QUEEN JL 103 .C6 E94 1992

> Division, Evaluation des programmes

Program Evaluation Division

DEPARTMENTAL ASSIGNMENT PROGRAM

EVALUATION ASSESSMENT STUDY

Consommation et Affaires commerciales Canada

Bureau des services stratégiques et généraux

1 1/12

Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada

Bureau of Strategic and Corporate Services

EVALUATION ASSESSMENT STUDY REPORT

OF THE

DEPARTMENTAL ASSIGNMENT PROGRAM

DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER & CORPORATE AFTARS LIBRARY JUN 3.0 1993 BIBLIOTHÈQUE MUNTÉRE DE LA CONSOMNATION ET DES CORPORATIONS

PROGRAM EVALUATION DIVISION STRATEGIC PLANNING AND CORPORATE SERVICES BRANCH

Gary Lazarus

July 1992

Queen JL103 1992

•

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this report is to present an assessment study for the evaluation of the Departmental Assignment Program (DAP). The findings of the evaluation assessment study are to be useful in the determination of whether or not to proceed with a program evaluation study. A recommended plan for evaluating the DAP is proposed along with detailed terms of reference.

One of four corporate objectives of Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada is to provide a developmental opportunity for each employee. Because **DAP** provides an excellent vehicle for such opportunities, an evaluation assessment study is both timely and important.

The objective of this evaluation assessment study is to improve the program by identifying actual and potential problems encountered by the program and suggesting directions for dealing with these concerns. Assessment studies serve other purposes, however. They ensure an appropriate focus for the ensuing evaluation study and serve as a means for indicating which kind of information will be produced.

APPROACH USED IN PERFORMING THE ASSESSMENT STUDY

The approach used to conduct the assessment involved a number of techniques for gathering information. These included:

a review of program documents,

- . interviews with program managers,
- . the preparation of a program component profile (which follows),
- . development of a list of issues and related questions,
- . a review of information on methods of data collection and
- . preparation of a Report on Methodology¹.

ISSUES

The assessment study identified three broad issues which varied in degree of importance:

- a) program access, the most critical issue, which concerns publicity or communications involving DAP, the way in which the DAP inventory is maintained and used and any obstacles to obtaining an assignment;
- b) client satisfaction of employees and managers (both home and host) who have used DAP;
- c) cost effectiveness.

EVALUATION OPTIONS

 DO NOTHING. An evaluation study is not needed because the program satisfies the current objectives and the clients are generally satisfied with it. Also, it is difficult to justify a thorough evaluation of the program on financial grounds given that the program cost approximately \$92,600 to run in the 1991-92 fiscal year.

¹. Report on the Methodology for the Survey of CCAC Employees on the Departmental Assignment Program. Program Evaluation Division, Strategic Planning and Corporate Services Branch, CCAC, October 1992.

- 2) EXPLORE THE ACCESS ISSUE. The evaluation would study both the positive and negative aspects associated with access to the program. Information about awareness of DAP services and procedures (i.e. the effectiveness of publicity about DAP), perceptions of obstacles or limitations of DAP and suggestions for improvements would be elicited. The approach would involve discussions with DAP managers and staff, high level management in the Department, managers of equivalent programs outside the Department and perhaps with Ian Clark, originator of the program. Four months of program evaluator time are required to complete this option.
- 3) CONSIDER THE ACCESS AND SATISFACTION ISSUES. Satisfaction refers to the degree to which employee or manager expectations of DAP are matched by the way the program functions. This approach would involve:
 - examination of program documentation such as annual reports to collect program usage and resource information as well as to avoid duplication of data collection

interviews with the management and staff of the DAP

 a survey of department managers and staff to collect both statistical and opinion information.

In order to assess the satisfaction of various groups of department personnel involved (i.e. eligible employees who have never used **DAP**, those on the inventory but who have not received an assignment, those who have had an assignment, or managers who have never used **DAP**, those who have withdrawn their proposal, those who have had their proposal filled, or home managers), survey questionnaires will be developed to elicit responses about program access and satisfaction from each of the target groups. The data collection stage, however, could add 4 to 6 months of program evaluator time to the above and, perhaps, \$20,000 in consulting fees.

4) REVIEW ACCESS, SATISFACTION AND COST EFFECTIVENESS. The cost effectiveness issue refers to whether the program resources are effectively and efficiently employed or whether more cost-effective alternatives exist. This option involves discussions with program as well as senior managers. The additional resources required to study the cost effectiveness are expected to be minimal.

The program evaluator recommends the pursuit of option 3. Although an examination of cost effectiveness would not add unduly to the resources expended, it is felt that the study of the access and satisfaction issues should be given priority at this time.

2. INTRODUCTION

In the context of better human resources planning and management, more emphasis is being placed on creating opportunities for employee development. In fact, one of four corporate objectives for Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada (CCAC) is to "ensure that employees have real opportunities to develop and adapt to the changing environment in which we work"². However, given the current labour environment within the public service, where both demographic make-up and constricting size of the public service severely limit opportunities for professional growth, the task of providing such opportunities is a difficult one. With fewer staffing actions occurring, more of staff movement will occur through lateral transfers.

DAP is an excellent vehicle for providing relatively secure, developmental opportunities in an on-going program that administers a system which offers employees a temporary change of job while assisting managers to fill short-term requirements. These assignments can also facilitate lateral mobility. It is, therefore, both timely and important to evaluate the DAP program.

Rapport, Consumer and Corporate Affairs Canada, May/June 1992.

3. PROGRAM COMPONENT PROFILE

A. BACKGROUND

I. MANDATE

The Departmental Assignment Program (DAP) was established by the Deputy Minister and the Executive Committee in May 1989 to encourage and to enhance an informal secondment process which existed prior to it.

II. OBJECTIVES

The DAP was set up to:

 assist managers in meeting short-term operational requirements by providing an inventory of candidates who are interested, as part of a career development strategy, in working on temporary projects or shortterm tasks; and

b) provide employees with assignment opportunities to apply their skills, as well as to develop and acquire new knowledge, skills, broaden their experience and revitalize interest in their work.

III. DESCRIPTION

The Departmental Assignment Program is responsible for all (at headquarters) departmental assignments and interdepartmental secondment agreements without

an acting clause.

Many factors may play a role in encouraging participation in the **DAP**. That is, managers may encourage their employee(s) to participate or employees may wish to participate owing to a desire to:

	develop skills, knowledge and broaden work experience in relation
	to career goals
•	improve second language abilities
	develop supervisory or management skills
	prepare middle managers for more senior positions
	learn new skills and re-train staff if their current position is affected
	by technological change or downsizing
•	implement affirmative action initiatives
•	enhance employee's competence and revitalize their interest in work
•	assist in the retraining and ultimate relocation of employees whose
	current position is affected by operational change

The DAP is open to all indeterminate employees in the department (although senior level managers have not participated in the past) and assignment terms last from three months to two years. Assignments can be arranged anywhere within the Public Service, not just within CCAC. Employees must have their supervisor's approval to participate. Information about the employee's qualifications and interests is entered into the DAP inventory so that when a management proposal is received, proposals and candidates can be matched. If an assignment is arranged, the assignee retains the salary and benefits of their home position and has the right to enter restricted competitions in both their home and host organizations. The host manager has no continuing obligation or commitment to a DAP employee but

the home manager must retain the employee's original position to which the assignee can return.

After eight months on the inventory with no resultant assignment, the employee has the option to withdraw from the inventory or remain on it. Managers can withdraw their proposals at any time.

Originally, the program was established by former deputy minister, I. Clark, and the Executive Committee. Currently, **DAP** management reports directly to the director of staffing. The closer relationship with staffing is believed to be beneficial to the program because: it facilitates the coordination of staffing actions, and it facilitates career counselling and publicity for the **DAP**.

An assignment is defined as an action taken to give new functions to an employee for a temporary period, within the department. The **DAP** facilitates access to assignments at headquarters. In the regions, the person responsible for regional personnel activities assumes that role. The Public Service Commission's Interdepartmental Network, comprised of 26 departments, is in full operation to facilitate interdepartmental secondments. Members of the network meet every three months and maintain regular contact with a view to meeting managers' requests and offering employees the best possible opportunities.

9

VI. RESOURCES

The personnel involved with the **DAP** consists of the chief, a program officer and a secretary. For the three years of its existence, **DAP** has been funded by Personnel Division.

The total budget accorded to the **DAP** for the 1991-92 fiscal year is estimated to be \$92,600. An estimate is required because the group working on the **DAP** also works on Special Assignments programs, student programs and other unspecified programs. Because the group has worked on these programs for some time, it is difficult to derive comparable figures attributable solely to the **DAP** for previous fiscal years. The capital assets, other than office space, accorded to the program include 2 personal computer units borrowed from the Consumer Bureau, 1 laser printer and other office supplies purchased and owned by Personnel.

B. ELEMENTS AND STRUCTURE

I. COMPONENT ELEMENTS

a) ACTIVITIES

The role of the **DAP** is to provide brokerage services related to the achievement of the two program objectives mentioned above. **DAP** activities are listed as follows:

- process applications from employees,
- . determine the eligibility of employees for inclusion in the inventory,
- . process proposals received from managers in the department,
- arrange assignments both within the department and interdepartmentally,

- monitor and assess the reactions of participating managers and assignees,
- provide training and career counselling,
- promote and market DAP,
- develop assignment opportunities for employees, and
- . find appropriate inventory candidates for management proposals.

b) OUTPUTS

The outputs produced by the **DAP** follow directly from the above activities. These include an up-to-date inventory of qualified employees in the department, the processing of proposals for managers looking to fill short-term needs, the assignments themselves and the surveys of the participants. **DAP** also produces an annual report which summarises the year's activities.

c) IMPACTS AND EFFECTS

According to the most recent annual report, the **DAP** received positive feedback from both employees and managers. Employees appreciated the opportunity to learn something new or to put their skills into practice, while managers were very satisfied with the calibre of candidates and the work performed on assignment. Hence, there exists at least some evidence to support the position that the clients of the program are satisfied.

II. COMPONENT STRUCTURE

Also in the most recent annual report, it is interesting to note that the DAP found it was often unable to satisfy interdepartmental requests for candidates given the shortage of candidates in the inventory, the specialization of some of them and the unilingualism of 40% of them. This suggests a problem with the size of the inventory or perhaps a gap between candidates qualifications and the stringent criteria of manager's requests. Such indications emphasize the need to assess the perspectives of both employees and managers toward the DAP program.

Evidence of the diminishing size of the inventory can be drawn from **DAP** annual reports. The numbers can be found in the following table.

FISCAL YEAR	APPLICATIONS FROM EMPLOYEES	PROPOSALS FROM MANAGERS	NUMBER OF ASSIGNMENTS
1989-90 ³	103	107	46
1990-91	73	89	45
1991-92⁴	57	85	44 ⁵
TOTAL	233	281	135

INDICATORS OF ACTIVITIES (DAP)

From the table, it can be seen that the number of assignments has remained virtually constant over the three years. Over the same time span, the number of applications from CCAC employees (located at headquarters) has declined substantially and the number of proposals received from managers has declined as well.

The need for an examination of the access issue is further strengthened by arguments found in the recently released 1992-93 Personnel Services Business

⁵. 39 of 44 were in CCAC.

³. The program was established in May 1989.

^{4.} Note that the operating budget (including salary) for 1991-92 was approximately \$92,600.

Plan. According to the business plan, CCAC employees want a strategic service that ties planning with hiring, hiring with training and training with both job related needs and overall career development. In a comment on the reason for reorganization of the Personnel Directorate into the Human Resource Services Directorate (HRSD), the Business Plan notes: "Change <u>is</u> required to improve access, ..., to provide an integrated and innovative service.

DAP falls under the umbrella of the HRSD services which are available to the departmental employees and the above comment applies to DAP no less than to other personnel areas.

4. SUMMARY OF ANALYSES CONDUCTED

I. ACHIEVEMENT OF OBJECTIVES

Based on the satisfaction with DAP expressed by both employees and managers, as indicated in the annual report, DAP appears to be operating as intended. However, both employee and manager activity has been diminishing. In the past, the DAP promoted the program heavily. The promotional activity produced increased interest in the program, but it should be noted that the program was relatively new at the time. According to the most recent annual report, the program is considering a renewed promotional initiative. Current constraints in the work environment on opportunities for upward movement add to DAP's appeal to both employees and managers at the present time. In sum, it appears that the program is achieving its objectives, but there may be room for improvement given the relatively small size of the inventory.

To the best of our knowledge, other government departments have not carried out evaluations of their assignment programs. Reasons for this include the relative newness of the program and the lack of identifiable outputs. Hence, the evaluation assessment and subsequent study in CCAC are expected to break new ground.

Three issues have been identified as being important to the achievement of the objectives of **DAP**.

a) The program access issue is the most critical and refers to the degree to which employees and managers who could benefit from DAP have adequate access to it. In order for the program to be considered successful, the DAP inventory must have an ample number of candidates and a sufficiently high

number of resulting assignments (i.e. managers must use the program). Managers have alternative methods of meeting staffing needs in addition to lengthy staffing actions (e.g. secondments, term employment). Therefore, to be successful, **DAP** must be able to respond quickly to managers' requests for qualified candidates. As the preceding activity indicators reveal, both the applications from employees and the proposals from managers have been decreasing in number since the inception of the program in 1989-90 although the number of assignments has remained constant. In comparison to similar programs in other departments (e.g. at Statistics Canada), such relatively low usage numbers warrant investigation of the issue of access to **DAP**.

Program access refers not only to an employee's or manager's (home as well as host manager) experience with using the DAP but also includes the likelihood of an assignment being arranged. To this end, investigation of the issue of access will address:

- employee/manager awareness of DAP features, terms and conditions (i.e. eligibility, assignment length, counselling, retention of home salaries and benefits) and how this awareness was obtained (i.e. CCAC or DAP publication, word of mouth, etc.)
- employee/manager perceptions of program limitations (i.e. required approvals, retaining home position, sufficiency of qualifications, mobility of regional employees)

. employee/manager suggestions for program improvement. In this way, the effectiveness of the communications about the program, the usefulness of the inventory and the availability of assignments can be examined.

 In order to measure fulfilment of the objectives of assisting managers to meet operational requirements and provide opportunities for employees, it is

essential that evaluation investigates the issue of client satisfaction. DAP procedure requires participating assignees as well as home and host managers to submit assignment appraisals upon completion of the assignment. Further assessment of client perceptions with respect to the program, those who participate as well as those who are eligible but do not participate, is required in order to assess the long-term impacts and effects of the program on the many stakeholders.

While general measures of satisfaction (such as opinions of services and procedures or willingness to use **DAP** in the future) relate to all stakeholders, other measures of satisfaction are related to the expectations of **DAP** that a specific group holds. Therefore, it is important that the evaluation study elicit general as well as group-specific information about satisfaction. In addition to the general satisfaction criteria listed above, it is important to assess the following group-specific information.

TARGET GROUP	SATISFACTION CRITERIA		
DAP Assignees	.length of assignment .effort to find assignment .reason for application .opportunity for advancement .experience gained .reception in assignment location and upon return		
Employees in inventory	.reason for application .effort to find assignment		
Employees no longer in inventory	.reason for withdrawal from inventory .effort to find assignment		
Eligible Employees	.reason for not registering .intention to use DAP		

Managers whose proposals were filled	.effort to find suitable candidate .fulfilment of short-term needs .length of time to fill position .impact on organization	
Managers whose proposals were withdrawn	.reason for withdrawal	
Managers who have not used DAP	.reason for non-use	

c) The third issue refers to cost effectiveness. The evaluation study will investigate the efficient and effective use of resources allocated to the program by way of person-years and dollars for purposes of expenditures on salaries, operations and maintenance. Any more cost-effective alternatives or suggestions for productivity gains while maintaining current levels of funding would greatly benefit the DAP program.

II. QUESTIONS AND APPROACHES

For each of the identified issues, weaknesses of the program tend to lead to questions which could be answered through a subsequent evaluation study. Under access, a number of important questions can be posed at this time.

QUESTION NUMBER	QUESTION	
1	What are the for the DAP Comment: - - -	e positive aspects with respect to selection criteria This question hopes to address the following points: DAP is for every indeterminate employee (who has his/her director's approval to participate); DAP terms may run from 3 to 24 months; DAP participating employees retain salary, status and benefits of their home position; DAP participating employees retain the right to enter competitions and the right to accept a permanent job; DAP, in collaboration with Training Division, is to offer workshops on Career Planning.
2	Are you aware that the program is addressed to people at all levels up to Management Category?	

	QUESTION	
3	 In your opinion, what are the limitations on the program? Comment: This question hopes to identify and discuss the following points: the approval of home supervisor and director; the fact that the home supervisor must hold the position open for the assignee; the identified gaps in qualifications of potential assignees, with respect to the other official language and to the limited scope in the workload of potential assignees; the location obstacle: movement of employees from head office to the regions and vice-versa; the exclusion of the management category. 	
4	In light of these limitations, what would you suggest can be done to improve access to the program, to help the program facilitate lateral mobility and to help managers fill short-term needs with respect to job openings? Comment: This question hopes to identify and to probe the following points: - the amelioration of training opportunities; - the coordination of staffing (DAP) and training a addressed in the 1992-93 Business Plan.	

The approaches for addressing the issue of **access** are: informal discussions with **DAP** manager and staff, the director of staffing and M. Moylan, and other senior

managers (especially from the sponsoring Bureaux and Training Division).

Questions pertaining to the issue of client satisfaction are	as as	follows.
--	-------	----------

QUESTION NUMBER	QUESTION
1	What is your opinion of the procedures involved in participating in DAP?
2	Describe your experience in the context of an assignee/home manager/host manager?
3	Discuss what you believe are the benefits of your DAP experience?
4	Itemize and explain those things you found to be unsatisfactory regarding your DAP experience?
5	In your opinion, based upon your experience with DAP, is the program achieving its objectives of facilitating lateral mobility/filling short-term openings? Explain.

The approach for collecting data on the client satisfaction issue involves a survey vehicle. Targeted individuals include assignees and host managers.

The questions pertaining to the issue of cost effectiveness are as follows.

QUESTION NUMBER	QUESTION	
1	Does the program have sufficient funding to achieve its objectives?	
2	Given its current resources, is the DAP achieving its objectives?	

The approach for the collection of data on the **cost effectiveness** issue consists of informal discussions with: **DAP** manager and staff, the director of staffing, Personnel, and representatives of the Bureaux which sponsor the **DAP**.

III. INDICATORS

Indicators of access include DAP counts of applications from employees, proposals from managers, and assignments (as shown in the above table). Percentages of the above relative to the size of the eligible participant base may convert the counts data into data that may be comparable to data obtained from similar programs in other federal government departments.

Indicators of client satisfaction could be based upon participant responses to the DAP appraisal questionnaires. Alternatively, the program evaluator can obtain desired counts based upon a sample survey of assignees and managers.

Resources spent specifically on the **DAP** are available for 1991-1992. This figure provides a good estimate of the program funding for 1991-1992. Analysis of data

collected from previous years is difficult because estimates of the percentage of time the staff work on DAP as well as on other projects are not available.

5. EVALUATION OPTIONS

I. CONFIDENCE AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The questions on **access** to the program are likely to promote constructive discussion and produce some answers although it is anticipated that the data collection process may uncover more questions than answers. **Client satisfaction** issues may be dealt with using the survey vehicle. Difficulties in obtaining cooperation from potential respondents can be anticipated for several reasons:

- Program participants have already been canvassed by DAP to complete appraisal forms;
- b) Lack of management response to survey results from previous Personnel initiatives;
- Other ongoing surveys which require cooperation from departmental employees.

There is little doubt that questions pertaining to the **cost effectiveness** issue can be answered. However, since it is possible that other cost effectiveness issues and questions may arise as a result of the evaluation of **access** to the program, it may not be beneficial to pursue **cost effectiveness** issues at this time.

It is recommended that all questions pertaining to the issues of access to and satisfaction with the program be rigorously pursued.

II. TIME AND RESOURCE REQUIREMENTS

The evaluation of access to and satisfaction with the DAP will cover 8 months although it is expected that 4 to 6 months of program evaluator time is required. The only anticipated contract money is with regard to the publication of the final evaluation report. A rough timetable is as follows.

- a) Preliminary contacts and arrangements for meetings would stretch over the summer (which tends to be a very heavy vacation period). Hence, this activity may extend into September. Program evaluator resource time: 0.5 months. The targeted individuals are: the manager and staff of DAP, the director of staffing, Personnel, and M. Moylan, representatives from the Bureaux which fund the program, other CCAC managers (including Training Division) and managers of similar programs in other federal departments.
- b) Based on the information derived from the above interviews, questionnaires will be designed to elicit relevant information on the designated issues.
 There will be a specific questionnaire for each of the groups to be surveyed in order to elicit appropriate information from that target population.
 Therefore eight questionnaires will be developed for each of the following groups:

employees who have been or are currently on assignment,

employees in the inventory,

employees no longer in the inventory,

eligible employees who have not participated in DAP,

managers whose proposals have been filled,

managers whose proposals have been withdrawn,

managers whose proposal has not yet been filled,

25

managers who have not used DAP.

In addition, a sample plan for the data to be collected and the analysis to be completed will be developed. A report documenting the methodology to be used in analyzing the data will also be produced.

- c) Data collection is to commence in October by completing a pilot test of the survey questionnaires, not only to ensure the accuracy and effectiveness of the questionnaires but also to train the interviewers. It is planned that the questionnaires will be mailed out to the appropriate target populations and that each recipient will be contacted by telephone so that an interviewer can conduct him/her through the questionnaire. Subsequent to this data collection, which is to occur in November, an outside contractor will be assigned the task of capturing and editing the data and completing the preliminary analysis according to the plan outlined in the methodology report. As well, the contractor will prepare an evaluation report, providing recommendations for improvements to the program.
- d) Several iterations of a final report will be required in order to obtain approval from all concerned parties. Program evaluator time is expected to be 1.5 months although this phase of the project may cover a longer period. The first draft of the report could be expected February 26, 1993.

26

TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR A PROGRAM EVALUATION STUDY OF THE DEPARTMENTAL ASSIGNMENT PROGRAM

1. BACKGROUND

In the context of better human resources planning and management, more emphasis is being placed on creating opportunities for employee development. One of the recognized ways to facilitate lateral mobility, to provide for developmental opportunities or for a temporary change, is through a secondment process. The Departmental Assignment Program (DAP) was established in order to encourage and to enhance an informal secondment process which existed prior to it. The DAP was set up to:

- assist managers in meeting short-term operational requirements by providing an inventory of candidates who are interested, as part of a career development strategy, in working on temporary projects or short-term tasks; and
- provide employees with assignment opportunities to apply their skills, as well as to develop and acquire new knowledge, skills, broaden their experience and revitalize interest in their work.

2. PROPOSED EVALUATION STUDY

It is proposed that an evaluation study focusing on the issues of access to and satisfaction with the program be undertaken.

3. ISSUES

The study is to address a number of concerns in the area of access to and **satisfaction** with the program. In particular, the study will consider the positive aspects of the program as well as the limitations on the program. Solutions to these concerns will be sought and itemized as recommendations in the final evaluation report.

4. METHODOLOGY

Information will be gathered from program documentation, interviews with targeted departmental managers and staff as appropriate and discussions with managers of equivalent programs from other government departments.

5. RESOURCES

It is estimated that this study will require four to six months of program evaluation staff time and nominal money resources for the publication of the final evaluation study report.

6. INVOLVEMENT OF THE DAP

The study will require the participation of **DAP** personnel and other staff both at headquarters and in the regional offices. Every effort will be made to minimize the requirements on the time of all personnel.

28

7. TIMING

The final report in draft form is to be completed by February 26, 1993.



QUEEN JL 103 .C6 E94 1992 Lazarus, Gary Evaluation assessment study

DATE DUE DATE DE RETOUR

DATE DE	RETOOR
	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1
	38-296
CARR MCLEAN	

