofar as farm operators with $84.7 \%$ of seeded area use some form of soil erosion control or conservation practice, and that farms with the most potentially erosive crops are the most frequent users of 4 out of 6 erosion control measures.

The real question is: are farmers winning the fight? To answer this question more information is needed. For example, where is the 4.4 million hectares of conventionally tilled land to which no erosion control is applied? Is it located on vulnerable soils? Is the area steeply sloped? Do the farms generate significant net revenues or are they among the less productive? Future research should provide insight into these questions as Agriculture Canada's soil landscape maps are more directly linked to the Census data base. This will allow detailed analysis of erosion risk as it relates to farm land use, farm economics and agricultural conservation practices.

## REFERENCES

Dumanski, J., D.R. Coote, G.Luciuk, C.Lok, 'Soil Conservation in Canada", Journal of Soil and Water Conservation. 41:4, July-August 1986.

Fox, M.G. and Coote D.R., A Preliminary Economic Assessment of Agricultural Land Degradation in Atlantic and Central Canada and Southern British Columbia. Development Consulting House (DCH) For Agriculture Canada, Contribution 85-70, Ottawa, 1986.

Steiner F.K., Soll Conservation in the United States. Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, 1990.
Trant, D., Estimating Agricultural Soil Erosion Losses from Census of Agriculture Crop Coverage Data, Research Paper Series \#27, Analytical Studies Branch, Statistics Canada, 1989.

Wischmeier, W.H. and D.D. Smith, Predicting Rainfall Erosion Losses - A Guide to Conservation Planning. Agricultural Handook $\# 537$, Washington, D.C., United States Department of Agriculture, 1978.

# 7 Household Activity, Household Expenditures and the Environment 

by Marcia Santiago

## INTRODUCTION

Many areas of daily household activity affect the natural environment. Some, such as the consumption of fossil fuels for residential heating or automobile operation, have direct impact in terms of using natural resources and in releasing pollutants. There are also other activities that are relevant to environmental quality but whose impact is indirect. One example is the use of recycling facilities, as an alternative to the immediate disposal of solid waste.

Using data from two Statistics Canada surveys, one on household behaviour (Household Environment Survey, 1991) and another on household expenditures (Family Expenditure Survey, 1990, abbreviated as FAMEX), this chapter describes patterns of household activity and household expenditure that are relevant to environmental concerns. The reader should bear in mind that the data presented in this chapter describe the reported activity of households, which may be different from their actual activity. In the case of environmentally relevant behaviour, this effect has been labelled a "green bias". It has been shown that a heightened media or social profile may influence respondents to give what they expect to be 'appropriate' answers (Rathje 1990). The reader must also recognize that expenditure and activity decisions are conditioned as much by social and economic considerations as they are by conscious response to an environmental imperative. Nevertheless, expenditures and activity do provide some important insight into the relationship of households and the environment.

Three general areas are discussed: access to and use of recycling facilities, energy and water consumption, and commuting patterns. Patterns of activity and expenditure are summarized, along with their relationship to a number of geographic and economic factors.

## ACCESS TO AND USE OF RECYCLING SERVICES

Although the public has long been concerned about the disposal of solid waste, this issue has become much more prominent in recent years. Perhaps in response to
this issue, there has been widespread implementation of recycling facilities and programs. In 1991, access to various recycling facilities was reported by almost half of the households questioned in the Household Environment Survey. Access to paper recycling facilities was reported by $53 \%$ of households, with $49 \%, 50 \%$ and $42 \%$ of households reporting access to metal can, glass and plastic recycling facilities respectively. Among households that reported access to these facilities, about $86 \%$ reported that they used them.

Table 1 shows the rates of access to and use of paper recycling facilities in fifteen Census Metropolitan Areas. There is quite a range in the reported access to this service. The highest rates of access are reported in KitchenerWaterloo ( $94 \%$ ) and Victoria ( $92 \%$ ), while Québec (24\%) and Montréal ( $37 \%$ ) report the lowest proportions of households with access. Reported use of the facilities also varies considerably, with the lowest rate reported in Winnipeg ( $55 \%$ ) and the highest rate in Toronto ( $98 \%$ )

Table 1: Access to and Use of Facilities for Paper Recycling by Census Metropolitan Area, 1991

|  | With access | Reporting use |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | percent of households |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Halifax | 47 E | 84 E |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Québec | 24 F | 79 F |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Montréal | 37 E | 77 E |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Ottawa | 70 D | 91 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Toronto | 74 C | 98 C |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Hamiton | 81 D | 94 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| St. Catharines-Niagara | 85 C | 94 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Kitchener-Waterioo | 94 E | 94 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| London | 66 E | 94 E |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Windsor | 77 D | 95 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Winnipeg | 78 E | 55 E |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Edmonton | 68 D | 89 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Calgary | 47 D | 75 E |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Vancouver | 72 D | 93 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Victoria | 92 D | 92 D |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Canada | 53 B | 86 B |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Note:
See the standard error symbots at the end of this chapter.
Source:
Statistics Canada, Household Environment Survey.

The type of service to which a household has access is related to the size of the municipality and to the type of dwelling (Table 2). This is in part because larger municipalities were the first to implement curbside collection programs and these generally served only single detached dwellings. Thus, it follows that the highest access rate ( $76 \%$ ) is reported by households in single detached dwellings in major metropolitan areas. The same group also reports the highest rate of use ( $91 \%$ ). In contrast, access
rates for apartment dwellers are quite low ( $23 \%$ to $36 \%$ ). Access might well be more difficult for apartment dwellers, which would partially explain their lower usage rate.

## Table 2: Access to and Use of Facilities for Paper Recycling by Area and Dwelling Type, 1991

|  | With access | Reporting use |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | percent of households |  |
| Major metropoltan areas (population of 100000 and over) |  |  |
| Single, detached | 76 | 91 |
| Singie, attached | 66 | 90 |
| Aparmment or flat | 35 | 83 |
| Other | 56 | 92 |
| Mid-size metropolitan areas (population between 30000 and 99999 ) |  |  |
| Single, detached | 64 | 87 |
| Single, attached | 55 | 82 |
| Apartment or flat | 36 | 69 |
| Other | 52 | 81 |
| Other urban areas (population less than 30000 ) |  |  |
| Single, detached | 52 | 50 |
| Single, attached | 46 | 79 |
| Apartment or flat | 36 | 71 |
| Other | 43 | 63 |
| Rural areas |  |  |
| Single, detached | 34 | 76 |
| Single, attached | 30 | 80 |
| Apartment or flat | 23 | 72 |
| Other | 26 | 65 |
| Canada | 53 | 86 |

Source:
Statistics Canada. Household Environment Survey.

## ENERGY AND WATER CONSUMPTION

It is reasonable to say that many households have considerable scope to reduce their consumption of water and energy. While concern for the environment may be a factor in the decision to do so, the potential to reduce utility bills is likely to be an important motivator as well.

In 1990, urban households spent, on average, \$1 170 on the consumption of water, fuel and electricity, which represents $14 \%$ of their spending on shelter, or $2.4 \%$ of their total spending. The average cost of water supply to primary residences was $\$ 118$, or $10 \%$ of household spending on fuel and energy.

At least partly in response to these costs, many households have adopted energy-saving habits. Seventyone percent of households with a thermostat report either that it is programmable or that it is regularly lowered during the heating season (Table 3).

## Table 3: Energy and Water Consumption Practices and Expenditures

| Percentage of households in 1991 |  |
| :--- | ---: |
| With a thermostat | 88 |
| With a programmable thermostat | 13 |
| With a regularly lowered thermostat | 58 |
| With compact fluorescent buibs | 11 |
| With low-flow shower heads | 28 |
| With low-flow toilet tanks | 9 |
| Average household expenditure in 1990 (dollars per year) |  |
| Electricity | 644 |
| Heating fuel | 408 |
| Water supply | 118 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Household Environment Survey and Family Expenditure Survey.
Water-conserving practices are not as widely adopted as those for energy. Comparatively few households have either low-flow shower heads ( $28 \%$ ) or low-flow toilet tanks ( $9 \%$ ). This may be because, in many cases, the cost of water supply is not directly related to the quantity used.

The tenure of a dwelling influences the degree to which the household feels responsible for the dwelling's condition and, therefore, its energy and water consumption. Households owning their place of residence have control over changing fixtures (like the thermostats), whereas tenants usually depend on their landlords to make these types of changes. This factor may contribute to the differences in energy- and water-use habits between households owning their dwellings and those renting. (Table 4). A higher proportion of homeowners report implementing conservation measures.

Table 4: Energy and Water Consumption Practices by Tenure of Dwelling, 1991

|  | Owned <br> dwellings | Rented <br> dwellings |
| :--- | :---: | ---: |
|  | percent of households |  |
| With compact fluorescent bulbs | 14 | 6 |
| With thermostats | 87 | 76 |
| With programmable thermostats | 16 | 7 |
| With regularly lowered thernostat settings | 56 | 42 |
| With low-fiow shower heads | 34 | 19 |
| With low-flow toilet tanks | 12 | 5 |
| All househoids | 64 | $\mathbf{3 6}$ |

Source:
Statistics Canada, Household Environment Survey.

## TRANSPORTATION

Commuting to the place of work is a common feature of most households' transportation activity, although the needs of households vary considerably. The potential environmental impact from this activity also varies depending
on the modes of transport that are chosen: walking or cycling instead of using a motor vehicle, taking public transportation rather than driving a private vehicle.

The cost of transportation accounted for $17 \%$, or $\$ 5$ 603, of total household expenditure (FAMEX, 1990). Most of this amount ( $88 \%$ ) is for private vehicles, the rest being for public transport. Fuel alone accounts for $23 \%$ of expenditures on private vehicles.

Households show a clear preference for private automobile travel when commuting to and from work. Overall, $76 \%$ of households reported at least one member who drives to work (Table 5). This rate does vary among metropolitan areas, although it is generally quite high (Table 6). The rate of private vehicle use ranged from $83 \%$ in Windsor and Kitchener-Waterloo, to $65 \%$ in Halifax.

Table 5: Commuting Patterns by Area and Dwelling Type, 1991

|  | Households where at least one member |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Has employment outside the home | Drives private vehicie | Uses public transportation |
|  | thousand |  | ent |
| Major metropolitan areas (population of 100000 and over) |  |  |  |
| Single, detached | 2255 | 77 | 17 |
| Single, attached | 639 | 74 | 24 |
| Apartment or flat | 1391 | 57 | 34 |
| Other | 42 | ... | ... |
| Other areas |  |  |  |
| Single, detached | 1859 | 82 | 2 |
| Single, attached | 203 | 77 | 5 |
| Apartment or flat | 254 | 67 | 9 |
| Other | 115 | ... | $\cdots$ |
| Canada | 6758 | 76 | 15 |

In contrast, only 15\% of Canadian households report that at least one member uses public transportation for travelling to and from their workplace. This rate also varies through metropolitan areas. It is generally higher in the larger and more densely populated metropolitan areas such as Toronto ( $33 \%$ ) and Montréal ( $30 \%$ ).

## INCOME AND HOUSEHOLD ACTIVITY

Environmentally relevant expenditures and activities may also be associated with household income. This variable is correlated with some of the geographic factors, such as urban structure, already discussed in this chapter. Income is related to the level of education attained, which might in turn influence the overall environmental awareness and activities chosen in a household.

Table 6: Commuting Patterns by Census Metropolitan Area, 1991


Note:
See the standard error symbols at the end of this chapter.
Source:
Statistics Canada, Household Environment Survey.
In fact, higher household incomes are associated with higher rates of adoption of certain environmentally useful practices (Table 7). With respect to energy conservation practices, households in the highest income group report the highest use of compact fluorescent bulbs (16\%); the proportion of households with programmable or regularly lowered thermostats is also highest in this group ( $79 \%$ ). For access to facilities for paper recycling, the rates range from $40 \%$ in the lowest income group to $73 \%$ in the highest income group. The reported rate of use varies in much the same way, ranging from $77 \%$ to $93 \%$. In both cases, the differences are also related to factors discussed in previous sections: tenure and type of dwelling. Higher income households are more likely to be owners and reside in single detached dwellings than households in lower income groups.

In contrast to the positive correlation between income and the adoption of environmentally useful practices, Tables 8 and 9 show that the use of public transport declines in favour of automobile use as income increases.

Vehicle operation expenditures illustrate the differences in consumption between higher and lower income households (Table 8). Among households in the highest income decile, $94 \%$ are automobile or truck owners, compared to $90 \%$ in the fifth and $68 \%$ in the third deciles of income. The pattern of expenditure on automotive fuel is similar. The average expenditure increases with household
income, ranging from $\$ 659$ in the first income decile to \$ 2048 in the tenth. In addition, among the higher income groups, more households report expenditures on this commodity. In contrast, the proportion of households that report expenditure on public transit is higher in the lowest two deciles of income than in the highest two. However, the opposite is true for their average expenditure on this service (Table 8). The highest proportion of households with at least one member commuting to work by public transportation is in the first income group (37\%) but the lowest rate is in a middle income group, the seventh, at $21 \%$ (Table 9) ${ }^{1}$.

Table 7: Selected Practices and Characteristics by Household Income Group, 1991

| Income groups | Owning their dwelling | Thermostats programmable or lowered | Compact fuorescent bulbs | Living in single detached dweling | Access to paper recycling facilities and reporting use |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | percent of households |  |  |  |  |
| First (lowest) | 21 | 61 | 7 | 16 | 77 |
| Second | 23 | 64 | 6 | 16 | 86 |
| Third | 27 | 63 | 7 | 22 | 81 |
| Fourth | 37 | 70 | 6 | 28 | 88 |
| Fifth | 42 | 70 | 8 | 30 | 87 |
| Sixth | 46 | 72 | 12 | 35 | 88 |
| Seventh | 53 | 73 | 11 | 39 | 86 |
| Eighth | 65 | 70 | 12 | 50 | 89 |
| Ninth | 73 | 76 | 13 | 62 | 90 |
| Tenth (highest) | 87 | 79 | 16 | 74 | 93 |
| Canada | 55 | 72 | 11 | 44 | 85 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada. Household Environment Survey and Survey of Consumer Finance.

## CONCLUSIONS

Response to recycling programs appears to be very positive. In areas where the facilities are available, most households report that they are used. Some households, those residing in less densely populated areas or those living in apartments, for instance, have lower overall rates of access.

The data suggest that households are both conscious of their consumption of water and energy, and willing to take steps towards conservation. The extent to which energy and water-efficient fixtures are used is related to income level (at least, in the case of energy) and the tenure of the dwelling.

[^13]Table 8: Selected Transportation Expenditures, by Household Income Decile, 1991

| Income deciles | Households that own vehicies percent | Average household expenditure |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Automotive fuel |  | Public transit |  |
|  |  | dollars | percent reporting | dollars | percent reporting |
| First (lowest) | 21 | 659 | 22 | 243 | 84 |
| Second | 52 | 764 | 53 | 347 | 81 |
| Third | 68 | 952 | 73 | 383 | 77 |
| Fourth | 81 | 1058 | 83 | 350 | 70 |
| Fifth | 90 | 1246 | 92 | 371 | 70 |
| Sixth | 90 | 1415 | 91 | 339 | 74 |
| Seventh | 94 | 1436 | 94 | 396 | 76 |
| Eighth | 96 | 1852 | 97 | 383 | 72 |
| Ninth | 97 | 1776 | 96 | 436 | 74 |
| Tenth (highest) | 94 | 2048 | 98 | 459 | 77 |
| FAMEX cities | 78 | 1430 | 80 | 363 | 76 |
| Note: |  |  |  |  |  |
| "Average household expenditure" is the mean expenditure among all families reporting a non-zero expenditure in a given category. |  |  |  |  | reporting a |

## Table 9: Commuting Patterns by Household Income Group, 1991



However, Canadian households generally remain committed to the use of private vehicles. For travelling to work, commuters far prefer to drive their cars instead of using public transportation. This preference is probably related to the level of service in the transit system and the particular circumstances of individuals. The above results show, nevertheless, that those considerations are more important to the households than the possible environmental effects.

## DATA SOURCES

Refer to the publication Households and the Environment for details on the methodology of the 1991 Household Environment Survey. For comparisons between income categories, a subset of the Household Environment Survey was selected corresponding to the urban areas that were sampled in the 1990 Family Expenditure Survey. "FAMEX cities" include St. John's, Charlottetown, Summerside, Halifax, Saint John, Québec, Montréal, Ottawa, Toronto, Thunder Bay, Winnipeg, Regina, Saskatoon, Calgary, Edmonton, Vancouver and Victoria.

Expenditure data are taken from the Family Expenditure Survey. These are based on a survey of households in Census Metropolitan Areas.

## REFERENCES

Rathie, W.L. "The History of Garbage". Garbage: The Practical Journal for the Environment 2(4): 33-39,1990.

Statistics Canada. Family Expenditure Survey, 1990. Catalogue 62-555, Irregular,Ottawa, 1991.

Statistics Canada. Households and the Environment 1991. Catalogue 11-526, Occasional,Ottawa, 1992.

## Alphabetic Designation of Percent Standard Error

| A | 0 to.5 |
| :--- | :--- |
| B | .6 to 1.0 |
| C | 1.1 to 2.5 |
| D | 2.6 to 5.0 |
| E | 5.1 to 10.0 |
| F | 10.1 to 16.5 |
| G | 6.6 to 25.0 |
| H | $25.1+$ |

## 8 Pollution Abatement and Control Expenditures

by Craig Gaston

Pollution abatement and control expenditures (PAC) are of interest as a measure of the impact of environmental regulations on affected industries and, more broadly, as part of overall environmental expenditures in national income. Since both the desirable and undesirable outputs derive from the same process, the generation of pollution can be viewed as a joint product problem. In many cases, expenditures to reduce pollution are often not distinguishable from those outlays made to improve overall performance. There are, however, some expenditures which are solely for the purpose of pollution abatement and control. These are often described as "end-of-pipe" solutions. Using this restrictive but unambiguous definition, PAC capital expenditures amounted to over $\$ 1$ billion in 1989, or about $1 \%$ of total capital expenditures in Canada. Table 1 shows that the distribution of PAC expenditure is very uneven across industrial sectors.

Table 1: Relative Importance of PAC Expenditures, Selected Industries, 1989

| Industrial sector | PAC operating | PAC capital ${ }^{1}$ | Total capital | PAC/ <br> total capital |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | milion dollars |  |  | percent |
| Manufacturing | 469 | 918 | 18942 | 4.3 |
| Paper \& allied | 76 | 368 | 5501 | 6.7 |
| Primary metals | 258 | 288 | 2341 | 12.3 |
| Petroleum \& coal | 36 | 71 | 961 | 7.4 |
| Chemicals | 44 | 71 | 1627 | 4.4 |
| Mining | 77 | 80 | 3573 | 1.1 |
| Utilities | $x$ | 106 | 19486 | 1.1 |
| Total economy ${ }^{2}$ | 729 | 1188 | 89722 | 1.3 |
| Notes: <br> ${ }^{1}$ See Statistics Canada (1992) for more detail on this survey, especially Appendix F for an explanation of the difference between the above data and those contained in Table 2 of Statistics Canada (1992). <br> 2 The total excludes capital items charged to operating expenditures and capital expenditures made by residential construction, agriculture, fishing and construction industries. <br> Source: <br> Statistics Canada, Investment and Capital Stock Division. |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

The Pollution Abatement and Control survey, conducted for the first time in 1989 by Statistics Canada, intentionally avoided the ambiguity inherent in the use of a broader definition such as "environmental expenditures". Interna-
tionally, there is no consistent approach. A similar survey conducted in the United States asks specifically for change-in-process expenditures as well as end-of-pipe expenditures as do France, Sweden and the Netherlands. Norway has abandoned PAC surveys altogether, rather than present partial results.

There is no doubt that the Statistics Canada PAC survey represents a lower bound on environmental expenditures. A survey of environmentally related expenditures prepared for Environment Canada by Dun and Bradstreet (1991), reported $\$ 20.9$ billion in capital plus operating costs in 1989, over 12 times greater than the combined capital and operating expenditures figure resulting from the Statistics Canada survey. This wide difference is not surprising since it is possible to argue that major improvements costing many millions of dollars are at least partially environmentally motivated, even though the decision to invest is dependent on a number of factors aside from environmental protection.

## HISTORICAL PAC EXPENDITURES

Statistics Canada has asked respondents to its regular annual Capital Repair and Expenditure Survey (CRES) to report capital expenditures by purpose, one of which is pollution abatement and control. The respondents are asked to assign their capital expenditures to the most relevant category in recognition of the fact that many expenditures could be assigned to more than one category. Even though the total for 1989 is similar to that reported in the PAC survey of the same year, an examination of the results by establishment shows important inconsistencies, a fact which demonstrates the need for strict definitions. Nevertheless, CRES provides us with a unique source of information covering the period 1985-1990.

Table 2: Capital Expenditure by Purpose, 1985-1990

| Investment categories | 1985 | 1986 | 1987 | 1988 | 1989 | 1990 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | percent of total investment |  |  |  |  |  |
| Expansion/ modernization/other | 97.4 | 97.7 | 97.7 | 97.6 | 97.1 | 96.8 |
| Pollution abatement and control | . 7 | . 7 | . 6 | 1.1 | 1.7 | 2.1 |
| Improvement to working environment | . 9 | 1.0 | 1.1 | . 9 | . 8 | 7 |
| Reduction of energy costs | . 9 | 7 | . 5 | 4 | . 4 | 4 |

Source:
Statistics Canada, Investment and Capital Stock Division.

Table 2 shows a marked increase in the percentage of investment in pollution abatement equipment from 1988 to 1990 largely owing to the paper and allied industries and primary metal industries.

## PAC EXPENDITURES BY PROVINCE

Table 3 shows that the large relative increase in PAC expenditures between 1988 and 1990 is accounted for mainly by Ontario and British Columbia. Investment in general, and investment in PAC in particular, tends to be volatile, and one would expect considerable variation of these ratios as the aggregates observed become smaller.

Although the 1989 PAC survey is felt to be more meaningful than CRES due to the stricter definitions, it is interesting to observe the movement of the latter over time (since the PAC survey itself has been conducted for only one year, 1991). Table 3 shows that no one province devotes a consistently higher proportion of investment to polfution abatement than the others.

## PHYSICAL MEASURES OF POLLUTION ABATEMENT

An important measure of effectiveness of PAC expenditures is the reduction in pollutants. The 1989 PAC survey attempted to obtain information on the physical quantity of pollutants abated but experience has shown that this is difficult to achieve with a single questionnaire designed to cover all industrial sectors. Since a number of the most polluting industries are covered by environmental regulations, administrative data collected for this purpose are probably a better source of information on volumes of pollutants.

Figure 1: Discharges from Canadian Pulp and Paper Mills, 1970-1987


Source:
Environment Canada, 1991, p. 14-19
As an example, the above chart shows the decline of pollutants from the pulp and paper industry compared with increasing production. Of course, the total volume of pollut-

Table 3: Provincial PAC Expenditures

ants abated is, in itself, an inadequate measure of environmental impact since the toxicity of the pollutant is also important. Recent regulations governing the production of dioxins and furans, for example, require that the levels of these chemicals be kept below the measurable concentration which, in this case, is 50 parts per quadrillion ( $10^{15}$ ).

## CANADIAN VERSUS UNITED STATES PAC EXPENDITURES

Unlike the Canadian survey, the U.S. industrial PAC survey asks respondents to report the portion of change-inprocess investment which is related to pollution abatement. This is a subjective judgement by respondents that limits comparability both within and between sectors. The U.S. expenditures are higher than those for Canada at least partly for this reason.

Table 4: PAC Capital Expenditures as a Percentage of Total Capital Expenditures, Canada and U.S., 1989

|  | Total | Air | Water | Solid <br> waste |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | percent |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | 1.3 | .6 | .5 |  |
| Canada | 3.4 | 1.3 | 1.9 | .2 |  |
| United States |  |  |  |  |  |

Source:
OECD, 1992.

## CONCLUSION

End-of-pipe pollution abatement and control expenditures have been increasing in absolute terms and as a percentage of total investment. These costs represent a lower bound on total PAC expenditures, many of which are impossible to isolate due to the complexity of the investment decision making process. There are no international standards in the definition or measurement of these costs and as a result, comparisons with other surveys should be made with caution.

There is an inherent ambiguity in interpreting PAC expenditures since end-of-pipe outlays are not necessarily the most efficient way to prevent pollution. In many instances, a change in production process leads to a more efficient use of energy and raw materials and reduces the need to install expensive and "non-productive" capital for the purpose of pollution abatement. Since the joint product nature of the problem precludes knowledge of the total costs associated with pollution control, it is useful to know the actual reductions in specific pollutants as well as expenditures on pollution abatement and control.

## REFERENCES

Dun \& Bradstreet Canada. Market Survey of Environmental Expenditures by Canadian Business. Report prepared for Environment Canada. Duns Marketing Services, May, 1991.

Environment Canada. The State of Canada's Environment. Ottawa, 1991.

Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). Pollution Abatement and Control Survey 1992. ENV/EPOC/GEEI(92)11. Preliminary. Paris, 1992.

Statistics Canada, "Analysis of the 1989 Pollution Abatement and Control Survey". Uncatalogued. Investment and Capital Stock Division, Ottawa, 1992.

## 9 Packaging Use and Disposition

by Marcia Santiago

## INTRODUCTION

Packaging material is used to protect, to contain, or to transport commodities. It is also used to market products and to communicate information about products. Most importantly, packaging may protect commodities from damage or spoilage. However, packaging is also associated with a number of environmental concerns, the most prominent of which is the disposal of solid waste.

In 1989, Canadian environment ministers gave formal recognition to the need for packaging policy in managing solid waste. The National Packaging Protocol, which resulted from this recognition, recommended six management policies:
packaging shall have minimal effects on the environment;
priority will be given to the management of packaging through source reduction, reuse and recycling;

- a continuing campaign of information and education will be undertaken to make all Canadians aware of the function and environmental impacts of packaging;
䀝 these policies will apply to all packaging used in Canada, including imports;
- regulations will be implemented as necessary to achieve compliance with these policies; and
all government policies and practices affecting packaging will be consistent with these national policies.

Ultimately, the protocol seeks to reduce the quantity of packaging material that is sent to landfills. Over the next few years, diversion targets should be met and, by the year 2000 , it is expected that packaging sent for disposal shall not exceed $50 \%$ of the 1988 level of 5.3 million tonnes (National Task Force on Packaging, 1992a).

Using results from the 1990 National Packaging Survey (ibid.), this chapter presents a profile of industrial packaging disposition and use. It describes the materials and the users of industrial packaging, with particular attention paid to the use, reuse, recycling and disposal of packaging.

## Figure 1: Packaging Flows



## PACKAGING FLOWS

Businesses typically handle packaging in conjunction with products they ship and with products they receive. Firms are described here as "using" packaging when it is filled with the product to be shipped whereas both businesses and households are said to have "consumed" packaging when it is removed from the product purchased. The use of packaging is equal to its consumption, except for the quantities attached to imported or exported goods. Since the survey included the waste management industry, estimates are available for the amount of household packaging waste that was recycled in 1990. It is therefore possible to calculate the total disposal for Canada as the difference between consumption and the sum of reused and recycled packaging (see Figure 1).

## PACKAGING MATERIALS

The consumption of packaging materials amounted to 13.5 million tonnes during 1990 (see Table 1). Wood was the leading material employed, accounting for $39 \%$ of the total quantity consumed. Most wood packaging was in pallets, accounting for 4.9 million of the 5.3 million tonnes of wood packaging consumed. Consumption of paper packaging, including cardboard (paperboard) amounted to over 3 million tonnes ( $23 \%$ of the total), with the largest portion consisting of corrugated cartons, boxes and cases. Most goods sold, from food products to electronic equipment, have at least some amount of cardboard or paper packaging attached. Glass and plastic materials made up 16\% and $10 \%$ of the total packaging consumed in 1990.

Eighty-five percent ${ }^{1}$ of wood packaging was estimated to be reused or recycled. Pallets, the largest component of

[^14]wood packaging, can be used over and over with only occasional minor repairs, so the low disposal of wood is not surprising. Glass also has a high rate of reuse and recycling ( $69 \%$ ). For paper and plastic which represent the second and fourth largest volumes of packaging material, the rate of reuse and recycling is lower. Seventy-nine percent of plastic was disposed while $48 \%$ of paper was sent to landfills or incinerated. Paper was the largest material by weight to be disposed of. As a percentage of total packag. ing consumed in 1990, 33\% ( 4.5 millions tonnes) was discarded.

Figure 2: Disposition of Packaging, 1990


Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Packaging Survey and National Task Force on Packaging.

Table 1: Consumption and Disposition by Packaging Type, 1990

| Material | Types | Total consumed |  | Total reused |  | Total recycled |  | Total disposed |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | thousand tonnes | percent | thousand tonnes | percent | thousand tonnes | percent | thousand tonnes | percent |
| Wood | pallets, boxes, crates | 5327 | 39.4 | 4187 | 57.1 | 335 | 20.1 | 805 | 17.8 |
| Paper | corrugated cartons, boxes, labels | 3149 | 23.3 | 899 | 12.3 | 723 | 43.4 | 1527 | 33.7 |
| Glass | carboys, bottles, containers | 2185 | 16.2 | 1373 | 18.7 | 136 | 8.1 | 676 | 14.9 |
| Plastic | containers, foam egg trays, wrap, liners | 1358 | 10.0 | 190 | 2.6 | 95 | 5.7 | 1073 | 23.7 |
| Metal | aluminum cans, caps, steel strapping | 888 | 6.6 | 362 | 4.9 | 162 | 9.7 | 364 | 8.0 |
| Muiti-material | mikk and juice cartons | 193 | 1.4 | 7 | ** | 36 | 2.2 | 150 | 3.3 |
| Textiles and other materials | jute sacks, bags, wrapping | 426 | 3.1 | 318 | 4.4 | 180 | 10.8 | - | -- |
| Total |  | 13526 | 100.0 | 7336 | 100.0 | 1667 | 100.0 | 4595 | 100.0 |

## Sources:

Statistics Canada, National Packaging Survey and National Task Force on Packaging.

## PACKAGING USE BY INDUSTRY

The manufacturing sector was the largest user of packaging, accounting for well over 10 million tonnes of the total 13.3 million tonnes used (see Table 2). Manufacturing industries, excluding food, beverage, and tobacco, were least heavily involved in reuse of packaging. Use of packaging material was relatively evenly spaced across the other industry groups, except agriculture, for which use was estimated at 376 thousand tonnes. The estimated packaging use by the wholesale and retail trade industries is not surprising, given their activity of packaging goods and selling them to consumers. Of the important industries in terms of packaging use, the largest percentage of packaging reuse was in the beverage manufacturing industry. This is consistent with the large proportion of glass packaging, which is most commonly used in distributing beverages to consumers.

It is important to note that wooden pallets account for over one-third of all packaging used, by weight, and that there is an economic incentive to reuse these rather than to recycle or discard them. The high reuse of packaging as a percent of use is partly due to this fact. (See Table 2.)

Table 2: Industrial Use and Reuse of Packaging, 1990

| Industry | Used (includes reused) |  | Reused |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | thousand tonnes | percent | thousand tonnes | percent of used |
| Agriculture | 376 | 2.8 | 200 | 53 |
| Manufacturing (excl. food and beverages) | 4287 | 32.3 | 1630 | 38 |
| Food manufacturing | 3556 | 26.8 | 1444 | 41 |
| Beverage manufacturing | 2423 | 18.3 | 2076 | 86 |
| Wholesale and retail trade | 2477 | 18.7 | 1853 | 75 |
| Other industries | 138 | 1.0 | 129 | 93 |
| Total | 13257 | 100.0 | 7332 | 55 |

Sources:
Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Packaging Survey and National Task Force on Packaging.

## PROVINCIAL CONSUMPTION AND REUSE

The provincial pattern of recycling rates (as a percentage of consumption) is similar to that observed in the Local Government Waste Management Practices Survey (see Chapter 11, Table 3). In both cases, Ontario had the highest rate of recycling followed by British Columbia.

Table 3: Provincial Consumption and Recycling of Packaging, 1990

| Province | Total consumed |  | Recycled |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | thousand tonnes | percent | thousand tomes | percent of consumed |
| Newfoundiand | 166 | 1.2 | -- | - |
| Prince Edward island | 47 | 0.3 | 4 | 9 |
| Nova Scotia | 338 | 2.5 | 24 | 7 |
| New Brunswick | 295 | 2.2 | 13 | 4 |
| Quebec | 3516 | 26.0 | 325 | 9 |
| Ontario | 5820 | 43.0 | 1065 | 18 |
| Manitoba | 514 | 3.8 | 31 | 6 |
| Saskatchewan | 328 | 2.4 | 17 | 5 |
| Alberta | 1130 | 8.4 | 41 | 4 |
| British Columbia | 1956 | 10.0 | 144 | 11 |
| Yukon | 5 | 0.0 | 0 | - |
| North West Territories | 11 | 0.1 | 0 | -- |
| Canada | 13527 | 100.0 | 1664 | 12 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, National Packaging Survey and National Task Force on Packaging.

## DATA SOURCES AND METHODOLOGY

In 1991, Statistics Canada conducted the National Packaging Survey. A large representative sample of establishments in all major industry groups was selected. Thirtytwo packaging categories were defined in the survey, spanning seven broad groups of materials: plastic, wood, textiles, glass, metal and multi-material packaging. Respondents were asked to report quantities (in tonnes) of packaging that was used during the 1990 calendar year. They were also asked to report the proportions of new and reused content in the materials. Finally, survey respondents were asked to report the quantities of packaging that were reused, recycled and sent for disposal.

Estimates of use, reuse, and recycling of packaging materials presented in this chapter were based upon the responses to the National Packaging Survey described in National Task Force on Packaging (1992b). Certain data collected by the survey were not deemed reliable. For instance, businesses were not generally capable of providing a good estimate of the amount of packaging discarded. Disposal was, therefore, calculated residually. Packaging attached to imports and exports of goods was based on data from the International Trade Division. The exports and imports of in-use packaging were pro-rated in proportion to the packaging used. Imports and exports of new packaging (not attached to goods) came from the International Trade Division of Statistics Canada. These data were available by commodity group and were allocated to industries and provinces on a proportional basis.

Provincial consumption of packaging was not measured directly since inter-provincial trade of in-use packaging was not known. Packaging was assigned to two categories, industrial and consumer. Total Industrial pack-
aging was allocated to provinces according to provincial sales for each industry group, whereas consumer packaging was distributed according to provincial population. Provincial recycling rates for each packaging type and industrial sector were based upon survey data.

For further analysis of these data and for comparisons with the 1988 benchmark levels, see National Task Force on Packaging (1992b). For information on the establishment of the 1988 benchmark see National Task Force on Packaging (1992a).

## REFERENCES

National Task Force on Packaging (NTFP). National Packaging Protocol: 1988 Benchmark Estimates. Report prepared for the Canadian Council of Ministers of the Environment. Office of Waste Management, Environment Canada. Hull, Quebec, December, 1992a.

National Task Force on Packaging (NTFP), National Packaging Protocol: Results of the 1990 National Packaging Survey. Report prepared for the Canadian Council of Ministers of the Environment. Office of Waste Management, Environment Canada. Hull, Quebec, December, 1992b.

## 10 Waste Management Industry Survey

by Craig Gaston

The waste management industry, which is not officially defined in the 1980 Standard Industrial Classification, includes all establishments that are primarily engaged in the collecting, hauling, recycling or disposing of waste material ${ }^{1}$. This industry is comprised of private companies as well as local government departments. Until recently, the waste management industry has not been surveyed by Statistics Canada. Therefore, two recent surveys covering the private and public components provide important, new information on the industry's structure in Canada. Chapter 11 provides preliminary information from the 1990 Local Government Waste Management Practices Survey and this chapter presents the 1989 Waste Management Industry Survey results.

The 1989 survey gathered information on 643 companies representing some 759 establishments. These establishments accounted for over $\$ 1.1$ billion in revenues and employed almost 10000 people. Table 1 shows that almost $72 \%$ of industry revenues were earned from

[^15] ties Industry (SIC 4999).
collection and haulage of waste, while about $21 \%$ came from disposal. In principal, disposal revenues are earned by operators of waste disposal facilities such as landfills, incinerators, etc. There is evidence, however, that some respondents indicated disposal revenues even though they provided only collection and transportation services.

Relatively high disposal revenue shares can be expected in provinces which are characterized by densely populated urban areas where space suitable for new landfilis is scarce. This pattern is detectable in Table 1 notwithstanding the exception of Newfoundland. Local government involvement in waste disposal also effects disposal revenues. A relatively high proportion of contractors are responsible for waste disposal in both Quebec and British Columbia according to the Local Government Waste Management Practices Survey ${ }^{2}$. Recycling services and sales of recycled goods accounted for less than $2 \%$ of industry income nationally. Even in Ontario, where recycling programs are best established ${ }^{3}$, the share of total revenues from this activity was only $2.6 \%$.

In Table 2 the category "Other expenses" contains such costs as depreciation, taxes and professional and contracted services.

Firm size appears to be a significant factor in the pattern of relative costs (see Table 3). Salary and wage costs as a percentage of total revenue increase with declining revenue size whereas tipping expenses show the opposite tendency. Fuel costs show a similar pattern to

[^16]Table 1: Revenues by Type of Service and Province, 1989

| Province | Establishments | Total revenue | Collection and haulage | Disposal | Recycling | Sales of recycled goods | Sales of energy | Other sales |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | number | millions of dollars | percent of provincial revenue |  |  |  |  |  |
| Newfoundland | 28 | 9 | 45.8 | 46.8 | 1.4 | . 1 | $\cdot$ | 5.8 |
| Prince Edward Isiand | 5 | $\times$ | $x$ | $\times$ | x | $\times$ | $\times$ | x |
| Nova Scotia | 45 | 13.2 | 81.5 | 13.3 | 1.7 | . 3 | 4 | 2.8 |
| New Brunswick | 24 | 4.8 | 80.7 | 17.6 | . 5 | 1 | - | 1.1 |
| Quebec | 207 | 339.6 | 70.0 | 22.6 | 3 | . 1 | - | 7.0 |
| Ontario | 222 | 517.7 | 70.5 | 21.3 | 2.6 | 8 | . 1 | 4.7 |
| Manitoba | 19 | 14.4 | 84.7 | 13.5 | . 8 | . 1 | . 6 | . 3 |
| Saskatchewan | 23 | 4.6 | 80.5 | 12.7 | 1.9 | . 1 | - | 4.8 |
| Alberta | 63 | 91.0 | 77.1 | 17.5 | 2.2 | . 1 | 2 | 2.9 |
| British Columbia | 112 | 127.8 | 76.1 | 19.6 | 1.0 | . 1 | 1 | 3.0 |
| Yukon and N.W.T. | 11 | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ | $x$ |
| Canada | 759 | 1119.1 | 71.9 | 20.8 | 1.6 | . 4 | . 1 | 5.0 |

Statistics Canada, industry Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

Table 2: Distribution of Expenses by Province, 1989

| Province | Establishments | Total expenses | Tipping fees | Fuel and electricity | Other materials | Salaries and wages | Other expenses |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | number | millions of dollars | percent of total expenses |  |  |  |  |
| Newfoundland | 28 | 0.8 | 2.2 | 12.9 | 10.9 | 46.6 | 27.5 |
| Prince Edward Island | 5 | x | * | $\times$ | $\times$ | x | x |
| Nova Scotia | 45 | 11.5 | 18.0 | 6.5 | 16.1 | 27.8 | 31.5 |
| New Brunswick | 24 | 4.3 | 6.2 | 7.2 | 37.8 | 30.8 | 18.2 |
| Quebec | 207 | 284.2 | 19.5 | 5.3 | 22.6 | 29.3 | 23.4 |
| Ontario | 222 | 448.8 | 30.1 | 4.2 | 14.6 | 24.5 | 26.6 |
| Manitoba | 19 | 12.1 | 25.3 | 6.5 | 6.9 | 22.1 | 39.2 |
| Saskatchewan | 23 | 4.1 | 13.5 | 9.8 | 10.8 | 36.3 | 29.6 |
| Alberta | 63 | 73.4 | 17.3 | 5.0 | 8.8 | 28.7 | 40.1 |
| British Columbia | 112 | 107.8 | 26.1 | 4.4 | 14.0 | 25.4 | 30.2 |
| Yukon and N.W.T. | 11 | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ | $\times$ |
| Canada | 759 | 952.0 | 24.9 | 4.7 | 16.5 | 26.6 | 27.3 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Industry Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

Table 3: Distribution of Expenses by Company Size, 1989

| Revenue class | Companies | Total expenses | Tipping fees | Fuel and electricity | Other materials | Salaries and wages | Other expenses |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | number | millions of $\qquad$ tollars | percent of total expenses |  |  |  |  |
| Greater than \$5 million | 27 | 665.2 | 26.5 | 3.5 | 17.2 | 24.0 | 28.9 |
| \$1-\$4.9 milion | 100 | 185.1 | 26.4 | 6.2 | 16.4 | 30.2 | 20.7 |
| \$.5-\$.9 million | 100 | 59.2 | 15.0 | 9.4 | 11.5 | 34.5 | 29.5 |
| Less than \$.5 million | 416 | 42.6 | 8.5 | 10.6 | 12.2 | 40.1 | 28.6 |
| All companies | 643 | 952.0 | 24.9 | 4.7 | 16.5 | 26.6 | 27.3 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Industry Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.
salaries and wages. The fact that larger firms are more likely to operate in densely populated urban areas could partly explain the correlation of tipping expense ratios to size.

Table 4: Employment and Salaries by Company Size, 1989

| Revenue class of company | Employees | Salaries and wages | Salaries and wages per employee | Salaries and wages/ revenue |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | number | millions of dollars | thousands of dollars | percent |
| Greater than \$5 million | 6084 | 159.6 | 26.2 | 20.1 |
| \$1-\$4.9 miltion | 1868 | 55.9 | 29.9 | 26.7 |
| \$.5-\$.9 million | 897 | 20.4 | 22.8 | 30.5 |
| Less than $\$ .5$ million | 947 | 17.1 | 18.0 | 34.6 |
| All companies | 9796 | 253.1 | 25.8 | 22.6 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Industry Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

Table 4 shows that about $60 \%$ of industry employment is in companies with revenues greater than $\$ 5$ million. These companies account for over $70 \%$ of the total industry revenues. Although a larger proportion of revenues is paid to employees as the firm size diminishes, employees in the smaller firms earn a lower average salary.

This brief profile of the private sector waste management industry is limited by a lack of time series information. The growth of the industry over time and the changing composition of revenues and expenses is a subject of increasing interest as waste management continues to be a focus of public attention. For more information on the 1989 Waste Management Industry Survey see Statistics Canada (1992).

## REFERENCES

Statistics Canada. "1989 Waste Management Survey". Uncatalogued. Industry Division, Ottawa, 1992.

# 11 Local Government Waste Management Practices Survey 

by Craig Gaston and Alan Goodall ${ }^{\prime}$

## INTRODUCTION

This chapter provides a preliminary report of some results from the national Local Government Waste Management Practices Survey. This survey sampled municipalities of all types and some special purpose boards known to be heavily involved in waste management. While questionnaires were mailed to a total of 1000 local government entities, data presented here reflect only 83 lower-tier municipalities ${ }^{2}$ that had a population of greater than 50000 in 1991. These 83 entities accounted for about half of the Canadian population.

The survey, the first of its kind for Statistics Canada, contained a number of questions designed to profile the practices of local governments with respect to the collection, transportation and disposal of garbage, as well as recycling and the handling of hazardous waste. As a pilot study, it was intended to obtain an overview of the structure and function of Canadian local government activities pertaining to waste management. Toward this end, the surveyed sample included every type of local government believed to have some responsibility for waste management. Questions were asked to determine whether the various functions were performed by the municipality surveyed, by contractors, or by another level of government. Information was also sought on a number of other items, including costs associated with waste management. A comprehensive examination of financial and other data is to be released in the final full survey report.

## RESULTS

Based upon the total annual quantities reported, the 83 municipalities collected, on average, slightly over 0.9 tonnes of residential garbage ${ }^{3}$ per dwelling served or about 2.5 kilograms per day (see Figure 1). Seventy-three of these municipalities reported having a recycling program, through which approximately $9 \%$ (by weight) of the

[^17]total waste ${ }^{4}$ stream was recycled. (This excludes private contracts by apartment building operators.)

Fifty-six of the municipalities had some form of residential hazardous waste program while only 10 had a program for non-residential hazardous wastes.

Thirty-six of the municipalities reported having arranged for waste composition studies, an important step towards effective waste management. In addition, 53 of the municipalities had some form of waste reduction program (public education, for example, but not recycling).

Figure 1: Garbage Collected per Dwelling, 1990


Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

## Collection

Waste collection is primarily a function of lower-tier governments, frequently involving both contractors and municipal employees. Eighteen municipalities (22\%) reported using only their own employees for this purpose and 40 ( $48 \%$ ) reported hiring only contractors (see Table 1). On a regional basis, only $5 \%$ of Quebec respondents had their own employees performing this function while $84 \%$ of them used only contractors. Municipalities within census metropolitan areas (CMAs) or census agglomerations (CAs) with populations of less than 500000 tended to use their own employees while those in CMAs or CAs greater than 500000 relied more on contractors.

[^18]Table 1: Garbage Collection by Agent Responsible, Municipality Size and Region, 1990

|  | Population of CA/CMA to which municipality belongs |  |  | Canada | Region |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & 50000 \\ & 499999 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 500000 \text { - } \\ 999999 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1000000 \\ & \text { and over } \end{aligned}$ |  | Atlantic Provinces | Quebec | Ontario | Prairie Provinces | 8.C. |
| Number of municipalities reporting | 37 | 14 | 32 | 83 | 5 | 19 | 37 | 7 | 15 |
| Agent responsible for collection | percent of muricipalities reporting |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Municipal employees only | 32 | 14 | 13 | 22 | 40 | 5 | 27 | 14 | 27 |
| Contractors only | 30 | 64 | 83 | 48 | 40 | 84 | 41 | 14 | 40 |
| Municipal employees and other | 5 | 0 | 3 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 29 | 7 |
| Municipal employees, other levels of government and other | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| Municipal employees and contractors | 24 | 21 | 22 | 23 | 20 | 11 | 27 | 43 | 20 |
| Municipal employees, contractors and other | 5 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 3 | $\bigcirc$ | 7 |
| Total | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public Institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

Table 2: Garbage Disposal by Agent Responsible, Municipality Size and Region, 1990

|  | Population of CA/CMA to which municipality belongs |  |  | Canada | Region |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 50000 - <br> 499999 | $\begin{array}{r} 500000- \\ 999999 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1000000 \\ & \text { and over } \end{aligned}$ |  | Atlantic Provinces | Quebec | Ontario | Praifie Provinces | 8.C. |
| Number of municipalities reporting | 37 | 14 | 32 | 83 | 5 | 19 | 37 | 7 | 15 |
| Agent responslble for disposal | percent of municipalities reporting |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Municipal employees only | 35 | 21 | 6 | 22 | 60 | 11 | 16 | 71 | 13 |
| Contractors only | 24 | 0 | 44 | 28 | 0 | 58 | 14 | 29 | 33 |
| Other levels of government only | 30 | 64 | 44 | 41 | 40 | 32 | 57 | 0 | 33 |
| Contractors and other levels of government | 3 | 7 | 3 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 0 | 7 |
| Municipal employees and other | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| Municipal employees and other levels of government | 3 | 7 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 7 |
| Municipal employees and contractors | 3 | 0 | 3 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 7 |
| Total | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public Instiutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

## Disposal

Upper-tier governments play a much more important role in waste disposal than they do in collection. Thirty-three of the municipalities ( $41 \%$ ) indicated that this function was handled solely by other levels of government (see Table 2). Contractors were exclusively involved in waste disposal for $23(28 \%)$ of the municipalities while $18(22 \%)$ used only their own employees. Again, population size is a factor as the municipalities within a CMA or CA having a population of under 500000 tended to rely more on their own employees, whereas those within CMAs or CAs with a population greater than 500000 contracted the function or relied more heavily on the upper tier. Regionally, Quebec municipalities
tended to rely more on contractors for disposal while disposal programs were run most frequently by upper-tier local governments in Ontario.

## Recycling Programs

Seventy-three municipalities ( $88 \%$ ) reported having an organized recycling program (of which 54 provided details) (see Table 3). In all size groups and regions, the percentage of respondents with recycling programs was quite high, ranging from a low of $74 \%$ in Quebec to $100 \%$ in the Prairies. Both collection and preparation for sale of recyclable ${ }^{1}$ materials are most often handied by contractors (see Tables 4 and 5). Municipal employees play a much smaller role in

Table 3: Recycling Programs and Percent of Waste Recycled by Municipality Size and Region, 1990

|  | Population of CA/CMA to which municipality belongs |  |  | Canada | Region |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & 50000 . \\ & 499999 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 500000- \\ 999999 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1000000 \\ & \text { and over } \end{aligned}$ |  | Atlantic Provinces | Quebec | Ontario | Prairie Provinces | B.C. |
| Number of municipalities reporting | 37 | 14 | 32 | 83 | 5 | 19 | 37 | 7 | 15 |
|  |  |  |  |  | ercent |  |  |  |  |
| Municipalities with recycling program | 86 | 93 | 88 | 88 | 80 | 74 | 97 | 100 | 80 |
| Waste recycled as a proportion of total waste collected | 9 | 7 | 10 | 9 | 4 | 5 | 13 | 6 | 10 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Pubbic Institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

Table 4: Collection of Recyclable Materials by Agent Responsible, Municipality Size and Region, 1990

|  | Population of CA/CMA to which municipality belongs |  |  | Canada | Region |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & 50000 \text { - } \\ & 499999 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 500000 \text {. } \\ 999999 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1000000 \\ \text { and over } \end{array}$ |  | Atlantic Provinces | Quebec | Ontario | Prairie Provinces | B.C. |
| Number of municipalities reporting | 37 | 14 | 32 | 83 | 5 | 19 | 37 | 7 | 15 |
| Agent responsible for collecting recyclable materlals | percent of municipalities reporting |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Municipalities' employees only | 11 | 14 | 22 | 16 | 20 | 5 | 22 | 14 | 13 |
| Contractors only | 46 | 36 | 56 | 48 | 40 | 58 | 57 | 14 | 33 |
| Other levels of government only | 8 | 21 | 6 | 10 | 0 | 5 | 14 | 0 | 13 |
| Other only | 14 | 7 | 0 | 7 | 20 | 5 | 0 | 29 | 13 |
| Contractors and other | B | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 14 | 7 |
| Municipal employees and contractors | 0 | 7 | 3 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 14 | 0 |
| Municipal employees, contractors and other | 0 | 7 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 14 | 0 |
| Municipal employees, contractors and other levels of government | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| No program | 11 | 7 | 13 | 11 | 20 | 26 | 0 | 0 | 20 |
| Total | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public Institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division
these functions compared to general waste management. Other organizations (primarily volunteer organizations and private enterprises) also play an important part in recycling operations. Upper-tier local governments tend to be more involved in the handling and preparation for sale of recycled materials than in their collection.

Table 6 shows the percentage of municipalities offering a recycling program for each of the nine materials listed by type of collection service offered. Percentages are based upon information from the 54 respondents reporting the detail of their programs. All of the municipalities reported newsprint recycling for low density dwellings. As one might expect, the frequency of such programs decreases as the density of dwelling increases since the logistics of coordi-

[^19]nating recycling programs for multiple unit dwellings may be more complex. The fourth column in Table 6 shows the percentage of local governments offering a depot recycling program. It should be noted that the existence of a program for compostable materials does not mean all possible materials in this category are collected. In some cases municipalities have reported collecting only Christmas trees.

## Hazardous Waste Programs

Fifty-six (67\%) of the municipalities reported they had a residential hazardous waste program. Ontario had the highest regional representation, with $95 \%$ of municipalities reporting some type of program (see Table 7). Note that for this survey, once-per-year household hazardous waste drop-off programs qualified as valid responses.

Table 5: Sorting and Preparing of Recyclable Materials for Sale by Agent Responsible, Municipality Size and Region, 1990

|  | Population of CA/CMA to which municipality belongs |  |  | Canada | Region |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & 50000 . \\ & 499999 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 500000- \\ 999999 \end{array}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1000000 \\ \text { and over } \end{array}$ |  | Atlantic Provinces | Quebec | Ontario | Prairie Provinces | B.C. |
| Number of municipalities reported | 37 | 14 | 32 | 83 | 5 | 19 | 37 | 7 | 15 |
| Agent responsible for sorting/preparing recyclable materials | percent of municipalities reporting |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Municipal employees only | 5 | 7 | 0 | 4 | 20 | 0 | 3 | 14 | 0 |
| Contractors only | 41 | 50 | 47 | 45 | 40 | 58 | 43 | 43 | 33 |
| Other levels of government only | 19 | 21 | 22 | 20 | 0 | 11 | 35 | 0 | 13 |
| Other only | 16 | 14 | 3 | 11 | 20 | 5 | 3 | 43 | 20 |
| Contractors and other | 5 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 7 |
| Contractors and other levels of government | 3 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| Other levels of government and other | 0 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| Municipal employees and other levels of government | 0 | 0 | 3 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 |
| No program | 11 | 7 | 22 | 14 | 20 | 26 | 5 | 0 | 27 |
| Total | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 | 100 |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public Institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

## Backyard Composting

Thirty-two municipalities (39\%) indicated that a backyard composting program existed within their boundaries. Of these, 28 provided data on the number of composters distributed. As reported, over 83000 composters had been distributed. Thirty percent were supplied by the municipality, $17 \%$ by contractors, $42 \%$ by other levels of government, with the remainder supplied by other organizations.

Table 6: Recycling Collection Programs and Depots, 1990

| Recyclable Material | Recycing collection program |  |  | Depots |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Low density dwellings | Medium density dwellings | High density dwellings |  |
|  | percent |  |  |  |
| Newspaper | 100 | 61 | 37 | 54 |
| Cardboard | 50 | 30 | 20 | 35 |
| Fine paper | 20 | 7 | 4 | 28 |
| Glass | 96 | 59 | 35 | 41 |
| Ferrous metal | 85 | 50 | 30 | 39 |
| Non-ferrous metal | 76 | 48 | 33 | 37 |
| Plastic | 67 | 37 | 30 | 37 |
| Compostable materials | 33 | 17 | 9 | 13 |
| Used motor oil | 15 | 7 | 2 | 13 |

## Note:

Based on detaifed information provided by 54 municipalities that provided details of their recycing programs.
Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public Institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

## Disposal Facilities

Information was provided for 165 of the disposal facilities used by respondents (see Table 8). Sanitary landfills are the most commonly reported means of waste disposal for municipalities with a population of 50000 and over. However, not all the sites (as described by respondents) appear to meet the criteria set for sanitary landfills. At a minimum, in addition to frequent and regular coverage of waste, a sanitary landfill must have either a natural or an artificial liner to prevent leachate from contaminating groundwater.

Of the 100 landfills reported, some detailed characteristics were provided for 60 sanitary landfills within local municipal boundaries (see Table 8). As reported, in addition to frequent coverage of waste, these sites had the attributes shown in Table 9.

## DATA QUALITY

Completed questionnaires were received for all of the 83 lower-tier governments reported here. Most of these were contacted by telephone in order to clarify responses, correct inconsistencies and obtain missing information. As a result of this follow-up, data on the availability of programs and the agent responsible for their delivery is considered to be very accurate. The more detailed information on characteristics of disposal sites is of lower quality because not all municipalities were able to provide these data. Population counts were verified using information from the 1991 Census of Population.

Table 7: Hazardous Waste Program by Type of Program, Municipality Size and Region, 1990

|  | Population of CA/CMA to which Municipality Belongs |  |  | Canada | Region |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & 50000- \\ & 499999 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{array}{r} 500000- \\ 999999 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1000000 \\ & \text { and over } \end{aligned}$ |  | Attantic Provinces | Quebec | Ontario | Prairies Provinces | B.C. |
| Number of municipalities reporting | 37 | 14 | 32 | 83 | 5 | 19 | 37 | 7 | 15 |
|  | percent of municipalities reporting |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Residential | 70 | 64 | 66 | 67 | 20 | 42 | 95 | 86 | 40 |
| Non-residential | 16 | 29 | 0 | 12 | 20 | 0 | 8 | 43 | 20 |

## Sources:

Statistics Canada, Public Institutions Division and National Accounts and Envifonment Division.

Table 8: Garbage Handling and Disposal Facilities, 1990

| Type of facitity as reported by respondent | Number | Percent |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Sanitary landfils | 100 | 61 |
| Other landfills | 5 | 3 |
| Volume reduction facilities | 7 | 4 |
| (e.g. incinerators) | 7 | 4 |
| Material recovery facilities | 46 | 28 |
| Transfer stations | . |  |
| Quarry dumps | 165 | 100 |
| Total |  |  |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public Institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

Table 9: Sanitary Landfills by Characteristics Reported, 1990

|  | Number reported |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Yes | No | No |
| Characteristic | 48 | 11 | 1 | 60 |
| Presence of weigh scales | 27 | 9 | 24 | 60 |
| Natural attenuation | 17 | 35 | 8 | 60 |
| Artificial liner | 29 | 27 | 4 | 60 |
| Leachate coliection system | 11 | 41 | 8 | 60 |
| Methane gas harnessing system |  |  |  |  |

Sources:
Statistics Canada, Public institutions Division and National Accounts and Environment Division.

Data were requested for the fiscal year ending nearest December 31, 1990 but many respondents reported programs implemented subsequent to that date. As it was not possible to correct for this tendency, some percentages are higher than would be expected for the reporting period requested. An analysis of responses to the recycling question indicates that the impact is greatest on local governments with the smallest population. There does not appear to be a regional bias to this tendency.

## LOCAL GOVERNMENTS: UPPER AND LOWER TIERS

Local government in Canada includes all government entities below the provincial/territorial level which, by the terms of their establishment, do not form part of the provincial/territorial level. Within this broad category, structures and responsibilities of local governments are further divided between municipalities, special purpose boards and local school districts. Municipalities are subdivided into unitary, regional and quasi-municipalities. To prevent double-counting, these municipalities were further classified into upper and lower-tier. For the purposes of this survey, upper-tier municipalities are those encompassing one or more local government entities. Lower-tier municipalities are those within the jurisdiction of another municipality type.

Upper-tier municipalities typically include metropolitan corporations, regional districts, regional municipalities, and counties (in Ontario and Quebec). Lower-tier municipalities include cities, towns, villages, townships, rural municipalities, districts and counties (in Nova Scotia and Alberta), and some quasi-municipalities (e.g., local government districts, local improvement districts).

## 12 Materials Recovery and Recycling by the Industrial Sector

by Marcia Santiago

## INTRODUCTION

Recycling is not new and neither is it limited to households. Industry has been active in recycling for some time. The materials collected for industrial reuse are broadly similar to those collected from households: metals, paper, glass and plastics.

From an environmental standpoint, there are some beneficial aspects to the manufacturing of metal products from recycled material rather than from ores or concentrates. First, producing components from scrap material, rather than from primary metal results in savings of 75-95\% of energy costs (Chandler, 1990). In addition, considerably less pollution is released.

There are three essential components in a cost-effective recovery and recycling system: supply, technology and markets. The source of recovered material must be readily accessible and reliable. An efficient collection network is especially important in this regard. There must also be in place sufficient technological capability to reprocess recovered materials. Most importantly, the demand for the reprocessed materials must be well developed.

This chapter attempts to compare virgin and scrap material prices, in order to describe their relative behaviour in changing markets. In general, differences in movements of virgin and scrap prices are expected to reflect the overall pattern of manufacturing activity. In cases where there are no regulatory pressures, market forces dictate the extent to which scrap is used. For metals, the difference between scrap and ore price movements would reflect the relative energy demand of primary and secondary manufacturing depending on the quality of ore that is available.

## PULPWOOD AND NEWSPRINT

Although environmental regulations and recently increased customer demand have focused attention on the recycled fibre content in paper, material recovery is actually a long-standing practice in the pulp and paper industries.

Pulpwood chips, a by-product generated by sawmills in the processing of timber to lumber, are an alternative to logs and bolts in the production of pulp. Similarly, newsprint and fine paper may be used as recycled fibre content, in the production of either other printing and writing paper or paperboard and boxboard.

Chipping is a natural extension of the sawmill business, as it is an efficient way of handling the large volumes of pulp wood debris that accumulate. One consideration in handling such waste, which usually consists of short log ends and chunks, is the distance that the chips must be hauled from the sawmill to the pulp mill. A chipping operation may, by some estimates, reduce wood debris by almost half (Phillips, 1992). These chips are eventually used in the production of pulp, newsprint and other paper products (Table 1).

Table 1: Selected Material Inputs to Pulp and Paper Products, 1987

| Commodity inputs | Commodities produced |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Pulp | Newsprint | Paperboard and building board | Paper boxes, bags and containers |
|  | millions of dollars |  |  |  |
| Pulpwood | 504 | 676 | 54 | $\cdots$ |
| Pulpwood chips and other wood waste | 784 | 313 | 82 | - |
| Puip | 85 | 261 | 237 | 9 |
| Miscellaneous paper | 22 | 70 | 539 | 2209 |
| Total | 1395 | 1320 | 912 | 2218 |

Source:
Statistics Canada, input-Output Division

Markets for paper containing recycled fibre continue to grow. This is especially true in newsprint, despite recurring technical problems like "stickies" - a buildup of residual ink on the paper machine that requires a great deal of cost and effort to control. The development of markets for fine paper is also well under way. A Mississauga, Ontario firm was the first to supply customers with paper that contained fibre from its own wastepaper supply (Hedlund, 1992).

Unit prices ${ }^{1}$ for some of these materials are shown in Figure 1. While the price of old newsprint has been well below that of unprinted scrap newsprint since mid-1988, the price for old newsprint began to fall about one and a half years ahead of the price for unprinted scrap newsprint. In contrast, prices for pulpwood chips and scrap wood actually increased until January 1990, when they reached their peak value of $\$ 116$ per tonne. More recently, the United States has been tightening up its regulatory framework, re-

[^20]quiring a higher recycled material content in newsprint and this may lead to higher prices in the longer term.

## Figure 1: Scrap Wood and Paper Products, Monthly Unit Prices, 1984-1992



Sources:
Statistics Canada, Intemational Trade Division.
Recoup Publishing Limited.

## ALUMINUM

Between 1988 and 1990, production of secondary aluminum in market economies set record volumes of about 5.1 million tonnes. These high volumes are attributed to continuing improvements in the scrap collection system and increased recycling promotion by governments and environmental groups (EMR, 1991). This is especially true of used beverage cans.

Table 2: Aluminum Production and Trade, 1989

|  | Quantity | Value |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Total Canadian production | thousand tonnes |  | million dollars |
|  |  | 1555 | $\ldots$ |
| Imports |  |  |  |
| Aluminum ore and concentrate | 2541 | 111 |  |
| Aluminum oxide | 2031 | 629 |  |
| Aluminum waste and scrap | 58 | 93 |  |
| Exports |  | 614 | 1450 |
| Aluminum, not alloyed | 544 | 1356 |  |
| Aluminum aloys | 164 | 328 |  |
| Aluminum waste and scrap |  |  |  |

Source:
Energy Mines and Pesources Canada, 1991

In 1989, aluminum scrap represented a total of \$328 million or 164 thousand tonnes in exports (Table 2). This mainly consisted of material recovered from industrial processes. Another source of aluminum scrap is consumer durable goods, which include pots, pans, flatware, appliances, as well as transportation equipment components. Packaging is also a large component of aluminum scrap; used beverage cans are the most common example.

Aluminum can scrap is used by both primary and secondary aluminum producers (Selke, 1990). The first step in recycling of aluminum cans is usually a preliminary screen with a magnet to remove any steel cans inadvertently mixed in. The cans are next shredded to one-inch pieces. Fines and dust are collected and removed by high efficiency cyclones to eliminate any explosion hazard. Magnets are again used to remove any steel scraps. Most other contaminants, such as paper, are removed in pneumatic processing. Finally, the aluminum scrap is charged in the furnace, where alloy composition is adjusted as required.

Compared to other nonferrous metal scrap, the unit prices for various grades of recovered aluminum are quite high (Figure 2). They range from $\$ 738$ per tonne for used beverage cans to $\$ 947$ per tonne for aluminum extrusions. This is also considerably higher than the unit value of aluminum ore and concentrate ( $\$ 37$ per tonne).

Figure 2: Aluminum Ore, Scrap and Extrusions, Monthly Unit Prices, 1984-1991


Part of the price difference between aluminum ore/ concentrate and recovered aluminum is related to a basic cost issue: compared to one produced from ore or concentrate, a product manufactured from a recovered source of aluminum requires less energy. Because of the high energy requirements for refining aluminum ores, energy accounts for about one fifth of the cost of producing aluminum from ore (Chandler, 1990). Use of recycled aluminum represents an overall cost savings of about $40 \%$.

However, the market for recycled packaging is subject to a number of stresses. First, aluminum is a somewhat more expensive packaging material than steel for producing beverage cans. In Ontario, some of the major soft drink manufacturers have begun to use cheaper bimetal cans. Although these alternatives may be used in steel recycling, they could pose problems for programs that depend on the more lucrative aluminum cans to fund other aspects of the recycling facility. Another factor is an environmental levy imposed on beer cans, to which some manufacturers of aluminum cans have attributed a recent drop in sales.

## IRON AND STEEL

Ferrous scrap is used in steel produced in electric furnace mills and integrated mills. Foundries are also a large market for iron and steel scrap. In turn, automotive manufacturers are these industries' primary markets. As such, Canadian scrap prices often fluctuate with the pattern of growth in these industries. For example, activity in these industries has been slack recently and that pattern is reflected in the prices of steel scrap.

In Canada, new scrap averaged $17 \%$ of total finished steel and represented $60 \%$ of total purchased scrap (Stollery, 1983). High grade ferrous scrap competes directly with pig iron in steel furnaces because it can be used without intermediate smelting or refining. Thus, the price of ferrous scrap may be expected to vary positively with steel output. Stollery shows that changes in the price of ferrous scrap affect the demand for iron ore, which is also influenced by increases in the output of steel in the U.S.

Several grades of ferrous scrap are traded in secondary markets and two examples are shown in Figure 3. Heavy melting steel, valued at $\$ 96$ per tonne, consists of wrought iron and steel segments that are at least four inches thick. Black and galvanized steel scrap, clippings, old auto bodies and fenders are all compressed to bundles of fixed sizes. Depending on the impurities, bundled scrap, as it is called, also has several grades. In late 1991, flattened car bodies were priced at $\$ 61$ per tonne.

Prices for both iron ore and ferrous scrap (heavy melting steel and flattened car bodies) have been stable since the middle of 1988. Price changes for these commodities
are shown in Figure 3. Scrap prices increased steadily from the beginning of 1984, when prices ranged from $\$ 47$ per tonne to $\$ 89$ per tonne, to the latter part of 1988 , when they reached $\$ 74$ per tonne to $\$ 113$ per tonne. These prices, however, have felt the effect of recession. By the latter part of 1991, they had fallen well below the 1988 level.

Figure 3: Iron Ore and Scrap Steel, Monthly Unit Prices, 1984-1991


Sources:
Statistics Canada, Intemational Trade Division.
Fecoup Publishing Limited.

## COPPER

A comparison of monthly copper ore and scrap unit prices is shown in Figure 4. Since 1984, the price movement has been similar to that of other primary and secondary metals. However, the unit price of copper ore and concentrate is about the same as that of Number 1 copper scrap, which is at least $96 \%$ pure copper and valued at $\$ 2.22$ per kg . This is quite different from the pattern shown by iron and aluminum. It reflects differences in the quality of ores and concentrates that are traded. There is also a range of lower grade, refinery brass and smelter copper, whose prices range from $\$ 0.88$ per kg to $\$ 1.83$ per kg .

Historically, Stollery (1983) has shown that the prices of scrap copper have followed the pattern of activity in U.S. and European durable goods manufacturing. Although there are considerable differences in the energy requirements of primary and secondary copper production, the availability of fairly high-grade virgin material has maintained the relative market positions of ore and scrap.

Figure 4: Copper Ore and Scrap, Monthly Unit Prices, 1984-1991


Sources:
Statistics Canada, Intemational Trade Division
Focoup Publishing Limited.

## DATA SOURCES

Price data for pulpwood chips, as well as metal ore concentrates, are based on quantity-weighted averages of import/export values. At the time of writing, time series based on the Harmonized Commodity Description and Coding System were available for the period September 1988 to April 1992. These are values declared at Customs, rather than announced or actual producer or purchaser prices. This is the most easily accessible source of nonconfidential unit prices.

Price data for recovered materials were taken from a series of publications (Recoup). From this series, the most recent available issue was for October 1991 prices. In all cases, these are announced broker prices. Prices shown are specific to certain regions: Northeastern U.S. and Southern Ontario (used beverage cans), Ontario (ferrous scrap) or Toronto (other nonferrous scrap, paperstock). There may be quite a large difference between the announced prices and the discounted ones.

## REFERENCES

Chandler, W.U. Materials Recycling: The Virtue of Necessity in S.E. Selke. Packaging and the Environment: Alternatives, Trends and Solutions. Lancaster, Pa: Technomic, 1990.

Energy Mines and Resources (EMR), 1990 Canadian Minerals Yearbook: Review and Outlook. Catalogue M38-5/ 39E, Ottawa, 1991.

Hedlund, J. "Recycling Kicks Into High Gear". Pulp \& Paper Canada 93(4):11, 1992.

Phillips, P.J. "At The Cutting Edge of Smallwood Pulping." Pulp \& Paper Canada 93(5):37-38, 1992.

Recoup Publishing Limited. Materials Recycling Markets. Chesterville, Ontario. Monthly issues from 1988 to 1991.

Selke, S.E. Packaging and the Environment: Alternatives, Trends and Solutions. Lancaster, PA: Technomic, 1990.

Stollery, K.R. Secondary Supply of Copper and Ferrous Metals and Canadian Metal Markets. Technical Paper No. 3. Kingston, Ont.: Centre for Resource Studies, Queen's University, 1983.

# 13 Preliminary Estimates of the Value of Crude Oil and Natural Gas Reserves in Alberta 

by Alice Born

## INTRODUCTION

Economically recoverable sub-soil mineral deposits are wealth assets and not merely "free gifts of nature" as they are presently treated by conventional methods of national accounting. Thus, there is no national accounting for the total value of Canada's renewable or non-renewable natural resources and their physical depletion. Currently, the value of Canada's natural resources is excluded from Canada's National Balance Sheet Accounts, thus underestimating Canada's wealth.

This article presents preliminary results from a pilot study of the value of Alberta's crude oil and natural gas reserves. Statistics Canada proposes to include the value of Canada's natural resources in the National Balance Sheet The development of physical accounts will provide a consistent national set of estimates of Canada's natural resource base, while the development of monetary accounts will provide a conceptual framework for monetary valuation of Canada's natural resources and their economic depletion.

Why should we measure the monetary value of Canada's natural resource endowment? Firstly, the use of natural resource assets generates substantial amounts of revenue and makes an important contribution to Canada's economic activity. The monetary accounts will provide an indication of the size of this income-generating potential. Secondly, monetary valuation of our natural resources provides a tool that allows us to compare Canada's net worth (assets - liabilities) to other industrialized countries without such natural resource endowments. The national balance sheet provides a total picture of a country's tangible and financial wealth thus aiding intertemporal and international economic structural comparisons. Thirdly, evaluation of a nation's future potential for sustained income generation can be enhanced by detailed analysis of national and provincial assets and liabilities. Revenues from non-renewable resources (e.g. royalties and land costs) may be converted into other assets capable of providing an ongoing return through savings and investment. An accounting representation should recognize that one kind of asset can be exchanged for another, the sale of a natural resource is
exchanged for the acquisition of a new income-producing asset and the loss of the natural resource extracted. There is also public concern about the availability of mineral resources needed to sustain economic growth. Will resource availability seriously constrain the high standards of living in developed countries and the economic growth of the developing countries? It is hoped that natural resource accounting will address some of these issues.

Natural resource accounts can be used to measure the interrelationship between the economy and the environment. The focus of traditional systems of national accounts on market transactions in the economy has excluded accounting for changes in the quality of the environment and the stock and depletion of natural resources. Initiatives have been taken by the United Nations and several countries on satellite accounting for the environment in the System of National Accounts (SNA) in order to account for environmental and natural resources such as air, water, land, forests and sub-soil mineral deposits. The current revision to the SNA by the United Nations presents an opportunity to examine how natural resource accounting can be linked to or incorporated in the SNA (Bartelmus, 1991). In measuring sustainable development, there is a need to fully account for the use of both man-made and natural capital in order to recognize the possibility of non-sustainable growth and development (Bartelmus et al, 1991). The proposed SNA framework extends the concept of capital assets to cover both.

Only those reserves capable of producing economic benefits to their owners with current technology, scientific knowledge and relative prices and costs at the date to which the Balance Sheet relates will be included in the physical and monetary accounts. These natural resources have a high probability of being used in production of goods and services. Known reserves of oil and natural gas reserves that are not commercially exploitable in the foreseeable future are excluded from that Balance Sheet Accounts. These reserves may possibly become economical as the result of new technologies or major changes in relative prices similar to those of the oil shocks in the 1970 s and 1980 s. Accordingly, the physical and monetary accounts record, for any given year, the value of resources known to exist in that year, and to be economically viable given the technologies available in that year, all evaluated at the prices and costs prevailing in that year.

In December 1990 the Federal Government released Canada's Green Plan. Some of the initiatives from the Green Plan include: updating estimates of all natural resource stocks; increasing monitoring programs on the uses of renewable and non-renewable resources; and identifying the value of Canada's natural resources. Statistics Canada's role is to provide statistical information that integrates economic and environmental elements so that, for example, the value of natural resources is reflected in the Canadian System of National Accounts. Two pilot projects in natural resource accounting have been initiated by the

National Accounts and Environment Division at Statistics Canada. One considers a non-renewable resource, crude oil and natural gas reserves, and the other involves a renewable resource, timber.

This work on the development of natural resource accounts is part of the continuing work to complete the Canadian System of National Accounts (CSNA). The CSNA is one of the most complete national accounting systems in the world. The National Balance Sheet is only one component of this system and it provides estimates of Canada's wealth. When partial estimates of non-financial assets were first published as part of the National Balance Sheet in 1985, it was intended that further work be undertaken to complete the balance sheet by including other non-financial assets such as renewable and non-renewable resource assets.

This chapter presents both physical and monetary accounts for the crude oil and natural gas reserves of the Province of Alberta from 1961 to 1990. It is a shorter version of an earlier discussion paper (Born, 1992). For a more theoretical and expanded discussion, readers are referred to this previous paper.

## THE OIL AND NATURAL GAS SECTOR IN ALBERTA

Alberta is the largest producer and owner of economically recoverable reserves of crude oil and natural gas in Canada. At the end of 1990, there were 530 million cubic metres of conventional crude oil reserves in Alberta, representing $60 \%$ of Canada's remaining established reserves of conventional crude oil, 1.7 billion cubic metres of marketable natural gas ( $62 \%$ of the Canadian total) and 524 million cubic metres of developed crude bitumen ( $100 \%$ of the Canadian total) (Canadian Petroleum Association, 1990; and Alberta Energy Resources Conservation Board, 1990).

The value of Alberta's production of conventional crude oil, natural gas and their associated by-products was $\$ 15.5$ billion in 1990 or $83 \%$ of the value of Canada's total petroleum production (Statistics Canada, 1990). The value of Alberta's production from non-conventional sources (e.g. tar sands) was $\$ 2.8$ billion, representing all of Canada's synthetic crude oil and bitumen production in 1990.

The upstream oil and natural gas sector is a capital intensive activity. Annual capital (namely exploration and development) expenditures in Alberta increased from $\$ 272$ million in 1961 to $\$ 4.0$ billion in 1990 . Net fixed capital stock estimates for the sector have increased from $\$ 1.6$ billion to $\$ 33.6$ billion in that same period.

Royalties, and land acquisition costs and rental fees totalled $\$ 154$ million in 1961 and $\$ 3.7$ billion in 1990 for the province. Operating costs for extraction of oil and natural
gas totalled $\$ 124.0$ million in 1961 and increased to $\$ 4.8$ billion in 1990.

Since most of Canada's petroleum production and remaining reserves are located in Alberta, this province has been examined first. Valuation models developed for Alberta's conventional reserves of crude oil and natural gas reserves are extended to other areas of Canada with oil and natural gas reserves and Alberta's non-conventional reserves of crude bitumen and will be published at a later date.

## DEFINITION OF MINERAL RESERVES AND RESOURCES

Estimates of the size of reserves of non-renewable (exhaustible) resources are continually being revised. In the development of physical accounts, the McKelvey Box is used to distinguish mineral resources from mineral reserves and to show what factors affect the size of the reserves (Figure 1). The vertical axis in Figure 1 represents the degree of economic recoverability and the horizontal axis measures the degree of geological certainty. Economically recoverable resources are located in the top left-hand corner of the diagram (e.g. identified proven, probable (established) and possible reserves). The feasibility of resource extraction decreases through to the lower righthand section (e.g. sub-economic and undiscovered resources). The boundary between economic and sub-economic resources is affected by the relationship between prices and extraction costs, and technological improvements. The boundary between discovered and undiscovered resources fluctuates as the result of a petroleum company's investment in exploration and development, and differing geological conditions.

Oil and natural gas reserve estimates of Canada provided by the Canadian Petroleum Association (CPA), Alberta Energy Resources Conservation Board (AERCB), National Energy Board and other government agencies are reported as established reserves. Established reserves are "those reserves recoverable under current technological and present and anticipated economic conditions, specifically proved by drilling, testing or production, plus that judgement portion of contiguous recoverable reserves that are interpreted to exist from geological, geophysical or similar information, with reasonable certainty" (Tanner, 1986; p. 22).

The AERCB estimates two types of established reserves: remaining established reserves and yet-to-be established reserves, the sum of which is remaining ultimate potential established reserves ${ }^{1}$. Yet-to-be established reserves are based on estimates of future reserve growth from new discoveries and reserve additions to be recov-

[^21]Figure 1: The McKelvey Box Used to Distinguish Reserves from Resources


Source:
Modified after McKelvey, 1972
ered from future enhanced recovery. The ultimate potential is defined as an estimate of established reserves that will have been developed in an area by the time all exploratory and development activity has ceased (AERCB, 1991). Estimates of the ultimate potential are used to forecast Alberta's oil supply. Table 1 shows the remaining and yet-to-be established reserves for crude oil and natural gas at the end of 1990.

## Table 1: Established Reserves of Crude Oil and Natural Gas in Alberta, 1990

|  | Remaining <br> established | Yet-to-be <br> established | Remaining <br> ultimate <br> potential | Reserve <br> life |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  | mililions of cubic metres |  |  | years |
| Crude Oil | 510 | 649 | 1159 | 21 |
| Natural Gas | 1649000 | 1420000 | 3114000 | 35 |

## Source:

Alberta Energy Resources Conservation Board, 1991
This study is concerned with identified economic resources which are defined as those deposits whose location, quality and quantity are known and that can be economically extracted at the time of determination. The physical accounts consist of opening and closing stocks of remaining established reserves, extraction (depletion) of reserves and their appreciation as the result of discoveries, development, revisions and enhanced oil recovery (secondary and tertiary recovery) since these reserves have a high probability of being extracted for economic purposes.

In natural resource accounting, both physical and monetary units are needed to provide a complete picture of the use and the stock of natural assets. Physical resource accounts show the total stock of reserves and changes in the stocks, thus providing the stock and flow data required for the monetary balance sheet accounts.

Estimates of remaining established reserves of crude oil and natural gas for the Province of Alberta are provided in Table 5 in the Physical Accounts for the period from 1961 to 1990 . Figures 2 and 3 compare the remaining reserves and cumulative production for crude oil and natural gas. For crude oil reserves, the rate of depletion of reserves has remained stable since 1981, averaging 55.2 million cubic metres per year. However, the remaining reserve stock has declined by $27 \%$ during that same period. For natural gas reserves, the average depletion rate was 68.3 billion cubic metres from 1978 to 1987 but has increased to an average of 88.2 billion cubic metres for 1988 to 1990. The stock of remaining reserves of natural gas peaked at 1853 billion cubic metres in 1982 but declined to 1647 billion cubic metres in 1990. General current trends of reserve stocks indicate that reserve additions are not replacing reserve depletion. This is more prevalent for crude oil than for natural gas.

Figure 2: Summary of Remaining Established Reserves and Cumulative Production of Conventional Crude Oil in Alberta, 1961-1990


## Sources:

Aberta Energy Resources Consenvation Board.
Statistics Canada National Accounts and Enviromment Division

Figure 3: Summary of Remaining Established Reserves and Cumulative Production of Marketable Natural Gas in Alberta, 1961-1990


Sources:
Alberta Energy Resources Conservation Board.
Statistics Canada. National Accounts and Environment Division.

## THE CONCEPT OF ECONOMIC RENT

The concept of economic rent is central to the monetary valuation of natural resources (Repetto et al, 1989). Economic rent constitutes the difference between the international commodity price and all factor costs of extraction, including a normal return to capital but excluding taxes, royalties and other costs that are not part of the cost of physical extraction. The value of the resource in the ground is equal to the future stream of income or economic rent derived from the extraction of the natural resource.

Economic rents obtained from the extraction of petroleum are defined as the returns in excess of those required to sustain production, reserve development and exploration (Kemp, 1992). As owners of the natural resources, governments may collect rents through auctioning of exploration rights, taxation or royalties. With competitive bidding for mineral rights, the host government collects anticipated or ex ante economic rents in a lump sum payment. A royalty system is used to ensure that the government receives an acceptable share of the realized or ex post economic rents.

Economic rents from natural resources are complex, consisting of Hotelling (scarcity) rents and Ricardian (differential) rents as well as locational rents (arising from differences in transportation costs). Since oil and natural gas reserves are non-renewable and their supply is finite, at least part of the net flow of income can be attributed to the scarcity of the resource. While much of the literature has focused on aggregate economic rent or Hotelling rents, there is little discussion on how to treat these different rents in the context of the development of natural resource accounts. There are conceptual difficulties in separating these resource rents as discussed in Born (1992).

In 1931, Hotelling provided a theoretical model of the behaviour of markets for exhaustible resources. The Hotelling "hypothesis" states that under certainty, in the absence of extraction costs and under competitive market conditions, the price of a natural resource rises at the market rate of interest. The ability of the theory to describe and predict actual behaviour of natural resource markets remains an area of considerable debate with little empirical evidence to support it. However, several recent studies in natural resource accounting of oil and natural gas reserves (Landefeld and Hines, 1985; Repetto et al, 1989; and Smith, 1991) use the Hotelling model as the basis for a method of monetary valuation. This is the "net price" approach presented below.

Others (Devarajan and Fisher, 1982, and Lasserre, 1985) have suggested the use of discovery costs plus the rent on exploration prospects (e.g. land acquisition costs) as an approximation for resource rents. The argument is that exhaustible-resource rents can be measured by what firms are ready to spend in exploration and development in order to make the resource available. This is the basis of
the "replacement cost" method of monetary valuation discussed below.

## MONETARY VALUATION OF OIL AND NATURAL GAS RESERVES

Mineral deposits should be viewed as capital assets that represent forms of national wealth. Ideally, reserves of mineral resources should be valued at the market prices at which the natural resource asset would be sold. However, most mineral stocks are not traded frequently on the market and their market values must be imputed. Three methods of monetary valuation are proposed in this study:
(i) Present Value
(ii) Net Price
(iii) Replacement Cost

Results from the different methods of valuation are presented for conventional crude oil and natural gas remaining established reserves in Alberta. These results are preliminary and may be further refined before the values are included formally in the Canadian National Balance Sheet Accounts. The three methods produce a wide range of monetary values and the difficulty is to determine what assumptions should be used and which set of estimates is most reliable.

## Present Value

As a capital asset, a mineral deposit is valued on the basis of its net flow of income or "rent" that is anticipated over the lifetime of the deposit. If the capital market is competitive and the merit of any investment is assessed in terms of alternative investments, the expected income flow from the deposit is then discounted to establish the "net present value".

The present value approach or discounted value of future net returns has been proposed by the UN SNA Handbook on Integrated Environment and Economic Accounting (United Nations, 1990) as the most appropriate method of monetary valuation of opening and closing stocks and changes to stocks due to volumes and price changes. Discounted cash flow analysis is the standard approach used by companies to value properties and is used in annual corporate reports and U.S. Annual reports include the present value of future net cash flows from the estimated production of proven reserves based on the Reserves Recognition Accounting (RRA) method. The RRA method is based on a discounted cash flow or present value which assumes the continuation of current oil and natural gas margins discounted at an arbitrary $10 \%$ real rate. A comparison of the results from this study with those from various companies showed similar results (Born, 1992).

The choice of an appropriate discount rate for calculating the present value of reserves is problematic in terms of
choosing a "private" or "social" discount rate. There are considerations of intergenerational equity, the opportunity cost of capital and social time preference. Discounting appears to be inconsistent with the concept of sustainable development since the higher the discount rate, the lower the importance attached to the future use of the natural stock (Pearce and Turner, 1990). Adelman (1986) suggests that a nation with a highly diversified portfolio of assets should use a discount rate near the commercial rate employed by industry to discount the flow of net revenues. Long-term corporate bond rates have been used extensively in other studies and are used in this study as the discount rate.

Some of the results from the present value calculations for oil and natural gas are presented in Table 2. Values presented in this report show that in 1990, the value of oil reserves in the ground ranges from $\$ 11.9$ billion to $\$ 14.4$ billion and the value of natural gas reserves ranges from $\$ 4.1$ billion to $\$ 7.7$ billion, discounted at long-term corporate bond rates. Present value estimates vary considerably depending on the assumptions made and this is their major weakness. Several assumptions relating to the appropriate discount rate, return to man-made capital and depreciation charges need to be chosen in order to produce results.

## Net Price

The net price method, as developed by Landefeld and Hines (1985) applies the current average net price per unit (i.e. current revenues less current production costs per unit) to the physical quantities of established reserves. It can be interpreted as an application of the "Hotelling" model where the net price of the resource is expected to rise at exactly at the same rate of return on alternative investments (e.g. the rate of interest). The net price method is a special case of the present value method in which on average, long-run equilibrium is assumed to occur (i.e. the net price will rise at the rate of alternative investments) and the increase in the net price will exactly offset the discount rate.

The net price is calculated from revenues less operating costs less opportunity cost of man-made capital (i.e. the return to capital and depreciation charge) divided by the quantity extracted in a given period. This net price per unit extracted is multiplied by the remaining reserves to obtain the total value of the opening and closing stocks. A variant on this approach, outlined by Landefeid and Hines (1985), subtracts the current replacement cost of manmade capital rather than its opportunity cost.

Table 3 presents preliminary results for the value of reserve of oil and natural gas reserves in Alberta. Two values are shown: the first method subtracts the opportunity cost of man-made capital employed by the petroleum industry plus depreciation and the second method uses the same methodology as Landefeld and Hines (1985). Results from this study indicate that in 1990 the value of crude oil reserves in Alberta ranges from $\$ 20.0$ billion to $\$ 41.2$ billion
and the value of natural gas reserves ranges from $\$ 10.4$ billion to $\$ 65.1$ billion using the net price approach.

The difference in the estimates from the two methodologies lies in the difference in the treatment of the manmade capital employed in exploring, developing and extracting the natural resource. In the method outlined by Landefeld and Hines (1985), there is no "normal return to (man-made) capital" excluded from the value added of the natural resource.

Most monetary values for oil and natural gas reserves reported in the current literature are based on the net price approach which assumes the Hotelling model. In Alberta, with the collapse of worid oil and natural gas prices since

1986 along with increasing extraction costs, the value of resource rents has decreased significantly. Analysis of the data in this study finds that the assumptions of the Hotelling model are too restrictive. It appears that the current net price is not appropriate for valuing future production of reserves. The net price method seems to have undervalued future production during the 1960 s and 1970 s given the rapid increase in net price from 1972 to 1985 for both oil and natural gas. The net price method has overvalued future production in the early 1980 s in light of the wellhead price collapse in 1986. However, the net price provides a basis for comparison with other studies (Repetto et al, 1989; and Smith, 1991) and the accounting procedures used in the net price method are similar to those used in the present value method. The net price has an advantage

Table 2: Estimate of the Monetary Value of Crude Oil and Natural Gas Reserves in Alberta Based on the

| Year | Crude oil reserves |  |  | Natural gas reserves |  |  | Total value of reserves |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | 12 | [3] | [1] | [2] | [3] |
|  | [1] | [2] | [3] | [1] | [2] |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1927.2 | 1461.4 |  | millions of dollars |  |  |  | 916.8 | 7849.2 |
| 1961 |  |  |  | $-309.7$ | $-544.6$ | $\begin{aligned} & 4431.8 \\ & 5494.9 \end{aligned}$ | 1617.5 1858.6 | 1145.4 | 日 341.1 |
| 1962 | 1747.9 | 1564.6 | 2846.2 | 110.6 | $\begin{array}{r} -419.2 \\ -77.1 \end{array}$ | 6454.4 | 2980.2 | 1623.1 | 9680.6 |
| 1963 | 2049.5 | 1700.2 | 3216.2 | ${ }^{930.6}$ | 378.7 | 7333.0 | 3263.8 | 2342.3 | 11159.8 |
| 964 | 2081.7 | 1963.7 | 3826.8 | $1182.1$ |  | 8850.7 | 3657.0 | 3218.8 | 17194.2 |
| 65 | 2297.9 | 2341.3 | 8343.5 | + 359.1 | 877.6 | 10334.9 | Э 327.8 | 3405.9 | 19794.9 |
| 1966 | 2071.2 | 2257.4 | 9460.0 | 1256.5 | 1448.5 | 9953.2 | 3481.2 | 3418.3 | 21700.9 |
| 1967 | 2026.6 | 2161.2 | 11747.7 | 1454.6 | 1257.1 |  | 3686.6 | 3331.8 | 22657.2 |
| 1968 | 2343.1 | 2063.3 | 12643.4 | 1343.5 | 1268.5 | 10429.2 | 3539.3 | 3322.6 | 23860.1 |
| 1969 | 2482.7 | 2092.5 | 13430.9 | 1056.6 | 1230.0 | 11422.8 | 4184.0 | 3607.7 | 26200.2 |
| 1970 | 3639.0 | 2478.2 | 14777.4 | 544.9 | 1129.6 | 12568.4 | 5398.6 | 4395.3 | $\begin{aligned} & 29441.5 \\ & 35162.6 \end{aligned}$ |
| 1971 | 5018.6 | 3398.9 | 16873.1 | 380.0 | 996.4 |  | 7062.0 | 5150.2 |  |
| 1972 | 6543.0 | 4405.9 | 19889.6 | 519.0 | 744.3 | 19724.0 | 12133.2 | 7038.9 | 44855.2 |
| 1973 | 10801.3 | 6291.0 | 25131.2 | 1331.9 | 747.9 | 28321.2 | 20329.4 | 10679.8 | 57122.0 |
| 1974 | 15839.9 | 9012.5 | 30800.8 | 4489.5 | 1667.2 | 25839.9 | 25286.5 | 16459.8 | 56252.1 |
| 1975 | 15394.4 | 12313.9 | 30412.2 | 9892.1 | 4145.9 | 28556.5 | 30626.6 | 24231.8 | 61793.6 |
| 1976 | 16039.0 | 16032.5 | 33237.1 | 14587.6 | $8199.3$ | 29984.0 | 42243.3 | 33786.7 | 65190.3 |
| 1977 | 21037.0 | 19639.8 | 35206.3 | $21206.3$ | 18407.1 | 29555.4 | 45759.2 | 40016.7 | 65560.9 |
| 1978 | 24834.3 | 21609.6 | 35965.5 | 20924.8 |  | 34833.9 | 54529.7 | 46492.4 | $\begin{aligned} & 75520.1 \\ & 68333.8 \end{aligned}$ |
| 1979 | $\begin{aligned} & 28646.9 \\ & 25160.9 \end{aligned}$ | 24196.2$24995.7$ | 40686.2 | 28699.0 | $22296.3$ | 30375.9 | 53859.8 | 48977.7 |  |
| 1980 |  |  | 33676.1 | $21155.2$ | 23982.1 |  |  | 46577.2 | 56502.4 |
| 1981 | 22013.9 | 24178.7 |  |  | $25640.6$ | 19152.1 | 43169.1 52325.2 | 53122.0 | $\begin{aligned} & 53981.0 \\ & 55077.4 \end{aligned}$ |
| 1982 | 28642.0 | 27481.4 | 34828.9 | 23683.3 |  | 18467.3 | 77695.9 | 68315.6 |  |
| 1983 | $47051.1$ | 35846.1 | 36610.1 | 30644.7 | 304831 | 11818.4 | 83193.2 | 71035.4 | 39774.0 |
| 1984 | 50967.3 | 40552.4 | 27955.6 | 32226.0 | 30483.1 | 9966.4 | 87702.9 | 85082.0 | 32858.3 |
| 1985 | 50620.5 | 49074.0 | 22891.9 | 37082.5 | 360081 | 9023.3 | 33873.1 | 82859.9 | 28196.4 |
| 1986 | 14083.6 | 46847.9 | 19173.1 | 19789.5 | 36012.0 | 12752.7 | 27626.7 | 65805.4 | 33120.9 |
| 1987 | 20838.2 | 37988.1 | 20368.2 | 6788.5 | 27817.3 | 133775 | 10119.3 | 44198.0 | 34555.5 |
| 1988 | 5958.8 | 25002.8 | 21178.0 | 4160.5 | 19190.2 | 15225.2 | 11710.3 | 22778.9 | 37183.6 |
| 1989 | 9218.4 | 13358.7 | 21958.4 | 2491.9 |  | 7705.2 | 16073.6 | 16627.0 | 22111.7 |
| 1990 | 11931.4 | 12033.5 | 14406.5 | 4142.2 | 4593.4 | 7705.2 |  |  |  |

[^22]over present value calculations since there is no need to forecast or to make assumptions about future prices, extraction costs and rates, and interest rates.

## Replacement Cost

Conceptually, resource rent is the most appropriate measure of the value of the resource in the ground. However, there are some problems involved when resource ents are used since rental values are not readily observed and must be imputed. Several studies have used the cost of discovering and developing reserves as a proxy for resource rent. The argument is that exploration and development dollars will be spent as long as the expected gain from finding the resource equals the marginal cost of exploration and development. The expected discovery value
of the resource stock should be equal to the present value of its expected rents.

In this study the "full marginal discovery cost" approach developed by Eglington and Uffelmann (1983), Lasserre (1985) and McLachlan (1990) has been adopted to approximate resource rent. It is the sum of the marginal cost of exploration and development plus land acquisition costs divided by reserve additions in a given period (e.g. reserves from discoveries, development and revisions, and in the case of crude oil reserves, enhanced oil recovery) to yield a replacement cost per unit of crude oil or natural gas reserve added. A 5-year average is used to average the costs and the booked reserve additions. The average unit cost of booked reserves is multiplied by the remaining es-

Table 3: Estimates of the Monetary Value of Crude Oil and Natural Gas Reserves in Alberta Based on the
Net Price Method, 1961-1990

[1] Net price equals revenue less operating costs, return on capital and depreciation charge
(2) Net price is based on the methodology by Landefeld and Hines (1985)

The results in this table should be treated as preliminary:
tablished reserves of crude oil and natural gas to obtain the value of the stock.

Table 4 presents a summary of the estimates of the replacement cost value of crude oil and natural gas reserves. The replacement value for crude oil has declined from $\$ 60$ billion to $\$ 43$ billion over the 1983 to 1990 period. While replacement costs for reserve additions per unit have increased, the volume of remaining reserves has decreased by $22 \%$ over the period, thus accounting for the trend in the value of remaining oil reserve stock. The replacement cost value which represents the present value of obtaining reserve additions through exploration and development produces similar results to the present value method until 1987 (Figure 4). ${ }^{1}$ This suggests that the expected discovery value of the resource stock is equal to the present value of its expected rents. The oil price collapse in 1986 and increasing capital costs have caused a significant decrease in the present value of oil reserves since 1986. It appears since 1986 that the assumption that the full marginal discovery cost can be used as a proxy for resource rent no longer applies in the short term.

Figure 4: Estimates of the Monetary Value of Crude Oil Reserves in Alberta, 19611990


Note:
The net price is from [1] in Table 3 and the present value is from [2] in Table 2.

[^23]The replacement cost value for natural gas reserves shows an increase from $\$ 53$ billion in 1982 to $\$ 81$ billion in 1990. While physical reserve stocks have decreased by $12 \%$ from 1982 to 1990 , replacement costs per unit of reserve added have more than doubled, thus producing increasing values for the total stock of natural gas. Present value and replacement cost value have similar trends until 1979 after which the replacement cost value increases and the present value decreases (Figure 5).

Table 4: Estimates of the Economic Value of Crude Oil and Natural Gas Reserves in Alberta Based on the Replacement Cost Method

| Year | Crude oil reserves |  | Natural gas reserves |  | Total reserve value |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Unit cost | Value | Unit cost | Value |  |
|  | dolars per m ${ }^{3}$ | mitions of dollars | dollars per thousand $\mathrm{m}^{3}$ | millions of |  |
| 1963 | 4.35 | 2632.5 | 1.86 | 1728.6 | 4361.1 |
| 1964 | 3.99 | 3700.4 | 2.04 | 2020.7 | 5721.0 |
| 1965 | 3.50 | 3384.6 | 2.28 | 2412.6 | 5797.2 |
| 1966 | 2.96 | 3179.3 | 2.37 | 2546.2 | 5725.5 |
| 1967 | 2.41 | 2734.6 | 2.77 | 3101.6 | 5836.2 |
| 1968 | 2.04 | 2469.7 | 3.02 | 3690.8 | 6160.6 |
| 1969 | 2.30 | 2810.5 | 3.37 | 4296.3 | 7106.8 |
| 1970 | 2.58 | 3122.0 | 3.96 | 5066.6 | 8188.6 |
| 1971 | 3.02 | 3547.3 | 4.69 | 5984.8 | 9532.1 |
| 1972 | 3.92 | 4409.9 | 5.13 | 6507.7 | 10917.5 |
| 1973 | 5.38 | 5655.9 | 5.63 | 7860.1 | 13516.0 |
| 1974 | 7.20 | 7278.7 | 6.60 | 9805.7 | 17085.4 |
| 1975 | 9.66 | 9183.1 | 7.30 | 10593.9 | 19777.0 |
| 1976 | 14.29 | 12452.1 | 8.03 | 12063.3 | 24515.5 |
| 1977 | 19.40 | 16098.3 | 8.65 | 13570.4 | 29668.7 |
| 1978 | 25.35 | 20138.0 | 10.23 | 17038.9 | 37176.9 |
| 1979 | 37:99 | 28877.1 | 13.08 | 22472.3 | 51349.4 |
| 1980 | 56.73 | 40841.6 | 17.67 | 30871.4 | 71713.1 |
| 1981 | 68.74 | 47842.8 | 22.88 | 41082.8 | 88925.7 |
| 1982 | 83.59 | 54285.4 | 28.76 | 53295.5 | 107580.9 |
| 1983 | 91.04 | 59886.8 | 31.92 | 58292.1 | 118178.9 |
| 1984 | 90.75 | 58145.4 | 32.46 | 58378.1 | 116523.5 |
| 1985 | 83.21 | 53960.1 | 31.35 | 55428.3 | 109388.4 |
| 1986 | 83.71 | 53131.4 | 30.68 | 52778.0 | 105909.4 |
| 1987 | 78.89 | 48424.2 | 35.11 | 57988.6 | 106412.8 |
| 1988 | 82.67 | 49013.4 | 41.60 | 67718.3 | 116731.6 |
| 1989 | 80.71 | 45235.6 | 46.10 | 76050.7 | 121286.4 |
| 1990 | 84.95 | 43359.4 | 49.41 | 81406.1 | 124765.6 |

Notes:
The results in this table should be treated as prelminary. Includes all exploration and development expenditures and land booked reserve additions; lagged and unit costs are derived from a 5 -year average of booked reserve adowions: unit costs are averaged over 5 years.

It appears that the replacement cost method measures resource scarcity. It is not, however, a proxy for the measurement of the value of natural resource wealth which accounts for capital gains and losses due to price changes over time.

## Comparison of Valuation Methods

Figures 4 and 5 provide a comparison of the estimates from the three different valuation methods described above. As previously discussed, present values and replacement cost values show similar trends until 1986. The net price estimates initially overvalue the reserve stock in the late 1980s given the price collapse of 1986 however they show a similar trend to present value after 1986.

Figure 5: Estimates of the Monetary Value of Natural Gas Reserves in Alberta, 1961-1990


Note:
The net price is from [1] in Table 3 and the present value is from [2] in Table 2.

In comparison with the net price approach, the present value approach provides a smoother times series since the method reduces price volatility by averaging or using actual wellhead price in cases [2] and [3] in Table 2, using interest rates related to the time period rather than assuming a constant discount rate such as $10 \%$ for the entire 30 -year time span and averaging or using actual variable (extraction) costs in calculations [2] and [3] in Table 2.

The advantages and disadvantages of each method have been discussed. However, with the net price method, the assumption of long-run equilibrium in natural resource markets has little empirical support and produces volatile values. The selection of the most appropriate valuation method for the Canadian National Balance Sheet will reflect the most reliable method of market valuation. The present value method conforms most closely to corporate financial reporting of the market value of reserves and is the preferred method of valuation by national accountants. However assumptions about future prices, costs and discounts have to be made when using this method.

## RECONCILIATION ACCOUNTS

Table 5 presents both physical and monetary Reconciliation Accounts for oil and natural gas reserves from 1961 to 1990. Net price values from Table 3 [1] for oil and natural gas are used to construct the monetary accounts in Table 5.

Reconciliation tables show the volume and price changes of the assets during the reporting period, in this case, one year. The basic formula for the reconciliation accounts is:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\text { closing stock }= & \text { opening stock }+ \text { net reserve additions } \\
& - \text { reserve depletion }+ \text { revaluation }
\end{aligned}
$$

where revaluation reflects the change in net price during periods in the monetary accounts only.

The monetary reconciliation accounts reflect changes in the net value of the resource due to changes in physical reserves, wellhead prices and operating and capital costs. These changes will be reflected in the value of non-produced tangible assets in the Balance Sheet Accounts and ultimately in national wealth and net worth.

Table 5: Reconciliation Tables for Established Reserves of Crude Oil and Natural Gas in Alberta, 1961-1975

|  | 1961 | 1962 | 1963 | 1964 | 1965 | 1966 | 1967 | 1968 | 1969 | 1970 | 1971 |  | 1973 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CRUDE OIL RESERVES |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Physical accounts (millions of cubic metres) |  |  |  |  | 926.1 | 965.7 | 1074.2 | 1332.9 | 1212.8 | 1222.8 | 1207.9 | 1173.6 | +126.0 1 | 1052.0 | 1011.5 |
| Opening stocks | 525.0 | 557.6 | 575.6 | 605.4 | 92.1 | 140.8 | 95.2 | 119.8 | 54.5 | 36.7 | 22.1 | 20.0 | 9.2 | 38.5 | 7.0 |
| Gross additions | 57.5 | 44.0 | 56.6 | 348.5 | 6 | 89.1 | 57.2 | 62.0 | 40.5 | 8.4 | 14.0 | 10.8 | 5.1 | 4.3 | 1.6 |
| Discoveries | 1.7 | 2.9 | 14.6 | 9.5 | 426 | 13.5 | 15.7 | 14.8 | -44.5 | .7.6 | 8.7 | -5.6 | -6.0 | 3.3 | 2.1 |
| Development and reevaluation | 31.5 | 21.8 | 12.6 | 88.2 | -24 | 38.3 | 22.2 | 42.9 | 58.5 | 36.1 | -0.8 | 14.8 | 10.2 | 30.8 | 3.3 |
| Enhanced oil recovery | 24.5 | 19.9 | 29.2 | 250.8 | -2.4 | 322 | 36.6 | 39.8 | 44.4 | 51.7 | 56.4 | 67.4 | 83.3 | 79.0 | 67.5 |
| Depletion | 25.1 | 26.2 | 26.8 | 27.9 | 29.2 | 32.2 | 58. | 80.0 | 10.1 | -15.0 | -34.3 | -47.4 | -74.1 | -40.5 | -60.5 |
| Net change | 32.4 | 17.8 | 29.8 | 320.6 | 39.6 | 10742 | $1+32.9$ | 121281 | 1222.8 | 1207.9 | 1173.6 | 1126.0 | 1052.0 | 1011.5 | 950.9 |
| Closing stock | 557.6 | 575.6 | 605.4 | 926.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Unit values (dollars per cubic metre) |  |  |  | 16.09 | $16.14$ | $16.27$ | $16.06$ | $16.14$$11.06$ | $\begin{aligned} & 16.00 \\ & 1074 \end{aligned}$ | 16.27 | 17.84 | 17.92 | 21.83 | 36.33 | 45.79 |
| Average wellhead price | 14.82 | 14.28 | 15.81 | 16.09 |  |  |  |  |  | 9.23 | 9.27 | 8.07 | 7.32 | 9.48 | 13.12 |
| Production and capital costs | 9.10 | 9.24 | 10.00 | 10.28 | 5 | 4.79 | 4.34 | 5.07 | 5.26 | 7.05 | 8.57 | 9.85 | 14.51 | 26.85 | 32.67 |
| Net price | 5.72 | 5.03 | 5.81 | 5.81 | 5.29 | 4.9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| *onetary accounts (militons of dollars) |  |  | 28 | 3519 | 5381 | 5107 | 5145 | 4921 | 6155 | 6431 | 8510 | 10061 | 11094 | 15262 | 27078 |
| Opening stocks | 2106 | 221 | 329 | 2025 | 364 | 674 | 414 | 608 | 287 | 259 | 189 | 197 | 133 | 1034 | 229 |
| Gross additions | 329 |  |  |  |  |  | 248 | 314 | 213 | 59 | 120 | 106 | 74-87 | 11548 | 69 |
| Discoveries | 10 | 15 | 85 | 55 | 151 | 427 |  | 75 | -234 | -54 | 75 | -55 |  |  |  |
| Development and reevaluation | 180 | 110 | 73 | 513 | 225 | 65 | 68 | 218 | 308 | 255 | -7 | 146 | 148 | 447 | 108 |
| Enhanced oil recovery | 140 | 100 | 170 | 1458 | -13 | 183 | 159 | 202 | 234 | 364 | 483 | 664 | 1209 | 1146 | 2205 |
| Depletion | 144 | 132 | 15 | 162 | 154 | 53 | 255 | 406 | 53 | -106 | -294 | -467 | -1075 | -112 | -1977 |
| Net change | 185 | 90 | 173 | 1863 | 203 | 52. | 479 | 829 | 224 | 2184 | 1845 | 1502 | 5241 | 12.987 | 5887 |
| Revaluation | 896 | -383 | 3519 | -2 | 5107 | 5145 | 4921 | 6155 | 6431 | 8510 | 10061 | 11094 | 15262 | 27161 | 31062 |
| Closing stock | 3189 | 2897 |  | 5381 |  |  | 4921 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| NATURAL GAS RESERVES |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Physical accounts (billions of cubic metres) |  |  | 912.1 | 928.2 | 992.0 | 1057.6 | 1072.6 | 1119.1 | 1223.6 | 1273.4 | 1279.4 | 1276.3 | 1269.1 | 1396.6 | 1486.5 |
| Opening stocks | 878.6 | 879.9 | 35.8 |  |  |  | 73.9 | 134.6 | 87.5 | 46.2 | 45.4 | 45.2 | 183.3 | 147.0 | 20.8 |
| Gross additions | 13.3 | 49.7 |  | 85.9 | 89.7 | 2.1 | 24.3 | 15.3 | 18.6 | 7.6 | 4.8 | 12.5 | 7.8 | 8.6 | 0.8 |
| Discoveries | 9.6 | 8.9 | 3.1 | 78.7 | 78.4 |  | 49.6 |  |  | 38.7 | 40.5 | 32.8 | 175.6 | 138.4 | 20.0 |
| Development and reevaluation | 3.7 | 41.0 | 32.7 |  |  | 38.6 | 49.6 27.5 | 119.3 | 68.9 | 40.1 | 148.5 | $5 \quad 52.4$ | 56.0 | 57.0 | 56.6 |
| Depletion | 11.9 | 17.6 | 19.6 | 22.1 | 24.2 | 25. | 464 | 4104.6 | 4 49.7 | 6.2 | $2-3.1$ | $1 \quad 7.1$ | 127.4 | 90.0 | -35.8 |
| Net change | 1.4 | 32.1 | 16.2 | 63.8 | 65.5 | $\begin{array}{r}15.2 \\ \hline 10725\end{array}$ | 2 $\begin{array}{r}46.4 \\ 1119.1\end{array}$ | + 1223.5 | ¢ 1273.4 | 41279.4 | 41276.3 | 1269.1 | 1396.6 | 1486.5 | 1450.8 |
| Closing stock | 879.9 | 912.1 | 928.2 | 992.0 | 1057.6 | 1072.6 | - 1119.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Unit values (collars per thou | usand cub | bic metres | res) |  |  |  |  | 1234 | 10.48 | 810.75 | $\begin{array}{ll}5 & 9.87\end{array}$ | $7 \quad 11.01$ | 13.25 | 23.46 | - 36.93 |
| Average composite wellhead price | 6.08 | 6.62 | 8.53 | 9.14 | 9.59 | 10.64 7.19 | $\begin{array}{r}11.80 \\ \hline\end{array}$ | (1).34 <br>  <br> 8.58 | - 7.86 | $6 \quad 9.42$ | 42 9.12 | $2 \quad 10.05$ | 510.86 | . 14.63 | 18.74 |
| Production and capital costs | 7.53 | 6.26 | $6 \quad 5.75$ | 86 | 3 | 9 | 9 | 3.77 | 7252 | 21.33 | 330.74 | $4 \quad 0.96$ | $6 \quad 2.39$ | 8.83 | - 20.18 |
| Net price | . 1.45 | 0.37 | $7 \quad 2.78$ | - 3.28 | 3.56 | 3.45 | 5.03 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Monetary accounts (million | $s$ of dollar | ars) |  |  |  | - 760 |  | 3509 | 94608 | 8 3335 | 351701 | 91949 | 91218 | 83343 | 313126 |
| Opening stocks | . 2443 | -1280 | - 336 | 2583 | 3258 | - 140 | 140208 | $8 \quad 507$ | 7229 | 961 | $61 \quad 34$ | $34 \quad 43$ | 3439 | - 1299 | 9420 |
| Gross additions | 19 | 918 | 8100 | - 282 | 2319 | - | 98 | 985 | 5849 | 4910 | 10 | 12 | 219 | 976 | $6 \quad 16$ |
| Discoveries | -14 |  | 9 | $9 \quad 24$ | 40 |  | 7 - | 449 | 180 | 80.51 | 5130 | $30 \quad 31$ | 31420 | - 1222 | 2406 |
| Development and reevaluation | . 5 | 5 15 | 591 | 1258 | $8 \quad 279$ | 133 | 83 | $11 \quad 113$ | $13 \quad 99$ | 9953 | 53 36 | 3650 | $50 \quad 334$ | 4503 | $3 \quad 1142$ |
| Depletion | -17 | $7 \quad 7$ | 54 | 4 | 86 | 86 | 88 11 | 189 | 34130 | 30 | 8 -2 | $-2 \quad-7$ | -7 305 | 5795 | 5 .723 |
| Net change | -2 | 212 | 1245 | 5210 | 0233 | 52 | 52 (87 | 18 - 29 | - 1404 | -164 | 43 -749 | $49 \quad 27$ | 751820 | 208994 | 4416872 |
| Revaluation | 1167 | 7604 | 2202 | 2466 | 668 | 88 -109 | 0961 | 18-294 | 4 -1404 | + 170 | 701 94 | $49 \quad 121$ | $18 \quad 3343$ | 13 13131 | 3129283 |
| Closing stock | -1280 | - 336 | 366583 | 3258 | $8 \quad 3760$ | 50-3703 | O3 450 | 094608 | - 333 |  |  |  |  |  |  |

[^24]Table 5: Reconciliation Tables for Established Reserves of Crude Oil and Natural Gas in Alberta, 1976-1990


## Physical accounts (millions of cubic metres)

| Opening stocks | 950.9 | 871.3 | 830.0 | 794.5 | 760.2 | 719.9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gross additions | -18.6 | 19.1 | 24.4 | 34.3 | 22.7 | 719.9 | 696.0 | 649.4 | 657.8 | 640.7 | 648.5 | 634.7 | 613.8 | 592.9 | 560.5 |
| Discoveries | 2.5 | 4.8 | 24.9 | 19.2 | 22. | 32.6 | 6.9 | 64.1 | 42.0 | 64.0 | 39.1 | 33.0 | 36.7 | 21.4 | 3.0 |
| Development and | 5.9 | 5.1 | -1.9 | 10.3 | 5.1 | 10.4 | 16.8 -16.5 | 21.4 24.8 | 29.1 -12.0 | 32.7 | 28.6 | 20.9 | 17.7 | 17.0 | 25.0 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.7 | -14.9 | 1.6 | 2.5 | -3.4 | -25.6 |
| Enhanced oil recovery | -27.0 | 9.2 | 1.4 | 4.8 | 8.6 | 2 | 6.6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Depletion | 61.0 | 60.4 | 60.0 | 68.5 | 63.2 | 565 |  | 17.9 | 24.1 | 21.6 | 24.6 | 10.5 | 16.5 | 7.8 | 3.7 |
| Net change | -79.6 | -41.3 | -36.6 | -34.2 | -40.5 | -23.5 | 53.6 | 55.0 | 59.2 | 56.2 | 53.2 | 53.9 | 57.2 | 53.8 | 53.1 |
| Closing stock | 871.3 | 830.0 | 794.5 | 760.2 | 719.9 | 696 | -46. | 8.5 | -17.2 | 7.8 | -14.1 | -20.9 | -20.5 | -32.4 | -50.1 |
| Unit values (dollars per cubic metre) |  |  |  |  |  |  | 649. | 657.8 | 640.7 | 648.5 | 634.7 | 613.8 | 592.9 | 560.5 | 510.5 |
| Average wellhead price | 53.73 | 64.40 | 76.77 | 82.97 | 97.75 | 119.36 | 157.64 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Production and capital costs | 15.90 | 16.11 | 18.94 | 20.61 | 29.77 | 42.47 | 53.85 | 201.29 | 212.44 | 220.07 | 117.58 | 145.35 | 104.92 | 127.74 | 150.69 |
| Net price | 37.83 | 48.28 | 57.83 | 62.36 | 67.98 | 76.90 | 103.81 | 54.90 | 62.20 | 73.03 | 77.50 | 85.06 | 88.30 | 100.20 | 111.58 |
| Monetary accounts (millions of dollars) |  |  |  |  |  |  | 10.8 | 146.40 | 150.24 | 147.04 | 40.08 | 60.29 | 16.62 | 27.54 | 39.11 |
| Opening stocks | 31062 | 32960 | 40073 | 45944 | 47406 | 48936 | 53521 |  |  | 96258 | 95353 | 25440 | 37004 | 9856 | 15438 |
| Gross additions | .704 | 922 | 1419 | 2139 | 1543 | 2507 | 716 | 67415 | 96300 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Discoveries | 95 | 232 | 1440 | 197 | 612 | 1154 | 76 | 9384 | 6310 | 9410 | 1567 | 1989 | 610 | 589 | 117 |
| Development and reevaluation | 223 | 246 | -110 | 642 | 353 | 554 | -1713 | $3631$ | $\begin{array}{r} 4372 \\ -1803 \end{array}$ | $1426$ | $\begin{array}{r} 1146 \\ -565 \end{array}$ | 1280 | 294 | 468 | 978 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 96 | 42 | -94 | - 1001 |
| Enhanced oil recovery | -1021 | 444 | 81 | 299 | 585 | 800 | 685 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Depletion | 2308 | 2916 | 3470 | 4272 | 4296 | 4345 | 5 6864 | 2621 | 3621 | 3176 | 986 | 633 | 274 | 215 | 145 |
| Net change | -3011 | -1994 | -2059 | -2133 | 4296 -2753 | -1345 -1838 | 5564 | 8140 | 8894 | 8264 | 2132 | 3250 | 951 | 1482 | 2077 |
| Revaluation | 4909 | 9107 | 924 | 601 | 4270 | - | 4848 | 1244 | -2 584 | 1147 | -565 | -1260 | -341 | -892 | -1959 |
| Closing stock | 32960 | 40073 | 45944 | 47406 | 48936 | 6422 | 18732 | 27656 | 2527 | -2052 | -69 360 | 12824 | -26801 | 6474 | 6484 |
|  |  |  |  |  | 48936 | 53521 | 6715 | 96300 | 96258 | 95353 | 25440 | 37004 | 9856 | 15438 | 19963 |

## NATURAL GAS RESERVES

## Physical accounts (bllions of cubic metres)

| Opening stocks | 1450.8 | 1501.7 | 1568.3 | 1665.2 | 1718.4 | 17470 | 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gross additions | 105.6 | 127.6 | 163.3 | 123.2 | 92.4 | 1747.0 | 1795.3 | 1853.1 | 1826.2 | 1798.4 | 1788.3 | 1720.1 | 1651.7 | 1627.7 | 1649.7 |
| Discoveries | 6.9 | 6.6 | 24.4 |  | 30.4 | 117. | 118.7 | 39.0 | 40.5 | 42.6 | 21.8 | 0.0 | 64.6 | 107.8 | 87.8 |
| Development and | 98.7 | 120.9 | 138.9 | 106.8 | 62.5 | 28.9 | 10.6 | 16.3 | 9.6 | 1.5 | 9.2 | 8.9 | 13.9 | 19.0 | 28.0 |
| reevaluation |  |  |  |  | 62.6 | 88.1 | 108.1 | 22.7 | 30.9 | 31.1 | 12.6 | -8.9 | 50.7 | 88.8 | 60.0 |
| Depletion | 54.6 | 61.0 | 66.4 | 700 | 638 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Net change | 51.0 | 66.5 | . 9 | 53.2 | 287 |  |  | 66.0 | 68.3 | 72.8 | 69.9 | 68.4 | 88.6 | 85.8 | 90.1 |
| Closing stock | 1501.7 | 568.3 | 16652 | 1718. | 28 | 48.4 | 57.8 | -27.0 | -27.8 | -30.2 | -48.1 | -68.4 | -24.0 | 22.0 | -2.3 |
| $\begin{array}{ll}\text { Unit values (dollars per thousand cubic metres) } & \end{array}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Average composite welihead price | 54.88 | 64.38 | 66.73 | 80.98 | 117.66 | 117.57 | 146.86 | 135.55 | 144.62 | 139.24 | 107.13 | 92.35 | 74.12 | 76.82 | 81.58 |
| Production and capital costs | 24.75 | 26.78 | 31.25 | 36.85 | 55.7 | 66.14 | 84.37 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Net price | 30.13 | 37.60 | 35.48 | 44.13 | 6189 | 51.42 |  | 74.28 | 78.69 | 75.32 | 75.38 | 80.83 | 68.12 | 73.16 | 75.29 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Opening stocks | 29283 | 45250 | 58963 | 59090 | 75827 | 108122 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Gross additions | 3182 | 4797 | 5795 | 5436 | 5713 | 6016 |  | 115805 | 111886 | 118566 | 113028 | 54618 | 19030 | 9767 | 6041 |
| Discoveries | 208 | 248 | 866 | 724 | \% | 80 | 741 | 2389 | 2670 | 2723 | 692 | 0 | 388 | 395 | 553 |
| Development and | 2974 | 4546 | 4928 | 4713 | 1857 | 1486 | 662 | 989 | 633 | 735 | 292 | 103 | 83 | 70 | 176 |
| reevaluation |  |  | 492 | 4713 | 3868 | 4530 | 6755 | 1391 | 2037 | +988 | 400 | -103 | 304 | 325 | 376 |
| Depletion | 1645 | 2294 | 2356 | 3089 | 3955 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Net change | 1537 | 2504 | 3439 | 2347 | 64 | 3527 | 3806 | 4044 | 4503 | 4653 | 2220 | 788 | 532 | 314 | 567 |
| Revaluation | 14433 | 209 | - $33+2$ | 890 | 1704 | 2489 | 3612 | -1654 | -1833 | -1930 | -1527 | -788 | -144 | 81 | -14 |
| Closing stock | 45250 | 58963 | 59090 | 14390 | 30525 | -18286 | 19873 | -2 271 | 8513 | -3614 | -56879 | -34801 | -9119 | -3806 | 4342 |
|  |  |  |  |  | 10812 | 92319 | 115805 | 111886 | 118566 | 113028 | 54618 | 19030 | 9767 | 6041 | 10368 |

Discrepancies are due to rounding and data sources.
Sources:
Alberta Energy Resources Conservation Board.
Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division.

## Table 6: Value of Petroleum Royalties and Land Costs Paid to the Alberta Government, 1961-1990

| Year | Royalties | Land costs | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | millions of dollars |  |  |
| 1961 | 55.0 | 85.4 | 140.4 |
| 1961 | 66.0 | 81.8 | 147.8 |
| 1962 | 73.0 | 89.8 | 162.8 |
| 1963 |  | 131.8 | 211.8 |
| 1964 | 80.0 |  | 272.8 |
| 1965 | 79.2 | 193.7 |  |
| 1966 | 91.7 | 171.2 | 262.9 |
| 1967 | 107.4 | 161.2 | 269.0 |
| 1968 | 125.6 | 166.2 | 291.7 |
| 1969 | 136.3 | 181. $\ddagger$ | 317.3 |
| 1970 | 154.0 | 147.6 | 271.6 |
| 1971 | 190.4 | 126.2 | 316.6 |
| 1972 | 226.0 | 125.6 | 351.6 |
| 1973 | 422.6 | 145.4 | 568.0 |
| 1974 | 1107.2 | 158.6 | ¢ 265.8 |
| 1975 | 1477.7 | 209.9 | 1687.6 |
| 1976 | 2087.6 | 256.0 | 2343.6 |
| 1977 | 2398.9 | 682.1 | 3080.9 |
| 1978 | 3054.9 | 7493 | 3804.2 |
| 1979 | 3623.3 | 1153.0 | 4776.3 |
| 1980 | 3920.3 | 1229.6 | 5149.9 |
| 1981 | 4496.7 | 736.1 | 5232.8 |
| 1982 | 5098.1 | 465.6 | 5563.7 |
| 1983 | 5467.2 | 565.1 | 6032.3 |
| 1984 | 5958.1 | 790.3 | 6748.3 |
| 1985 | 5843.3 | 1021.1 | 6864.4 |
| 1986 | 3205.0 | 447.3 | 3552.3 |
| 1987 | 2634.7 | 841.1 | 3475.8 |
| 1988 | 2456.9 | 676.5 | 3133.4 |
| 1989 | 2559.0 | 551.7 | 3110.7 |
| 1990 | 3085.0 | 614.2 | 3699.2 |

Source:
Statistics Canada, The Crude Petroleum and Natural Gas Industry Catalogue 26-213 (various years)

Table 6 provides the value of royalties and land costs paid to the Alberta government from 1961 to 1990. The data demonstrate that the extraction of oil and natural gas generates significant amounts of revenue to the Alberta government. As suggested earlier, land costs represent an ex ante rent and royalties are expost. With the decline in the value of rent from oil and gas reserves due to declining reserve stocks and prices, and increasing operating and capital costs, one can observe how potential income to government could also decrease.

## SUMMARY

This study has examined the treatment of a non-renewable resource, oil and natural gas reserves in Alberta, in the national accounts. Natural resources have long been regarded as free gifts of nature by economists. The assumption that our natural resources are in infinite supply with a zero supply price is being reconsidered in national
accounting. Since balance sheets measure national wealth, Canada's wealth is currently not being estimated correctly by including only man-made assets and excluding non-renewable and renewable resource stocks.

Physical accounts are necessary in order to describe the interrelationship between the environment and the economy. These accounts not only show the short-term exploitation of natural resources but also show the remaining stocks available for primary inputs to economic activity. The physical quantities are required in order to determine the monetary value of the remaining stock.

The focus of this study has been to determine an appropriate method of natural resource valuation. While the development of the physical accounts is based on the definition of established reserves, the monetary accounts require further evaluation in order to incorporate monetary values into the Canadian National Balance Sheet. The present value and the net price approaches seem to conform most closely to the development of wealth accounts. These approaches allow the value of man-made capital employed by the industry to be separated from the value of natural resource itself and identify capital gains and losses due to price changes. This is not the case for the replacement cost approach. While the present value approach is favoured by national accountants, in general and is used in corporate financial reporting, it is limited by the assumptions required.

Oil and natural gas reserves are assets and are components of the national wealth. By extending the definition of capital to cover both man-made and natural capital, a balance sheet presentation shows to what extent natural resource depletion is offset by the addition of man-made and natural capital. If future income and consumption are based on the level of capital stocks, it is important to include the value of the stock of natural resources as well as the value of the man-made capital in the Canadian National Balance Sheet Accounts in order to show whether or not we have sustainable growth and development.

By including the value of natural resources as a nonproduced asset and the value of man-made capital in the Canadian Balance Sheet Accounts, one has a more complete picture of Canada's wealth. One can determine whether or not we are creating wealth while depleting our natural resource base or consuming the revenue generated from natural resource extraction. Incorporating the value of oil and natural gas reserve stocks into the Balance Sheet Accounts will be the next stage of this project.

## REFERENCES

Adelman, M.A. "Oil Producing Countries' Discount Rates". Resources and Energy, vol. 8, 1986. p. 309-329.

Alberta Energy Resources Conservation Board. "Alberta's Reserves of Crude Oil, Oil Sands, Gas, Natural Gas Liquids and Sulphur". ERCB ST91-18, 1991.

Barteimus, Peter. "Environment Statistics and Accounting". 48th ISI Session, Cairo Sept. 9-17, 1991.

Bartelmus, P. et al. Integrated Environmental and Economic Accounting: Framework for a SNA Satellite System; Review of Income and Wealth, ser. 37, no. 2, 1991 p. 111-148.

Born, Alice. "Development of Natural Resource Accounts: Physical and Monetary Accounts for Crude Oil and Natural Gas Reserves in Alberta, Canada". Discussion Paper No. 12, National Accounts and Environment Division, Statistics Canada, 1991.

Canadian Petroleum Association. Statistical Yearbook (various years).

Devarajan, S. and Fisher, A. "Exploration and Scarcity". Journal of Political Economy, vol. 90, no.6, 1982. p. 12791290.

Eglington, P. and Uffeimann, M. 'Observed Costs of Oil and Gas Reserves in Alberta, 1957-1979". Discussion Paper No. 235, Ottawa, Ontario: Economic Council of Canada. 1983.

Hotelling, H. "The Economics of Exhaustible Resources". Journal of Political Economy, vol. 39, 1931. p. 137-175.

Kemp, A., "Petroleum Policy issues in Developing Countries". Energy Policy, Feb. 1992, p. 104-115.

Landefeld, J.S. and Hines, J.R. "National Accounting for Non-renewable Natural Resources in the Mining Industries". Review of Income and Wealth, vol. 31, 1985. p. 1-20.

Lasserre, P. "Discovery Costs as a Measurement of Rent". Canadian Journal of Economics, vol. 18, 1985. p. 474-483.

Levin, J. "Valuation and Treatment of Depletable Resources in the National Accounts". IMF Working Paper 58, International Monetary Fund, 1991.

McKelvey, V.E. Mineral Resource Estimates and Public Policy". American Scientist, vol. 60, 1972. p. 32-40.

McLachian, M. "Replacement Costs for Oil and Gas in Western Canada: Methodologies and Application". CERI Research Report 90-1, Calgary, Alberta: Canadian Energy Research Institute, 1990.

Pearce, D.W. and Turner, R.K., Economics of Natural Resources and the Environment. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1990.

Repetto, R. et al. "Wasting Assets: Natural Resources in the National Accounts". Washington: World Resources institute, 1989.

Smith, R.S. "Income Growth, Government Spending and Wasting Assets - Alberta's Oil and Gas". Unpublished Manuscript, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, 1991.

Statistics Canada. Exploration and Development and Capital Expenditures from Mining and Petroleum and Natural Gas Wells, Catalogue 61-216 (various years).
----. The Crude Petroleum and Natural Gas Industry. Catalogue 26-213 (various years).

Tanner, J.N. "Reserves of Hydrocarbons in Alberta: A Review of Canadian Petroleum Association and Alberta Energy Resources Conservation Board Estimates and Methodology". CERI Research Report 86-2, Calgary, Alberta: Canadian Energy Research Institute, 1986.

United Nations. SNA Handbook on Integrated Environmental and Economic Accounting: Preliminary Draft of the Part 1: General Concepts. New York, 1989.
van Tongeren, J. et al. "Integrated and Economic Accounting: A Case Study for Mexico". Environment Working Paper No. 50, The World Bank, Environment Department, 1991.

## PICK A TOPIC... ANY TOPIC

The 1993 Statistics Canada
Catalogue is your guide to the most complete collection of facts and figures on Canada's changing business, social and economic environment.

No matter what you need to know, the Catalogue will point you in the right direction.

From the most popular topics of the day - like employment, income, trade, and education to specific research studies - like mineral products shipped from Canadian ports and criminal victimization in urban areas you'll find it all here.

the 1993

## Statistics

 Canada Catalogue will help you get your bearings...The Catalogue puts all this information at your fingertips. With the expanded index, you can search by subject, author or title - even periodical articles are indexed. There's also a separate index for all our electronic products.

The Catalogue has everything you The Catalogue has everything you
need to access all Statistics Canada's products:

- descriptions of over 200 new titles, plus succinct abstracts of

the over 900 titles
and 7 map
series already produced;
- newly released 1991 Census products;
- a complete guide to finding and using statistics;
- electronic products in a variety of media, and advice on getting expert assistance on electronic products and on-line searches;
- tabs to each section - so you can immediately flip to the information you need.
...time


## and

 time againTo make sure that
the Catalogue stands up to frequent use, we used a specially coated cover to prevent broken spines, tattered edges and dog-eared comers.

Order today - you'll be lost without it.

## 1093 Statistics Canada Catalogue

Onty $\$ 13.95$ in Canada (USS17 in the U.S. and USS 20 in other countries). Quate Cat, no. 11-2042.
Write to Publication Sales, Statistics Canada, Otawa, Ontario Kin OTG
fax: (613) 951-1584 call toll-free: 1-800-267-6677
Or contact the nearest statisties Canada Reference Centre listed in this publication.

# Puttite Matrifitiale Datan Conalds hamm and Farmers to Work for You! 

Keeping up with changes in janada's dynamic agriculture iector could be a time:onsuming task. To help, the 991 Census of Agriculture iffers the most comprehen;ive information available in a ormat to suit you.
Nith our free publication, the 1991 Census of Agriculture 'roducts and Services, you'll liscover all the products and iervices available from the خensus of Agriculture.
A unique series of 24 Data 'ublications presents a ascinating insight into agriculture at the national, proincial and sub-provincial levels.
 are a must for anyone with a keen or casual interest in agriculture.

Got a specific request? Custom Services offer a wide range of services in the combinations of variables or geographic areas that interest you. Unpublished Data are available in print or on diskette in a series of specially designed small area data tables.

Three Analytical Publications, with maps and graphics, provide a quick look at current trends in Canada's fastchanging primary agriculture industry. These publications

For more information, contact your local Statistics Canada Regional Reference Centre or:

U User Services Unit<br>Census of Agriculture<br>Statistics Canada<br>Ottawa, Ontario<br>K1A 0 T6

$\square$
In Ottawa, call:
613 951-8711

To order Publications:
call Toll free:
Outside Ottawa, call
$1800267-6677$
Toll free: 1800 465-1991
Fax: 613 951-1680

## 

On the occasion of the nation's 125th anniversary of Confederation, the 1992 Canada Year Book takes a unique look at the fascinating highlights in the development of Canada since 1867.

Exceptionally popular among business people, journalists, librarians,
parliamentarians, educators and diplomats for 125 years, the 1992 Canada Year Book is designed as a comprehensive reference source for the latest on economic, political, and social information on Canada and Canadians. And for the first time, this "special collector's" edition presents picturesque vignettes on Canada's past with informative, easy-to-read text.

Special features include:

- a new 22 cm X 30 cm (9" X 12") format
- larger typeface
- over 300 rare archival photos
- historical perspectives on Canada's past
- 22 chapters, 577 pages bound in deluxe hard cover.

Time and time again, you'll reach for this compact encyclopedia to answer questions on all aspects of Canada.

- THE PEOPLE
- THE NATION - THE ECONOMY
- ARTS AND LEISURE


Available in separate English and French editions, the Canada Year Book (Cat. No. $11-402 \mathrm{E}$ ) sells for $\$ 49.95$ (plus $\$ 5.05$ shipping and handing) in Canada, US $\$ 60$ in the United States, and US $\$ 70$ in other countries (includes shipping and handling).
To order, write Publication Sales, Statistics Canada, Ottava, Ontario, K1A OT6, or contact the nearest Statistics Canada Regional Reference Centre listed in this publication.
For faster ordering, using your VISA or MasterCard, call toll-free 1-800-267-6677 or fax your order to (613) $951-1584$. Please do not send confirmation.
|AIL TO: ublication Sales tatistics Canada Ittawa, Ontario, K1A OT6

Yease print)
ompany
epartment $\qquad$
ttention
ddress
ity
ostal Code

FAX TO: (613) 951-1584
This fax will be treated as an original order. Please do not send confirmation.


Iheque or money order should be made payable to the Receiver General for Canada/Publications. Canadian clients pay in Canadian funds. Slients from the United States and other countries pay total amount in US funds drawn on a US bank.

|  |  |  | PF |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| For faster service | $1-800-267-6677$ | VISA and MasterCard | 092146 |  |
|  |  |  | Accounts | $1993-03$ |

Version française de ce bon de commande disponible sur demande


[^25]Statistique Statistics
Canada Canada


[^0]:    1. The next issue of Human Activity and the Environment will appear in 1994 in order to provide more timely data from the quinquennial Censuses of Population and Agriculture.
[^1]:    1. For example, carbon steel sheets increased from $21 \%$ to $31 \%$ of the constant dollar value of output of iron and steel from 1971 to 1986. Copper dropped from $25 \%$ to $14 \%$ of the constant dollar value of output of nonferrous metals from 1981 to 1986.
[^2]:    1. The author would like to thank Patrick Adams for his work in developing the energy disposition tables that were used in this study.
    2. Those readers interested in more details of input-output modelling and its use for environmental analysis are referred to the appendix at the end of this chapter. Details of the input-output model used in this study are available on request from the author.
[^3]:    3. Although water vapour is the most important greenhouse gas in terms of overall warming power, its atmospheric concentration is not affected significantly by human activities.
    4. Households in this context include non-profit organisations.
[^4]:    1. It must be emphasized that the figures shown in Table 4 are the emissions associated with the production activity required to meet the demand for commodities from final consumption categories. They do not represent the emissions associated with the consumption of these commodities once they have been purchased. The latter were shown in Table 2.
[^5]:    1. Petroleum-based fossil fuels include diesel fuel, light and heavy fuel oils,
[^6]:    1. The troposphere is the lowest level of the earth's atmosphere.
    2. Environment Canada estimates that 1990 CFC emissions amounted to 11 kt (Jaques, 1992, p. xviii).
[^7]:    1. Except where explicitly noted, all references to data in this section refer to Table 3.
    2. Estimates of capital and operating costs for specific mills were prepared by N. McCubbin Consultants Inc. These data were used by Environment Canada to evaluate the anticipated impact of the Puip and Paper Effluent Regulations published in the Canada Gazette on December 14, 1991.
    3. Surplus is defined here as the value of shipments less the cost of energy, materials and labour. Since the study is conducted at the level of the individual mill, it is not possible in most cases to determine actual profits. Surplus, as defined here, includes head office overhead, certain purchased services, depreciation and profits.
    4. The capital cost is expressed as annual payments over 20 years amortized at 8.19\% (See McCubbin, 1990, p 63.)
[^8]:    1. It is important to distinguish between B.C. coastal and interior mills be cause of the marked difference in their circumstances. Most interior mills had already acquired secondary treatment facilities whereas the coastal milis were relatively unequipped. Furthermore, due to the limited area surrounding coastal mills, it is necessary for many of them to use the activated studge treatment process which is more costly.
[^9]:    Farmiand change refers to change in proportion of zone farmand. Municipalities making up the Riding Mountain Biosphere Reserve are outined around the park.
    Sources:
    Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division and the Census of Agriculture.

[^10]:    1. The spatial units (polygons) in Map 5 are generated from enumeration area centroid points. Thiessen polygons are created around each centroid using a "nearest neighbor function". Lines between points are bisected at the mid-point to form continuous boundaries around each
[^11]:    1. The author would like to thank Marcia Santiago for her contribution to the research which supports this chapter. Thanks should also go to scientists at Agriculture Canada's Centre for Land and Biological Resources Research who provided valuable comments.
[^12]:    1. The 1991 Census responses to the "no-tillage" question are somewhat overestimated because in some instances hay crops were reported as "no till" when only crops requiring seed bed preparation should have been reported.
[^13]:    1. Note that in contrast to Table 8 which is in income deciles, Tables 7 and 9 show income groups. Consequently, there is not an even number of households in each group, a fact that, while unimportant for this analysis, does make it impossible to compare the three tables in detail.
[^14]:    1. The percentages in this paragraph reflect the proportions shown in Figure 2.
[^15]:    1. These establishments are, for the most part, included in the Other Utili-
[^16]:    2. See Chapter 11, Table 2.
    3. See Chapter 11, Table 3.
[^17]:    1. The authors would like to thank Don Kerr for his painstaking work in assuring the quality of the data.
    2. See the section titled: "Local Government: Upper and Lower Ters".
    3. On the questionnaire, garbage is defined as non-hazardous waste excluding materials diverted to a recycling program.
[^18]:    4. Waste is defined as any substance discarded for final disposal or recycling for which the owner or generator has no further use.
[^19]:    1. Material which, technically, can be reused as a raw material in the manufacture of a new product.
[^20]:    1. Unless otherwise specified, unit prices quoted in the text are based on October 1991.
[^21]:    1. The term "remaining" refers to initial established reserves less cumulative production.
[^22]:    Notes:
    I11 Discounted using a long-tem bond corporate bond rate; based on year-end prices and costs.
    [2] Same as [1] except based on a 4 -year moving average.
    [3)
    the results in this table should be treated as preliminary.

[^23]:    1. Both the replacement cost value and the present value are "discounted" using a long-term corporate bond yield.
[^24]:    Note:
    Discrepancies are due to rounding and data sources.
    Sources:
    Aberta Energy Resources Conservation Board.
    Statistics Canada, National Accounts and Environment Division

[^25]:    This order coupon is available in English upon request

